CASAE 2012 Proceedings of the 31st Annual Conference.

Hosted at Wilfrid Laurier University and the University of Waterloo in Waterloo. May 28th - 30th, 2012.

Edited by Susan Brigham
2012 Conference Proceedings

31st National Conference of the Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education (CASAE)/ L’Association Canadienne pour l’Étude de l’Éducation des Adultes (ACÉÉA)

Wilfrid Laurier University and the University of Waterloo in Waterloo, Ontario

28 May to 30 May 2012.

Edited by Susan M. Brigham
Mount Saint Vincent University, Halifax, NS
2012 Meeting of CASAE. Proceedings of the 31st National Conference of the Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education (CASAE)/ L’Association Canadienne pour l’Étude de l’Éducation des Adultes (ACÉÉA) held at Wilfrid Laurier University and the University of Waterloo in Waterloo, ON from 28 May to 30 May 2012.
Edited by Susan M. Brigham.

Copyright belongs to individual authors. Please contact individual authors for permission to reproduce and distribute their work.
1. Adult Education – Congresses. I. Brigham, Susan M. II. Wilfrid Laurier University and the University of Waterloo in Waterloo. III Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education Conference (31st: 2012: Wilfrid Laurier University and the University of Waterloo in Waterloo)

Greetings CASAE/ACÉÉA conference delegates,

It has been a pleasure to edit the 31st annual CASAE/ACÉÉA conference proceedings. This collection of papers, roundtables and symposia covers a wide range of themes including health, research methods, women learners, employment, workplace learning, literacies, social movements, teacher education, learning in community, migration, policy, and critical reflection, dialogue and pedagogy, and much more. These proceedings, like those of previous CASAE/ACÉÉA conference proceedings, make an important contribution to the field of adult education. The theory development, research findings, and personal critical reflections shared in these papers will provide the reader with a sense of what adult educators care deeply about, how we strive to understand the world around us and the various changes we envision for the future.

As has been the practice for many years now, the conference proceedings are in a CD format, rather than in hard copy. This makes the proceedings much lighter weight, portable, and more environmentally friendly by saving on paper and ink.

I would like to thank Mount Saint Vincent University graduate research assistant David Neilsen for all his help. In addition to his invaluable assistance, David’s photography is featured on the proceedings’ cover. I thank him for this cheerful colourful design that reflects the hopefulness of adult educators who toil with commitment and passion at their work.

Enjoy lively engaged dialogue at the conference.

Best wishes,

Susan M. Brigham,

Associate Professor
Graduate Studies of Lifelong Learning Coordinator
Faculty of Education, Mount Saint Vincent University
# Table of Contents

## I. Presentation papers

1. **Tannis Atkinson**:  
   Between Social Good and Market Imperative: Adult Literacy Work Under Employment Ontario.......................... 12-18

2. **Amanda Benjamin, Melissa White, Mary MacKeracher & Katie Stella**:  
   Riding the River: Adult Education in a Have-Not province......................... 19-25

3. **Virginia Bogusz & Launa Gauthier**:  
   Promoting Lifelong Learning in Women’s Federal Correctional Programs: A Communities of Practice Approach.................. 26-32

4. **Sandra Bohlinger**:  
   Which Way Forward? – Comparing Prior Learning Assessment and Recognition Across Countries.......................... 33-41

5. **Susan M. Brigham**:  
   Notes From a Small Island: Storytelling in Adult Education Research........ 42-47

6. **Derek Briton**:  
   Making Sense of Why Some Learners Choose Failure Over Success .......... 48-52

7. **Shauna Butterwick & Maren Elfert**:  
   The Social Movement Learning of Women Social Activists of Atlantic Canada: “What Shall We Do and How Shall We Live?”................................. 53-59

8. **Paula Cameron**:  
   Seamfulness: The Disruptive Pedagogy of Young Women’s Depression and Implications for Adult Education................................. 60-68

9. **Susan L. Carter**:  
   Mediating Learning: An Activity Theory View of the Workplace Harassment Industry ................................................................. 69-75

10. **Darlene E. Clover, Kathy Sanford, & Fatma Dogus**:  
    Visual Discourse Analysis of Adult Education, Learning and Community Cultural Development on Public Art Gallery and Museum Websites in Canada and the United Kingdom.................. 76-81

11. **Maureen Coady**:  
    A Study of Informal Learning in a Community-Based Health Education Program: The Transformative Experience of One Inter-Disciplinary Health Care Team.............................. 82-89
12. **Suzanne L. Cook**:  
Reflections on the Self: Learning, Engagement and Redirection through Volunteering......................................................... 90-95

13. **Stacey Crooks**:  
Mapping the Maze of Family Literacy Policy in Canada................................. 96-102

14. **Susan Diane**:  
Reflexivity and the Journey of a White Lesbian Researcher...................... 103-109

15. **Rose A. Dyson**:  
Corporate Rule, Climate Change and Social Upheaval:  
Old Challenges and New Opportunities for Adult Educators.................. 110-116

16. **Leona M. English**:  
A Very Gendered History:  
Women and Literacy in Early 20th Century Newfoundland....................... 117-123

17. **Behrang Foroughi & Christine Durant**:  
Urban Spaces of Creation, Convergence and Collaboration..................... 124-130

18. **Tara Gibb**:  
All [Employers] Want is a Number:” Language Policy and Systems of Classification Mediating Internationally Educated Professionals’ Employment Relations............................................................... 131-137

19. **Patricia A. Gouthro, Susan M. Holloway & Erin J. Careless**:  
Critical Literacies and Democratic Learning:  
Using Fiction Reading and Writing to Engage in Lifelong Learning Connected to Citizenship................................................. 138-144

20. **Erin Graham**:  
What do You Think You’re Doing? An Examination of Developing a Theory and Practice of Teaching Teachers.................................................................145-151

21. **Janet Groen & Colleen Kawailak**:  
Have We Sold Out?  
Adult Education in a Teacher Preparation Program................................. 152-158

22. **Shibao Guo**:  
Reclaiming Lifelong Learning in a Multicultural Society:  
Exploring Tensions between Immigration, Ethnicity, and Citizenship......159-164

23. **Loretta Howard**:  
Walking the Talk:  
Applying Adult Education Principles to Influence Change....................165-172
24. Catherine Irving & Sue Adams: 
Not so Quiet After All: 
Two Outspoken Librarians of the Antigonish Movement..........................173-179

25. Kaela Jubas, Dawn Johnston, Angie Chiang & Rebecca Reznick: 
Health Care, Culture and Politics: How American TV Figures in Young Canadian Adults’ Learning about Medicare……… 180-186

26. Colleen Kawalilak, Noella (Little Mustache) Wells, Lynn Connell, & Kate Beamer: 
Dialogues with Elders, Adult Learners, and Teachers in Rural First Nations Communities – 
Exploring E-Learning Interest and Potential…………………………………….. 187-194

27. Jennifer Kelly and Bruce Spencer: 
Work, Learning, Inequality and the Academy................................. 195-201

28. Jenna H. Kelland: 
Encroaching on and Destabilizing my Haven: Blurring Boundaries Between School and Home for Women Learning Online................. 202-208

29. Paul Kolenick: 
Two Worlds, Four Directions: A View of Adult Education, Communities And The Just Learning Society.................................................. 209-215

30. Jonathan Langdon: 
Moving With the Movement: Collaborative Building of Social Movement Learning Participatory Action Research Spaces in Ada, Ghana......... 216-222

31. Anna Laros: 
Entrepreneurial Learning in Different Intercultural Contexts: A Case Study on Germany and Canada................................. 223-229

32. David W. Livingstone & Milosh Raykov: 
Economic and Educational Inequalities and Support for Occupy Movements: Some Recent Canadian Evidence............................................. 230-236

33. Geraldine Macdonald: 
Advocating for Reflection: Serving Adult Learners.......................... 237-240

34. Saikat Maitra & Srabani Maitra: 
The Production of Neoliberal Subjects through Employment Training Programs: A Comparative Analysis of Workers’ Training Programs in Kolkata and Toronto................................................................. 241-247

35. Scott MacPhail & Robert McGray:
Public Pedagogy and Policies of “Conditionality”:
A Comparative International Analysis ...........................................248-254

36. Angus McMurtry, Chatalle Clarkin, Francis Bangou, Emmanuel Duplàa, Colla MacDonald, Nicholas Ng-A-Fook, David Trumpower:
Interdisciplinary Learning and Collaboration
Within a Group of Adult Researchers: An Instrumental Case Study......... 255-262

37. Kiran Mirchandani, Sanjukta Mukherjee & Shruti Tambe:
Learning Old Jobs in New Sectors:
The Professionalization of Housekeeping Services .............................. 263-269

38. Linda Morrice:
Learning and Identity (De)construction: The Case of Refugees .............. 270-275

39. Donovan Plumb:
Entanglement in Things:
Lifelong Learning in the Paleolithic and Neolithic ............................. 276-282

40. Adnan Qayyum:
Relationships Over Brochures: The Role of Communities for
Promoting Adult Health Education Among Immigrant Groups .............. 283-287

41. Jean-Paul Restoule, Sheila Gruner & Edmund Metatawabin:
Paquataskamik: Learning from Place at Fort Albany First Nation ............ 288-295

42. Carol Roy:
How Transformative is a Film Festival? Exploring the Contributions
and Limits of a Documentary Film Festival ...................................... 296-301

43. Thomas Saczkowski:
White Masculinity and Ableism in the
Formation of an Oppressive Consciousness ....................................... 302-308

44. Lisa Stowe:
Beyond ‘Educational Tourism’: Informal and Formal Learning Outcomes as an Example of Critical Pedagogy in Short Term Travel Study.. 309-315

45. Jennifer Sumner:
Learning for Life: Food Literacy and Adult Education ........................ 316-323

46. Nancy Taber:
Generals, Colonels, and Captains: Discourses of Militarism, Education, and
Learning in the Canadian University Context ..................................... 324-330

47. Alison Taylor & Milosh Raykov:
But What About the Girls?
Youth Apprenticeship and Social Mobility........................................... 331-338

48. Maurice Taylor, David Trumpower & Ivana Pavic:
Adult Learning and Social Capital Theory:
Towards the Development of a Measure for Adults with Low Literacy..... 339-344

49. Tricia van Rhijn:
An Investigation of Mature Students' Motivation to Attend University..... 345-352

50. Pierre Walter:
Cultural Hegemony and its Contestations: The Vancouver Canucks
Hockey Riot and Occupy Vancouver as Public Pedagogy.................... 353-359

51. Jacqueline Warrell:
Social Networking Sites:
Online Spaces for Informal and Incidental Learning......................... 360-366

II. Roundtables

1. Natalie Abdou, Behrang Foroughi, Catherine Irving, Shelagh Savage, Anton Struchkov:
Teaching Leadership to Community
Development Practitioners............................................................... 368-370

2. Mali Bain:
Global to Local: International Service Learning in Canada ................. 371-373

3. Bahar Biazar:
Teaching English for Activism....................................................... 374-375

4. Colleen Cameron, Maureen Coady, Leona English, Jane Moseley, Kathy Hibbert & Anne Kinsella:
Adult Education and Health: A Critical Approach to Learning,
Organizing and Building Civil Society............................................ 376-377

5. Erin J. Careless:
Power, Politics and Possibilities: Relationships and Learning between
Teachers and Mothers of Children with Autism..............................378-380

6. Rebecca Reznick:
Learner Awareness of Informal and
Incidental Learning within Communities......................................381-383

7. Dorothy Goldin Rosenberg:
Health, Peace and the Environment: Educating and Integrating
Relationships in Women’s Peace Movements……………………………….. 384-386

8. Samina Sami:
Colliding Narratives:
Cinema and Viewers in Critical Dialogue…………………………………… 387-388

9. Jasjit Sangha:
Research Roundtable “Learning Through Soul”:
Spirituality and Transformative Adult Learning………………………….. 389-390

10. Judith Walker & Tara Gibb:
Exploration of Human Capital Assumptions
in a Canadian Construction of a Knowledge Economy………………….. 391-392

11. Susan H. Young:
Women Survivors of Sexual Violence and Partner Abuse: Exploring
Transformative Learning Through Social Action
Participation…………………………………………………………………… 393-395

III. Symposium

1. Yukyung Kim-Cho and Sheila Stewart:
What Shall We Do with the Self?……………………………………………… 397-403

2. Tom Nesbit, Edward W. Taylor, John Holford, Patti Gouthro, Virman Man,
Michael Osborne, Jim Crowther, & John Dirkx:
Adult Education Journals in Metric Time:
Editors’ Perspective………………………………………………………… 404-413

3. Peter H. Sawchuk, Joseph E. Sawan, Rakhat Zholdoshalieva, Susan L. Carter, Agnes S.
Thomas, Amna Sha:
Motivation and Social Movement Activity:
Perspectives on Learning and Social Change…………………………….. 414-422

IV. Poster abstracts…………………………………………………………………. 423-427
Between Social Good and Market Imperative: Adult Literacy Work Under Employment Ontario

Tannis Atkinson
Ontario Institute for Studies in Education of the University of Toronto

Abstract: Current adult literacy policy in Ontario requires community-based programs to partner with other agencies under the banner of employment preparation. I argue that these partnerships are driven by political rationalities that treat subjects as human capital and education as a means to develop human assets. This paper reports preliminary findings from research documenting how community literacy workers are responding to policy pressures in Ontario. While some have adopted neoliberal understandings, others see their work as caring for marginalized people; these women resist policy efforts that seek to construct education as a mechanism for fostering competitiveness.

Introduction
This paper grows out of my dissertation research, an analysis of the disconnects between what women who work in community-based adult literacy programs in Ontario think they are—or should be—doing as adult educators, and what current policy requires them to do and be. My interest in this topic arises from my own experience of working in community-based programs and witnessing how “caring and helpful intentions” (Miller, 1997, p. 96, cited in Campbell & Gregor, 2002, p. 110) were transformed as provincial policy introduced mechanisms to standardize practice in a field primarily served by charitable organizations holding divergent views about adult literacy. Community-based adult literacy programs in Ontario were established in the 1980s, before the province had developed policy (Alden, 1982; Darville, 1992). Many, especially in rural areas, are part of a network of volunteer programs following the work of American missionary Frank Laubach (Christoph, 2009), a few are satellites of Frontier College and still others were started by librarians or other community workers who approached literacy as critical praxis. Documents describing the aims and structures of critical literacy programs were an important component of advocating for a provincial policy (Alkenbrack, Atkinson, Duncombe, McBeth, & Williams, 1984; Gaber-Katz & Watson, 1991; Pratt, Nomez, & Urzua, 1977), but once policy and funding were in place, programs became implicated in processes of governance (Stewart, 1998) with different objectives.

My dissertation research includes both a genealogical analysis and semi-structured interviews with twelve women who work in community-based programs across the province—in rural and urban areas, and in towns and cities of different sizes in all regions. My genealogical analysis traces how Ontario’s policy constructs ‘literacy’ as required of responsible, productive subjects. My first round of interviews, completed in January, included questions about informants’ work histories, what knowledge and skills they draw on to do their work, any challenges and frustrations they currently experience, whether they would recommend that others enter the field, and their vision of an ideal adult literacy program. This paper is based on preliminary analysis of only six transcripts, the data available to date, and focuses on only one aspect of the current policy: the Service Quality Standard that requires adult literacy programs to partner with other employment and training agencies in their communities under the banner of Employment...
Ontario (EO). In this paper I consider how adult literacy workers respond to the Service Quality Standard that hooks them into assertions that subjects must develop their human capital and contribute to the overall prosperity of the province. In highlighting how the workers experience the Employment Ontario partnerships, I hope to show that neoliberalism is more tenuous in practice than many of its critics suggest.

**Literacy, Labour and Ontario’s Competitive Advantage**

In Ontario, adult literacy programs are funded by the Ministry of Training Colleges and Universities (MTCU). Each year, programs apply for funding by submitting business plans which form the basis for a contract they sign in order to receive funding. Since 2007, adult literacy has been part of what MTCU calls Employment Ontario, a network that brings together “employment and training services from the federal and provincial governments into one coherent and comprehensive service delivery system” (Ministry of Training Colleges and Universities, 2011, p. 1). The imperative to develop partnerships is driven in part by a desire to ensure that delivery of services is cost-effective and in part by the ministry vision that “Ontario will have the most highly educated and skilled people in the world in order to build the province’s competitive advantage and quality of life” (Ministry of Training Colleges and Universities, 2011, p. 1).

According to the MTCU performance management framework, adult literacy programs must demonstrate Customer Service, Effectiveness and Efficiency. The current Service Quality Standard requires that all LBS programs aim for an 85% “customer satisfaction” rating, that they serve 90% of the number of learners listed in their contract with MTCU, and that at least 29% of the learners meet “suitability indicators” (p. 59), a list of “identified learner barriers to achieving learning goals related to employment, further education or training, and independence” (p. 21). Starting in 2014-15, measure of a program’s effectiveness will be expanded to include how well the agency works as a member of the Employment Ontario network as measured by “the percentage of learners who experience effective, supported referrals into, during or at exit from the LBS program” (p. 45).

**Partnerships in Practice**

While several informants praised the aim of creating connections between services and agencies, many were concerned about implementation of the partnerships and some questioned the assumptions on which the partnerships are based. Most informants stated that they supported the principle of partnerships, that they liked the idea of acknowledging that different programs serve different needs and that they wanted students to be able to easily move between programs. SB, who works in a mid-sized community in southern Ontario, described her ideal literacy program as located in a building that housed a range of programs and services under one roof. For RF, who works in a small northern community, partnerships are a way to make sure that individuals get the supports they need from the relevant agencies. Learners who come to the program “should be theoretically accessing a network of agencies designed to work for them” and referral would be “a very integrated process between these agencies so that we’re never doing the same thing with a person.”

Referrals are based on identifying the learner’s goal, their academic skills and their source of income, all categories outlined in Employment Ontario’s guidelines. The Literacy and Basic
Skills (LBS) policy compels literacy programs to focus their support on five learning goals—employment, apprenticeship, secondary school diploma, postsecondary education or independence—and defines the target population for the LBS program as unemployed adults, especially “people receiving income support” (Ministry of Training Colleges and Universities, 2011, p. 9). But a number of informants stressed that transitions between programs are complex and the needs of individuals can vary widely. As SB noted, having partners under one roof might help adults to find and access other programs but “other agencies really don’t always get it…they don’t understand literacy or [they have] a stereotype of a typical literacy student.” Given that common misconceptions about adult illiteracy include assumptions that people who need basic education are stupid, incompetent or dangerous, many informants are concerned that “effective referrals” from partner agencies may be difficult to attain. For many informants, mistaken ideas about adult literacy are embedded in the current policy.

Putting Policy into Practice
My preliminary analysis suggests that there are two basic responses to the pressure to partner more closely with other agencies in the interests of enhancing employment. Some community literacy workers have adopted the literacy-as-human-capital rationality and understand their role as helping to develop human assets. Others are frustrated by such rationality and sees it as part of a system that treats some portions of the population as disposable. These workers seem to understand their work as care for the marginalized; they place high value on practices that attend to the financial and emotional barriers that learners face, and consider themselves responsible for giving learners confidence and hope.

Literacy work as developing human assets.
Of the six interviews analyzed for this paper, the only informant who adopted the dominant rationality was RF, who works in a northern community with low unemployment. The majority of students who attend the program are working and “just need to upgrade their skills to get a better job, or to maintain employment.” She considered motivation to be an issue, noting that some people in her community that could ‘benefit’ from the program only attend when they are laid off. From this RF observed, “if you’ve got a good job and you’re making good money, where’s the motivation to upgrade your skills? It’s when you’re in fear of losing that job or you need a new job or you need a job.” Her program works with learners at higher levels of upgrading, and she seemed to see unemployment as an individual rather than structural issue. RF viewed her role as one of “helping people who otherwise wouldn’t be able to succeed on their own”, of offering a “leg up” to people who are “victims of their situation.” She described skill acquisition as closely tied to employment, even as she recognized the vicious cycles that can keep people from work:

You need the skills to get the job, but you need the job to have the money to be able to pay for the skill acquisition… And how do you go to a program when the childcare costs will kill you? And how do you go and apply for a job and go to an interview if you don’t have anything decent to wear? But how do you go and access that if you don’t have any money?

RF also noted that often what keeps people from succeeding at work are what she called soft skills: “It’s problem-solving, it’s initiative, it’s punctuality, it’s attitude, it’s things like oral communications … non-verbal communications.” She noted that people who most need to develop these skills tend to be on social assistance and believed that by teaching those soft skills,
“what you can create is a very viable, a very valuable asset to an organization.” RF had little to say about partnerships in her community except that she hoped that the referral protocol which she had helped to develop was “really going to help Employment Ontario partners work very seamlessly together.”

**Literacy work as caring for the marginalized.**

Five other informants believed that their programs are primarily sites of learning rather than training; much of their frustration at current policy related to the profound differences between the assumptions embedded in policy and how the agency where they work approached literacy. For these informants, partnerships have highlighted the prevalence of misconceptions about adult literacy, the profound inequities between EO partners, and complexities in how literacy and employment get linked.

Informants who took the **care for the marginalized** approach acknowledged that many adults in their programs have had negative educational experiences that have had profound effects; they understood that, for many adults, the first step towards learning is undoing this emotional residue. In one example KT described a woman who, as a child, was “tied to the chair in the classroom for being bad because she couldn’t learn.” KT noted that the first time the woman came to the program she was accompanied by her sister; “she couldn’t read anything and [the family] were trying to take care of her. Although she was working, she wasn’t reading anything.” At first the woman couldn’t even “be in the classroom she’s so nervous” and was “really nervous trying everything.” Three years later, although this learner still suffers from anxiety, she has gained confidence enough to be curious: “She reads something she [says] ‘I want to know about that now’ and...she’ll get on [the computer] and try and find out the thing that they said in the book that she didn’t know.” Why, KT wondered, does provincial policy not value gains of this kind; why is learning how to read and write “not good enough?” She noted that learners often state that they want to “be like everybody else...pick something up and read it.” Asked to clarify her greatest frustration with the current regime, KT replied “all this reporting, and all this learning how to report, is taking us away from them.” Most informants echoed this frustration, describing how recently-introduced administrative requirements have expanded workloads but have not been accompanied by additional funding. One informant, the executive director of her agency, said “it’s added a lot of administrative, a lot of administrative work to follow these new guidelines. But yet the funding’s not there.” To meet these demands, programs have either sought out additional sources of revenue or have reduced expenses by closing the program for several extra weeks and cutting the number of hours staff are paid each week. HW estimated that she spends 70% of her time on fundraising “just to keep the school open and to buy supplies... and it is really a waste because it takes me away from the students.” For her, the most discouraging part of her work was “knowing that we really are supposed to produce a lot with very little money.”

Frustration with inadequate funding is exacerbated by the profound discrepancy between funding for different agencies under the Employment Ontario umbrella. In a northern community with high unemployment, HW noted that staff at the local employment services office “don’t have to raise money and do all the things that we have to do to keep their job. And they don’t have to clean their own toilet. We do our own cleaning here, too.” She also remarked that “the people they’re helping don’t even really need so much intervention, they pretty much need their resume
typed up and be on their way so they can get going.” BD, who works in a rural area in southern Ontario with high rates of unemployment, noted that community-based programs “get the hardest to serve sometimes. And that’s not a bad thing; we serve decent people.” For her the scarcity of funding for community-based programs reflects the fact that some people are considered disposable: “…as a society as we’re moving forward in our big machine, the most vulnerable and the most difficult to serve, they’ve decided they’re just going to plow them under.” She understood the lack of funding as directly related to glossing over the lived realities of marginalized people, describing the Minister of Training, Colleges and Universities as a “good guy, nice guy, academic, but what the hell does he know about somebody on welfare whose husband beat her up and she’s got a restraining order on him and she’s trying to get her grade 12?”

The informants who took the care for the marginalized approach were clear that their role is education rather than employment preparation; they were frustrated at the mismatch between how they understand their work and what MTCU expects of them. As BD asserted, “It’s not my job to get them jobs! It’s my job to give them confidence, to start them on the road of, you know, further education, lifelong learning.” In another community, HW was perturbed that the ministry field representative has the “mentality [of] rapid re-employment, get them back to work,” because there are no jobs in the community. For her, the focus on employment was, in effect, requiring the adult literacy program to “prepare them to leave the community.” These women understood the unemployment of learners in their program as structural. They noted that learners have been “pushed out to pasture almost” because “now all the ones who had their education and had jobs and stuff, they trickled down into the jobs that normally our students maybe would have qualified for” in the past. Informants who took this approach were quite savvy about the political rationalities behind the focus on employment. When asked why the provincial government would place such emphasis on employment, DM, a retired teacher who works part-time in the literacy program in a small community with high rates of unemployment, said:

They want to get people back into the workforce. But the other thing would be that they also want to get a lot of people off government-funded programs. Like OW or WSIB, they want to move people away from those programs where they’re giving them support. So employment gives them that opportunity, if they can push employment rather than independence or whatever personal goals, then they get off the system that much quicker.

How do women who took the care for the marginalized approach understand their role? Many argued that a significant part of their work is supporting learners to believe that they can learn and can have a future. They are, as HW says, “pretty much counsellors” in that a significant part of their work involves “getting [learners] to find that confidence to even attempt education.” Many learners face significant socio-economic barriers, including coping with ongoing health issues and “finding affordable, accessible and safe housing. And enough food.” For daily challenges such as these, SB saw her role as providing information that can help learners. In other cases, informants understood their role as informing students about their rights. When a landlord threatened one learner with eviction, BD told him about his rights as a tenant. She observed that many learners “don’t stand up for themselves. They’re so beaten by society and welfare and you gotta do this, gotta do that.” These examples indicate that some community literacy workers are carrying forward values that pre-date provincial policy and understand their work within the current policy as an act of translation. As SB stated, “We’re still doing
everything we’ve always done, the same way, it’s just called something different.” DM echoed this sentiment when she said, “our basic philosophy has always been to give [learners] what they need and then we worry about fitting it into the documentation.” All of the staff in the program where she works “just try to get creative in how we report out what they’re doing.”

Conclusion
In this paper I have argued that the requirement that adult literacy programs partner with other agencies under the umbrella of Employment Ontario hooks literacy work into neoliberal assertions that subjects are responsible for contributing to the overall prosperity of the province. However, the partnership requirement has also brought into sharp relief what understandings—and people—have been marginalized by this discourse. While some community literacy workers have adopted the political rationality of neoliberalism, many approach their work as teaching and caring for people who have been scarred, emotionally and economically, by processes of educational sorting. For these women, the principles on which their agencies were founded and the experiences of the individuals they encounter every day are more important than the policy requirements that are being sedimented over those values and realities. While policy may demand that community literacy workers adopt an employability rationale, these women’s refusal to do so indicates that, as Larner (2000) has argued, neoliberalism is less a complete project than an ideal which can be resisted.

References


Riding the River: Adult Education in a Have-Not province

Amanda Benjamin, Melissa White, Mary MacKeracher & Katie Stella
University of New Brunswick

Abstract: This study examines the state of contemporary adult education in New Brunswick. New Brunswick is currently experiencing increasing unemployment as well as the loss of traditional employment bases. Concurrently, there are greater numbers of adults who are finding themselves with no clear employment direction. One of the places they are ending up is in formal and non-formal adult education programs. Our belief is that the purpose of adult education in the province of New Brunswick has undergone a shift, moving away from an ethic of adult education for personal, social and political change towards a neo-liberal skills agenda.

Purpose of the Study and Relevant Literature
New Brunswick is currently a have-not province, marked by increasing unemployment and loss of traditional employment bases. The national unemployment rate in Canada currently hovers at 7.4%. In New Brunswick this figure is closer to 9.5% (Statscan, 2012). There can be many interpretations of what that unemployment figure means but one obvious reason is a decline in available jobs. It can also mean those who have been displaced in this declining economy do not possess the education and skills required for the available labour market.

Adults, both by choice and necessity, are finding themselves in adult education programs in greater numbers in both formal settings of university and college and non-formal training programs. The goal of this study is to gain a greater understanding of the state of contemporary adult education in New Brunswick. One of our key questions in this study is who’s doing adult education in New Brunswick and what does it currently look like in light of this employment gap? While the history of adult education runs deep in the Maritimes, from university extension and the Coady legacy to government funded training schemes, our belief is that there has been a shift in the purposes of adult education away from an ethic of adult education for personal, social and political change towards a neo-liberal skills agenda. We also assert that this shift reflects broader trends internationally as evidenced by the OECD and other international political bodies.

Rubenson, Yoon, Desjardin (2007) in their report on Adult Learning in Canada, describe the Atlantic region as having the highest increase in levels of participation in adult education between 1994 and 2003, as compared to the rest of Canada. This is seen as a positive improvement, with 60% growth in participation in the region. However, we contend that this number is also troubling because at the same time we are seeing a higher rate of unemployment and the return to adult education is based on an assumption that sending workers who are displaced back to training programs or formal education will somehow change outcomes and contribute to economic development. As Adumati-Trache (2008) reminds us, lifelong education is no longer an optional activity, but rather the solution for living in a global society. The economy in New Brunswick, however, is not reaping the benefits of lifelong education. While increasing numbers of adults are participating in adult education, New Brunswick’s economic situation continues to decline. Thus, while many adults are returning to school and training with the aim to find new jobs, these supposed jobs are becoming even scarcer. Furthermore, while the
numbers reported by Rubenson et al. (2003), in the Atlantic region are encouraging in terms of participation in adult education, the Atlantic region in general is only discussed on 5 pages out of 104 of a national report on participation in adult education. This suggests to us a need for further investigation on the status of adult education in New Brunswick and the rest of Atlantic Canada.

**Research Design and Theoretical Framework**

This is an ongoing study that is at a preliminary stage. The data for this paper consists of document analysis of existing adult education programs in the province of New Brunswick. Our document analysis consisted of what Bowen (2009) describes as a systematic review that required our data be examined and interpreted in order to “elicit meaning, gain understanding, and develop empirical knowledge” (p.27). Our data was gathered from government sources as well as independent providers and publicly funded programs.

Our theoretical approach uses a critical framework as a lens for exploring the discourses around a neoliberal agenda. The concept of discourse is helpful for examining the different forms of power and how participation in adult education in New Brunswick has seen to be improving while at the same time the province is seen to be in crisis. Benjamin (2012) reminds us that, power relations are inscribed in discourses as knowledge, and power relationships are achieved by a construction of “truths” about the social and natural world (Luke, 1995). Discourse is then both a social practice that constitutes the social world and is constituted by other social practices (Phillips & Jørgenson, 2002). What this means is that language used in the development of adult education programs should be considered within its social context and moreover it is important to examine how discourses around the neo-liberal skills agenda function ideologically.

We also consider the issues through a political lens. White (2004) has found that adult education and training cannot be separated from the larger political landscape. Youngman (2000) notes that a political economy approach “…looks at how the historical evolution and contemporary nature of the capitalist mode of production conditions the relationship between adult education and society” (p. 3-4). Because we are investigating not only the current state of adult education in New Brunswick, the way in which the political, neo-liberal agenda influences that state, a political economy approach is called for.

**Findings**

Our findings are split into two categories: the role of the Government of Canada in providing and funding adult education programs that affect New Brunswick and the public and private programs and initiatives in the province of New Brunswick. In the second case we examine provincial programs and initiatives, and the role of private business, both big and small, and the provision of adult education in the province.

**The Government of Canada**

Service Canada plays an important role for the Government of Canada in providing adult learners with financial assistance to return to education programs through grants, RRSP benefits, loans, and bonds. Interestingly, there are only a select few programs offered by the federal government that do deliver training and/or education. For example, the Canadian Forces Aboriginal Entry Program, the Aboriginal Training Program in Museum Practices, the Cadets Program, the Junior Canadian Rangers Program, and the Language Instruction for Newcomers to
Canada Program all provide training specific to skills development, trades, and vocational programs (Service Canada, 2011). There are many government departments that focus on literacy, such as Human Resources and Skill Development Canada (HRSDC) with its programs on literacy and essential skills, apprenticeship completion and grants.

In keeping with a neoliberal discourse, Canada’s International Education Strategy (Foreign Affairs & International Trade Canada, 2011) places emphasis on increasing Canada’s educational presence in the global market place. The program is aimed at attracting international students to study in Canada and to increasing the export and marketization of Canada’s educational services abroad (Foreign Affairs & International Trade Canada, 2011). Our analysis of the Government of Canada’s educational and training programs has found that many of these programs are aligned with knowledge economy principles (HRDC, 2002) and are influenced by the mandate to enhance employability skills to make Canada a leader in the global marketplace.

Province of New Brunswick Adult Education
The Department of Post-Secondary Education, Training and Labour (PETAL) works with 12 Regional Adult Learning Committees to deliver community adult learning services. The New Brunswick government does not deliver the training, but instead, provides the funding. Through Community Adult Learning Centres, academic and literacy programs are offered to adults by using the Community Adult Literacy Program (CALP). The Adult Learning Centres, in conjunction with CALP, provide computer access, programs to assist with GED testing (math, English, and French preparatory courses), software and hardware skills and social media education to adults living in rural and urban areas. The Centres are designed to increase the employability level of adults in the province by developing their job preparatory skills and increasing literacy levels.

Literacy initiatives are the common denominator for the majority of not-for-profit adult training and development programs in New Brunswick. In 2003, adult literacy levels in New Brunswick were at 44% compared to the national level of 52%, and 56% of the population had literacy scores below level 3 (HRSDC, 2012), and that figure climbed to 48% by 2008 (Parent Central, 2008). An International Adult Literacy and Skills Survey (IALSS) administered by Statistics Canada in 2003 further reinforced the sorry state of literacy in New Brunswick (2005). Citing the same survey, the Director of HRSDC’s National Learning Policy Research determined, “Less than half of New Brunswick’s working-age population (16-65) have the literacy skills required for coping successfully in today’s world” (HRDC, 2003).

In 2009, the government of New Brunswick published Working Together for Adult Literacy, a strategy document on the issue of literacy in the province. The document determined four strategic priorities to improve provincial literacy skills:
1. Reduce barriers and increase participation;
2. Increase the number and range of effective adult literacy learning opportunities;
3. Ensure the quality and effectiveness of adult literacy programs; and
4. Strengthen partnerships to develop a robust and effective adult literacy system (p. 7).

In 2010, the Literacy Coalition of New Brunswick (LCNB) released its Strategic Plan 2010 – 2013. In response, the Community Adult Learning Services Branch Department of Post-
Secondary Education, Training and Labour (PETL) released its Action Plan 2010-2013 in 2010, which indicated that research would be undertaken to determine the best possible methods for addressing these four strategic priorities. These priorities appear redundant in the face of Rubenson et al’s (2007) assertions that participation in adult education in Atlantic Canada has risen by 60%. When researching the province of New Brunswick’s education website (Government of New Brunswick, 2012), it would seem that the province offers a number of adult education programs. However, there are many overlaps among the programs listed on this site. Several of the program descriptions are worded similarly, with subtle differences. For example, Post-Secondary Education, Training and Labour (PETL) lists 11 adult education programs, but three of them, Adult Literacy Services, Community Adult Learning Centres, and Community Adult Learning Program, work together under the same literacy mission. What they do, however, is reflect the emphasis on literacy as an employability skill.

In New Brunswick private adult education programs are often found in international and national corporations that offer in-house training to their employees in such areas as heavy machinery certifications, environmental practice, leadership and mentoring, and software certification. Many of these companies also provide training and mentoring for professional advancement within the corporation, conference and seminar funding, and tuition reimbursement (relevant to employment) for all employees, from entry-level and to middle management. The larger companies and institutions that serve only provincial or Atlantic-area needs likewise offer in-house training in areas relevant to all employment levels, however, detailed information regarding those opportunities was often unavailable.

From our analysis it appears that employers in New Brunswick are offering more in-house employee development training by optimizing their current human resources—employees. By using internal staff to deliver training and development initiatives, it can be assumed that this strategy is a cost-saving measure. Several employers provide mentorship programs in an effort to help staff develop, which are likely designed to retain talent and reduce turnover. When words such as ‘development,’ and ‘growth,’ are used to describe the organization’s value statement, the opportunities that present from our analysis are related to role-specific growth, job enhancement, and greater pay. Although each employer’s education and learning descriptions are limited in scope, it is evident that education for social change is not part of the business sector’s agenda. It can be assumed that from this analysis, that New Brunswickers are working and training under capitalistic ideals whereby labour market specific training is vital to strengthening Canada’s economy and increasing its global presence.

Some of the kinds of programs found within the business sector in New Brunswick were programs that focused on the orientation of new employees as well as specialized Executive Training, such as the Executive Development, Middle Manager Development, Career Assignment (for entry-level executives) and Management Trainee Programs. Other programs focused on the employability skills needed to succeed in the workplace. There were other examples of a focus on ‘soft skills’ training such as teamwork, decision-making and leadership. Additionally many of the businesses investigated in New Brunswick offered courses specific to the position (e.g. WHMIS, banking, investment, capital markets, technology and operation). a
Conclusions and Implications for Adult Education and Practice

Education is shifting from what was once prominent in developing active participation and citizenship, to producing a self-sufficient workforce that is prepared for the demands of the ever-changing and globalized labour-market. Lehmann and Taylor (2003) argue that employability skills demonstrate a new kind of vocationalism, marked by the influence of the Conference Board of Canada’s Employability Skills Profile (ESP) (McLaughlin, 1992). What the ESP provides is an interpretation of specific competencies and learning outcomes. Employability skills are generally thought of as the combination of generic ‘soft’ and ‘hard’ skills or competencies that are needed by workers (Williams, 2005). ‘Soft’ skills refer to behaviours and aptitudes, such as teamwork, that are believed to be needed for employment, whereas the ‘hard’ skills are specific quantifiable skills like writing a resume or cover letter (Benjamin, 2009). A key aspect to this understanding of employability is the presumption of sameness in the expectation that workers all need the same generic sets of skills and behaviours.

Education is commonly viewed as the panacea for social and economic problems, and this is particularly so in the case of adult education and lifelong learning. As such, governments, international organizations and industry place heavy emphasis on the importance of education and training for economic development. The focus on training is particularly strong in the context of the ‘new’ or ‘knowledge’ economy. Theorists, too, emphasize the need for a well-trained population with regard to economic development. According to the OECD (cited in Rubenson et al, 2004) “Education is becoming less distinct from the economy.” (p. 154)

The ability to participate and compete in the global market forms the foundation of many domestic policy decisions, particularly those related to education, economic development and the labour market. The extent to which education and training are seen as the key to successful economic development and participation in the global economy is amply evident in even a cursory glance at the documentation of many national and sub-national level governments as well as international organizations and the literature. Discussions of the knowledge economy are rife with reference to training and education as the key to participation in the global economy. Human Resources and Skills Development Canada in its 2002 publication, Knowledge Matters: Skills and Learning for Canadians: Canada’s Innovation Strategy, reports, “Countries that succeed in the 21st century will be those with citizens who are creative, adaptable and skilled.” (p. 5). The belief in the relationship between education, training and economic development is pervasive. Ashton and Green (1996) write, “In some cases, this link is conceived in quite simple terms: conventional wisdom has emerged wherein ‘better’ education or training is assumed to lead automatically to improved economic performance.” Coucherne (n.d.) writes, “The most exciting feature of this new era … is that it is privileging knowledge and human capital in much the same manner as the Industrial Revolution privileged physical capital. As such, knowledge and human capital are not only at the leading edge of international competitiveness and wealth creation, they are also the drivers for sustainable growth and productivity enhancement.” (p. 1)

The assumption, then, is that an educated and trained population, in and of itself, will lead to economic development.

We must also consider the kind of economic development and job creation under discussion. In tandem with a neo-liberal market ideology and globalization comes the knowledge economy. Most Western, industrialized countries now view knowledge as the basis of their economies. In
the government documentation reviewed for this research, the focus was entirely on the knowledge economy. However, this is somewhat of a disconnect. We live in a region often untouched by the knowledge economy.

As evidenced in the data, the knowledge economy and education’s role in it remains at the forefront of economic development thinking in this country and this region. A significant criticism of the knowledge economy has been the potential for a large gap to develop between those who know and those who work. There are concerns that a knowledge-based economy leaves lesser skilled individuals on the margins of the workforce. Attention should be given to the emphasis placed on the knowledge economy itself and the predilection for high skills training for communities often untouched by the knowledge economy. Does not such an emphasis, especially in the policy sphere, in and of itself, marginalize many regardless of whether they have or can obtain high skills? It seems a fruitless endeavor to focus on providing workers with high skills training when high skills jobs don’t exist. Not all workers have access to the knowledge economy. Furthermore, policy focused on developing and enhancing the knowledge economy must assume conditions that don’t exist in many regions.

Continued unquestioned emphasis on training (and education) for the knowledge economy, and the subsequent influence that this will undoubtedly have on policy development, has great potential to marginalize individuals, communities and regions that do not posses the physical, economic, educational, social and community infrastructures to support the knowledge economy.

References


Promoting Lifelong Learning in Women’s Federal Correctional Programs: A Communities of Practice Approach

Virginia Bogusz & Launa Gauthier
Mount Saint Vincent University

Abstract: The current approach to program planning in Canadian women's correctional facilities is based on the traditional scientific management model. A paradigm shift is required in order to design rehabilitation programs that align with Corrections Services Canada’s (CSC) women-centred philosophy. This paper critiques the traditional scientific management model and explores Etienne Wenger’s (1998) communities of practice (CoPs) as a theoretical framework for program design. We assert that CoPs are ideal sites for holistic learning and would better complement a women-centred philosophy than the current traditional design.

Introduction
Since the development of correctional programs for federally-sentenced women in Canada, there have been many critiques concerning the availability and the types of programs offered in correctional facilities, but there has been very little literature critiquing the theoretical framework for program design. Corrections Services Canada (CSC) uses the scientific management model for correctional program planning. The scientific management model was developed by Ralph Tyler (1949) and made popular in his book Basic Principles of Curriculum and Instruction. The scientific management model's systematic approach to program planning has been credited for its highly structured and organizational framework which makes program delivery easy to follow. However, through a series of linear steps, program planners create a “one style fits all” program. Cognitive Behavioural Therapy (CBT) is CSC’s approach to learning and rehabilitation that is delivered through a scientific management design.

We question how the efficacy of prescribed programs can meet the individual needs of women in ways that are holistic and empowering. We believe that a paradigm shift is required in order to design rehabilitation programs that align with CSC’s women-centred philosophy. We argue that communities of practice (CoPs) are ideal sites for holistic learning because they are conducive to involving learners in the program design, they allow learning to emerge to meet the needs of learners, and finally, they foster individual identity development. Our paper explores Wenger’s (1998) communities of practice as a theoretical framework for program design.

We acknowledge the difficulty of implementing an emergent design, such as CoPs, within a correctional facility due to the hierarchical power structures within the institution. We therefore propose that program planners find a balance between a fully emergent CoPs design and a traditionally-structured design.

Background - Women's Correctional Programs
In keeping with CSC's mission statement*, CSC's main objective is to rehabilitate offenders through correctional programs. Correctional programs in Canadian women's prisons have evolved over the past three decades. In 1990, the implementation of the document, Creating Choices: The Report of the Task Force on Federally Sentenced Women, marked the beginning of...
a correctional system recognized as feminist and women-centred. For the first time, gender-specific programs were designed in an effort to meet the needs of incarcerated women. This change followed the closure of The Prison for Women located in Kingston, Ontario and the opening of five regional facilities across Canada.

The Creating Choices document laid the foundations for the correctional Program Strategy for Women Offenders, which required that programs be holistic and incorporate the women-centred framework (Fortin, 2004). The five principles set out in Creating Choices, empowerment, respect and dignity, supportive environment, meaningful and responsible choices, and shared responsibility, laid the foundation for the development of the program strategy. This strategy outlined that correctional programs should respect women’s gender and their ethnic, cultural, spiritual, and linguistic differences (Fortin, 2004).

Moreover, correctional programs are the main focus of intervention since they are designed to address criminogenic risk factors in an effort to reduce recidivism rates. Put another way, these programs reduce the risk of continual criminal behaviour that leads to reoffending. Each woman is responsible for following a correctional plan that outlines her risk and recommends program interventions to address her personal need areas. Although participation in one’s correctional plan is considered voluntary, the Parole Board of Canada (PBC) considers successful completion of correctional programs when rendering decisions for early conditional releases to the community. Consequently, many women are primarily motivated to participate in correctional programs so that they will be granted early release. The motivation to learn new skills and attain personal growth is typically secondary in nature, or not present at all.

Scientific Management Model of Program Planning
The scientific management model typically used to plan adult education programs predetermines the specific way in which learning will take place. This prescriptive model fails to recognize learning as a holistic process. The model assumes that knowledge is acquired and it ignores the influence of learner’s experiences. Similarly, CBT, which is an approach to learning and rehabilitation in correctional programs, became popular during the Scientific Revolution. During this time “interior knowing through a sense of connectedness was displaced by the primacy of reason and the requirement that the knower and the known be separate and distinct” (Clark, 2001, p.84). This disconnection is evident as many offenders attend correctional programs but fail to internalize the skills taught to them in the classroom.

Since the 1990s, CSC has used the risk-need-responsivity model (RNR) to assess and treat offenders. The risk principle asserts that criminal behaviour can be reliably predicted through the use of actuarial tools** and that treatment should focus on the higher risk offenders; the need principle highlights the importance of criminogenic needs in the design and delivery of treatment; and the responsivity principle describes how the treatment should be provided. We argue that this scientific and linear model contradicts the women-centred philosophy of women’s correctional programs. This scientific process is criticized for largely obliterating the person by losing the holistic individual profile by compressing all factors into a single score (Ragin as cited in Brennan, 2008). For example, although poverty and victimization are assessed, they are lost within the scores of actuarial tools, and they are not reflected in the correctional program.
In corollary, it is important to note that CSC’s notion of rehabilitation is primarily concerned with crime reduction. Therefore, the focus on crime reduction localizes offender needs into seven domain areas: substance abuse, personal and emotional factors, attitudes and beliefs, social interactions and associations, family and marital relationships, education level and employment skills, and community functioning. It is expected that the women offenders will address these areas through their participation and successful completion of correctional programs. The rationale is that engagement in correctional programs will help women to develop insight into their behaviours which will decrease their risk to reoffend.

One of the difficulties with prescribed programs is that the developers assume that the participants will understand and adopt the program content. However, there is a long list of responsivity issues such as literacy and comprehension deficits, mental health and medication issues, age, culture, disability, and length of sentence that stand in the way of learning. In reality, these issues could interfere with content internalization or transformation. The scientific model leaves it up to the educator to match the style and delivery mode of the program to the learning styles of the participants (Fortin, 2004).

**Situated Learning in Communities of Practice**

The scientific management model imposes a set of external objectives that all women offenders are expected to learn through the process of internalization. In contrast, we examine correctional programs through a social learning lens to see learning as it occurs when people participate in communities of practice. According to Wenger (2006), these CoPs are typically “formed by people who engage in a process of collective learning in a shared domain of human endeavour... [and they] share a concern or a passion for something they do and learn how to do it better as they interact regularly” (para.4). Through CoPs, it is possible to see a more holistic view of how knowledge is created, how individuals make sense of the world around them, and how individual identity is formed.

Lave and Wenger (1991) describe learning within CoPs as *situated learning*, which views learning as a characteristic of social, participatory processes and not solely a cognitive function that is independent of the physical world. Central to Lave and Wenger’s 1991) theory is a process they call legitimate peripheral participation. This process is the way individuals learn as they participate as a part of communities of practitioners, moving from the periphery of the community toward full participation. Full participation occurs as new members continue to gain knowledge and skills to be granted legitimacy by more experienced members. Participation within communities of practice is guided by the reification of objects or concepts as a way that a community gives form and meaning to their practice. For example, in the context of a women’s prison, the reification of the principles in the Creating Choices document would provide meaning to the women offenders as they participate in correctional programming.

Wenger (1998) identifies three fundamental elements that make up a community of practice and give meaning to the processes of participation and reification: mutual engagement, joint enterprise (or domain), and a shared repertoire. These three elements are key determinants of communities as sites for learning. Community members cultivate a sense of mutual engagement as they participate in the community – they form relationships and establish norms for the group as they work together. Secondly, as members interact they form a shared understanding, or joint
enterprise, of what it is that connects them together. This joint enterprise is also constantly negotiated and re-negotiated throughout the life of the community. Finally, as a result of the pursuit of joint enterprise over time, the community produces a set of communal resources or shared repertoire. The resources are a collection of activities, routines, words, tools, stories, symbols, concepts, actions that a community uses to negotiate meaning about the world and their personal identities (p.83).

Communities of Practice as Holistic Sites for Learning in Prison Environments
We have examined thus far that CoPs are sites for developing shared knowledge and understanding around a common practice or endeavour. CoPs are also sites where individuals define themselves and for identity formation. According to Lave and Wenger (1991), the individual identity forms as a result of participation in various communities of practice of which they are a part. It is the process of collective negotiation and defining the meaning of the shared repertoire (activities, tasks, functions, and understandings) that a learner is defined (p. 53). Handley, Sturdy, Fincham, and Clark (2006) conceptualize this position well by explaining that learning in CoPs is not just about acquiring knowledge and developing practice but also about an individual’s involvement and interaction as a way individuals gain an understanding of who they are (p. 644). In short, participation in the various CoPs becomes the cornerstone of individual learning, meaning making, and identity development.

Wenger (1998) argues that identity is a constant interplay between participation and reification in a community of practice (p. 153). Identity is therefore dynamic as it is continually negotiated and renegotiated throughout the course of life. "As we go through a succession of forms of participation, our identities form trajectories, both within and across communities of practice” (p. 154). An inbound trajectory, for example, takes the newcomer from the periphery to the centre of the community of practice. As the participants in the prison programs move inbound within the program's community of practice the notion is that they will not only learn (in an external sense) but that their identities will be transformed to incorporate that learning as well. Therefore, change happens from the inside out.

CoPs are ideal sites for holistic learning because in theory, learning is viewed as more emergent rather than acquired. Furthermore, learning through participation in CoPs honours the unique backgrounds, experiences, and needs of learners, which is fundamental to lifelong learning. According to Orey and Nelson (1994) it is through participation that learners “develop a holistic view of what the community of practice is about, and what there is to learn within that community”(p.625). Wenger, McDermott, and Snyder (2002) assert that “Community [emphasis added] design is much more like lifelong learning than traditional organization design.” (para.7). The community members work together with a coordinator to reflect on, negotiate, and redesign aspects of the community according to what emerges from the personal experiences and shared histories of the participants. This emergent design not only allows for members to cultivate a sense of ownership in their learning, but also provides a sense of belonging and commitment (Handley, Sturdy, Fincham, & Clark, 2006, p. 642).

Realistically, it would be difficult to implement the kind of emergent learning design found within communities of practice due to the highly structured design of a prison environment. A practical way to incorporate communities of practice would be to work within the current system
to negotiate a balance in approach that incorporates emergent design within the existing traditional structure. The problem with the traditional scientific management model is that it perpetuates the hierarchical power structure and contradicts holistic learning.

Wilson and Cervero (1996) describe planning as a process that should address this hierarchical power structure. The authors suggest that planners negotiate personal and organizational interests in order to construct educational programs for adult learners. It is beyond the scope of this paper to discuss the complexities of the various power dynamics that exist in the institutional organization of a corrections facility. However, issues of power cannot be ignored insofar as they impact whose interests are being served. Ultimately issues of power spill over into effecting how relevant program content is to learners. One way that program planners might seek a balance between the scientific management model and a CoPs model is to involve learners in program design throughout the life of the community of practice.

Certain sources suggest that there are multiple benefits to incorporating learner interests and feedback into the direction of CoPs (Cervero & Wilson, 1999; Cervero & Wilson, 1996; Falansca, 2011). Learners can gain an increased sense of ownership and possibly increase motivation for learning by participating in guiding the internal direction of the community. This approach also coincides with the concept of value within CoPs—motivation is derived from value which in turn gives meaning to the practice and contributes to the longevity of the community. Furthermore, involvement in planning would also help to address the various responsivity issues mentioned earlier in this paper. When the women are part of the design process there is less of a gap between program content and learner comprehension.

**Conclusion**

The scientific management model has been the prominent discourse in CSC women’s program planning since the late 1990s. This model is deeply embedded within the structures of the prison system. The one-size-fits-all approach to program design can be criticized because of its prescribed learning outcomes that do not match CSC’s intended holistic approach to correctional programs. The prescribed curriculum does not work well in women’s correctional settings because the women’s identities usually run counter to the program content. Therefore, some women typically go through the motions of learning in order to gain early release from prison. CSC has made an effort to take a more holistic approach to correctional programs by creating the five principles of *Creating Choices* in order to make programs more women-centred. However, CSC’s use of the RNR model to assess and treat offenders is a cognitive behavioral approach that reduces the individual to a single score, thereby negating the concept of the holistic individual and ignoring the social factors involved in learning. As a result, CSC falls short of fully meeting the goals of its women-centred framework.

To supplement the RNR model, we introduced Lave and Wenger’s situated learning theory within communities of practice as a holistic model that acknowledges the social nature of learning, negotiation of meaning, and identity formation. We argued that CoPs are ideal sites for holistic learning because they are conducive to involving learners in the program design; they allow learning to emerge to meet the needs of learners; and finally, they foster individual identity development. It is also crucial to create these environments because it greatly reduces responsivity issues that stand in the way of learning.
In essence, CoPs are a way to truly foster CSC’s holistic principles as outlined in *Creating Choices*. Although a CoPs model seems ideal, applying it in a correctional setting is difficult due to the hierarchical power structures within the institution. In response, we have suggested that finding a balance between the scientific management model and a fully emergent CoP model for program planning would contribute to correctional programs that would support lifelong learning and improve the life circumstances of incarcerated women.

**Acknowledgment**

Many of the ideas for the background of this paper emerged from discussions with our classmates in our Lifelong Learning Designing Contexts course. We acknowledge the contributions of Sally Dunford and Angelina Amaral who worked with us on the original project from which this paper emerged.

**Note**

*The Correctional Service of Canada (CSC), as part of the criminal justice system and respecting the rule of law, contributes to public safety by actively encouraging and assisting offenders to become law-abiding citizens, while exercising reasonable, safe, secure and humane control.

**The Custody Rating Scales consists of two independently scored sub-scales: a five-item Institutional Adjustment sub-scale and a seven-item Security Risk sub-scale (Lucianna, Motiuk, & Nafekh, 2008). The Offender Intake Assessment is a collection and analysis of information on each offender’s criminal and mental health history, social situation, education and other factors relevant to determine criminal risk. The data is scored on each of the seven criminogenic areas (Motiuk, 1994.).

**References**


Which Way Forward? Comparing Prior Learning Assessment and Recognition Across Countries

Sandra Bohlinger

Abstract: While all countries agree on the importance of PLAR (Prior Learning Assessment and Recognition) little attention has been paid to this issue from a research perspective. Thus, there is a large variety and intransparency of strategies, procedures, and regulations which may restrain individuals from applying for PLAR to gain labour market access and/or access to educational programs. Focussing on PLAR for vocational education and training, this paper presents key findings across four countries (Canada, Germany, Norway, and Switzerland) and a research framework for analysing PLAR across countries.

The Politics of Prior Learning Assessment and Recognition
In general, the term validation refers to the process of identifying, assessing, and recognizing knowledge, skills and competences an individual has acquired in different learning contexts outside formal education and training systems. However, in some countries we find notions such as accreditation, certification, assessment or award that are used in terms of validation. The heterogeneity and complexity of notions is immense as are the multiple motives that underpin recognition and validation systems. At the core of the discussion we find several criteria for implementing validation systems which are

– to promote lifelong learning,
– to foster individual employability and meet labour market demands,
– to strengthen countries’ competitiveness, and
– to better link labour markets and education and training systems.

In this paper, PLAR is understood as ‘a process that identifies, verifies, and recognizes relevant learning (knowledge and skills) acquired through work and other life experience that cannot be fully recognized by the traditional means of credential assessment, credit transfer, articulation, or accreditation’ (Canadian Council on Learning, 2009, p. 4).

The purpose of this paper is to explore and critically review policies and practices of PLAR in four countries (Canada, Germany, Norway, and Switzerland). All four countries have a long tradition of PLAR for the purpose of labour market access and non-tertiary vocational qualifications, and Canada and Norway also have a long tradition for the purpose of higher education access. But whilst in Canada, Norway, and Switzerland recruitment of high-skilled immigrants has been an integral part of labour force development for years, in Germany, it has been no earlier than in 2008 that recruitment of high skilled immigrants has been declared a national policy strategy. Despite of long traditions in PLAR in all four countries, there is a massive lack of (research on) transparency of procedures, assessors’ qualifications, assessment criteria, regulations and effects, particularly with respect to PLAR for labour market access and non-academic qualifications (Pires, 2005; Souto Otero, Hawley & Nevala, 2007).
In this context, one of the key challenges is to be aware of the perspective we argue from, i.e. whether PLAR is mainly used in terms of meeting labour market demands or in terms of personal development: 'the perspective is either utilitarian or more humanistic and one has to be aware about the respective consequences. Moreover, one has to consider the scope of the general approach: In general, there is a dilemma between generality and accuracy. The more holistic and general the approach is, the more broad is the standard, the more abstract are the principles of validation. This could mean making the recognition of competencies too general, so that in the end they may not express anything at all. A common currency for measuring competencies may be the time unit, that someone has spent in practising something; similarly, one could use the criterion of work load as is done in universities, for comparing various study programs’ (Preisser, 2004, p. 3).

Following the types of comparative education research as developed by Theisen & Adams (1990) and Watson (1996), this paper starts with a description of national PLAR conditions and traditions in Canada, Germany, Norway, and Switzerland. It then provides a comparative evaluation of national strategies and procedures of PLAR including regulations, costs, number of (successful) applications, assessors’ qualifications, and applicants’ skills. Particular emphasis is placed on assessment criteria against which competent bodies and agencies are judging applicants’ prior learning outcomes. But rather than legitimating existing policies and practices this paper attempts to identify the need for a critical review and evaluation of such policies and practices, for a research-based design of coherent PLAR strategies, and its sustainable evaluation.

**National PLAR Traditions and Conditions**

Whilst none of the countries has (not yet) a National Qualifications Framework, all of them have certification activities that follow national standards, curricula, or guidelines. Moreover, national educational structures both in general and in PLAR differ largely across countries. Except from Norway, none of the countries has a nationally unitary education system. Thus, in Canada, Germany and Switzerland PLAR is much related to regional and national efforts to develop more coherent recognition and validation procedures and thus to promote intranational and international mobility of the labour force.

**Canada**

Canada does not have a national education system. Instead, education falls under the jurisdiction of the provinces and territories. PLAR is part of Canada’s numerous recognition activities encompassing

- qualification recognition (assessment of credentials)
- credit recognition (the granting of credits based on equivalent competencies)
- the assessment of experimental learning
- Prior Learning Assessment and Recognition (PLAR) (Dyson & Keating, 2005, p. 43).

PLAR was first introduced in the 1980s in Winnipeg/Mantioba to grant credits to learning acquired in non-college settings in the area of nursing, dental assisting and early childhood education. In 1997, the Canadian Labour Force Development Board developed 14 guiding principles to act as a framework for the implementation of PLAR across Canada. Although
realising this framework rests with the provinces and territories national and territorial/provincial activities are both supported by several stakeholders such as the Human Resources Development Canada (HRDC) aiming at co-operating, developing, implementing, and evaluating PLAR mechanisms and instruments.

In terms of PLAR in apprenticeship all territorial/provincial jurisdictions have unique provisions for granting credits. Each jurisdiction administers and manages its own apprenticeship programs. However, a study on PLAR in apprenticeship prepared by Prism Economics and Analysis (2004) has identified a number of similarities that can be found across territories and provinces:

- Apprentices may apply for credits to be granted for either on-the-job training or in-school training.
- Credits for in-school training are given in the units of training delivery (blocks or modules)
- Time credits may be given against the on-the-job training part of training
- PLAR is usually undertaken once (upon initial registration of the apprentice or shortly thereafter).

It is particularly the Red Seal Program that provides opportunities for PLAR which was established to provide greater mobility across Canada for skilled workers. Through the program, apprentices who have completed their training and are certified trade persons, are able to obtain a Red Seal endorsement on their Certificates of Qualification and Apprenticeship by successfully completing an interprovincial standards examination. This qualification allows qualified tradespeople to practice the trade in any province or territory in Canada where the trade is designated without having to pass further examinations. To date, there are 49 trades included in the Red Seal Program on a national basis.

**Germany**

Despite an overall legal framework or PLAR system in Germany, there is a large variety of approaches and funding mechanisms. In terms of vocational education and training, the National Vocational Training Act allows experienced workers to take exams which lead to the award of a qualification in a recognised apprenticeship trade. Since 2009 qualified workers owning a professional non-tertiary diploma have access to higher education. This decision was taken by the Standing Conference of Ministers of Education and Cultural Affairs of the German Lander.

PLAR is offered by regionally competent authorities, most of them chambers and guilds. Applicants may take the final exams without being a registered apprentice. However, they have to demonstrate that they have satisfied eligibility requirements (typically by a documentation of previous trade-related work experience) at the time he/she takes the final examinations to acquire a trade diploma. National standards against which applicants are tested are developed by the BIBB (Federal Institute for Vocational Education and Training) and the Standing Conference of Ministers of Education and Cultural Affairs of the German Lander. In terms of curriculum and standards development both institutions co-operate with numerous stakeholders such as trade unions, guilds, and vocational training centers.
Norway

PLAR has a long tradition in Norway. It is highly recognised in society and plays a vital role in Norway’s skills formation. Its key idea is to provide ‘education for everybody’ in a unitary education system where the idea of valuing and validating learning outcomes independently of learning contexts and settings is fitted into a policy based on egalitarian and democratic values.

Several acts of law allow individuals to either have prior learning validated to be admitted to either formal qualifications programmes/exams or to the labour market or to equate their competencies with a formal qualification.

PLAR in Norway is based on a national approach leaving a certain degree of autonomy to validating institutions, in particular higher education institutions. PLAR initiatives aim at all adults, both employed and unemployed and in particular those with undocumented work experience. It is provided by regional assessment centres, higher education institutions and VOX – the Norwegian Agency for Lifelong Learning which is a division of the Ministry of Education and Research. Following the so-called national competence reform (1998-2003), a national PLAR system was implemented in 2003 and includes a set of principles and assessment methods. The key idea of PLAR in VET is to have applicants actually demonstrate their skills rather than taking written tests or oral examinations.

Switzerland

In Switzerland, PLAR activities started some 30 years ago in the French-speaking region of the country. Since 1978, the Vocational Training Act allows experienced workers to take the final exams in recognised apprenticeship trainings or to have prior learning assessed and recognised as a certificate. Since 2002, the Vocational Training Act allows the use of PLAR to lead to the award of a formal qualification (professional diploma). PLAR aims at experienced workers who lack a formal qualification and migrants whose qualifications are not fully recognised in Switzerland. To date, validation is an officially recognised procedure linking informally and/or non-formally acquired learning results with certificate/diploma requirements (BBT¹, 2010). Thus, validation is an officially recognised procedure offered by an institution (school, university, public authority) through which prior learning results are accepted as equivalent to a certificate or diploma acquired through formal training and learning.

PLAR is offered by numerous centres and institutions² in all 26 cantons, all of them following a validation procedure developed by the BBT, the National Agency for Vocational Education and Technology.

Assessment Criteria and Procedures

Leaving aside prior learning documentation for the purpose of personal development, we now turn our focus on PLAR in terms of labour market access and awarding formal qualifications. All four countries apply numerous assessment methods for PLAR, most of all written and/or oral

¹ Bundesamt für Berufsbildung und Technologie (National Agency for Vocational Education and Technology).
² E.g. l’office d’orientation scolaire et professionnelle, Kompetenzzentrum Bern etc.
examinations, documentations, portfolios, simulations, observations, and evidence from real situations at work or in other contexts. None of the countries has a strict regulation on how and when to apply which method. In all countries, the results are assessed against ‘standards’ which may be either national ones, sector-specific ones, or ones developed by the assessing institutions. Assessment is run by experts, i.e. professionals who in some cases (Norway, Switzerland) have to acquire additional skills and qualifications for PLAR. The desired outcome of assessment is to award of a formal qualification (diploma/certificate) and improved labour market access for the individual. Also, Germany and Norway provide additional training plans and/or the validation of competence units without awarding the full formal qualification.
The following table provides an overview of key aspects of PLAR across countries.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Canada</th>
<th>Germany</th>
<th>Norway</th>
<th>Switzerland</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cost</strong></td>
<td>approx. $ 100 – $ 325, depending on trade and examination/type of application</td>
<td>up to $ 400(^1), depending on Land, trade and authority</td>
<td>Free of charge for unemployed and disabled and those born before 1978; otherwise approx. $ 133 – $ 2,390(^4)</td>
<td>approx. $ 6,020(^5), depending on canton and authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Number of applications</strong></td>
<td>on average 20% of all Red Seals are awarded to candidates who took the exam without having completed an apprenticeship program, depending on trade between 8% (plumbers) and 42% (steamfitters/pipefitters)</td>
<td>in terms of external applicants: in 2010: 533,364 successful applications (~ 5.4% of all successful exams), most of them in house keeping</td>
<td>In 2008, 41% of all students in upper secondary education applied for PLAR, 25% received a time credit; 59% of all PLAR applicants who challenged the exam passed it</td>
<td>depending on profession and sector between 7 (print industry) and 300 (health care) applications per year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Assessors’ qualifications</strong></td>
<td>‘professionals’; no national regulations in terms of further requirements</td>
<td>‘professionals’; no national regulations in terms of further requirements</td>
<td>counsellors, assessors, and validation process administrators; need to be participating in continuing training</td>
<td>‘professionals’; no national regulations in terms of further requirements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Assessment criteria</strong></td>
<td>Red Seal Endorsement standards</td>
<td>national professional standards</td>
<td>national professional standards</td>
<td>national professional standards</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


\(^1\) 0-300 €  
\(^4\) 100-1,800 €  
\(^5\) 5,500 sFR
Which way forward? – Key Elements of Future Research

As a result, we can see that all countries agree on the importance of PLAR. However, little is known about a) assessment criteria and procedures in practice b) applicants’ perspectives and whereabouts, and c) assessors’ skills. The discussion is dominated by documents stemming from a political perspective resulting in a lack of reliable and comparative data on the actual impact of recognition and validation activities. However, there are some lessons that can be learnt from these countries’ experiences which provide a framework for further analysis.

The first issue concerns recognition and validation in workplace contexts. The extent to which recognition and validation systems are implemented in the workplace depends on a number of factors – one of which is the role of stakeholders who design and carry out the validation and recognition processes. This topic is closely linked with the implementation of occupational standards and their linkage to educational standards. While occupational and educational standards and outcomes-based curricula are becoming more common in many countries worldwide, recognition and validation processes are still typically carried out in relation to standards or benchmarks that are not fully or not yet defined but rest on a sense of what someone should achieve if he or she completes a qualification, gains access to a learning programme, or an occupation by a validation procedure. The lines between occupational standards on the one hand and educational standards on the other hand are not clearly defined which makes it even more difficult to meet the needs of both types of standards by recognition and validation processes.

The second issue is the structural linkage between labour markets and education and training systems. In Canada, Germany, and Switzerland, education and training systems are highly decentralized and partnerships between labour market stakeholders and education and training institutions are often based on regional initiatives. Although these countries have managed to implement organisations whose work is strongly focused on validation, the awarding bodies still depend on educational institutions to determine what knowledge, skills, and competences are deemed valuable. In Norway, a national validation system allows for a greater participation in awarding formal qualifications.

In this context, Dyson & Keating (2005, p. 58) as well as Singh (2005) have pointed out that the issue of qualifications frameworks is closely linked with a successful implementation of a validation system. Although none of the four countries has a National Qualification Framework (NQF) (that is yet in place) they all have long traditions in PLAR. Since the actual impact of NQFs on improving validation systems and education and training systems in general is limited and little is known about their long-term effects (Allais, Raffe, Strathdee, Wheelahan & Young, 2009), there is hardly any evidence whether they are an enabling or an inhibiting factor in promoting recognition and validation systems and practice: While in Canada and Switzerland, implementing validation procedures follows a bottom-up approach driven by companies, unions, and learning providers, Germany and Norway have developed top-down approaches including validation mechanisms that were at least partly systems driven by supra-national or international developments. Thus, NQFs can be a driving force in the practice of recognition and validation systems if they establish common benchmarks and standards which allow for the formal equivalence of qualifications recognized through recognition and validation.
What they cannot be expected to do is act as generators and promoters of the acceptance of recognition and validation systems. This needs a long-term strategy close to the workplace and provider levels as well as close to learners, teachers, and trainers.

Another issue are obstacles to the implementation of PLAR systems which may be either at systems level, at institutional level, at individual level or political and scientific obstacles. However, there is hardly any reliable data on PLAR and on its impact. Given the amount of local and undocumented methods and initiatives, this indicates a strong need for research-based evidence on PLAR.

Reviewing individual countries’ experiences with PLAR as summed up by e.g. Dyson & Keating (2005) or Singh (2005) we can identify four types of obstacles for PLAR which should be taken into account for future research, namely:

- **Institutional obstacles** include qualifications structures and rules, assessment criteria, and financing mechanisms. They depend on the degree of outcomes-orientation of formal qualifications. They are mostly built around course participation and completion. Thus, PLAR is often not readily accessible to non-traditional learners and/or the financing of PLAR is not separated from the course financing.

- **Organisational obstacles** are related to the practices of competent bodies, education and training institutions and providers that prevent individuals from assessing formal education and training and from fully benefiting from recognition and validation schemes that are in place. Organisational obstacles are very much linked with financing mechanisms since PLAR is time consuming, cost-intensive and usually not part of standard assessment procedures which in general are coupled with formal education and training programmes. Decoupling such programmes and its inherent assessment procedures demands for either more differentiated financing mechanisms or new modes of cost accounting or a different understanding of learning and its outcomes.

- **Cultural obstacles** are based on a general lack of trust in PLAR or the value of informal and non-formal learning per se. Such a lack of trust may result in overly rigorous or overly lax recognition and validation procedures and/or a lack of supporting infrastructures (lack of time, adequate procedures, staff).

- **Individual obstacles** are a bundle of complex and contradictory aspects one of which is how to attract learners who are not familiar with formal procedures in learning contexts. Also, little attention has been paid to encouraging learners’ participation in recognition and validation. Thus, there is a high risk of leaving behind traditional non-learner groups. This is even more likely as regards gaining information about PLAR: Gaining such information is generally a difficult procedure and it is even more difficult for individuals with weak education biographies.

Summing up these findings, these four areas (institutional, organisational, cultural, and individual obstacles) are relevant for further investigation and should build a future research framework – together with the key aspects mentioned in the table above, i.e. costs, number of applications, assessors’ qualifications, assessment criteria, responsibilities, and involved institutions.
References
Notes from a Small Island: Storytelling in Adult Education Research

Susan M. Brigham
Mount Saint Vincent University

Abstract: In this paper I discuss storytelling as a research method; a method largely under-theorized in adult education. Storytelling is an interactive process, a form of knowledge construction, which opens our imagination, provides spaces for questioning, challenges taken for granted assumptions that shape our judgments, prompts new ideals, opens up reflexivity, and instigates action. In this paper I highlight a research project that involves the stories of migrant women (now in their 70s) of ‘mixed race’ who emigrated independently from a small remote island in the 1950s to work in domestic service in England when they were between 15 and 18 years old.

Every time I went into Jamestown I’d ask [the agency man], “Can you get me a job in England?” He always said I was too young. You had to be 16. Finally in 1955 I was 15 years and a few months old and he got in touch with my Mum. “I’ve got an opening for her if it is OK with you” he said to Mum, and she gave permission. She said, “If this is what you want to do, child I can’t stop you.” ...I was really sad when the day came for me to leave. They had a party the night before I left. My brother had his guitar and we all sat around the kitchen table and my brother was singing, “If you ever go across the sea to Ireland” [sings to the tune of the song] and oh I started bawling [laughs]. It was just one of those things [choking sound]; you knew you were leaving home. My Mum was really upset. I was the right hand to my Mum. I helped with the cooking, cleaning, and the washing, and I took over with the little ones, my brothers, sisters, and my other sister she was also a work horse like me. [Lilleth, research participant]

Introduction
The intent of this paper is to explore the methodological (philosophical and ideological) underpinnings of a research project that I have been working on as a way of highlighting several critical aspects related to conducting research in the field of adult education. In this paper, I discuss story-telling as a research method and the role of emotion and resonance for the research participants and the researcher.

Last year during my sabbatical I traveled with my husband and daughters (aged 8 and 10 years) to the island of Saint Helena in the South Atlantic Ocean (Latitude 16º South, Longitude 5º45' West). The island, a British overseas territory, is one of the most remote islands in the world, accessible only by ship. Located more than 2,000 kilometres from the nearest major landmass, it measures 16 by 8 kilometres with a total of 122 km², and has a population of just over 4000 (2008 census). Our journey began in Halifax, Nova Scotia, where we flew to South Africa via London followed by a six day voyage from Cape Town on board the Royal Mail Ship (RMS) St Helena (a ship that carries everything the “Saints” [as they are referred to] need, from automobiles, medicines, food, clothes, livestock, electronics, and spare parts for machinery, as well as about 120 passengers and just over 50 officers and crew).

This journey took me ‘home’ to a place I had never been, the first home of my mother (who passed away nearly 20 years ago), home to my late grandparents, and the current home of my
uncle and step-aunt, cousins and other extended family. As a result of the journey, my newfound family, the island, our stay, our return, and of course, the research I conducted, I heard, shared, and created a bale of stories; some incomplete, some loosely packed and some wadded up tightly, but all bound together with ‘baling twine’ of sorts. This bale which I have carried around for about a year is precious cargo that calls for reverence and careful handling, for I agree with Kenyon (2003, p. 32) that “People’s life stories are possibly their most intimate possessions.”

As a researcher and traveler I believe [to borrow from de Beauvoir’s (1959, pp. 67–70) descriptions] that these stories are “unique and irreplaceable…they would interest others, and so [should] be saved from extinction.” Yet, this fragile bale has had me considering: What is the use of these stories? What should become of them and why should we care? What can we learn from them? How do they contribute to our knowledge of adult education? And, does storytelling constitute research?

Storytelling in education research has remained largely under-theorized (Gallagher, 2011, p. 49). This is so in the field of adult education where the methodological complexities inherent in storytelling have not been adequately examined. This paper begins a conversation around this method and attempts to address the questions I posed above.

The research project
The purpose of my study is to understand the lifelong learning experiences of female migrants from the island of Saint Helena who left the island between 1950 to 1970 to work as domestic workers in England and the impact their migration has had on their families left behind and the island’s society in general. For this study I met with two main groups of people: former migrant domestic workers (n=12), and family members of migrants (n=12). Additionally, I met with other Saints and UK-born government officials who provided context to the study (e.g. the Governor, the Bishop, the Chief Education Officer, the Tourism Officer, etc.) (n=12).

A qualitative methodology is aimed at understanding the complexity of individuals’ experiences and thoughts (Denzin & Lincoln, 1994). Personal perspectives and feelings are best explained through descriptive language so a semi-structured long interview with open-ended questions “maximize discovery and description” (Reinharz, 1992, p. 19). Therefore, to understand the lifelong learning experiences of female migrants from the island of Saint Helena and to explore the impact their migration has had on their families left behind, I used semi-structured one to one interviews.

As I listen to the audio tapes of the ‘interviews,’ particularly of the women migrant workers, they are better described as long conversations as opposed to a staccato of questions from me and responses from the interviewees. I also note how these stories are tied to me in various ways, for inevitably on an island as small as St Helena some of the interviewees would have known my family and would mentioned in a comment something about my mother as a girl, my grandmother, grandfather, or great aunts. Hearing these comments like “your mother was a timid thing, she’d always make me walk in front,” “Your grandma was strict, she would correct any misbehaving child,” or “Your grandfather used to play funny tricks on people” felt to me like rescuing an elusive oddment from oblivion much like chasing after puffs of dandelion seeds blowing on a strong gust of wind; to catch even one was astonishing and gratifying. The island itself (the land
and its contours, the broken pieces of fine bone china regularly washing ashore from long ago ship wrecks, the defunct flax mills, Napoleonic’s house, the old Boer internment camp, the recently unearthed bones of 1000s of slaves, the eroding fortress walls, the rusting cannons, the flora and fauna, including the centenarian tortoises that live on the Plantation House grounds) contain stories far too numerous to count or hear. My point is, research in the social sciences is often motivated by a researcher’s own fascinations and “desire to make sense… to make meaning” (van Manen, 2007, p. 79). Our emotional resonance with someone’s story engages us in a personal way instigating reflection to determine deeper meaning and to examine relationships with others people’s experiences. Hence, as I discuss below a researcher’s subjectivities, connections, passions, and emotions need not be amputated from the research in order for it to be valid.

In this paper I present snippets of a story from a research participant, Lilleth (not her real name) in which she shares vivid details of her experience of migrating. The significance of her story for human science in general terms is that it: “provides us with possible human experience”; “enables us to experience life situations, feelings, emotions, and events that we would not normally experience”; “broaden(s) the horizons of our normal existential landscape by creating possible worlds”; “appeal(s) to us and involve(s) us in a personal way”; “lets us turn back to life as lived”; “evokes the quality of vividness in detailing unique and particular aspects of life that could be my life or your life”; and “transcends the particularity, mak(ing) [it] subject to thematic analysis and criticism” (van Manen, 2007, p. 70).

Being brought up on the island and not wearing shoes at all and all of a sudden I am having to get on this ship and I have to wear shoes constantly, right? And mum had bought me this pair of shoes, flat shoes, orange and brown, the ugliest things you ever saw. We never thought about style. You just bought whatever fit you and you wore it. And I remember she made me this dress, it was red and white sear sucker. A woman made me a little cap, because everyone who left the island had to wear a little cap or hat. And she had crocheted the prettiest little skull cap ... those little things that meant something, you know. Now I look back on it I think I should have had the sense to keep that. [Lilleth]

**Storytelling as research method**

Frank (2004, p. 431) declares, “After the methods, there has to be a story,” while Gallagher (2011, p. 52) asserts that storytelling is “not as a place at which to arrive, but as a place to begin inquiry.” I propose that storytelling is not something that merely follows the method, rather it is the method; it is the beginning and an end product. Storytelling is an interactive process, a form of knowledge construction, which opens our imagination, provides spaces for questioning, challenges taken for granted assumptions that shape our evaluation or critique, prompts new ideals, opens up reflexivity, and instigates actions (Barone, 2001; Clarke and Ryan, 2006; Freire, 1970; Gallagher, 2011).

Rodriguez (2010, p. 1) asserts that storytelling serves theoretical, pedagogical, and methodological purposes:

First, stories (or more specifically, counterstories) build a sense of community among those at the margins of society by providing a space to share their sense of reality and experiences. Stories build consensus, a common culture of shared understandings.
Second, counterstories challenge dominant ideology. Last, they can teach people about how we construct both story and reality. Critical race theorists assert that story-telling as a research method has significant transformative potential particularly for people of colour (Solorozo & Yosso, 2002). Storytelling is a political act bringing the storytellers of colour from the margins to the centre with the potential of empowering the storyteller as well as the listener (Delgado, 1988-1989). The stories of people of color (which are often untold) can challenge the meritocratic, color-blind, and liberal grand narratives that assume to speak for the majority (Delgado Bernal & Villalpando, 2002). These stories include parables, histories and stories of research participants (Closson, 2010, p. 267). Such stories serve to trouble traditional ways of research in adult education, which limit our understanding of the learning experiences of marginalized adult learners and in turn limit their educational opportunities (Solorzano & Yosso, 2001). Stories of the experiences of people of colour reveal “the complex of routes, cul-de-sacs, and dead ends down which educational equity and access decisions have travelled” (Closson, 2010, p. 268). Further, storytelling “can serve as a means for researchers to create collective transformational spaces, coconstructing knowledge about self, further deepening our understandings about the role of race while in the field” (Rodriguez, 2010, p. 1).

When people ask about my racial background, I say, “I’m Heinz 57” [laughs]. I just tell them where I was born. On my father’s side there is some Irish and on my grandpa’s side it would be South African slaves. My grandpa was dark, he wasn’t black. He married my grandma who was white – her family was all pretty fair. It never dawned on us about being different colours. I remember I was hanging around with [a young man who] was black as can be. He was so much fun. He was a lot older than us... and he thought the world of us kids. I remember my dad used to say, “You keep away from them black boys.” My dad couldn’t have been prejudice because he was a most loving person and he had lots of black friends too but I wondered if I had gone on to marry a black person how he would have felt about it. It didn’t dawn on me what he was saying. It was confusing. Colour never mattered. So I don’t see [black people] as black I see them as me.

Clearly, research through storytelling, “is shaped by personal history, biography, gender, social class, race, and ethnicity and those of the people in the setting” (Koch, 1998, p. 1182). Herein lies the problem for researchers of the positivist persuasion, that is, how can research be value-free and objective if the researcher is not detached from values and biases and the methods are not objective? How can a single truth be found with this method? From a post-positivist perspective, within which storytelling as a research method is located, there is an understanding that research cannot be value-free, that methods cannot be objective, that there is no one single truth to be found, that there is no single method which can capture the complexity of human experience, and that the researcher need not be disconnected from his/her own emotions, values, attitudes, and experiences. In fact, the researcher’s subjectivities are acknowledged and made known from the start, for “knowledge is constructed through transactions among researchers, participants, evidence, and the social context” (Coulter & Smith, 2009, p. 588). Researchers who use storytelling as a method recognize that stories, recollections and reflections of experience cannot be identical to the lived experience (van Manen, 2007, p. 54); hence, a researcher’s concern is with research participants’ reflections on not of the world as it is known (Riessman, 2008, p. 188). In addition, the truth/lie dichotomy is moot in storytelling, for “truth is not a fixed
but an evolving content” (Okpewho, 2003, p. 228). And finally, storytelling as method does not attempt to capture firm facts that can be generalized to a broad population, rather the point of storytelling is for the listener/reader to get to know the specifics of experience and be open to resonance or possible vicarious connections to other stories of experience.

We had 16 days at sea. A chauffeur picked me up from the dock. I was to work for upper crust gentry. It was very upsetting when I got there. I cried for about 3 months [laughs]. We drove so far out in the English countryside. The driveway to the Estate from the main road was about 2 miles long. They had a mansion that had at least 56 rooms; on the grounds there were tennis courts, gardens, cottages for the gardeners and for the chauffeurs and their families. They had 2 cooks, a governess, maids, 2 chauffeurs, and gardeners. After 2 days of my arrival the madam took me to town and she bought me warm soft underwear, I only had knickers that I came with and she bought me a big warm winter coat. I had no warm clothes and only had summery cotton clothes and I had never had a coat before. I was also given uniforms. We had a day uniform, blue and white gingham and in the evening we’d have another uniform, black and white with a cap that had lace around it. They treated us really well. We still had our place as servants, but they were always nice and polite and always remembered our birthdays and we got gifts on our birthdays. One time I got a transistor radio, another time I got a red leather wallet. I got £4 a week and I thought, “I am making twice as much as my dad”. He was only making £2 a week and there [was a dozen] of us in the family to support.

Implications for adult education
Certainly adult educators are fascinated by stories; we celebrate a historical legacy of stories, we share and listen to stories, we learn and educate through stories and our practices and theories are informed by stories. Yet the role of storytelling in adult education research has not been adequately theorized. This paper begins a conversation about storytelling as a research methodology with a particular focus on a research project that centres the marginalized stories of transnational migrant whose stories can teach us something about identity, transformation, transmigration, social justice, and much more. For example, through references to her attire and new possessions, Lilleth reveals transitions in her identity and membership. She refers to concrete details that metaphorically tie her life to transformational moments, e.g. from never having worn shoes to “wearing shoes constantly”; from wearing homemade cotton clothes to wearing store bought outfits, including the maid uniforms and warm woolens produced in the United Kingdom. Her reference to a developing sense of “style” versus sole practicality as well as the need to identify herself to fellow Britons who share her nationality but have little knowledge of the island are defining moments in her shifting racial, gender, class, and national identity and personal transformation as she began a journey that distanced her geographically, culturally, socio-economically, and temporally from her island home and family.

Conclusion
I conclude with two reminders for adult educators/researchers/storytellers/listeners. Firstly, the adult education research domain is, in general, “dominated by a history of institutional practices and by particular paradigms and approaches to research held by communities of like-minded scholars” (Smith, 2010, p. 140). While some adult educators have been deconstructing the
dominant paradigms, developing new methodologies and opening possibilities of alternative ways of knowing, there is a need to continue this work and persist in evaluating the ways in which we reproduce exclusionary practices which marginalize and silence certain voices and stories in our research and through our research methods. Secondly, many adult educators/researchers would do well to acknowledge the role and value of storytelling in research, for research is always an interpretive process that involves conversations and storytelling, though the research framework traditionally applies other names such as aims, methods and conclusions. Research conventions are a particular form of storytelling that allows sociologists and historians to ‘tell stories as if they weren’t storytellers.’ (Game and Metcalfe 1996, p. 65, cited in de Carteret, 2008, p. 246)

The potential for storytelling as research method in adult education is worthy of further exploration and theorizing. What’s your story?

References


Making Sense of Why Some Learners Choose Failure Over Success

Derek Briton
Athabasca University

Abstract: Adult learners do not learn in a vacuum. Unlike their less mature counterparts, they must contest with a host of factors that impinge upon and structure their learning environment. Unfortunately, in the haste to provide them with new knowledge, skills, and capacities, adult educators often pay little heed to the affective impediments adult learners bring to the learning environment. Yet rather than carefully-planned teaching and learning methodologies, lesson plans, or assessment models, it may well be such factors that determine the success or failure of adult learners.

Adult learners do not learn in a vacuum. They bring much more to the learning environment than textbooks, binders, and pencils, even laptops. They bring their hopes, fears, beliefs, experiences, memories, uncertainties, doubts, goals, hopes, dreams, and desires. I have argued elsewhere that this is why adult educators are not simply technicians with predefined skill sets, but cultural workers who guide learners to “critically examine the life they are living... and come to understand their innermost selves” (Briton, 1996, p. 34).

The “disenchantment” of adult education began in earnest with the onset of the 20th Century, when adult education programs became increasingly professionalized, and “scientific” models of adult education came to dominate curricula (Carlson, 1977; Wilson, 1993). Consequently, modern adult educators came to learn very early in their preparation that cultural conceptions of knowledge and learning are far too nebulous, amorphous, and emotive a foundation for professional practice. Keen to project an aura of “professionalism,” adult education programs, with a doff-of-the-cap to social constructivism, a respectful nod to feminism, and a condescending wink to post-rationalist/cognitivist studies, continue to promote rational-cognitive conceptions of knowledge and cumulative-linear models of learning. Consequently, much of adult education remains in the thralls of “scientism.” Increasingly pressured to provide learners with new knowledge, skills, and capacities, adult educators feel compelled to restrict their practice to the cognitive realm, yet it is often the affective domain (values, motivations, attitudes, stereotypes, beliefs, feelings, desires) that determines the success or failure of adult learners, as opposed to carefully-planned teaching and learning methodologies, lesson plans, and/or assessment models.

This is hardly a revolutionary claim: over two decades ago, the work of noted female educators such as bell hooks (1994, 2003) and Jane Gallop (1997, 2002) revealed the learning environment to be shot through with affective elements—the writing of both, for example, draws our attention to the cultural and romantic bonds that fuel and complicate the teacher/learner relation, and in so doing reveals learning to be a far from rational, cognitive, and linear process. But it is the insight of a third female educator, Shoshana Felman that provides the most compelling case against

6 “The fate of our times is characterized by rationalization and intellectualization and, above all, the ‘disenchantment of the world’” (Weber, 1979, p. 155).
7 “The conviction that we can no longer understand science as one form of knowledge, but rather must identify knowledge with science” (Habermas, 1972, p. 4).
instrumental conceptions of learning, and she provides this through a psychoanalytic lens: “proceeding not through linear progression but through breakthroughs, leaps, discontinuities, regressions, and deferred action, the analytic learning process puts in question the traditional pedagogical belief in intellectual perfectibility, the progressist view of learning as a simple one-way road from ignorance to knowledge” (1987, p. 76). Desire, Felman argues, is interwoven into the very fabric of learning. It can, of course, be ignored, but at a cost. That cost is the ability to identify why some adult learners fail to succeed, in spite of elaborate teaching and learning methodologies, explicit lesson plans, and/or appropriate assessment models. Yet Felman’s promotion of Jacques Lacan’s psychoanalytic insights into learning has had little impact on adult education. This paper looks to remedy that situation through the application of psychoanalytic concepts to an everyday, personal narrative that exemplifies desire’s crucial role in learning.

The personal narrative, or “first person singular,” aired on the Canadian Broadcasting Corporation’s “This Morning.” The author of the narrative speaks tellingly of the role desire and fantasy play in the formulation, pursuit, and near attainment of a central goal, offering, in plain and humorous language, insightful comments on not only the fantasies she constructed to support her desire and sustain her in the pursuit of her goal, but also the factors that led her to reconsider and ultimately sacrifice her goal when reality clashed with fantasy. This personal narrative serves as the perfect vehicle to introduce and discuss some important yet otherwise abstract insights into the relation between desire and learning.

The author of our First Person Singular recounts how, after being told by her doctor that she risked a heart attack, stroke, or diabetes if she didn’t lose weight, she suddenly found herself with sufficient incentive to lose forty pounds in quite short. The process is typical of that prescribed by many adult education programs: expert knowledge ➔ linear learning ➔ predictable outcome. But with only an additional thirty pounds to go and her desired goal in sight, the author found her motivation waning. The author notes:

Good health is a fine reason to lose weight. But after a point, health is not enough. Call me impatient, or needy, or fragile, or vain, but 120 over 70 just doesn’t cut it. No one can see my low blood pressure. No one can see my good health. Only I—and my doctor—can see that I am healthier. The people I pass when I jog, they just see another jogger, plodding her way along the seawall, trying not to trip over the dog droppings along the way (emphasis added).

Troubled by her waning motivation, the author reflects:

Why can’t I keep the weight off? Why can’t I just become normal and stay there? It’s because I don’t know what normal is. I can’t long for that flat stomach I had in high school. I never had it. I can’t accept who I am since I’ve never been who I wanted to be.

8 Instrumental reason is “the kind of rationality we draw on when we calculate the most economical application of means to a given end. Maximum efficiency, the best cost-output ratio, is its measure of success” (Taylor, 1992, p. 5).

9 “CBC Radio’s flagship current affairs program, This Morning, is in the market for personal essays. We call the this feature of the show ‘First Person Singular.’… These pieces do not deal with issues, but with significant experiences and happenings that shape people’s lives in big and small ways. In each there should be an element of transformation … an epiphany...a turning point” (Levine, 2003).
She continues: “They see someone normal. I’m not normal. I’ve never been normal. I’ve always been fat. When I was 20, I managed to shed about fifty pounds and keep it off. For about a month.”

However, she recounts how, “Sometimes, in my imagination, I am thin, tall—maybe even blonde, why not?—with an aquiline nose and high cheekbones. The most popular girl in the school. Brainy, too. When I try to lose weight, that’s who I’m trying to become” (emphasis added). It is not good health, then, that supports the author’s desire to lose weight, but the fantasy construct to be someone other than she is: thin, tall, blonde, etc. The author’s elaboration on her fantasy construct is revealing:

When I am thin, I will look fabulous in Size 5 Gap jeans. My little butt will stick out just the right amount. I will wear my shirts tucked in, like in my hairdresser’s fashion magazines, with the top buttons undone just enough to show off the lace on my sexy push-up bra. Maybe I will wear those little T-shirts that expose just a hint of my iron-hard tummy. My jawline will be ice sharp, my cheekbones—way up near my ears—will glow, and my long flaxen hair will glisten as I toss it around oh-so-casually. I will be amazing.

The fantasy is startling in both clarity and detail:

Heads will turn. People will stare as I walk down the street. I won't be able to jog; I’d attract too much attention. I’ll come home from work at night and change out of my Size 5 Jones New York business suit into a slinky wraparound gown, and I’ll enjoy a glass of wine and some chocolate-dipped strawberries with my loving husband, who won’t be able to keep his hands off me. Jeez, we’ll probably even have sex standing up! And the best thing of all? When I eat an ice cream cone, I can get a little dribble on the end of my nose, and I will be devastatingly cute.

What this charming and entertaining account reveals is that what is supporting the author’s desire to lose weight is neither her doctor’s expert knowledge, a regimented method of balancing calories in against calories out, nor a goal of good health, but the fantasy of becoming someone she is not. But after losing forty pounds and moving ever closer to realizing her goal, we learn that what the author wanted to avoid, even at the cost of failing health, was a former painful truth that threatened her fantasy:

What I remember, so vividly and so painfully, was looking at myself in the mirror one day, having lost all that weight, and realizing that, after all that caloric deprivation, I was still only five feet tall. My hips still stuck out too much on the sides. My hair was still limp and mousy brown. My knees still knocked. And my nose still turned up too much. I was back at the peanut butter before you could say “body mass index.” And, of course, back came the weight. And again it went, and again it came back.

The author goes on to share what she knew only too well: “If I lose those last 30 pounds, I risk finding out the truth” (emphasis added), a truth she finds too painful to accept:

The truth is that I am fortyish, nearsighted, and short. If I got into those Size 5 jeans, I’m sure I wouldn’t be able to walk ten feet. I have a gall bladder scar across my stomach that looks like a tire skid, so the little T-shirts are out. I will never have an ice
sharp jawline or high cheekbones. My face is a little apple dumpling and always will be. And my greying hair will never swing because it’s too much hassle to grow it long. As for sex, well, my loving husband is past 50, has a bad back, and isn’t likely to cart me around the house in sexual ecstasy any time soon. And ice cream on my nose? Cute if you’re six, but pretty embarrassing for a grown woman.

Clearly the author is under no allusion about her actual appearance and condition, but what is particularly telling is her conclusion: “Yes, it's lunacy. But while I am fat, I can think whatever I want and ain’t no one going to tell me I'm wrong” (emphasis added).

What this First Person Singular makes clear, then, is that the author’s desire to lose weight is sustained not by her doctor’s expert advice, the cumulative accomplishments of her dietary and exercise regime, or the measurable outcome of good health, but the fantasy of being someone she is not. Moreover, knowledge and sound reasoning aside, it is this “insane” fantasy the author chooses to sustain rather than attain her logical goal.

This is completely in keeping with Lacan’s account of desire, which holds that a fantasy construct does not disappear once it is successfully interpreted and its function revealed. This is because a certain enjoyment, what Lacan dubs *jouissance*, remains at play. For instance, the “lunacy” of remaining overweight affords the author of the First Person Singular the pleasure of: “thinking whatever I want and ain’t no one going to tell me I'm wrong.”

Yet when learners fail to achieve their goals, we continue to focus on identifying inappropriate teaching methodologies, flawed lesson plans, and/or poorly conceived outcomes, rather than the learners themselves and the fantasies that sustain their desires. The argument against such a course is that if adult education abandons its “scientific” principles and methods (knowledge as observable, measurable, abiding; learning as the transmission of knowledge from expert to novice), it will lose its legitimacy and status. But until we’re willing to look beyond the boundaries of modern adult education practice, it will remain impossible to make sense of why some learners choose failure over success, for as someone far wiser and gifted than I pointed out over four hundred years ago:

> There are more things in heaven and earth, Horatio.  
> Than are dreamt of in your philosophy.¹⁰

**References**


¹⁰ (Shakespeare, 1969, Act I, Scene 5, 166–167)


The Social Movement Learning of Women Social Activists of Atlantic Canada: “What Shall We Do and How Shall We Live?”

Shauna Butterwick & Maren Elfert
University of British Columbia

Abstract: In this paper, the life stories of 27 women activists of Atlantic Canada are explored, illustrating the organic process of women-centred organizing, the mutually informing interactions between private and political engagement, and how lifelong learning is core to long standing civic engagement and activism. These are stories about things that matter, about re-enchantment of a disenchanted world, and about hope and determination as necessary ingredients to bring about social change.

Introduction, Methodology and Framework

“If I haven’t learned something in 83 years, what’s my life all about?” is a question asked by Shirley Chernin, an activist looking back at six decades of volunteer work in a variety of social programs in Nova Scotia. Shirley is one of 27 women social activists of Atlantic Canada whose stories of sustained engagement for social justice were the focus of a multi-year project http://etc.lib.unb.ca/womenactivists initiated and directed by Liz Burge at the University of New Brunswick. Between the 1950s until today these women were involved with many advocacy struggles. Some time ago Shauna was invited by Liz Burge to review these narratives and provide a commentary for the project’s website in response to the question “how do these women understand social change and their role in it?” This paper extends that analysis and asks “what insights and lessons can we discern about social movement learning from these accounts?”. Another goal of this paper is to raise the profile of women in a field of study where women’s contributions have been minimized. We have employed a narrative-interpretive analysis, building on Frank’s (2002) argument that there is great value in gathering and listening to stories about ‘things that matter’ which is, he argues, “sustained civic involvements in the instigation of collective social change” (p. 111). Stories can interrupt what Charles Taylor in The malaise of modernity (1991) calls the ‘disenchantment of the world’ reflected in the prominence of “individualism” and “instrumental reason”. Frank suggests that “hearing the moral impulse in others’ stories enables us to become part of their struggle to re-enchant a disenchanted world” (p. 18). Frank (reflecting Weber’s questions at the turn of the 20th century) suggests that stories about things that matter can help answer the question “what shall we do and how should we live?” “By affirming the authenticity of the personal, narrative analysis can initiate a significant political intervention” (p. 116).

As noted, the stories were originally collected by Liz Burge and this analysis is based on how she framed these accounts and what she heard. Each profile on the web includes a photo and some brief comments about the interview context. The women profiled in Liz Burge’s project included: Sr. Angelina Martz, Sr. Kathrine Bellamy, Sr. Joan O’Keefe, Sr. Dorothy Moore, Phyllis Artiss, Viola Robinson, Yvonne Atwell, Sue Rickards, Shirley Chernin, Anne Bell, Stella Lord, Mary Lou Stirling, Joan Hicks, Elizabeth Lacey, Kathy Sheldon, Betty Peterson, Maria Bernard, May Bouchard, Ann Brennan, Shannie Duff, Nancy Riche, Edith Perry, Anne Bell,
Stall and Stoecker’s (1998) critical review of traditional models of community organizing served as an interpretive lens for our analysis. Stall and Stoecker critique how the “Alinsky model” and the “women-centered model” have been positioned as ideal type constructs. The “Alinsky model” is outcome- and power-oriented, building on strong leadership, confrontation and professionalism in the “public sphere”, whereas the “women-centered” model of community work emphasizes relationship-building and collaboration and sees communities as an extension of the “private sphere”. Using Stall and Stoecker’s sensitivity to these gendered binaries of civic engagement, we were interested to see how the women’s identities, practices and learning were located in spheres of private and public.

In what follows several themes are presented. They are interconnected and overlapping but for the purpose of this analysis they are offered here as analytically distinct.

**The Findings…**

**The Personal is Political**

The stories testify to the process of what C. Wright Mills calls “translating private troubles into public issues”. Many women describe their social activism as a journey from the “personal” to the “public”, in the course of which they found identity and authenticity as women and human beings. “Like many other women at the time, I suppose I was also coming to terms with my own experience of inequality, my sense of identity, and my search for autonomy and meaning”, says Stella Lord. “We have to make social change personally before we can make it publicly, become strong in our own personal centre…”, says Ann Brennan.

According to Stall and Stoecker’s definition of the “women-centered organizing model”, one of its characteristics is the blurring of boundaries between the public and the private sphere. The private sphere, which includes the family as well as the neighborhood and the local community, is based on private relationships and empowerment, whereas the public sphere associated with the “Alinsky model” is based on leadership, strategizing, conflict and competition. In the stories, the women hardly ever differentiate between these two spheres or between their “private” lives and their lives as social activists: “Being a social activist is a way of living every day” (Yvonne Atwell). Most of the women were born in rural areas at a time where the home was their main life sphere and their educational perspectives were limited (“In my time, I was a farmer’s daughter and putting me through college was out of the question” (Elizabeth Lacey).

The stories reveal how the women broadened their “private troubles” into “public issues” by expanding their field of action away from their homes by working, by attending a college or university, or by taking up a role in their community. They describe a rather organic process where they gradually entered new territories by being exposed to new knowledge they hadn’t been aware of before, by uncovering unknown skills, forming new relationships and getting involved in groups, communities and social justice institutions. For these women, the private and public fields of action are not distinct but somewhat merged; the “public” is referred to as practices in which the women claim a new and broader identity that crosses the boundaries of
their traditional roles.

**Speaking Up**

An example of crossing boundaries is public speaking, which was a challenge for many described as challenging and a skill they needed to learn. “Speaking up” was often referred to as a key moment when the woman’s agency was reinforced by others and she gained confidence in herself. Sr. Angelina Martz remembers her first public speaking event as a turning point in her activism: “I prayed I would be able to say this”. In her life, she reached a point where she felt “I have something important to say and I must say it”, and she drew a lot of strength from this moment when she spoke up for something that mattered. Nancy Riche discovered her political agency through claiming her identity as a feminist: “I might have lost a battle, but it was absolutely from that first day when I stood up and said, ‘I’m a feminist,’ that I thought it was important to put it out there all the time.” She recalls how she felt when she got quoted in an important meeting by a man: “I almost stood up and said, “Hold it! I’ve just been quoted!” Others such as Marian Perkins also refer to their first “speaking up” experience as the key moment that triggered their social activism. In Marian’s case it was calling in anonymously on a radio program. Maria Bernard reports how, on several occasions, speaking against what was expected from her (e.g. at meetings and conferences) changed things for her. Many defined their identity as social activists by “speaking” or “being the voice” for others: Sr. Kathrine Bellamy “felt it was her voice that was key to her activism – the capacity to speak for those who were not always able to raise their own voices.”

**Organic Leadership**

The stories reflect a mix of what we call organic and assigned leadership. Elizabeth Lacey and Maria Bernard spoke explicitly about assuming a leadership role. Elizabeth saw herself as “a natural leader”, and Maria Bernard reflected: “see yourself as a leader and grow the skills for it.” She also acknowledges the challenge: “It takes courage to be different.” Some commented that they assumed a leadership role because it was a “necessity” or because someone else approached them and they felt they had to step in. “I think of myself as someone who steps up to the plate to do a job that needs to be done”, says Phyllis Artiss. Others described a more collaborative approach to leadership. For example, Sister Joan O’Keefe noted that “as a leader, don’t get yourself out there in front”. Madeleine Gaudet, who was President of the New Brunswick Nurses Union for many years also articulated a more collective orientation: “I want to be part of collective change; I never wanted to run the show. Once the collective decision is made, I’m comfortable being the voice.” For some, like Nancy Riche, the label feminist was embraced, while Lou Stirling preferred to use the “notion of fairness” over the word “feminist” because of its negative association with “radical man-haters”.

**Skills, knowledge and critical analysis:**

“My way of being a feminist and activist has been to learn skills”, says Mary Lou Stirling. In some cases, these were academic skills, in other cases the skills of “consensus” or “learning how to speak from a political point of view”. Important skills mentioned are interpersonal skills such as persistence, patience, empathy and listening.
Some of the women identified activist skills as very pragmatic, for example learning how to “hand deliver key letters to city councillors”. Many stressed frustrations about not having the skills needed to win battles with their opponents. In almost all profiles adapting, negotiating, mediating, compromising, being patient and putting oneself into the other’s position instead of imposing oneself and one’s values on the other were identified as key skills. Viola Robinson when referring to negotiating argued that it was important to “try to dig deeply into their minds – that’s what it’s all about.” Sue Rickards become skilled at “relying on her intuition”.

Many women emphasized the importance of learning to critically analyse and to understand the origins of problems as the precondition to change: “What we did was to educate ourselves and the people we were working with on what was really going on.” (Stella Lord). Learning occurred through a combination of experience and education in order to undertake “sharper digging into the root causes of injustice and inequality” (Liz Burge, Edith Perry’s profile). Many describe how they learned to see clearer over time when they looked at things in a “more analytical” way. “As you become a little more exposed to the outside world and a little more knowledgeable, you begin to put a finger on what’s wrong with this picture” (Edith Perry).

In the course of this process of “conscientization” (Paulo Freire), many of the women came to differentiate between discourses of “helping” or “charity” and discourses of “justice” or “fairness”. Sister Joan O’Keefe noted that how “charity” can make you “feel good”, “ justice is the hard work” as it involves systemic change. Edith Perry found that it was difficult to change policy because “the system in Canada [...] is based on the charity model, not the social justice model.” A critical understanding that injustices are deeply embedded in the systems awoke in these women a desire to contribute to social change. Mary Lou Stirling describes this “tension between helping and fairness as ‘a big paradox’ that took her decades more to fully comprehend and resolve”. She experienced discrimination in the academic environment at the University of New Brunswick. As a woman she felt the limitation of not having access to systems of knowledge that would have enabled her to defend herself against this injustice:

I put a huge amount of energy into saying “You’re not fair, you’re not fair, you’re not fair” - which was an irritation to the men. I kept a file this thick of their actions, and supported others who were being harassed as well. In retrospect, I could have accomplished just as much if not more if I’d been able to put my energy into providing an analysis of their actions as a form of systemic discrimination. But this was not a framework that was available to me then.

Many women acquired higher education degrees because they felt that more education would help them to “know their rights” and to prevent discrimination and exploitation. Education is a way to “gain a deeper understanding of the forces that were shaping our world and Canada” (Stella Lord).

A pedagogy of hope and collective action

These accounts reflect the importance of hope, determination and persistence. As Freire (2004, p. 2) notes “As an ontological need, hope needs practice in order to become historical concreteness”. “Never give up” and “there is always hope” are frequent advices given in the
stories. Stella Lord says: “There is always a glimmer of something on the other side: you focus on these things, the world doesn’t end”.

According to Stall & Stoecker, “the goal of a women-centered organizing process is ‘empowerment’” (p. 741). The stories certainly show empowerment as a key feature of community work and social activism with its emphasis on learning, personal and social relationships and networks. Solidarity, collaboration and being with “like-minded” people who share similar values and concerns gives a sense of comfort and meaning to these women: “Social activism [...] brings you together – connecting, learning, growing” (Yvonne Atwell). Many evoke the principles of “compassion”, “caring for others” and “trust”. These profiles reinforce the “common perception of women as caring and connected” (English 2005).

While aspects of collaboration, relatedness and care are emphasized in the stories, these profiles also point to how confrontation and conflict were central to their social action. As they asked questions and spoke out, thus stepping outside of traditional roles for women, they often experience challenges and resistance to their actions and thus experienced or witnessed discrimination in one way or another. Many felt the reduction of women to traditional roles by patriarchy as evident in the absence of women in politics, academia and unions, and the controlling attitudes of the Catholic Church. They spent their lives fighting against funding cuts by government authorities and city councils. They won some of the battles, but lost many others. “No matter what you decide and do, it hardly ever reaches the people who need it the most” (Kathy Sheldon). Some found it very difficult to remain engaged in social action. “It’s hard balancing social justice work with your own personal life” (Stella Lord).

Their frustrations with injustices and the slow pace of change did lead to anger. Several argued for balancing or self-control strategies: “I also have quite a good sense of humour – that’s how I channel some of my cynicism” (Stella Lord). Many stressed the importance of valuing the “small victories”, which prevents social activists from becoming frustrated. Maria Bernard says “You may fail, but you’ll learn from failure to go on and do things better.” In one of the profiles, Liz Burge writes: “Her [Shannie Duff’s] story points to the synergy between activist and opportunities as the primary dynamic of change, and to the openness to continuous learning as intrinsic to success.”

Collaboration among the women was not always easy, but instead of elaborating on such problems, principles of understanding and respecting each other are being put forward. Many mention that they have come to understand that one should “not judge others until you have walked in their shoes [...] Who are we that we should tell others how they should be?” (Carolyn McNulty)

There is a lot of reference to justice, fairness, equality, but little specific reference to racism, power, and violence. An exception is Viola Robinson who gives as one of her “lessons and advice”, the need to “establish the issue precisely: is it discrimination? Racism? Inequality? Violence?” Stella Lord is another exception: She names the “underlying structures and legacies of capitalism, patriarchy, capitalism and colonialism” as the injustices that have driven her.
Stories about “Things that matter”

Social activism is about finding meaning for one’s life; for some it is even about finding happiness: “You can expect the exhilaration and inner satisfaction of knowing you are doing the right thing [...]” (Marian Perkins). Carolyn McNulty goes even further: “If you are in any type of social work and it is not conducive to your happiness, you will not be able to help anyone.” These statements clearly indicate how “the identity claimed in the story depend[s] on certain values that go beyond the self” (Frank, 2002, p. 15). Social activism for these women is a way of making sense of one’s own life by being part of something that goes “beyond the self”. Many women say that what drives them is the desire to encourage other women to discover their true authenticity and “pursue some of the things that they want to do, and not to be tied down to the traditional roles that other people thought they should be filling” (Kathy Sheldon). Yvonne Atwell sees her role as an activist in helping women “to critically examine the dynamics of their lives” and “providing the opportunity for them to hear their own voice, and to be able to say ‘I can do this’”. Sister Angelina Martz describes her social activism as an experience which gave her “a sense of my own being that I didn’t have”.

Some of the women express their motivation to serve something “higher” or “better” than what they can find in themselves: “walking the lonely path to look for the “something that is right ethically” (Sister Dorothy Moore); “Women worked together toward a larger goal” (Betty Petterson). Carolyn McNulty believes that her community work “was her mission in life”. Some of the women have a religious background, but also others such as Yvonne Atwell refer to spirituality as one of the guiding principles of their lives as a social activist.

Every woman in her own way comes to understand the dark side of the reign of individualism through their experiences in their communities. Sue Rickards describes her disillusionment when she discovered that the ideas she had in her head about individualism (“you get what you deserve”; “if you work hard, you’ll succeed”) did not correspond to the reality she experienced in her work as a teacher in a high school in St. Lambert in Quebec: “You can work and work, but if you’re starting from a point way behind everybody else, you’re probably not going to succeed”.

Conclusion

In this paper, we have tried to show the “continuous learning” central to these women’s social activist lives and the many different sites of learning and foci including: the self-reflective learning process in terms of growing as a human being; learning about the needs of the community; learning and education in the sense of acquiring formal and academic credentials; learning in terms of the acquisition of skills that are needed to be an effective social activist; learning as an embodied, collective and collaborative experience; and the learning induced in policy makers and decision makers. Learning for these women involves “developing a more positive self-concept and self-confidence, a more critical worldview, and the cultivation of individual and collective skills and resources for social and political action.” (Stall & Stoecker, p. 741).

These are testimonies of women striving for meaning and identity as a reaction to their “disenchantment of the world” by engaging in relationships with others for “things that matter”.
The social activism of these women can be interpreted as a way of responding to the “disenchantment of the world”, a counter-reaction to the sense of meaninglessness in the face of today’s individualism. Finding an identity and authenticity by engaging with “things that matter”, these women have contributed significantly to social change in many areas including improved community services, indigenous rights, women’s rights, environmental rights and many others.

These women from different social locations lived lives of “sustained civic involvements in the instigation of collective social change” (Frank 2002, p. 111). We invite the reader to examine these stories and make their own meaning.

References:


Seamfulness: The Disruptive Pedagogy of Young Women's Depression and Implications for Adult Education

Paula Cameron
Ontario Institute for Studies in Education/University of Toronto

Abstract: Feminist adult educators call for a closer look at women's experience within adult learning. The role of emotion and the arts in fostering women's transformative learning has been identified as possible areas of inquiry. In this paper, I explore young women's "depression" as critical transformative learning. I introduce "seamfulness," a methodology that aims to take the pedagogy of depression, and women's adult learning experiences, into account. I close with a consideration of zinemaking as a possible site for women's embodied, emotional and creative adult learning.

up until my twenty-first year, i worked hard to conform to what a young rural woman should be. in the final year of my undergraduate degree, however, this delicate fiction began to tear at the seams.

after years of learning how to not take up too much space in the world, i became the embodiment of disruption.

and it was only the beginning.

Nancy Taber and Patricia Gouthro argue that "paying attention to women's experiences in adult education broadens the focus of traditional adult education research, theory, and practice" (2006, p. 58). This attention, they note, requires shifting focus to the fabric of women's lives while attending to questions of power, privilege, and inclusion. Identifying a dearth of feminist adult learning literature, Irving and English (2011) suggest several opportunities for exploration, all of which surface in this research. To this end, they posit themes such as the importance of relationships and collective transformation, the body as "the impetus and the site of learning," the role of emotions for "women who became stirred up by their circumstances," the significance of race, class and ability in women's transformative learning, and finally, the importance of the arts in supporting women's transformation (Irving & English, 2011).

Women's experiences of "depression" and other "mental illnesses" hold rich potential for theorizing power, privilege, and inclusion in relation to adult learning. Knowledge, after all, is intimately tied to trauma and loss. Largely unspoken "emotional rules" of learning and life can

11 I use these two dominant and medicalized Western terms here as a shorthand for a richly complex experience of physical, emotional, political, and spiritual grieving.
condition people to accept and internalize specific boundaries on what can be thought and felt (Zembylas, 2005).

In this paper, I will enact and describe possible ways of sharing intensely particular, yet consciously fragmented, narratives about young women's depression. Verbal and visual stories are ways of summoning such interruptions, or seams, in identities and our shared world. Through the ethical-aesthetic strategies in this piece, I will begin to write myself into the unfolding story of academic authority. By doing so, I aim challenge seamless aesthetic conventions that uphold (and obscure) "the grand narratives/myths of progress, rationalism, [and] classification" (English, 2006, p.105) and assume the educator and academic's right to remain invulnerable.

**Emotions and Learning**

The dominant Western world's denigration of emotions as a site for learning is well documented. Reason and logic take precedence over emotional and embodied ways of knowing (Lawrence, 2008), particularly in academia (Kemp & Parrish, 2010). Fortunately, a growing number of educators and theorists situate emotions at the heart of learning across the lifespan, from youth (e.g., Boler, 1999; Zembylas, 2005) to adulthood (e.g., Dirkx, 2001b; Lawrence, 2008). Within adult education, emotions are included by name in theories of transformative learning, popularly defined as "a deep, structural shift in basic premises of thought, feelings, and actions" (O'Sullivan, 2003, p.326), and an examination of how "uncritically accepted and unjust dominant ideologies are embedded in everyday situations" (Brookfield, 2000, p. 36).

_in depression, i moved closer to wordlessness, seeking distance from the labels grinding me down._

_i used my tangled hair to speak back to rules about how a woman is meant to look._

_my pajama uniform taunted the pressure to be a striving student;_

_my near-catatonic silence mocked our easy reliance on words._

More recently, adult educators have questioned modernist conceptions of transformative teaching as intervention through rational interpretation, moving toward an "alternative vision of critical transformational learning" that emphasizes "embodied, holistic, performative, intersubjective, and aesthetic aspects of learning and development" (Sandlin, Clark, & Wright, 2011, p.601) and emotional aspects of transformation (Cranton, 2006; Dirkx, 2006).

Notably, Patricia Cranton advocates for viewing transformative learning through a prism of these elements and more; for her, "[it] has to do with making meaning out of experience and questioning assumptions based on prior experience" (emphasis mine, 2006, p.8). Learning thus becomes the act of crafting meaning from embodied and emotional experience, all suspended in a web of social, geographic, cultural, and life contexts. I share Cranton's alternative vision,

---

12 My conference presentation will weave visual images throughout this text, as a way of disrupting the rational order of language.
specifically her understanding of learning and transformation as creative, tentative, emotional, fluid, non-linear, and inherently seamful processes of becoming.

**Depression as Learning**
Navigating "depression" requires engaging physical, emotional, intellectual and spiritual ways of being. People currently and/or formerly depressed are required to reconsider their assumptions, and in certain ways, build their lives anew. In this way, depression serves as a "disorienting dilemma," as defined in Mezirow's description of transformative learning (1991). However, much more than a structural process of replacing core beliefs, depression enacts a critical transformative pedagogy in which binaries are disrupted through "being radically in relation to one's self, to others, and to the world" (Ellsworth, 2005, p.2).

The embodied and emotional experience of depression sparks radical new questions regarding the nature of knowing, learning, and living itself—a radical relation that challenges structural understandings of the human learner as a self-contained, self-knowing, and masterful subject. Periods of debilitating depression can interrupt expectations for life and work, and change a person's role in her community. Life stories, and their conventional assumptions, are disrupted and often revised (Williams, 2000). Depression is therefore a powerful catalyst for critical transformative learning.

*reasons, manners, control, pride: i had to let them go.*
*there was grief, fear, guilt, and the shifting of almost everything i thought was true.*

Persistent stigma surrounding depression, what Canadian poet Hilary Clark calls "an anguish added to anguish" (2008, p.1), prevents a clear understanding of how it is lived day to day by real people. Perhaps it is not surprising that mental illness is so threatening to "business as usual" in capitalist societies. At the surface, it disrupts a steady flow of labour, bringing what is supposed to be the inner world (and body) of an individual into conflict with the goals of a family, an organization, a society, and the economy in which they are situated. Although breakdowns and healing work often unfold "behind closed doors" (for those with the luxury of shelter), they challenge the ideas that a market economy enriches life for all. As an individual and collective expression of distress, depression can provide rich ground for learning; inextricably linked to this disruptive pedagogy, however, is an additional layer of emotional, political, and "soul work" (Dirkx, 2001a) for people experiencing depression must navigate.

Depressed people draw on complex skills to navigate their suffering. Diagnosis, treatment, healing, maintenance and sensemaking are all phases of work depressed people do. People haunted by depression often have their sense of certainty shaken, if not destroyed. They dwell at the seams of illness and health, a borderland—which Gloria Anzaldúa (1987) describes as

*a vague and undetermined place created by the emotional residue of an unnatural boundary. ... Los atravesados live here: the squint-eyed, the perverse, the queer, the troublesome, the mongrel, the mulatto, the half-breed, the half dead; in short, those who cross over, pass over, or go through the confines of the “normal.” (p.25)*
The deepest knowledge of depression is unspeakable, existing more as a disruption in life as we know it; this is another reason it may be simplified or overlooked. Conventional ideas of authority and mastery assume that knowledge is a resource that can be tapped into, processed, and distributed for public consumption like any other capitalist product. Framing depression as elusive, unspeakable knowledge, then, calls dominant ideas of knowing into question.

**Seamfulness**

seam
\sēm\%
1. the joining of two pieces by sewing (usually near the edge)
2. a line left by a cut or wound
3. a weak or vulnerable area or gap
(Merriam-Webster, 2008)

New ideas require new metaphors. I call my mix of feminist poststructuralist (Davies & Davies, 2007) and arts informed methods (Knowles & Cole, 2007) seamful inquiry, or "seamfulness" (Cameron, 2011). Arising from my doctoral research on young rural Canadian women and depression, this methodology frames aesthetic choices as germane to ethical practice—a way of honoring the creative, tentative, emotional, fluid, non-linear ways of knowing that Cranton situates at the heart of transformative learning. Seamfulness means examining power at the seams of daily life, where disorienting dilemmas surface as tensions between "official" and "unofficial" sites of power, bodies and language, life stories and broader social forces. It articulates an ethical commitment to making discursive processes (at least partially) visible, tracing impersonal norms as they puncture the continuity and mastery of our bodies and life stories—including unspoken norms about gender, emotion, and sanity that disrupt the lives and bodies of people living with mental illness.

Arts-informed researchers are engaged in “efforts to map an intermediate space we can’t quite define yet, a borderland between passion and intellect, analysis and subjectivity, ethnography and autobiography, art and life” (Behar, 1996, p. 174). As arts-informed research, seamful inquiry aims to "enhance understanding of the human condition through (...) [artistic] processes and representational forms" thus becoming more accessible to diverse makers and audiences (Knowles & Cole, 2007, p.59). Arts-informed methodologies honor diverse ways of knowing, inviting wider communities to engage subject matter through minds, hearts, and bodies.

Moving beyond exclusive academic language and analysis, stories and bodies inspire embodied empathy, the imaginative capacity to see as another. As Ardra Cole and Maura McIntyre explain, the representational richness of “good” qualitative research “allows the reader/audience member to engage more fully with the work, to understand it in a more intimate way, to get as close as possible to it. (...) In this resonant space the reader attaches meaning to the work” (Cole & McIntyre, 2004, p.4). Citing Suzanne Lacy’s community–based art, for example, Garoian points out that “Seeing through another’s eyes allows for the emotional investment that social action requires. Aesthetic experience illustrates the workings of empathy because it represents the
ability to project oneself in the place of cultural forms, to absorb oneself in their dynamic content” (1999, p.149).

**Zines as Seamful Transformative Pedagogy**

As an inherently artful form, the zine genre holds rich potential for women's transformative learning in relation to "depression." Zines have been defined as “physical printed self-published creations ... independently made for the love of creating [that] rarely make a profit” (Wrekk, 2009, p.6) and “quirky, individualized booklets filled with diatribes, re-workings of pop culture iconography, and all variety of personal and political narratives” (Piepmeier, 2008, p.214). Whatever their style and subject matter, zines are linked by a shared critique of mainstream society and the media, a resistance to a flashy, seamless aesthetic, and a common “commitment to the personal” in zinemakers' lives (Sinor, 2003, p.243).

and now? now i have seen the shiny edge of reason, I know that those people who interrupt the tidy order of reason are brave storytellers of realms too many are afraid to name. storytelling, then, can be an act of compulsion, resistance, and survival: after all, to forget what is learned in the literal agony of depression is to risk drifting back in.

Zines are potent sources of learning for makers and audience. For zine readers, they create a tangible, bounded space where alternative ways of being can be expressed and experienced. This "seeing through the eyes of another" can introduce embodied nuances seldom present in stereotypical representations of stigmatized groups. For zine creators, the process of relating stories close to one's heart can generate new insight and, in certain cases, even healing.

Adult learning theorists often frame knowledge as a living process of becoming, rather than a static outcome or commodity, as in the "banking model" of education (Freire, 2002). Learning through zinemaking may unfold through physical processes of writing and illustration, or both simultaneously in layout phases in which words and images are combined. Its material engagement with multiple media, from drawings to photos to poetry, create space for "knowledge in the making," knowledge as a living process rooted firmly in "the thinking-feeling, the embodied sensation of making sense, the lived experience of our learning selves that make the thing we call knowledge" (Ellsworth, 2005, p.1).

A way of "using words differently," zines enable storytelling not normally found in mainstream corporate media. They are financially accessible, as they are typically made at low cost and either gifted, exchanged, or sold at cost. However, zines are accessible in several other ways as well, further supporting their potential as grassroots pedagogy. Zines provide space for diverse creators and readers. Creative, emotional, intuitive, and critical perspectives on a topic are enabled and encouraged. Similarly, this form is open to creators with varying degrees of artistic experience. The common use of collage enables many zinemakers to create powerful images without the time and/or technical skills required to illustrate from scratch. Verbally, zine texts are often sparse and written in the vernacular, enabling people with varying literacy abilities to participate.
Zines can also protect the dignity of their makers. Rather than immediate storytelling, this format enables makers to be simultaneously anonymous and self-revelatory. Creators have the option to conceal their identity if discussing a difficult topic. Intimate details can be shrouded in visual/verbal metaphors, or left out altogether. The delay between creation and reading provides an additional buffer around the zine creator. The maker can control the amount she shows and tells, while having the final say in aesthetic choices. In turn, her audience can read the work at her or his own pace.

Zines are often distributed internationally via formal and informal networks. These networks forge extended "virtual" communities. However, zines can spark awareness about isolated groups and individuals living among us in our neighbourhoods and communities. Rural communities in particular often lack high profile campaigns and social movements designed to combat mental health stigma. In rural Nova Scotia, where I live and work, communities may encounter unique forms of stigma surrounding mental illness, including a culture of silence around difficult topics.

For rural women survivors of depression, self-publishing can also help counteract a "culture of consumption," where women's political role in public life can often be limited to consumer. Though zines can serve as a vehicle for wider political awareness and engagement, in and of themselves they can be considered political interventions that bridge private/public space (Piepmeier, 2009). By connecting personal, lived experience and wider social practices, norms and discourses about depression, zines highlight and address the lack of women's voices in mainstream media. Taking artistic and media production into our own hands allows depressed women to pass the gift of depression forward, to engage as creators in a consumer society, and to "talk back" to mainstream accounts of women's lives and experiences.

In making and sharing zines, their creators also perform specific kinds of cultural and political work. As Piepmeier notes of third-wave feminist zines, self-publishing women's stories is a powerful act in an increasingly globalized and homogenized world. She writes,

> While global capitalism and media consolidation work to create homogenization for the sake of ever-larger markets, zines embrace the unmarketable, the local, the particular, and the quirky. (...) By offering an alternative to mainstream late-capitalist modes of operation, zines enact a public pedagogy of hope. (2009, p.20)

**Loose Ends**

Women, and particularly women of color, queer, and differently abled women, inhabit the borderlands, marginalized subjectivities in a world still economically and politically dominated by men. In public, male-dominated spheres including academia, women's experiences and perspectives tend to be framed as "aberrant," pathologized, or are absent entirely. The resilience and struggle in women's lives, particularly the lives of women survivors of "mental illness," makes seamful methods especially well suited to sharing their stories of experience.

Although, like any cultural text, zines are implicated in relations of ruling, they provide a relatively open space for women to work through unspeakable experiences. Because they privilege self-expression over perfection, these seamful booklets can convey complex and contradictory emotions. In order to contribute to social discourse, zines tell us, we don't need to
express logical, irrefutable, black and white certainties. We can hesitate; our hands can shake. We can speak from the heart.

Depression teaches by unteaching; it unsettles and eludes. Zines can help gesture toward its unspeakable knowledge as young women struggle and learn on behalf of the societies and communities around them. The zine's rough edges mirror our own. In the case of the zine, imperfections are expected guests from the beginning, rather than failed attempts at seamlessness to be swept under rugs. For zinemaking and critical transformative learning, then, imperfect, embodied knowledge is a starting point: a way of moving from chaos to art. By sharing these stories, we move the gift forward. A seamful gift that knows its own limitations: the limitations of knowing itself.

References


Davies, B. & Davies, C. (2007). Having, and being had By, “experience” or, “experience” in the social sciences after the discursive/poststructuralist turn. Qualitative Inquiry, 13(8), 1139-1159.


New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education, no.89. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.


Mediating Learning:  
An Activity Theory View of the Workplace Harassment Industry

Susan L. Carter  
Ontario Institute for Studies in Education/University of Toronto

Abstract: This paper seeks to problematize workplace harassment from the perspective of workplace learning; it is part of a larger effort to problematize the mediating role the workplace harassment industry plays in shaping workers’ experiences and in limiting the scope of workplace specific remedies by insufficiently accounting for the role of work and workplace conditions and structure in the production of harassment.

Workplace harassment has become normalized. Employers routinely budget for anti-harassment training, lawsuits, production of written and audio-visual materials, as well as resource personnel whose job it is to ‘resolve’ workplace harassment. Indeed, an entire workplace harassment industry has sprung up, creating a proliferation of policies and procedures that now exists a priori, ready to respond to workplace harassment, not if, but when, it occurs.

My broader efforts are to problematize this industry as both a site of learning and as a set of ruling relations (Smith, 2005). Problematizing the role of this industry in shaping workplace harassment - through the lens of individual, collective and work organization learning – allows us to unearth the highly contingent and variable conditions, impacts and outcomes of harassment more broadly. The impact of harassment – personally, organizationally, culturally, financially – remains an enormously important social issue in the lives of Canadians. While significant research exists on the extent, typology and impact of workplace harassment, and on the conditions that engender workplace harassment, insufficient attention has been paid to the industry itself, and to the informal learning that both harassment and the treatment of harassment engenders.

My work over the past fifteen years developing workplace harassment investigation manuals and policies, and developing as well as delivering workplace harassment materials for unions and employers, has led me to believe that if we want to ‘teach’ anti-harassment, intervene in workplace conflict, and effectively evaluate our work, we should do so from the perspective of learning, and in particular acknowledge ways in which experience and learning are mediated by the harassment industry’s ruling relations.

The main contention raised in this paper is that both work and the workplace have been given short shrift in research and policy framing of workplace harassment – in some cases disattended altogether, with significant consequences for both interventions and individual and collective learning. My broader analysis borrows from institutional ethnography insofar as it is an attempt to problematize everyday ruling relations; it takes as its starting point the experience of workers; and it attempts (however crudely) to map key texts that are activated to inform and direct experience.

13 This paper focuses on literature and policies related to that which is defined as sexual harassment; however, sexual harassment is taken by the author as understood as intrinsically linked to racialization, sexuality, and other forms of embodied difference. Where questions are raised here regarding the production of harassment and of gender, interrogations into the production of sexuality and race are equally and integrally critical.
Harassment and Learning

What do workers who deal with workplace harassment learn from the experience of the harassment and from processes designed to resolve it? How are workers’ experiences of harassment re-structured to fit policy, investigative, and resolution frames? What do we know about how workers navigate, or, in many cases, refuse to activate these frames? How do workplace anti-harassment training programs and policies/procedures reflect a particular framing of workplace harassment and how are these texts in turn activated to mediate experiences and learning of victims, perpetrators, bystanders, and intervenors?

Within the field of adult learning theory, socio-cultural theories of learning, particularly cultural historical activity theory (CHAT), offers analytical tools to surface the tensions that form the basis of individual and collective learning in every day practices. CHAT offers us the potential to provide a robust accounting of the learning involved in workplace harassment and the mediating influence of the workplace harassment industry on workers’ experiences. In CHAT terms, an activity system is defined by shared object, and occupied by multiple subject positions (it is said to be ‘multi-voiced’). From various subject standpoints, learning is mediated by the division of labour within the activity system, the rules and conventions of the activity system, the community of the activity system (however understood), and by tools in use (Engestrom, 2001). Each aspect of the activity system is understood in dialectic relationship with the others, with an emphasis on historicity. Further, the unit of analysis is multiple inter-connecting activity systems. For example, a workplace anti-harassment activity system can be understood in relationship with the workplace activity system; the collective bargaining / employee relations system; and provincial/federal labour legislation.

Examining the full range of individual, group and organizational learning that results from the filtering of emotionally charged experiences into a bureaucratic, para-legal or legal process of investigation and resolution, has the potential to provide fundamentally new insights into how everyday practice “reproduces relations of exploitation and oppression, and the extent to which it does, or can, resist and help to transcend, such relations” (Foley, 2001, p. 85).

The workplace harassment industry both includes, and draws upon, workplace harassment research. Following a very brief review and critique of theories of workplace sexual harassment, I will use the remaining section of this paper to ask preliminary questions about the mediating influence of the industry’s application of key tools (anti-harassment investigation and resolution processes, including policies of zero tolerance) on individual and collective learning.

Theories of workplace sexual harassment

Pina et al. characterize prevailing theories on the causes of workplace sexual harassment as: socio-cultural, organizational, sex-role spillover, natural/biological theory, social-cognitive, and multi-factor (2009). Socio-cultural theories of workplace harassment are based in a feminist analysis of power and patriarchy, and focus on the influence of broader social and political context. Harassment in the workplace is viewed as a logical extension and expression of gender inequality prevalent in society. To characterize the variations: masculine dominance and power out there, comes in here; harassment provides the link for enforcing the out there, in here; the workplace mirrors society and what’s out there is also in here. Where sociocultural theories fall short is in interrogating how either the activity of work - or the workplace itself as the site of
harassment - plays a part in the (re)production of workplace. Can sexism be located everywhere, but produced nowhere? Does it really seep, or creep, into the workplace from the outside? Or just act as mirror?

Organizational models of sexual harassment

focus our attention on the immediate worksite, the broader culture of the organization, and the ways that organizational norms may implicitly encourage or explicitly discourage workplace sexual harassment. One aspect of this contextual focus is on the organization’s sexual harassment policy and grievance procedures. (Dekker & Barling, 1998, p.9)

In their analysis of 108 workplace ethnographies, Lopez et al., concluded that key organizational predictors of sexual harassment are: physicality of work; the ratio of men to women and ‘guardianship’. With respect to physicality, they cite three examples – construction work, firefighting, automobile assembly - where “the defense of masculine identity and the defense of jobs become intermingled” (2009, 20). An integrated organizational sociocultural model of harassment might include a robust examination of the interplay between masculine identity and agency, workplace identity and agency, and physicality and harassment.

In male-dominated workplaces harassment functions not only to protect men’s jobs by keeping or pushing women out, but is said to also protect the maleness of jobs. Research indicates that male-dominated workplaces tend to be highly sexualized and gendered, whether or not women are present (Quinn, 2002, Lopez et al., 2009). Female dominated workplaces also tend to be sexualized and gendered. For example, nurses, airline attendants, waitstaff all have gendered components to their work (caring, service), and the work tends to be both gendered and sexualized (by uniforms, cultural expectations, sexualized-emotional labour). Again, a feminist sociocultural lens on the how work and the workplace produce ‘maleness’ and ‘femaleness’ would round out this organizational analysis.

The third major predictor of workplace harassment is ‘guardianship’ – that is, the presence of a grievance system and anti-harassment policies as key mitigating factors (Lopez et al., 2009, p.12). Both the EU’s research (1989) and a review of Canadian arbitration cases (Haiven, 2009) suggest that this is the angle of research that has received the most take up by organizations, policy makers and arbitrators, thus narrowing the lens on organizational predictors down to the question of whether or not employers develop and post clear harassment policies / procedures and anti-harassment training programs (and leaves aside questions of hiring practices, the nature of work, workplace pressures, gender ratios, as well as any interrogation into the ways that work is organized or structured).

Leaving out the work in workplace harassment?

Harassment at work is an everyday occurrence. Why then is it not interrogated more deeply by the harassment industry as a work and workplace issue? As a class issue? People do horrendous things to each other at work that, in many cases, they would not do in other situations – why not ask substantial questions about how work itself either affords, fails to constrain, contributes and even produces such egregious behaviour? What is the nature of the relationship between workplace harassment and capitalism generally and the relationship between workplace
harassment and workplace relations and processes - specifically? How (and why) is it that workplace harassment can be understood as product of society generally but not a product of the workplace specifically? How does the drive for profit intersect with harassment (for example, deliberately sexualized environments in the restaurant and gaming industries? Outsourcing of call centres to India which engender xenophobic client responses)? What, for example, might we learn about workplace harassment by studying labour processes, and vice versa? How might we consider repetitive work, lack of worker control, over-supervision, de-skilling, and working injured as factors in particular forms of harassment (i.e., juvenile horseplay)? Research into sexual harassment considers the role of masculine identity, but doesn’t adequately link forward to literature on the ‘evisceration’ of working class men and contemporary work organization (Sawchuk, 2006). What might it mean to understand some forms of harassment as gaming (Burawoy) – an albeit disturbing expression of agency, a response to alienation? This approach no more lets perpetrators off the hook than a socio-cultural explanation that rests on patriarchy does – but what it does do is re-position the role of the employer and implicates the workplace as a site of harassment (and gender) production.

Anti-harassment investigation and resolution policies

Workplace anti-harassment policies emerged as a defensive strategy (motivated by well-publicized lawsuits and by legal requirements on both unions and employers), and as a response to pressure from women’s movements. As such, policies tend to carry the hallmarks of both - a legal framework and a (limited) socio-cultural framework.

Workplace harassment policies frame harassment as “an expression of perceived power and superiority by the harasser(s) over another person, usually for reasons over which the victim has little or no control: sex, race, age, creed, colour, marital status, sexual orientation, gender identity, disability, political or religious affiliation, or place of national origin” (CAW Policy on Workplace Harassment). It is not surprising that where harassment is framed as being driven by individual attitudes of power and superiority that people bring with them into the workplace, harassment industry strategies are then aimed at curtailing individual behaviour, removing offenders from the workplace, and deterring behaviour.

Anti-harassment policies lay out divisions of labour, definitions of harassment, and protocol and procedural steps for dealing with harassment when it occurs. In a unionized environment this means that the harassment investigation proceeds as a parallel process to a grievance, and is conducted jointly by union and management (and in some cases the union side process is undertaken not by stewards, but by ‘women’s advocates’).

A joint union-management approach to investigating and resolving workplace harassment has both operational and symbolic significance. At the symbolic level, it indicates a shared framing - harassment is an ill wind that blew into the workplace from outside, in the form of individuals, and union and management are joining forces to remove it. A limited framing of workplace harassment leads to limited responses. Joint workplace policies on harassment investigation and resolution must be understood as part of the “textual architecture of routine organizational action” – the very stuff that organizes social relations (Campell & Gregor, 2002, p.24) and learning. Negotiated steps in formal harassment investigation procedures, complaint forms, legal definitions and conventions intersect /inter-text to streamline the work out of workplace harassment, and in many ways gut complaints of their situated complexities.
Harassment investigations focus on establishing guilt or innocence and are judged on a balance of probability – not ‘beyond a reasonable doubt’. One might imagine that the conditions surrounding the harassment would thus be given strong prominence in both the investigation and any resolution. However, a commitment to ‘jointness’, largely precludes systemic analysis of the worksite (i.e. labour processes, hiring practices, supervision, work organization, as intensity of supervision, workplace stress and injury, workplace design, sexualized language embedded in work practices, boredom, work pace, noise, etc.) thus severely limiting demands by workers or their unions on employers. These limitations in part account for the incidental learning that the harassment investigation/ resolution engenders in complainants, co-workers, alleged harassers, and certainly those tasked with attempting to resolve or prevent workplace harassment.

In CHAT terms, activity systems are defined by object – there is presumed shared object in a declaration of jointness between a union and an employer, and there is a presumed shared object between workers and their unions/employers as harassment is broadly understood to negatively affect workplace conditions. In the instance of harassment, complainants may also (depending on prior learning) enter the investigation resolution activity system in good faith that their goals (usually articulated as ‘wanting the harassment to stop, wanting an apology, and wanting assurance it will not happen again’) will be met and their object in the broader workplace activity system will be again be realizable.

Expansive learning (Engestrom, 2001) occurs where there is there is conflict or contradiction between expected outcomes and actual outcomes; between subjects of the central activity; between object of dominant form of central activity and other object; or between activity systems – and where these conflicts and contradictions cause people to reach for, adapt, or invent new tools. Future empirical research will help us better understand ways in which anti-harassment activity systems of investigation and resolution thus afford, or constrain, both outcomes and learning by multiple subjects (i.e., complainants, alleged harassers, bystanders and co-workers, union officials and management, individually and collectively).

Zero Tolerance

Once upon a time, feminism’s focus was on changing minds and winning converts. Increasingly, that focus has shifted to one emphasizing the use of the power of the state to force compliance with feminist goals without bothering to gain agreement. This amounts to endorsing the actions of a juggernaut we cannot control, which has consistently, over many years and many issues, shown itself much more adept at crushing lives than at dispelling ignorance (Bresnahan, 1997, p.68).

Anti-harassment statements proclaim (on the one hand) mutual respect and (on the other hand) warnings of zero tolerance of behaviour (no second chances). Zero tolerance policies limit the scope of harassment investigations to discipline, and too often shift the terrain for the union from attending to the complainant, to defending the harasser, to defending the union itself. According to Judy Haiven’s study of arbitrations related to harassment, “management tends to use the victim – and the issue of sexual harassment – to club the union” (2006, 172). Unions get caught in this quagmire, in part because manoeuvrability has shrunk to match the narrowness of the frame. Zero tolerance may result in the dismissal of a worker – but by itself this will not change a culture of gender harassment or deal with conditions that made harassment possible in the first
place, nor will it necessarily improve the working life of the complainant (and in fact, the potential for retaliation and isolation may make it worse).

Haiven (2006) points out that some arbitrators consider zero tolerance ‘lazy policy’. More meaningful harassment resolutions require substantive attempts to address some of contributing factors, as well as systemic workplace power imbalances. Without both a more holistic and a more specific understanding of workplace harassment (i.e., what is it about the nature and conditions of this work, the organization of this workplace?), we cannot have holistic or specific remedies. However, interest in this level of reform is likely greater among workers than management, whose liabilities are met, even if in revolving-door fashion, through policies of zero tolerance and other disciplinary measures.

**Anti-harassment training**

Anti-harassment training programs draw on sociocultural theories of sexual harassment and on ‘guardianship’. In addition to focusing on challenging and changing individual attitudes and clearly defining appropriate (and, more to the point, inappropriate) behaviour, curriculum focuses on familiarizing participants with the steps in an investigation process. In this way policies and training work in tandem, are mutually reinforcing in terms of framing, and contribute to reducing organizational liability.

By way of some contrast, the curriculum of workplace anti-violence programs delivered by three major Canadian unions in the health care sector demonstrate that there are distinct ideological differences between joint anti-harassment training delivered in the workplace and anti-violence training delivered solely by the union outside of work hours. Workplace harassment is positioned a problem that’s gotten into the workplace. Workplace violence is positioned as problem of the workplace. Violence is treated as a class, gender and race issue and as a workplace issue. Curriculum takes an organizational approach to the issue, and situates workplace violence as a product of the workplace (the analysis is not focused on violence in society, media, video games, etc.), and interrogates its industry-specific and workplace-specific attributes. Building an understanding of context and focusing on contributing factors supports participants as they develop action plans that include, but go beyond punishment, reconciliation, policing, and education. In training sessions with health care workers, it substantially expands the conversation regarding employer obligations and opens up potential tool use.

**Conclusion**

Workplace harassment isn’t an ill wind that blew in from the outside. It is assembled in workplaces, and any meaningful resolution needs to go beyond zero tolerance and take the full production (and location)of harassment into account.

This paper raises more questions than it answers. What’s needed now is stronger empirical research into the ways that workplace harassment policies mediate workers’ experiences (particularly workers who experience harassment), learning, action and sense of agency, and the ways that work and work practices are contributing factors in workplace harassment. A more thorough linking of feminist research with scholarship on labour process theory and alienation could also lead to a more fully developed sociocultural understanding of workplace harassment (that centres work and the workplace) which could open up new questions about agency.
subjectivity and social change for workplace learning, and could have important implications for the ways both workers and their representatives understand, participate in, navigate, and challenge the workplace harassment industry.

References

A visual discourse analysis of adult education, learning and community cultural development on public art gallery and museum websites in Canada and the United Kingdom

Darlene E. Clover, Kathy Sanford & Fatma Dogus
University of Victoria

Abstract: Using visual discourse analysis, we explored how adult education and learning and community development/outreach were portrayed on the websites of 33 major public art galleries and museums in Canada and the United Kingdom. Findings show that learning or learn are used rather than education, which seems to be confined in most cases to schools and children. The first images that come up under learn, learning or education are groups of children. Images of adults are listening to speakers or engaging in art education and the majority, despite the multi-cultural nature of the two countries, are white. There is no link made, in the majority of sites, between public programming/community development and education/learning. Inter-active learning on the websites is most often the sharing of a lecture on art although some have tweets and blogs.

According to Kroker and Kroker (2004), the 21st century is for many a life lived “in the wires” (p.1). In other words “we both inhabit and are, in turn, inhabited by the electronic world [and] while we may sometimes wish to disconnect from technology, the world of electronic communications definitely appears to be unwilling to disconnect from us” (p.9). Within this world of wired communications, Irving and English (2011) see websites as extremely important tools for agencies, organisations and institutions working for the public good because they represent their “formal online presence” (p. 5). They provide basic information such as contacts as well as convey intentionality, share purposes, missions or goals, provide organisational credibility and even accountability, or outline past and current activities.

The websites of public art galleries and museums in Canada and the United Kingdom are the focus of our study. Over the past year we have been interviewing educators and community development staff in these institutions. We became interested in the websites primarily because each time we contacted an institution, we heard what can only now be described as a mantra: “See our website.” We wanted to understand how their websites actually portrayed the adult education and community work being done both inside and outside the institution. Public art galleries and museums have been charged with elitism, exclusion, racism, sexism or irrelevance to community and their educational work has been peripheral. However, over the past decade in particular governments and society have tasked them to play more socially responsive roles. Scholars suggest education has moved to the forefront, becoming more engaging, inter-active or issue-oriented in aid of today’s complex and problematic world (Hooper-Greenhill, 2007). Having a well developed website has become a defining issue for these institutions in terms of how they now showcase their new mandates and practices to the world (Kelly, 2011). Using visual / discourse analysis, our study aimed to uncover what the websites of these major public art galleries in Canada and the UK actually tell us about their contemporary understandings and practices of adult education and community development/outreach and their place within the institution.
Literature Review

Public art galleries and museums have become prominent features of the landscape but they are not neutral. They play roles – positively or negatively - in representing or manufacturing identity, deciding what counts as knowledge and history, determining aesthetic value, and/or giving legitimacy to various relations and practices of social and cultural power (Sandell, 2002). These institutions of course began as extremely elitist and exclusionary sites. First as private collections and playgrounds for the upper classes, over the years, as they became more ‘public’, these institutions began to extend to the intellectual improvement of the working classes and uplifting “the spirits of slum dwellers” (Perry & Cunningham, 1999, p. 40). Whilst some suggest this was done with all good intentions - to help them to obtain higher wages and have more time for leisure - other see this work as ‘civilizing’, a patronizing process that does little for social change (Cunningham and Perry, 1999; Hooper-Greenhill, 2007; Janes, 2009). But the pressure to respond to the needs of a broader citizenry has mounted. Today, art galleries and museums are mandated with everything from social inclusion and citizenship building to arts education and community cultural development. This makes them important pedagogical sites “whether they like it or not” (Thompson, 2002, p. 29) and they now provide “both informal individual learning as well as structured learning activities for groups of learners” (UNESCO, 1997, p. 3). But there remains contention. Although education departments in galleries and museums in Canada and the UK were formalized in the 1970s and 80s, the role of the educator in these institutions remains ill defined. Moreover, confusion swirls around definitions of education, how it should be carried out and whether or not education and learning are (and should be) part of community development outreach strategies (Hooper-Greenfield, 2007; Styles, 2002). In their study in 2003, Anderson, Gray and Chadwick (2003) found that most institutions (in Europe) continued to make little special provision for ‘adult’ education. Yet later studies by scholars such as Kelly (2010) and Grenier (2008) argue there has been a major shift towards better supporting visitors’ learning and active engagement, coming from new visions of education and learning and resulting in a plethora of exciting new on-line and face-to-face activities. We have found, however, that this is all somewhat hit and miss (Clover, Sanford & Dogus, 2011). What is clearer is a shift in rhetoric from ‘education’ to ‘learning’. Some believe this is an important move because education was “too restrictive and misleading...[so] there has been a conscious shift toward language such as ‘learning’ (learner over teacher), ‘experience’ (open-endedness of outcome) and ‘meaning-making’ (interpretation)” (Roberts, 1997, p. 8). Others, however, are concerned this ‘shopping market’ approach will not only individualize learning but also validate any and all interpretations of art no matter how problematic (Grek, 2009). A new and extremely important instrument these institutions use to further their work is their websites. Kelly (2011) argues that these have been designed to re-shape the image of institutions, create knowledge, educate, inform and attract more visitors/learners as they reach out beyond the gallery walls -- this is where our study begins.

Context, methodology and methods

Our cross-national study responds to the question of how major public art galleries and museums in Canada and the UK portray themselves and their new mandates for adult education and community cultural development through their websites. Canada and the UK still have relatively robust ‘public’ arts and cultural institutions and practices. Problematically, however, both countries are steeped in neoliberal ideology that continues to escalate social, economic, and cultural inequalities and injustices, the implications of which neither has fully absorbed. This
threatens the health and welfare of all public institutions; however, the arts are always the most expendable in a world that deifies technology and science. A major difference between Canadian and British art galleries and museums is that in the UK, culture is now seen as a national treasure and therefore institutions in this country are supported by the taxpayers and have mostly free admission to the collections. The taxpayer also supports public arts institutions in Canada, but culture has a lower priority and therefore visitors pay an admission fee for the right to view their own heritage. However, art galleries and museums in both countries also receive private funding from wealthy individuals and from corporations and have Boards of Directors and members to whom they must answer. This public-private dance to which these institutions have been invited has both potential and challenges.

Our study employed visual discourse analysis to explore the language, ideas, philosophies, and images on the websites. Language and images -- like the institutions under study here -- are not neutral but rather contain meanings, which display a multitude of realities (Walliman, 2006; Rose, 2001). To Fairclough (2001), discourse analysis guides the researcher to analyze texts to “discern connections between language and other elements... which are often opaque” (p. 230). It is a process of analysis aimed at how people communicate through language -- orally or through written texts - in social and/or institutional settings. But on websites, as in many other places, images and text live in intimate relation to one another and therefore, a depiction is never simply an illustration but also, a representation (Rose, 2001). Visual discourse analysis uncovers how words and images work together to effect “the social construction of difference and authority” and how different views or accounts of something are shown through a medium, in our case, the website (Kurtz, 2004, p.81).

The questions we used for analysis focused on the how the words education and learning were used, their mention or use in the overall visions/mission statement of the institution, the types of educational programming displayed and their emphases, connections made between adult education/learning and community cultural development/outreach, how the images worked to convey meaning, identifications of the ‘educators’, as well as the inter-activeness and accessibility of the site. As this is a cross-national study, we also wanted to explore the differences between the Canadian and the UK sites. Cross-national comparative social research “is highly relevant [because] countries are growing more interdependent, and the policy challenges they face are similar, although often the responses to these challenges vary greatly” (Harris, 2007, p. 2), as we will show is the case with the institutions under study.

We identified 30 large, public, urban, nationally or regional/provincially focussed, and non-themed institutions across Canada and the UK (e.g. National Gallery, London, Art Gallery of Ontario, Toronto). We focussed on urban sites because the institutions are more frequented and we excluded themed institutions as well as institutions that had neither an education nor a learning/learn section on their webpage. The former were excluded because their mandate is by nature social-justice and educationally oriented, and the latter because education was not a focus of the institution. These institutions of course need attention and speak volumes and they will be taken up later in our three-year study. Each website was visited extensively and information was categorized using the above questions and compiled onto an excel spread chart. Researchers individually perused the data then met to analyse understandings and interpretations of the images and texts.
Findings and implications

Today, websites are often the first point of contact someone has with an institution and therefore, one should assume they provide an accurate vision of what the organization values and does (Irving and English, 2011). There were a number of complex differences yet similarities between the Canadian and UK websites around ‘adults’ and ‘education’ as well as inside/outside, which makes them difficult to categorize succinctly. Although not across the board, on most websites in Canada the educational emphasis was on children, teachers and schools rather than on adult education. On a generous note, this emphasis illustrates an important mandate to connect young people to, with and through art and therefore, fills a vacuum being created by funding cuts to the arts in schools (Smithrim & Upitis, 2005). Perhaps they will become strong advocates for the arts in the future as a result? However, more likely, this emphasis on schools has to do with economics since school districts pay to send large groups of students to visit the institutions -- an interesting public form of funding! But it also speaks to the lack of interest by the Canadian government on adult education unless it is linked to skills training for the market (Fenwick, Nesbit & Spencer, 2009), which is not listed on websites as the mandate of these institutions. The second most predominant educational focus on the Canadian websites is ‘family’, meaning nonformal activities that revolve around children’s interests. UK websites also always have a focus on family, children and school/teacher activities and programmes, but there is an equal emphasis on adult activities. In both countries, there are a number of activities for adults: art-making workshops, lectures, talks and guided tours. Art making, art appreciation and history are always the majority of the learning opportunities, but there is also an emphasis on the development of cultural identity and social inclusion we will return to shortly. The images that accompany ‘learning’ are almost always children creating art or adults reflecting on a painting or listening to someone speak about a painting. The websites show the UK has many more long-term courses, often connected to universities, than does Canada, but this speaks to greater community connections that can be seen on the UK websites, although these are seldom, as we discuss in more detail below, linked to education or learning.

On the majority of sites in both countries the main icon on the webpage is titled ‘Learning’ or ‘Learn’ rather than education. When used, however, throughout the sites, the terms education and learning are used interchangeably. Upon closer inspection, ‘education’, when in relations to adults, refers to formal talks, lectures, symposia and the like ‘inside’ the institution. Public programming or events are the terms used for community activities, with little connection to education and learning. Learning seems to imply what ‘people do’ when in the institution. There is clearly, as Roberts (2007) noted, a belief that the term and idea of education is formal, didactic and expert-driven – something ‘done’ to people. But language is also political. While the concept of learning is important and laudable, it conjures up notions of ‘government speak and ‘individuality’. It also often lacks the political/social intentionality of adult education. Linked to this, seldom are those who deliver educational programmes referred to as ‘educators’ on the websites. Rather, they are artists, curators, critics, academics and volunteers (sometimes the American term ‘docent’ is used on the Canadian sites but only in the western provinces). This supports findings from our interviews that most gallery or museum staff has no degree (or training) in adult (or any) education and may also account for different uses and purposes of language.

In Canada mission statements focus predominantly on emphasizing that “art matters” and creating a sense, as noted above, of civic cultural pride and unity. Of course, as noted above, you do not get to experience this physically without paying an admission fee. Paradoxically, whilst
class is less an explicit issue in Canada than the UK, there are serious class implications in the ‘price’ of admission. However, these uses of language in the mission statements simultaneously defy contemporary neo-liberal assaults on the arts yet support age-old mandates to build a particular kind of nationhood. In few cases were “the advancement of knowledge” or “learning”, as they were in the UK, mentioned in the mission statements in Canada and oftentimes if they were, they were linked to leisure and entertainment. In the UK, the emphasis in mission statements was also on art appreciation and leisure, although the term education was used more often. Like Canada, creating a greater nationalism and social inclusion was front and centre, although paradoxically, seldom mentioned in the education – sorry, ‘learning’ - work buried inside the website. Interestingly, however, some of the art galleries in the UK have ESL classes and these are labelled as a way to respond to ‘citizenship’ and ‘social inclusion’ mandates.

In both countries, although there were a great deal more of these outlined on the UK websites, activities that involved community and took place ‘outside’ (not always physically but certainly, metaphorically) were seldom if ever identified as ‘educational’ or even placed in connection to education or learning although there were exceptions where under the major link called Learning, the term ‘community’ could sometimes be found. But descriptions of community activities we not discussed as educational. As noted, these activities were referred to as ‘community’ rather than community development or community engagement. We cannot account for why this is so except to say that sometimes, the activities under ‘community’ were artists engaging in the making of ‘public artworks’ with or in community settings. The organisations the art galleries and museums seem to have the most connection to are those focussing on mental health or seniors, although archives also show connections to Chinese and Bangladeshi (England) and Jewish and homeless (Canada) communities.

From our examination, interactive website learning seemed to mean being able to listen to lectures on artworks or to take virtual walks though a gallery. One some, there are places to tweet and others send out blogs. These were, however, limited and without excellent broadband access or connection, these are quite inaccessible as they take a great deal of time to download. Dare we connect this to class?

Finally, in both countries, all education inside the galleries and museums revolves around the collections. In the UK, however, they seem to have a sharper critical social edge. For example, a series of talks hosted at Tate Modern focused on how society creates “the other” as portrayed through Gauguin’s paintings. The image connected to this on the website was a large audience of mostly white, middle class women watching images on a large screen while listening to a speaker. This reinforces notions of elitism and exclusion (admission was charged for the talks). In fact, the majority of images of adults on the websites in both countries were of white people making or appreciating art. This stood in contrast to the portrayal of groups of school children who were, depending on location, often reflective of the multicultural societies. But, in connection to the Tate series, it is important to ponder what other anti-racist adult education activity could reach this particular audience? The websites, as reflections of the programmes, policies, and practices of these particular institutions, still represent dominant hegemonic cultural worldviews, but there are a few instances of alternative perspectives and voices being included. Through this initial textual and visual analysis, we recognize that there is much more work to be done.
References


A Study of Informal Learning in a Community-Based Health Education Program: The Transformative Experience of One Inter-Disciplinary Health Care Team.

Maureen Coady
Saint Francis Xavier University

Abstract: This paper examines the informal learning of an interdisciplinary health care team as facilitators of a 12-week community-based cardiac education/rehabilitation program over 2 years. Significant learning and unlearning is apparent as the team negotiated working collaboratively and facilitating group learning in diverse community settings. The study reveals transformative learning associated with dialogue and critical reflection that helped the team navigate the areas where health and learning overlap, and to learn informally and continuously in and from their practice.

Introduction
Health professionals are increasingly being encouraged to learn how to work in collaborative teams, in order to ensure that people have access to holistic and comprehensive care. The role of the health care team is to understand the whole person, and to support them in making decisions about how best to address their health needs. Working as a collaborative team involves the integration of the clinical knowledge of all team members and balancing an emphasis on clinical expertise, with a focus on enabling people as competent managers of their health and health problems (Pringle, Levitt, Horsburgh, Wilson & Whittaker, 2000). Learning to become a collaborative practitioner, therefore, is a complex and longer-term process involving significant learning and change for health professionals. Barriers to professional learning in this context include the biomedical training of many health professionals, which has not oriented them to these interactive and participatory concepts and ideals (Daley, 2006; Hill, 2011; Rifkin & Ratna, 2007; Tones & Tilford, 2001).

This emphasis on learning to work collaboratively extends beyond clinical practice and settings to health care teams working in communities to educate people about their health. They too are challenged to work in teams outside of their normal clinical boundaries in an educational role. They may have little training or a history of working collaboratively or with groups in community settings, and while their role often includes education, most health professionals lack information about adult learning and appropriate curriculum design (Bryan, Kreuter & Ross, 2009; Daley, 2006; Hill, 2011; Stuttaford & Coe, 2007). As a result, they must learn about collaboration, but also curriculum design and adult learning processes appropriate to groups and community settings.

This paper examines how a team of health professionals approached and navigated these professional learning challenges. Specifically, the paper reports the informal learning of an interdisciplinary health care team as facilitators of a 12-week, multi-site “Community Cardiovascular Hearts in Motion” (CCHIM) program, over a 2-year period. The paper highlights informal learning realized across repeated implementations of the CCHIM program. Significant learning and unlearning is highlighted in the team member’s accounts, and transformative learning is also reported here. The paper does not focus on the complex, and often formalized,
process of developing collaborative competencies. Rather, the specific focus here is the early informal and sometimes transformative learning of the health team in their role as educators, beginning to navigate collaboration, and an educational role and community context unfamiliar to them.

**Background and Methods**
The Community Cardiovascular Hearts In Motion (CCHIM) is a cardiac health education/rehabilitation program, operating in Nova Scotia. The program is made available to referred cardiac patients, having experienced, or at high risk of a cardiac event. It is a group program (15-20 participants) that is community-based, and available two full days a week for 12 weeks. This research explores the implementation of the CCHIM in one health district. At the time this research was undertaken, the CCHIM program been offered in 12 rural communities in the health district. The interdisciplinary team facilitating the individual and group learning in the program comprised a nurse, cardiac nurse practitioner, nutritionist, physiotherapist and a part-time health motivator. Their early learning and experience in facilitating the CCHIM program is the focus of this study.

The study methodology was a basic qualitative inquiry into the views of the interdisciplinary health care team on their professional learning in the first 2 years of facilitating the CCHIM program. The data collection methods included a single semi-structured group interview and two semi-structured individual interviews. Three of the five team members participated in a single group interview; the remaining two team members were interviewed individually because of scheduling conflicts. A thematic analysis of the data is being used, although this process is not yet complete. The findings shared here are preliminary.

**Team Learning**
Informal learning is learning that occurs as a result of individuals making sense of the experiences they encounter in their daily lives (Livingstone, 2005). In this research the ‘daily lives’ of the health care team constituted their experience of facilitating the CCHIM program. For this research, they were asked to critically reflect on their professional learning while facilitating the CCHIM. An early analysis reveals informal learning related to collaboration and teamwork, facilitating adult learning and curriculum design, cultural competency (working with diverse populations), and reflective practice. They used dialogue and critical reflection to evaluate and deepen their learning in order to improve their practice. In this paper I discuss their informal learning related to each of these themes. Discussion of transformative learning – learning that transforms one’s worldview (Mezirow, 2009), is incorporated into this discussion of informal learning.

**Learning Collaboration**
All of the members of the CCHIM facilitation team were experienced clinicians, knowledgeable in individualized clinical teaching, primarily, but not exclusively, in hospital settings. They indicated a desire for change in their professional practice, and an interest in a more holistic approach to practice, motivated them to join the CCHIM team. For example, Susan, (team nutritionist/dietician) envisioned the CCHIM as an opportunity to work in a way that was more consistent with her professional beliefs and values:
I see health as having many dimensions, but I work in the nutrition side of things, which is just one aspect related to heart disease, and so I was attracted to the idea of working as a collaborator in a more integrated approach, and I envisioned we could actually have more of an impact if we actually addressed all aspects of a person’s response to a heart attack, and to be able to see the results of that kind of an approach first-hand. I thought that would be very rewarding, and it has been.

However, retrospectively most team members reported a naïveté associated with their early enthusiasm and knowledge of team collaboration. They reported initial unanticipated tension among team members, as they attempted to re-orient themselves to work collaboratively and in a team. Retrospectively they linked this unease with challenges of sharing power and decision-making. As Mary (team physiotherapist) points out, learning to work collaboratively, and as a team, challenged her clinical and professional values:

We are all taught to lead, and so we tend to value our own clinical expertise over others in that process, and here my professional expertise was only one part of the overall picture, so there was this sense of losing power initially, and then acceptance, and learning to value other people’s clinical expertise, and in some cases letting others lead. Patsy (cardiac nurse practitioner), for example, was the only one who had worked in cardiac care, so by times it was important for her to lead.

However, Bill (health motivator) describes, that a readiness to work in new ways helped the team navigate and reposition themselves and to learn collaboration and teamwork.

We are trained to be outcomes focused, so we were open to new ideas that would enable us to actually move people along the sickness spectrum towards wellness. It was an environment that required us to go beyond our clinical expertise to support people towards the program goals. So, it was a bumpy transition … trying to figure out what working together looked like, and to find our individual place in all of that, but in the end there was a strong collective will that developed to solve problems, in the end it just takes will if people decide they want to work together.

Transformative learning was apparent in descriptions of coming to understand collaboration, and realizing its benefits and efficiencies in the team’s day-to-day practice. Jane (team nurse), describes her own experience of coming to know the meaning of collaboration, and the transformative impact of that insight:

I think the fact that we were all here in the same room working together to help. If I noticed someone should follow up with Susan, I would say catch her by the end of the day, and if someone else needs a medication clarification they could see me, and so we learned that collaboration meant our scope of practice should overlap. It was kind of an intuitive process in the end where we came to know the potential of other team members in any given situation. Over time we learned that collaboration was about trust and respect and just trying to do the best for the people. My entire outlook on practice has shifted with that understanding.
Patsy (cardiac nurse practitioner) describes that learning collaboration enabled her and others to expand their thinking and transform their professional perspective:

You don’t think of it when you are working in a hospital with others, and where everything is based on power and protocol. Working as a team outside of that environment the rules weren’t so clear, so we could be really creative and use our imaginations, and there was this synergy working with others where you could experiment, and we learned to think more expansively and about a more integrated approach, and I think we have all realized the limitations of our earlier clinical boxes.

These experiences highlight the CCHIM team members as a ‘community of knowers’ constructing knowledge and creating conditions under which collaboration and teamwork could occur. Trust and care were central to developing collaborative team relationships. In these safe spaces team members reported being able to re-envision and reinvent themselves as part of a collaborate team. According to Taylor (2000b), “a trusting environment for learning, and promoting autonomy and collaboration are ideal conditions for fostering transformative learning” (p. 5).

**Learning Group Facilitation and Curriculum Design**

The CCHIM program provided participants with access to education related to heart health, nutrition, and physical activity, and access to exercise programs and pharmacotherapy, when needed. The health care team brought this professional knowledge, and some experience in one-to-one clinical teaching, but they had no formal training in adult education, or experience facilitating group learning in community settings. Facilitating the CCHIM program, therefore, represented a significant learning opportunity and challenge for team members.

Some training in patient-centered care and self-management approaches helped shape the team’s planning and facilitation style. These approaches are based on a philosophy that individuals living with a chronic disease have the knowledge, skills, judgment, and ability to be an expert in the management of their own health and wellness (Edwards et al., 2000). This training emphasized CCHIM participants taking ownership of their learning (Merriam, Cafarella & Baumgarter, 2007); the role of the team was to help them to set realistic goals, and to support them in their efforts to reach their goals.

While team members reported valuing this training, many reported feeling challenged to put these participatory ideals into practice. Retrospectively they linked their unease with shifting power differentials. For example, Jane (team nurse) describes how she came to understand the limits of her previous “power-over” and behaviorist orientation; she describes her struggle to learn how to work in a more empowering and person-centered way, and the transformative impact of this shift:

The whole thing was a big shift for me, liberating but difficult probably for most of us in our practice habits, you are usually the person who has what they need, and so telling them what they need to know or do … so it felt like you had no control when you couldn’t do that. But, gradually I realized people need time to be ready to change and I
can’t control that, so now I position myself differently and work first with those who are ready, and try to provide encouragement to the others until they are ready.

In adopting a learner-centered facilitation style, team members reported realizing many new insights about adult learning, and facilitating individual and group learning that they were able to incorporate into the design of the CCHIM program. Here I draw out three examples that demonstrate new insights in this area, and explanations of how they were accommodated into the learning activities and CCHIM curriculum. For example, at an individual level, Patsy (cardiac nurse practitioner) identifies learning the importance of developing appropriate instructional strategies, in response to different learning styles and preferences:

Some people wanted lots of information but for others less was better … they didn’t want things written down, but preferred the verbal instruction or visual aids. I could even see a difference in their learning when I would stop from using a power point screen to just an informal circle and discussing with them with a flip chart… I think we have moved, 80 per cent of our stuff now is around a circle. You had to get a sense of what worked and what didn’t with them, and that was always different … different from one person to another, and one group to another. If I looked at the materials I used now versus back to day 1 they are completely different. I think they are better and the participants’ make them better.

Bill (health motivator) reinforces the need for a variety of learning strategies and formats. Here he describes learning that small group formats fostered co-learning and meaning making, and access to social support:

You see them learning from each other too, the dialogue, the interactions that go back and forth between them, and you realize that is where change occurs…its like value added to our teaching… so over time we tried to orchestrate situations like that … they were having fun with it, and supporting one another and reframing their thoughts at the same time. I realized there was much more to this than the content we were delivering.

In a health context, social support is recognized to play a key role in a decision to change health related behaviors (Baumgartner, 2011).

Emotion is integral to living with a chronic disease. Here Jane (team nurse) acknowledges the emotional and spiritual dimensions of adult learning and how they learned to accommodate these dimensions in the CCHIM program:

We saw repeatedly that change was very threatening and that people have strong emotional responses to the need for change – shame, anger, fear, and defensiveness, particularly in the early stages of the program. So we needed to be accepting of that, and we created spaces where that could be acknowledged and supported.

According to English and Tisdell (2010) it is these emotional and spiritual dimensions of learning that enable adults to learn alternate and varied ways of being, and to acquire new insights about themselves.
Learning Cultural Competency

The team members also reported learning to be more culturally sensitive, as they moved from one community to another with the CCHIM program. Cultural competency is the application of cultural knowledge behaviors and interpersonal and clinical skills that enhances a provider’s effectiveness in managing patient care (American Medical Association as cited in Zieghan & Ton, 2011, p. 57). The team learned that individuals and communities often have distinctively different beliefs and values around illness. As Mary (physiotherapist) suggests, over repeated implementations of the CCHIM program, the team learned that familiarity with the local context and culture was important and enhanced learning in the program.

We learned that one size doesn’t fit all. You get more of a sense of this outside the facilities. The heritage here is predominantly Acadian, Scottish and Irish, and the demographics are very different from one community to another … we learned we needed to bring context into the discussion so people are actually able to think about health in relation to that reality, and their social circumstances. We were either quite familiar with the community, or made a point to know more before we went in, and it seemed that participants appreciated and responded to that.

Learning Reflective Practices

A reflective capacity is regarded as an essential characteristic for maintaining professional competency across a lifetime (Kinsella, 2009). Nowhere is this more important than in the ever-changing context of healthcare where health professionals must continually refresh and update their knowledge and skills in order to solve complex health care problems. Yet, while ‘reflective practice’ is recognized as a process for professional learning, it is not widely practiced in the health professions (Mann, Gordon & MacLeod, 2009). However, in the CCHIM, the team recognized their reflective capacity as a vehicle on-going professional learning in the program, and repeated implementations of the program enabled them to critically reflect on their practice, and to use their learning to continually refine and adapt their approach in order to foster learning success in the program. Their experience in these processes transformed their understanding of reflective practice. For example Mary (team physiotherapist) describes her emergent understanding and its transformative impact.

You talk about it [reflective practice] in your training, but its not really emphasized that much. It was essential here though, if we were going to figure out how to work together. So it was about having a deliberate conversation, taking the time to get to the root of things, why something didn’t work, and how we might change our approaches, and then we could test it out with the next group, and it became a way to evaluate and improve our work. We all learned to stretch ourselves, but it was fruitful, and we learned that we could solve almost any problem we came across, and that really inspires me because it gives me some idea of my own potential.

Significance and Implications

The study reinforces informal learning and reflection as highly compatible processes that support professional learning and the development of adaptive capacities, which can enable health
professionals to respond to new professional practice demands. These preliminary study findings reinforce the potential to embed informal interaction and reflection processes into more formalized efforts to foster professional learning and change. The completed research will be of interest to health care managers and interdisciplinary teams navigating professional learning and change in this context, and to adult and health educators researching and supporting professional learning and change in health contexts.

References


Reflections on the Self: Learning, Engagement and Redirection through Volunteering

Suzanne L. Cook
Ontario Institute for Studies in Education/University of Toronto and Rotman Research Institute

Abstract: This study examines the experiences of retirees who volunteer with nonprofit organizations and their self-reflective learning as they construct a new sense of self after their work self ends through retirement from their work role. Findings indicate that retirees gained self renewal, fulfillment, personal growth and a sense of self worth from their volunteer role. Their career self-concept is impacted by the job loss and needs to be redefined. It is reconstructed through volunteering. Retirees underwent a process where they constructed a new sense of self through their experiences. I call this “Redirection”.

As the huge Baby Boomer cohort approaches retirement, they will be looking for what comes next. The Canadian Survey of Giving, Volunteering and Participating indicates that 40% of adults age 55 to 64 and 36% of adults age 65 plus volunteer (Hall, Lasby, Ayer & Gibbons, 2009). However, the end of work life creates challenges of identity, particularly for those who enjoyed their paid work.

This paper draws on my mixed methods doctoral study which examined the experiences of retirees who volunteer with nonprofit organizations. The purpose of this paper is to examine retirees’ self-reflective learning as they construct a new sense of self after their work self ends and they transition into retirement. This stage of life is a critical life milestone (Holmes & Rahe, 1967). With the ending of their work role, there is an opportunity for growth, development, transformation and empowerment. This study explores how this process occurs through the context of volunteering.

Some previous research has examined retirement and later life pursuits. Steer (1973) found retirement activities that were similar to those in pre-retirement work were associated with higher levels of satisfaction and said that this higher satisfaction may stem from participation in activities that are congruent with self-concept. Teuscher (2010) found that retirement from a professional role did not lead to a loss of professional identity; however, higher professional status was positively related to the importance of profession for self-identity. Reites & Mutran (2006) found that preretirement worker identities had a positive influence on retirement adjustment and on self-esteem for men and women. In their qualitative case study on later life creative leisure occupational identity, Howie, Coulter and Feldman (2004) found that self reflection and the opportunity to consider the sense of self through activity was very important for identity.

This study uses and integrates career development and learning frameworks. I use Donald Super’s life-span, life-space theory of career development to examine career self-concept and how this develops across the life course (Super, Savickas & Super, 1996). Career self-concept is the part of self that is derived from work or occupation. The last stage of this theory is the disengagement stage where individuals anticipate retirement and plan for it. This theory has
often been used to assist with the choice of career or occupation among younger adults (Osborne, Brown, Niles & Miner, 1997). The five stages within this theory are: Growth, Exploration, Establishment, Maintenance and Disengagement. I wondered if there was another stage during the second half of life for individuals who remain active in the community and use their skills, abilities and knowledge in volunteer activities. I also wondered what happens to career self-concept when paid work ends.

Peter Jarvis’s (2009) theory of human learning is also important and useful to this investigation. Jarvis discusses how individuals learn from primary experience. Individuals learn in a social situation and this learning is transformed and integrated into the individual’s biography. It results in a continually changing individual as self-learning occurs. Learning is also a process that occurs throughout life from our experiences and interactions with the world. Similar to Super et al (1996), Jarvis describes his theory as an integration of psychological and sociological factors. This theory speaks to the interaction of the worker and volunteer role as well as the cognitive thoughts and reflections of the individual.

Methodology
This study employed a developmental mixed methods research design with 2 phases, combining a survey with in-depth interviews (Brewer & Hunter, 2006; Creswell, 1998; Creswell & Plano Clark, 2007; Greene & Caracelli, 1997). In Phase 1, qualitative interviews were conducted with 12 participants to better understand retirees’ volunteer experiences. Snowball sampling was used and the semi structured interviews helped to develop the Phase 2 survey. Survey respondents were between 55 and 75 years of age, volunteered at least 3 hours per week and had retired during the last 10 years. Survey results are reported in this paper. The Phase 2 survey included closed and open-ended questions. For Phase 2, access to potential respondents was facilitated through nonprofit organizations including those affiliated with a volunteer bureau that was part of Volunteer Canada and those connected with the social economy research centres across Canada. Fifty-seven percent of respondents were women and 43% were men. Respondents had a mean age of 64. Most respondents were highly educated: 66% had university degree and 14% had a college diploma. Eight percent identified themselves as members of diverse ethno-cultural groups, and many volunteered with more than one organization.

The survey questions examined many topics such as respondents’ volunteer experiences as well as their sense of self, their personal learning goals for their volunteer activities, any issues they encountered during their transition to retirement, and the transformation of their career self-concept. Respondents were also asked why they chose their volunteer activities. Some specific questions included: “How would you have answered the question ‘Who am I?’ during the year before you retired?” and “What was most difficult for you during the retirement role transition?”

The case study interviews were examined for trends and themes. The open-ended questions on the survey were examined in a similar manner. Finally, frequencies were tabulated for the survey questionnaire responses.

Findings
This study indicates that retirees who volunteer want an active, engaged retirement. They want to contribute to their community and to society. The volunteer activities that they have found and
chosen seem to provide a lot of meaning and life fulfillment. When respondents were asked what had most contributed to their choice of volunteer activities, approximately 43% stated that contributing to the community and to society had influenced their choice and 20% said that a desire to be active and engaged had influenced their selection of volunteer activities. One respondent commented: “I think I most wanted to give back to my community and I chose two areas [for volunteering] that were important to me.” (Female, Age 71).

The respondents were forced to redefine themselves as their former work role is ending or has ended. Their transition to a new role pushes them to see themselves differently as their work role ends. The changes that they experienced within their identity were described by some of them and this is evident in the following quotes:

I really felt that I had lost my identity. My profession gave me my identity. Once I stopped working I truly wondered who I was. I was shocked by this as I didn’t know that it would happen. I wish I had been warned but in retrospect, perhaps a warning wouldn’t have been sufficient.... (Female, Age 68)

It is difficult to realize that you are no longer needed and feel that, in some instances you have nothing to offer anymore. Volunteering at the Habitat for Humanity Restore... gave me a new outlook and a purpose. I enjoyed working there and was looked up to for my abilities and knowledge to help in the merchandising of products in the Restore. Also the interaction with shoppers was an added bonus to being there and helping them with their selection of products for their use. (Male, Age 72)

During the year before I retired I was aware that I was transitioning to a new phase of my life and I was worried about not being busy, not doing enough, being forgotten and looking at life instead of contributing to it. I am driven, detail oriented and therefore a bit of a workaholic.” (Female, Age 55)

In the first few years of being retired, I did experience a loss of “identity”. I had taken an early retirement and missed my colleagues and the cerebral stimulation very much…. (Female, Age 71)

One respondent spoke about the “[b]itterness over being "downsized"... packaged out of the organization. [The l]oss of peer group at work. Loss of identity, ‘I am....’ (Male, Age 62).

Some volunteers spoke about how they had become “full time volunteers”. One said that the volunteer work that she does resonates with her because it “creates an identity for me” (Female, Age 59). Other respondents described how a new me emerged from this transition to retirement and the new experiences that this brings. One stated that the most difficult part of the transition was “[c]hanging from a work oriented identity to just plain me” (Male, Age 67). Some respondents spoke about a new me that emerged:

I found it hard to give up the structure of my organized life and to give up my title and reputation in the work place. My career was a big part of my happiness, but I have come to realize it was what I did, not who I was. I am finding a new order and a new routine in retirement and am able to participate in so many new and
exciting experiences in life….and to "just be" is a new joy in my life. The old me had to be achieving or accomplishing at work or at home to be happy. The new me can just listen to music, go for a walk or read a good book to be happy. (Female, Age 60)

For many of us our identity during the working years came from our family and our jobs. With retirement we lost that bit around the jobs and volunteering helped to fill the gap. But as time progressed the gap disappeared and our identity came more to rest as just plain "me". I find it surprising to some extent that in conversation with new people I meet I very seldom ever refer to my retired profession of social work (Male, Age 67)

Respondents indicated that they had many learning experiences through their volunteer activities. One theme that emerged from the study was that of self reflection and personal growth that occurs through volunteering. One respondent articulated this well when she said: "I believe that I have grown as a person in the past decade - in my knowledge of self and others and because of circumstances "given" to me.” (Female, Age 63)

Discussion
Many adults age 55 and over volunteer within their community. Many respondents in this study said they wanted to give back to their community. They also stated that they chose volunteer activities in order to be active and engaged. Volunteering provides self esteem and new social roles. In addition, their volunteer activities provided these retirees with meaning and fulfillment in life. These findings may relate to those found by Steer (1973) in that retirement activities which provide elements similar to paid work, such as structure and a feeling of contributing, lead to higher levels of life satisfaction.

The sense of self, self-concept and identity were big themes in this study. The respondents were forced to redefine themselves and many spoke about losing their identity and needing to find a new one. They reflected on retirement and their experience of retiring and a few mentioned that they had become a “full time volunteer.” They described the enjoyment and fulfillment that they received from their volunteer roles. The respondents seem to have found a new direction through volunteering. I view this as a new stage within life-span, life-space career development theory, and I have labelled this stage “Redirection”. Redirection involves the transference of career self-concept where individuals redefine themselves, find renewal through their volunteer activities and integrate and cultivate a new sense of self.

Jarvis (2009) states individuals learn from experience and that the individual is constantly changing as he or she learns. There is an interplay of the social and the psychological. This study indicates that the worker, retiree and volunteer role interact as a new sense of self emerges. Self reflection and interaction are critical to this process. This is the case in this study. Respondents described the high level of self esteem and self worth that they derived from their volunteer roles. They felt valued in the community and the broader society. They felt competent because of the participation and contribution through social roles. Respondents were transformed through a psychological process of self reflection on their worker, retiree and volunteer roles.
Most of the respondents were highly educated and this may have influenced the results. For these respondents, their sense of self seemed to be very connected to their previous occupations and this may be because higher education can equate with higher status positions. If this is the case, respondents may have more resources to assist them with the adjustment to their retirement and more choice of activities (Tennant, 2009). Alternatively, the loss of status with retirement may make this transition more psychologically and socially difficult for them. Volunteering could become a very important activity that fulfills their career self-concept needs.

Conclusions
Retirees enhanced their sense of self and gained fulfillment, personal growth and self worth from their volunteer roles. They underwent a process where they constructed a new social identity and developed a strong sense of self (Jarvis, 2009; Tennant, 2009) through their experiences. They were able to integrate elements of their paid work, retiree and volunteer roles into a new sense of self. The social role of volunteering helped them through this process of career self-concept development. I call this new stage of life-span, life-space career development “Redirection”.

Implications for adult education theory and practice
The development and transformation of the self has always been of interest within adult education (Tennant, 2009). It is important to apply empirical knowledge to the field of adult education practice. This study has implications for any work done with adults age 55 plus who are retired or retiring, especially for volunteer management practice and for life coaching and retirement planning. The findings can be used to help people who are looking for what comes next after retirement. With population aging, increasing numbers of adults will be interested in opportunities for personal growth and volunteering is one option for this. By using the volunteer management approach, this study can help inform and guide programs to recruit, engage and retain volunteers age 55 plus.

References


Mapping the Maze of Family Literacy Policy in Canada

Stacey Crooks
Ontario Institute for Studies in Education/University of Toronto

Abstract: Mapping family literacy policy in Canada is a complex, but important project. Due to the diversity of program contexts and models, family literacy programs in Canada are shaped by several different policy narratives. These narratives have distinctive, and at times contradictory, ways of constructing family literacy programs, constructions which may have significant implications for research and practice. This paper attempts to engage in the challenges of mapping policy in such a complex field. Through a discussion of field-based reports and government policy texts, the paper illustrates the layered and shifting nature of family literacy policy in Canada.

This paper is a work in progress, a part of my attempt to better understand where family literacy policy is located in Canada, what it looks like and, ultimately what it does. Many researchers have emphasized the importance of understanding educational policy (Finch, 1988; Reder, 2009). According to Levinson, Sutton & Winstead, policy “(a) defines reality, (b) orders behaviour, and (sometimes) (c) allocates resources accordingly” (2009, p. 770). But the complexities of mapping family literacy policy in Canada are many. This is largely because family literacy programs in Canada draw on many different program models and are located in many different organizational contexts (Kennedy, 2008; Ontario Literacy Coalition, 2010; Thomas, 2001). As a result, several different, and sometimes contradictory, policy narratives impact family literacy programs, and each of these have implications for how we understand family literacy practice and research.

For example, rooted in different policy discourses, family literacy programs can be characterized as adult literacy programs that focus on how literacy is used and developed in families (Kennedy, 2008), or as early childhood literacy programs that emphasize parent involvement (Nutbrown, Hannon & Morgan, 2005). The field of family literacy might be described as “a social movement based on social equity and empowerment of families” (Thomas & Skage, 1998, p. 18) in one policy conversation, or an intervention intended to “inoculate” children against future school failure and poverty in another (Anderson, Lenters & McTavish, 2008). Similarly, family literacy policy is sometimes based in a social practices or critical view of literacy emphasizing the ways family and community members of all ages use literacy in their daily lives (Auerbach, 1995). At other times it is based on brain research suggesting that the first years of life are a critical window for fostering brain development necessary for future academic success (Anderson, Lenters & McTavish, 2008). These different understanding of family literacy will construct family literacy programs in very different ways. The implications of this become even more complex when individual programs are influenced (and funded) by more than one policy narrative, in which case all of these understandings may be present simultaneously.

In this paper I make a tentative step towards mapping family literacy policy narratives in Canada. In order to do so, I have started with a selection of Canadian reports and government documents that explicitly discuss the support and development of family literacy programs. However, as I engage with these texts, I see clearly that they are connected to policy conversations outside of their immediate context, both in Canada and internationally. In focusing on the definitions of family literacy that they offer, I am cognizant of other ways of
talking about family literacy work. For example, although many of the texts come from an adult literacy perspective, I know that early childhood education policy and funding have made significant contributions to family literacy policy and programs in Canada (Ontario Literacy Coalition, 2010). And while in Canada, school-based understandings of parent involvement have often been separated from family literacy programs, I am aware that the two fields overlap in many ways (Compton-Lilly & Greene, 2011). I have tried in my discussion here to point out these complexities, but I know that this too will be an ongoing process.

A starting point

In beginning my scan of family literacy policy in Canada, I was fortunate to come across a document produced by the former Movement for Canadian Literacy (now the Canadian Literacy and Learning Network). The document, entitled Mapping the field of family literacy in Canada (Kennedy, 2008), identified the funding opportunities for family literacy programs, the kinds of organizations doing family literacy work, the supports available to programs and the program models common in each province and territory. This document offered me a historical background to family literacy funding in Canada, as well as a starting point from which to identify current family literacy policy.

The Movement for Canadian Literacy (MCL) report shows that, although family literacy program funding and policy differ in each province and territory, there are some commonalities. First, family literacy programs exist in all provinces and territories are offered by a variety of community-based organizations (e.g. family resources centres, adult literacy programs) and institutions (e.g. schools, libraries, colleges). These organizations usually do family literacy work as part of their larger mandate, a mandate that generally has its own policy context. Also funding programs tend to locate family literacy as community-based; provinces that explicitly fund family literacy programs often do so through adult education, community development or social service departments. Some provincial or territorial governments include family literacy as part of adult or lifelong literacy strategies (e.g. British Columbia, Saskatchewan, Yukon). In some provinces, targeted family literacy policy and funding does not exist. Programs in these provinces may access funds through public health, early childhood programs and social services.

Another trend evident in the report is that, in most provinces, the provincial literacy coalition (or similar organization) provides training and/or support to family literacy programs, sometimes through an official partnership with the provincial government (e.g. Alberta, British Columbia, Northwest Territories, Yukon). In provinces where the partnership is particularly strong or well-defined (as we shall seen in the case of Saskatchewan), the coalition’s role in policy making and interpretation may be the clearest message available about family literacy policy and its relationship to practice.

MCL’s report, while acknowledging that “a variety of programs and services are given the label of ‘family literacy’” (p. 6), emphasized family literacy programming that has a strong adult literacy component. This is perhaps due to MCL’s historic focus on and history with adult literacy. However, the report may have underplayed the role of early childhood intervention programs, such as Best Start in Ontario or KidsFirst in Saskatchewan, in shaping family literacy work in Canada (Government of Saskatchewan, Early Years, n.d; Ontario Literacy Coalition, 2010). Furthermore, the extent to which schools across the country are involved in family literacy (e.g. ABC Life Literacy Canada, 2012) is not evident in the report.
Changes in Federal Literacy Policy

A further complication to mapping family literacy policy, is the fact that policy is a moving target, constantly changing in form and practice. As those who work in adult literacy know, there have been considerable changes in the policy climate surrounding literacy in the last five years since the MCL report was written (Strategic Policy and Research Branch, 2010). Until 2006, the federal government funded adult and family literacy programs under the National Literacy Secretariat (NLS). The NLS was an important source of funding for family literacy programs in the 1990s and continued to have a family literacy program stream until it was dissolved in 2006 (Kennedy, 2008; Strategic Policy and Research Branch, 2010).

Since 2006, federal literacy funding has been administered through the Office of Literacy and Essential Skills (OLES). OLES has an explicit focus on literacy for employment and the office’s most recent calls for proposals, while not excluding family literacy programs for eligibility, have placed more emphasis on workplace essential skills. OLES has continued to fund some family literacy projects but the numbers have decreased substantially compared to pre-2006 levels (Government of Canada, 2012). Another example of a move away from family literacy may be seen (or rather may not be seen) on the website of the Canadian Literacy and Learning Network (formerly Movement for Canadian Literacy), a national organization funded by OLES. The website has recently changed and no longer has any content relating to family literacy programs. Even MCL’s 2008 report, which I have been discussing and which recommends an expanded role in family literacy for MCL, is no longer available on the website.

Further implications of this shift are likely still to be seen. Perhaps one result will be that early childhood education programs such as Community Action Program for Children (Public Health Agency of Canada, 2011) or Understanding the Early Years (Human Resources and Skills Development Canada, 2011) will become more significant for family literacy in Canada; although in recent years some of these types of programs have also been closed down. It will be interesting to see if any change will be evident in the role of the provincial literacy coalitions, which are also funded by OLES and which have in the past had the same mandate as MCL but at the provincial level.

Of course delivery of education is a provincial responsibility in Canada. While the federal policy climate has an impact on family literacy programs in the provinces, the provincial policy agenda, particularly in education but also in health and social services, is probably more immediately relevant in shaping family literacy practice at the local level. In order to better understand how family literacy programs and policy operate at a provincial level, I have chosen to use policy in Saskatchewan as an example. I will discuss changes since the 2008 report and also try to illustrate the complexity of locating family literacy policy in Canada.

Provincial Policy: A Look at Family Literacy Policy in Saskatchewan

In MCL’s report, Kennedy noted that the Saskatchewan Literacy Commission was primarily responsible for family literacy policy and funding in Saskatchewan. At the time of the report, the commission funded two programs that supported family literacy in the province. The first was the Saskmart Literacy for Life Initiative; the second was the Family Literacy Initiative Program (FLIP). The report also stated that the provincial literacy coalition, the Saskatchewan Literacy Network, provided for training and support of family literacy practitioners in the province.
Since 2008, there have been some changes in the family literacy policy context in Saskatchewan. First, the Saskatchewan Literacy Commission, which was charged with addressing literacy policy and programming across provincial ministries, is now the Literacy Office, a unit under the Libraries branch of the Ministry of Education (Government of Saskatchewan, Ministry Overview n.d.). However, although the scope and prominence of literacy in Saskatchewan may have changed with the loss of the commission, the commission’s centerpiece funding program still operates. Sasksmart, Literacy for Life puts out a yearly call for proposals for the Sasksmart Innovation Fund (SSIF).

The purpose of SSIF is to promote the implementation of “community literacy plans” (Literacy Office, 2011). The program funds “communities,” represented by a group of organizations or stakeholders from self-defined geographical or social communities. The funding is a one-time grant, but communities may apply for the full amount in two stages. First a small grant (up to $10,000 in 2011) can be received under the “Expression of Interest” fund to help organizations work together to prepare a “Community Literacy Plan.” Groups can then apply for the larger “Community Literacy Plan” fund ($up to 70,000 in 2011) to support the further development and initial implementation of the plan.

Community Literacy Plans funded by Sasksmart are required to have a family literacy as well as a workplace literacy component. However, there is some evidence that more emphasis is placed on the workplace component than on the family literacy piece. For example, the 2011 Innovation Fund Application Guidelines (Literacy Office, 2011) emphasize literacy as an economic investment leading to employment for learners and a skilled workforce for the province. In addition, all groups are required to have a local business or chamber of commerce as one of the partners.

Another noticeable change in family literacy funding in Saskatchewan since 2008, is the absence of the Family Literacy Initiative Program. The only money the Literacy Office currently has available specifically for family literacy programming is directed to “family literacy hubs.” (Government of Saskatchewan, Family Literacy, n.d.). These organizations are funded to deliver programs but also to provide training, support and promotion for other family literacy programs in their regions. There is no call for proposal process for this funding; the organizations have been “designated” by the Literacy Office. Some of these organizations are part of larger institutions such as regional libraries or colleges. Most get funding from several other sources.

Beyond calls for proposals for Sasksmart funding and a document about the roles of family literacy hubs, there are no official policy documents available on the Saskatchewan Literacy Office’s website. The website itself contains some descriptions and definitions, but nothing that could be seen as a formal policy text. So in order to better understand the policy climate of family literacy programs in Saskatchewan, where do we look?

First, we might look at the organizations that the office funds as hubs and at the relationship of the Literacy Office with the SLN and the Saskatchewan Aboriginal Literacy Network (SALN). As discussed above, family literacy hubs are responsible for regional promotion, outreach, support and training. In addition to the regional hubs, there are two province wide organizations that are involved in training and support for family literacy programs in Saskatchewan: the Saskatchewan Literacy Network (SLN) and the Saskatchewan Aboriginal Literacy Network (SALN).

The Saskatchewan Literacy Network (whose core funding comes from OLES) has a long history of working closely with the provincial government. Kennedy (2008) notes that the guidelines for the Family Literacy Initiative Program funding were based on the SLN’s standards.
for family literacy. In addition, the SLN worked with the province to develop the province’s adult literacy benchmarks document (Saskatchewan Literacy Network and Saskatchewan Advanced Education and Employment, 2006). Currently, the government’s Literacy Office’s website states that “ongoing support for CLP (community literacy plan) communities is provided by the Saskatchewan Aboriginal Literacy Network and the Saskatchewan Literacy Network” and directs readers to contact the Literacy Office, the SLN, or the SALN with questions about funding or the role of the family literacy hubs.

Considering the role that the hubs and, in particular, the provincial organizations play in family literacy training, support and communication in the province, it seems that the provincial government is communicating something about family literacy policy through these partner organizations. For example, one responsibility of the hubs is the organization and delivery of the “Introduction to Family Literacy Training” in the province. The training is also delivered by the SLN (who were involved in developing the program) and the SALN as part of the support offered to all literacy programs in the province, including Sasksmart funded groups. In the absence of other explicit policy from government, the content of this training could be seen as a kind of de facto policy statement about family literacy programs in Saskatchewan.

Another way that governments communicate policy is through budget decisions. In the case of family literacy, we might consider that most groups that receive SSIF grants do so on a one-time basis (assuming they are not designated as a hub). This suggests something about how much government policy makers value literacy work and also about how they imagine it should be done.

The lack of ongoing funding from the Literacy Office also suggests that policy narratives from outside the provincial Literacy Office shape much of the family literacy work that happens in the province. To the extent that communities initially funded through SSIF continue to do family (and other kinds of) literacy work, they must rely on other funding. This may come from new grant sources, private as well as public; or the organizations that are part of the community literacy plan may continue to do family literacy programming as part of their core work. Lists of groups that have received SSIF grants (available on the Literacy Office website) point to several other policy contexts that may influence family literacy work in these communities and in the province. Partners in communities that received funding for 2010-2011 include United Ways, YMCAs, community colleges, playschools, public libraries, family resource centres, first nations and “Kidsfirst” programs (a provincial government program targeted to “vulnerable families” with preschool children). Almost every community also includes a public school as a partner.

To locate family literacy policy in Saskatchewan, it is not enough to focus on the written policies that explicitly govern family literacy programs. The policy narratives that inform family literacy programs in the province are not explicitly stated in policy documents; they are communicated in other ways. Furthermore, family literacy programs that are funded by government in Saskatchewan are, by necessity, part of several policy narratives.

What does this all mean?

The example of family literacy policy in Saskatchewan gives just a taste of the complexity of creating a policy map for family literacy in Canada. Neither the starting points nor the boundaries are clear. Programs are delivered in diverse contexts based on diverse models and they are informed by multiple policy narratives. Furthermore, written policy tells us only so much about what it actually does, or is, in practice. Much policy “may exist in unwritten form, through ongoing institutional memory and practice” (Levinson et al, p. 770) and these memories...
and practices cannot be accessed simply by combing through reports and websites. Yet understanding how these policy narratives overlap and contradict is important to understanding the context for family literacy program delivery in Canada.

Writing this paper has been a process, not only of learning about family literacy policy in Canada, but also of learning about policy research and analysis. One thing I have noticed in writing this paper is the degree to which policy research is always incomplete, always inadequate and always situated in a moment in time. As I write this paper in Saskatchewan, discussions are underway that may significantly change the way family literacy policy looks in the province. And in the last two weeks the provincial and federal budgets were released and the funding picture for literacy in Saskatchewan has changed again. But then this is always the case. Policy is living, shifting, always in process; as are the programs that are shaped by it.

References


Reflexivity and The Journey of a White Lesbian Researcher

Susan Diane
University of Toronto

Abstract: A white lesbian doctoral student, my project involves queer women activists of diverse ethnicities. My early reading included literature on same-sex relationships in African and Asian cultures, yet only after I began writing reflexively about my race, my Whiteness, did the literature process gain direction and momentum. I learned how white guilt can create barriers to deeper understanding. Reading about racialized LGBTQ people lead to reflexive writing about my past interracial relationship. I discovered research on positive benefits for lives on more than one margin. Proving instrumental in this literature review process, reflexivity became a scholarly subject of interest.

Introduction
As a PhD. candidate, I planned qualitative research with Toronto lesbian activists, with some having cultures and ethnicities different from my own. How could I, a lesbian with a Protestant, white-settler ancestry, be prepared to listen and analyze stories from individuals who have roots in cultures that had been dominated by white colonizers and who continue to be discriminated against in economic and social ways today?

I shuffled off to the library to read about same-sex sexuality in African (Arnfred, 2004) and South Asian (Kapur, 2008) pre-colonial, colonial and postcolonial contexts. I sat down to write and it hit me. I’m a White lesbian. Whiteness is my race. This is where I need to start, before I write about other ethno-cultural sexuality literature, and definitely before I enter into research conversations with lesbians who have a different race or ethnic background to my own. Whiteness is the underbelly of racism, and I needed to explore my struggle with that awareness, to come face to face with my own White privilege that is complicit with systemic racism in society.

Reflexivity
Reflexivity, “where researchers engage in explicit self aware meta-analysis” (Findlay, 2002), has had an important role in qualitative and feminist research (p.209). “We accept that the researcher is a central figure who influences, if not actively constructs, the collection, selection and interpretation of data” (p. 212). I had stepped into what Findlay calls the “swamp” of reflexivity. I wrote everything I could remember about my racial/ethnic/cultural circumstance. My reflexive writing was therefore about “situating the researcher and voicing difference” and also about “attending to broader political dimensions” (Findlay, 2002, p. 224).

Growing up white
In my small Ontario town everyone appeared to be white with religion the difference that was noticed. You were Catholic or Protestant and attended the appropriate school. Eventually I noticed that a subtle Protestant superiority in a religious joke or remark. My grandfather told of his father discovering he was seeing a “Dogan” girl when the family horse turned up her laneway out of habit. Dogan was a negative/slang word for someone who was Catholic and dating/marrying was not allowed. This was a continuation of the protestant/catholic conflicts as
evidenced in “the troubles” in Ireland. Although I have a white ancestry, I have a mix of European ethnicities including English, Irish, Scottish and German. As I learn more about ethnicity and colonial history, I realize I have both the colonizer (English) and the colonized (Irish) in various drops of my blood.

Looking back, I am aware of racist comments. Examples of this include one grandfather that using the “n” word, and another commenting on “darkies”. We had a black dog named Toby and a black cat named Sambo, names used derogatorily towards black people. “Indian reservations” were a collection of rundown buildings in an isolated area as we drove to the family cottage. This cottage on the shores of Lake Huron is a clear marker of my White, middle-class privilege. My brothers played cowboys and Indians with toy guns and bows and arrows. I was oblivious to the irony of Sunday school teachings about a loving Jesus who wanted all the children, “red and yellow, black and white”, brought to him.

I went through rigorous interviewing and psychological testing before acceptance into a school of nursing. I never thought about how white our class was although I was increasingly aware of sexism in the hospital hierarchy with female nurses and mostly male doctors. The Christian roots of nursing meant that I was to treat everyone with the same compassion and as being non-judgmental was one of the principles of nursing practice, although at that time it was part of a liberal, colour-blind philosophy. Years later when I was working on my Masters’ thesis, I became aware of the history of racism in nursing in Ontario (Das Gupta, 1996).

Deeper into Whiteness
My undergraduate degree in Psychology included an elective course in sociology focusing on First Nations people. This was eye opening, as I developed an understanding of the genocidal decimation by white European settlers. I finally understood the political/historical/social issues in the alcoholism, poverty, and numerous related health issues of First Nations people outlined in my earlier nursing education. At the University of British Columbia in the nineties, in new Women’s Studies courses, I read Peggy McIntosh’s (1989) foundational work that started to open the “invisible knapsack” that contained my white privilege. This work added another layer to the ground breaking work of Black feminists, such as belle hooks (1984), and Audre Lorde (1984), who exposed the racism in feminism. McIntosh (1989) compares male privilege, with its unearned advantages, crazy-making denials and insidious entrenchment in social norms, to the similar processes of white privilege. Just as men’s lives were taken as normal, with anything related to the feminine disparaged or secondary, so too she points out are white lives the ideal and normative, with many everyday benefits from systemic racism (McIntosh, 1989).

At OISE in 2007, with marked ethno-cultural diversity in the students sitting beside me, I uncomfortably dug into Richard Dyer’s (1997) work on whiteness. He comments on “racial imagery” and its enormous power in the world.

At what cost regions and countries export their goods, whose voices are listened to at international gatherings, who bombs and who is bombed, who gets what jobs, housing, access to health care and education, what cultural activities are subsidized and sold, in what terms they are validated – these are all largely inextricable from racial imagery (p. 1).
Dyer sees a strong need to include whiteness in this racial imagery. “For as long as white people are not racially seen and named, they/we function as a human norm” (Dyer, 1997, p. 1). So if they/we are “human”, this places “others” outside this norm so they are less than “human”. This less than human, racist ideology at its extreme, leads to wars and genocides, with soldiers trained to think of the ‘other’ in dehumanizing ways to rationalize and facilitate killing people. As white bodies “take up space” it shifts the space for the non-white bodies. Ahmed (Ahmed, 2007) states:

If the world is made white, then the body-at-home is one that can inhabit whiteness. As Fanon’s work shows, after all, bodies are shaped by histories of colonialism, which makes the world ‘white’, a world that is inherited, or which is already given before the point of an individual’s arrival . . . . a world ‘ready’ for certain kinds of bodies, as a world that puts certain objects within their reach (p.154-154). The systemic nature of the normalized white world is evidenced in how its institutions work. “When we describe institutions as ‘being’ white (institutional whiteness), we are pointing to how institutional spaces are shaped by the proximity of some bodies and not others: white bodies gather, and cohere to form the edges of such spaces” (Ahmed, 2007, p. 159). And what of non-white bodies? “Such bodies are made invisible when we see spaces as being white, at the same time as they become hypervisible when they do not pass, which means they ‘stand out’ and ‘stand apart’” (Ahmed, 2007, p.159). “Stand out” not in a positive, above the crowd, extraordinary way, but as a negative, out of place, odd, not belonging and “stand apart” way.

A young Black man in my university class described how he would not eat a watermelon or a banana in public spaces. He is very aware of racist stereotypes that turn black men into grinning slave boys eating watermelon in the cotton fields, or the portrayal of blacks as much like apes and monkeys, eating bananas and swinging from trees in the jungle. This young man’s sharing of his reality brought home to me how racism creates such intense uncomfortable feelings and curbs behaviour in public “white” spaces.

Being questioned about where you are born, not being perceived as Canadian, then further questions about where your parents were born, can all feed into a position of “stranger” in your own country. “Such bodies are stopped, where the stopping is an action that creates its own impressions. Who are you? Why are you here? What are you doing?” (Ahmed, 2007, p.161). The attack on the World Trade twin towers in New York city in September of 2001, showed how racial profiling can have serious consequences for citizens whose bodies are read as a particular race. She calls this “stop and search” and labels it another “technology of racism” (p.161). Recognizing the workings of white institutions can facilitate the ability to fight these technologies.

Another way to affect change is to “see whiteness, see its power, its particularity, and limitedness, put it in its place and end its rule” (Dyer, 1997, p.2). Dyer (1997) also states “… it seems especially important to try to break the hold of whiteness by locating and embodying it in a particular experience of being white” (p. 4).

White guilt is a problem that Dyer (1997) sees as blocking our ability to examine how whiteness is constructed. The history of white peoples’ violence to non-white people can engender guilt that he feels can hamper or stop our continuation of analysis into whiteness and all its
“complexities and contradictions” (p. 10-11). Continuing to examine how these racial injustices evolved, and the myriad of ways in which they continue to harm non-white people and relationships, is key to changing current racist practices and systems. What can I, as white woman, do to assist in the fight against systemic racism that keeps this privilege/oppression in place? Exposing these unearned privileges, making them visible, creating awareness, is a beginning step to system change. I can do this consciousness-raising about whiteness both in my teaching practice and also in my research.

Interracial couples
In April of 2010, Statistics Canada released a report examining mixed race couples from the 2006 census. “A higher proportion of same-sex couples were in mixed unions in 2006 compared to opposite-sex couples. Almost one in ten (9.8%) same-sex couples were in mixed unions compared to less than one in twenty (3.8%) opposite-sex couple” (Milan, A, Maheux, H, & Chui, T, 2010, p.77). I had added another layer to my awareness of racism through an interracial relationship with a Japanese Canadian woman. I can never fully experience the sting of a racist comment or the daily sandpaper wearing down of being looked at differently but I developed some insight into the realities of my girlfriend’s experiences with abuse and discrimination. Her father’s history of living in an internment camp in British Columbia and later working on the sugar beet farms was an example of her family’s reality that I glimpsed in a deeper way. My family’s whiteness had protected my ancestors and relatives from these and other types of historical discriminatory practices. My girlfriend told of people saying, “go back to where you came from”, but she was born in Canada and as she said, “I ate my Cheerios watching cartoons like everyone else”. She told of stepping into an elevator with two white women, one turning to the other to say “there is snot in here”. My girlfriend looked around for the “snot” and then realized that they were referring to her. Listening to stories of how racism hurts can have a profound impact on the listener. Ruth Frankenberg (1993) has dubbed this painful experience “rebound racism”.

Interracial intimacy and how it “may catapult White members of interracial couples toward a more nuanced analysis of race and Whiteness”, has been examined by Twine and Steinberger (2006, p. 342). In a qualitative study of interracial couples, both heterosexual and homosexual, in USA and the UK, they discovered that about 25% of their participants developed some degree of “racial literacy” (Twine, 2006). Thus a majority “articulated a version of the colour-blind discourses” or “race evasion” and stayed in a ”White comfort zone” (p.358). Still, a minority of white partners developed racial literacy, “‘a reading practice’ – a way of perceiving and responding to the racial climate and racial structures individuals encounter” (Twine & Steinbugler, 2006, p.344). This learned analytical skill meant they “carefully evaluated their everyday practices and the social processes that threatened to sustain and/or reproduce racial and ethnic hierarchies that denigrated Blacks and distributed various forms of privilege to Whites” (p.358). These racially literate research participants see their respective contexts as very important using their “double consciousness” and “insider/outsider” status to read the racial dynamics (Twine, 2006, p.360).

Lesbians who have been Racialized
DeBlaere et al. (2010) state,

... much of the scholarship about lesbian, gay, and bisexual (LGB) populations is rooted in the experiences of White individuals, and much of the scholarship about people of
color is based on samples that are predominantly heterosexual or of unknown sexual orientation, resulting in a paucity of scholarship about LGB people of color”. (p.331-332)

DeBlaere et al. (2010) discuss critiquing a Eurocentric focus, including language and concepts that may marginalize those with same-sex relational behaviours from non-European ethnicities. Historically in the West the most common labels for women have been heterosexual, bi-sexual or lesbian. A recent study on sexual fluidity illustrates how some young women in Western culture resist this process, desiring to identify as “unlabeled” (Diamond, 2008). There are cultures that have other concepts and words for same-sex behaviours. Mati-ism is an Afro-centric concept, some African-American women use the terms sister or girlfriend, and two-spirited is a Native, North American descriptor for alternative gender and/or same-sex sexual/relational behaviours (DeBleare et al., 2010, p.333).

Another researcher, (Garber, 2003) mentions how globally “woman loving woman” communities “have resisted or worn uncomfortably” the English labels. Garber (2003) notes that in China “tongzhi” is the word used and activists see “‘coming home’ rather than ‘coming out’ as an appropriate rubric to understanding the dilemmas of tongzhi in a society profoundly structured by familial relations rather than individual identities” (p. 125). “Queer” is another identity label being reclaimed and used by activists and those who do not see themselves as represented by sexist and hetero-normative ideologies and discourses or by the representations of past generations of lesbian and gay identity categories (Noble, 2010).

Other research (Meyer, 2010) warns against seeing the experience of LGB people of colour, as vastly different from white LGB experience. He points out that mainstream culture is quite pervasive with many LGB people of colour raised in Western countries from birth, and even if they have immigrated, assimilation and acculturation is common. He also notes that the LGBT social movement is known and active in many countries across the globe. Meyer (2010) states “that local cultures matter in the analysis of LGB populations” and that there are “subcultural differences and maybe even clashes with White American culture”, but he also cautions researchers that “cultural differences among LGB racial/ethnic populations in the United States could be easily exaggerated” (p. 444).

My study will explore how queer women/lesbians of colour(s) articulate their membership in the Toronto LGBT community, in their ethnic communities, and therefore their involvement in more than one minority community, needs to be explored. There are growing theoretical debates on how multiple oppressions are experienced including critiques of additive models that assume that combined oppressions create increased negative effects on quality of life. Other studies point to some positive effects to living a life on many margins.

Positive Marginality
Hall & Fine (2005), discuss positive marginality as “the strength and vibrancy and radical possibilities that lie and grow on the margins of social arrangements” (p.177). Hall and Fine (2005) list, four outcomes of positive marginality:
(a) critical observation and reframing of life experiences in the margins, (b) conversion of obstacles into opportunities, (c) subversion of social institutions, and (d) development of safe spaces for individuals in the margins. (p. 349)
As my participants have been well-known activists, it makes sense that they may have experienced some of these outcomes as they created their lives.

**Racial Capital**

Pastrana’s (2010) concept of racial capital discusses how race can be both a “barrier and a conduit” for LGBT activists. Pastrana (2010) states,

... racial capital is the amount of power individuals have in using their racial identities. It is a form of power that shifts according to the setting or the environment, to language proficiency, and to skin color. In other words, a racial identity that is oppressed is not always and everywhere that way. (p. 102)

Pastrana (2010) continues to say that a “basic feature of intersectionality is that oppressions are not additive but instead are multiplicative” (p.96). He suggests that having multiple oppressions can actually increase the number of interactions with people and communities and therefore is seen as beneficial in organizing work (p. 98-99). Pastrana, (2010) states:

It is not easy, and it is often confusing, but these strategies for living intersectional lives do exist. And it starts with the articulation of how racial identities can constrain and enable people in different settings. (p.103)

**Minority Stress and Resilience**

Meyer’s (2010) work reveals that “LGB individuals had more mood, anxiety, and substance-use disorders than heterosexuals” yet this “minority stress hypothesis” does not show similar results for LGB people of colour”. This is despite the fact that “Black and Latino LGB persons are exposed to greater stressors and have less support and resources than LGB and heterosexual Whites” (p. 448). How to account for this discrepancy? One of the possible factors that he sees as needing more research “is the distinction between individual-and group-level resources. Both clinicians and researchers should remember that great personal resources are not sufficient to cope with minority stress” (p. 450). Is membership in two supportive minority communities adding to the resilience of LGBTQ people of colour? Meyer states that “(m)inority stressors require group-level resources because only the group can repair or replace societal prejudicial norms and values (e.g., about concepts of family and intimacy) and only the group can promote affirmative social support, role models, and so on” (p. 450).

The pivotal nature of reflexivity has been revealed in this discussion of my literature review process. Elliston (2005) identifies lesbians and gays as spearheading reflexivity, especially in sexuality studies. Forbes (2008) discusses how reflexivity “might be used as an active attempt to think differently and make permeable hither to taken for granted conceptualizations” (p. 449). She sees “identities as discursively constructed” and that reflexivity can play a role in shifting pre-doctoral identities in the progress of obtaining a doctorate (p. 449). This paper as an example of one doctoral student’s journey and I invite others to rethink how reflexivity could be useful for their own work.

**References**


Corporate Rule, Climate Change and Social Upheaval: Old Challenges and New Opportunities for Adult Educators

Rose A. Dyson

**Abstract:** Most of humanity remains either too focused on survival to protest or is quite happy with the creature comforts technological gadgets provide. What are some of the outgrowths of the movement and what kind of challenges and opportunities lie ahead for educators?

**Introduction**

Within weeks, the OCCUPYWALLSTREET movement in lower Manhattan was declared too big to fail. Launched on September 17, 2011 in New York City’s financial district to protest the encroachment of corporate rule in the lives of ordinary citizens, it quickly spread to hundreds of cities around the world. Thousands of students, and under employed people of all ages proclaimed themselves members of the exploited 99 percent and managed in a remarkably short period of time, to raise the public profile on unbridled capitalism, joblessness, and profit driven disregard for the environment, health and social well being. Although facilitated by social media savvy organizers, and first kindled by Adbusters in Vancouver as a logical grass roots response to unsustainable social, political, cultural and educational organization, the occupiers quickly garnered the attention of all media and attracted widespread public support.

Political activists discerned the potential for more voter engagement among the crowds that gathered. But the uprising was still largely generated by a disenchanted middle class minority. Most of humanity remains either too focused on survival to protest or is quite happy with the creature comforts technological gadgets provide. What are some of the outgrowths of the movement and what kind of challenges and opportunities lie ahead for educators.

**Occupiers Aims and Objectives**

A Canadian magazine helped launch the Occupy Movement but as co-founder and editor, Kalle Lasn, has pointed out, although Adbusters, is based in Vancouver it does not focus, specifically, on Canadian issues. Most tents around the world were dismantled as cold weather set in and since then, plans for a “Showdown in Chicago” in May, 2012 to coincide with a G8 and NATO Summit were shelved when Camp David was announced as the new site. But over the winter, occupier demands became more focused. They included a tax on all international financial transactions; a binding climate change accord and tougher penalties for ‘corporate criminals’ (Tactical briefing #25 Issue #100 Adbusters.com).

In Canada, Leadnow emerged as the main outgrowth of the Occupy Movement. Calls for action on the Internet have varied from endorsement of New Democratic Party leadership Candidate, Nathan Cullen’s proposal for a Liberal-NDP-Green Party collaboration to ward off a Conservative win in the next federal election, to protests against the ‘robo-call’ election fraud scandal that erupted in early 2012, and forums to “challenge the myth of ethical oil”. Leadnow spokespersons have encouraged participation in the political party process and support calls for electoral reform.
More Social Upheaval

On February 29, 2012, CBC TV aired a feature report on a world-wide anti-government movement called “Freeman on the Land”. Estimated to number around 30,000 in Canada, its members avoid paying taxes, claim a common law right to the land, frequently own guns, usually make their own car licence plates and regard their birth certificate number as a stock security. Although these myths have already landed some people in jail, indications are that, as the economy worsens, more people are being seduced into the movement. This is the flip side to what Leadnow is advocating, which is to work inside the existing democratic process.

Meanwhile, the financial sector is losing its cache in attracting America’s best and brightest college graduates. Former Goldman Sach’s executive, Greg Smith calls it a “toxic and destructive” culture. His epiphany came when he was trying to extol the benefits of a Goldman career to college students. In both The New York Times and The Toronto Star it was reported that at Princeton University, a group affiliated with the Occupy Wall Street Movement interrupted sessions by JP Morgan Chase and Goldman Sachs urging their fellow students to rebel against “the campus culture that whitewashes the crooked dealings of Wall Street as a prestigious career path.” (Roose, 2012).

Ironically, the decline of the finance industry’s allure, accelerated by the explosion of the information technology industry, is still regarded by graduates as a sector where they can profit without bringing their morality under a microscope. Overlooked are ways in which these technologies, themselves, are voracious energy users and toxic polluters. Even the ecologically modernizing digital production cannot avoid energy and resource use. Each advance depends on a further cradle to grave cycle of extraction and transport from manufacture to market - then consumption and waste pit. Occasionally a report surfaces on exactly what happens to our computers, television sets, and other electronic gadgets when they reach the end of their useful lives.

According to the Spring, 2012, issue of the ‘free’, avant garde, glossy Canadian fashion magazine Nuvo, Environment Canada reports that Canadians currently dump more than 140,000 tonnes of high-tech trash into this country’s landfills every year. These electronic cast-offs contain a witch’s brew of heavy metals and toxic substances, which include almost 5,000 tonnes of lead, 4.5 tonnes of cadmium and 1.1. tonnes of mercury. Most of this waste, however, gets shipped off to developing countries willing to trade cash for trash. The recommended solution? Consumer beware. Take the products to properly certified electronic recyclers, push governments to take the problem more seriously and be careful about the toys one wishes for at Christmas. But is that enough?

A look at the content offered by these high tech gadgets sheds light on another dimension to the problem of social upheaval. A special report in the December 10, 2011 issue of The Economist, titled “All the World’s a Game”, predicted that video games will be the fastest-growing and most exciting form of mass media over the coming decade. The video game, “Call of Duty: Black Ops”, for example, had in one month taken in more than $1 billion in sales. Fans in countries around the world queued for blocks on the day of its release a year earlier, to purchase a coveted early copy. In 2010, PricewaterhouseCoopers, estimated that the global video game market was worth around $56 billion, and that sales will continue to grow rapidly, eclipsing an estimated $82 billion by 2015.

Brief reference was made to the Columbine High School shooting in Colorado on April 2nd, 1999 and evidence that the two student perpetrators were heavily into violent movies and the gory video game “Doom”. But on the whole, The Economist concluded that “the moral
panic about video games is subsiding” because the evidence on harmful effects is “hard to pin down”. Acknowledged, nevertheless, was the fact that video game developers, themselves, have expressed concern about the online games they rely on to keep players hooked.

The simple reason for the phenomenal popularity of Suzanne Collin’s book for teens, *The Hunger Games*, and the new film based on it is that killing has become very popular entertainment that generates huge profits. The story involves a dystopian fantasy about teens forced into gladiatorial combat by a tyrannical regime, in which children kill children until only one of them is left alive. Sadly, neither the book nor the film, have generated much public concern. As Kenneth Oppel points out, “It’s somewhat disquieting that the same parents and educators who are horrified by the notion of child soldiers have bestowed upon *The Hunger Games* a double mantle of critical praise and global bestsellerdom. (Globe, 2012).

**Exploiting Children for Profit**

As Joel Bakin points out in his book *Childhood Under Siege*, by tapping into teen emotions like love and fear, [addictinggames.com](http://addictinggames.com) has become one of the Internet’s premier casual gaming sites. Every month, over ten million players log on to play games such as “Whack your soul mate”, involving excessive amounts of blood and gore. Gaming expert and psychologist Douglas Gentile, says the video game industry considers addictiveness a game’s “main indicator of success”. The industry doesn’t think in terms of addiction as a problem for health or well-being. As in the case of *World of Warcraft*, whose 10 million members pay $15 per month, it encourages repeat play (Bakan, 2011).

Eruptions of violence, serial murder and senseless deaths continue to dominate news coverage with the usual speculation on why or how these occurred. Was it social media, too much alcohol and youthful exuberance that precipitated the Stanley Cup violence in Vancouver in 2011; the London, England riots in August, 2011; and on St. Patrick’s Day, 2012 at Fanshawe College in London, Ontario? Did U.S. Staff Sargent Robert Bales, accused of killing 16 civilians in Afghanistan in March, 2012, some of them children in their sleep, suffer from post traumatic stress disorder due to four deployments in Iraq and Afghanistan in a decade (Bumiller, 2012)? Was there a connection between Norwegian mass murderer, Anders Brevik’s rampage that killed 77 people in July 2011 and police reports that he was a computer game abuser, having played, “World of Warcraft” for a total of 500 hours over a period of three months (Aftenposten, 2012)?

According to U.S. Lieutenant Colonel and professor of military science, David Grossman, operant conditioning, a technique widely used in military training to teach soldiers to kill with impunity, is initiated by the rewards aspect of points received for brutal action in video games. When talking of conditioned responses”, he explains, “we must also talk about violent video games, because to understand how we can make killing a conditioned reflex - stimulus-response -stimulus response -stimulus-response - it is important to understand how the average opponent has been trained” (p.77). In the military, these techniques are reluctantly employed as a trade-off for national security reasons but to indiscriminately reward children for repeatedly blowing off the heads of their virtual playmates, is to encourage dangerous and dysfunctional play. In the past, children who beat up their friends or classmates were punished. Today, not only are we teaching them that such violence can be entertaining, we are rewarding them with points for being good at it.

In response to the London, England riots last summer, retired prison psychiatrist Theodore Dalrymple wrote about how deeply embedded into everyday life, criminality has become (Globe, 2011). Pioneering media theorist, George Gerbner called the normalization of
anti-social, criminal behaviour resulting from violence in the media, the mean world syndrome (Morgan, 2002). Predictable consequences usually result in calls for tougher law and order measures such as more prisons and longer sentences. The hidden curriculum in video games and complementary forms of social media constantly reinforce the notion that boys and men should be brutally violent, girls and women are sexual objects, buying and accumulating material things leads to happiness, parents and other authority figures are uncool and that obsessive-compulsive behaviour is normal.

Gerbner argued, “We distinguish the long-term cultivation of assumptions about life and values from short-term “effects” that are usually assessed by measuring change as a consequence of exposure to certain messages (Morgan, 2002, p296). In other words, the accumulation of exposure to negative media imagery over time can have deeply corrosive effects on how we think and the values we espouse, even if those effects appear only to be experienced in the short term. Chris Hedges, is much more direct in his assessment of unfolding instability, reinforced by irresponsible media trends. In his book The Empire of Illusion he argues that we are now immersed in a culture that has “passively given up the linguistic and intellectual tools to cope with complexity, to separate illusion from reality” (p.44).

On June 8, 2011, it was reported in The Toronto Star that a Statistics Canada study found that police reported incidents of hate crimes had increased 42 percent nationwide between 2008 and 2009. Furthermore, that these numbers may underestimate the true extent of hate crime in Canada because not all incidents are reported to police. Everywhere in the developed world it seems that hate and intolerance resulting in crime is on the rise. The full impact of the 4 killings at a Jewish school in France by a radicalized Islamic citizen and lone gunman on a motorcycle on March 19, 2012 has yet to be determined but that they were hate-tinged and add to a culture war influencing French politics there can be little doubt (Saunders, 2012).

Institutional Responses to Media Issues
The Toulouse shootings in France spawned reflections on how increasingly elusive and dangerous those that counter terrorism agents now hunt are becoming. Today, terrorists are as likely as not to be citizens radicalized via the Internet in any country, including Canada. Prevention is getting harder. Federal agencies have had to come up with creative strategies - including what those on the front lines of fighting cyber crime refer to as “disruption” techniques (Freeze, 2012).

In Canada, recent debate on the issue has revolved around Bill C-30, introduced in the House of Commons in February, 2012. Although vetted by every attorney general serving provincially and in the territories, the opposition quickly branded it a draconian attempt at privacy invasion. Huge advances in the uses and capabilities of information technologies and how these provide safe havens for criminal activity such as organized crime, sexual exploitation, fraud and identity theft were ignored. It was argued that a warrant should be required before any data is gathered. Now, neither telecommunications nor Internet providers are required to preserve data but, as pointed out by the Ontario Provincial Police, by the time law enforcement officers obtain a warrant, which could take weeks or even months, the desired content may not be available. Ironically, as the attention of opposition critics shifted to the alleged wrongdoing during the last federal election involving the robo-call scandal, a call was made for the CRTC to get involved in the investigation, because it does not require a warrant to gather data (Chase, March 3, 2012). This begs the question of why the telecommunications federal regulator enjoys a privilege denied officers working on the front lines of cyber crime.
Occasionally, attempts are made to restrict gratuitously violent media for entertainment purposes from being marketed to children. In 2010, California Senator Leland Yee proposed a ban on violent video games backed by the state chapter of the American Academy of Pediatrics, other health organizations, and supported by eleven other states. Nevertheless, the U.S. supreme Court ultimately ruled in favour of the software industry, stating that the California law banning the sale or rental of violent video games to minors is unconstitutional because it violates the right to free speech guaranteed in the First amendment. Justice Antonin Scalia said, “California’s argument would fare better if there were a long-standing tradition in this country of specially restricting children’s access to depictions of violence, but there is none…” (Bascaramurty, 2011). This case demonstrates how the court system has leaned in favour of big business in recent years, protecting political speech, pornography and violent media entertainment under the First amendment. In other words, no distinction is being made between individual freedom of expression and corporate freedom of enterprise. This anomaly has yet to be discovered by the Occupy Movement.

Calls for restrictions on marketing violence to children as harmless entertainment are hardly new and, over the years, have come from the American Psychological Association, American Psychiatric Association, American and Canadian Paediatric societies, the U.S. Center for Disease Control and Prevention, the Canadian Centre for Science in the Public Interest, EDUPAX and Canadians Concerned About Violence in Entertainment (Dyson, 1995;2000; www.C-CAVE.com). As psychologist Craig Anderson points out, “After 40 years of research, one would think that the debate about media violence effects would be over”. Many criticisms in the new debate are recycled myths from earlier objections to restrictions on media violence that have repeatedly been debunked on theoretical and empirical grounds. Valid weaknesses have been identified and often corrected by media violence researchers themselves (2003).

Legislation in Quebec, the U.K., Scandinavian countries, France, Switzerland, Italy, Malta, New Zealand, Greece and other countries, banning advertising the children based on research showing harmful effects, has yet to be adopted in the rest of Canada, despite several bills introduced at both the federal level and provincial level in Ontario in recent years, calls from the Toronto and other Boards of Health in Ontario, EDUPAX, the Centre for Policy Alternatives, The Centre for Science in the Public Interest and Canadians Concerned About Violence in Entertainment (Dyson, 1995; 2000; Jeffery, 2007; Linn, 2010; www.C-CAVE.com). Similar demands have been made and bills introduced to eliminate taxes and funding for audio visual productions deemed to be contrary to the public interest. In Canada, Bill C-10, introduced by the minority Harper Government in 2008, although initially passed in the House of Commons, was ultimately defeated by the Liberal dominated Senate at the time.

In 2011, it was reported in The New York Times, that wasteful government spending in both Canada and the U.S. involves generous tax breaks for video game producers regardless of the content. According to tax professor, Calvin H. Johnson at the University of Texas in Austin, a collection of deductions, writeoffs, and credits now makes production of video games such as the gory “Dead Space 2”, one of the most highly subsidized businesses in the U.S. In 2008, Ontario paid one game company more than $321,000 for each job to relocate on the north side of the border. Montreal has also been generous with a rich package of incentives for relocation (Kocieniewski, 2011). Following 9/11 the industry held back in releasing extra-ordinarily violent films for several months in deference to the victims who died as a result of the al Qaeda attack on the U.S. but soon it was back to business as usual (Dyson, 2003). In Ontario, much of this
generous tax money is discreetly packaged under subsidies for “electronic arts”.

**Conclusion**

In Canada, the current preoccupation with robocalls, involving anonymous and misleading information to voters during the 2011 federal election, is just the tip of the iceberg in challenges that lie ahead for elected officials. They cross over party lines and surpass our institutions’ current abilities to manage them. Clearly we must learn to regulate powerful new information technologies and yet ensure that they do not subvert democracy. But who should be in charge of new breakthroughs in scientific laboratories? The market, which translates into large profit driven, corporate interests, or those who are elected to act in the public interest? The older challenges of how to govern our economy are still with us but now, we are increasingly being overtaken by the need, in the 21st century, to decide how we should govern technology. It offers us enormous potential, in limiting climate change, maintaining the biosphere, and securing energy needs but governments and educators must engage these issues in a serious way soon or risk losing entirely the ability to influence outcomes.

**References**

*Aftenposten.* (February 9) Brevik addicted to video games. <www.aftenposten.com>


A Very Gendered History: 
Women and Literacy in Early 20th Century Newfoundland

Leona M. English
St. Francis Xavier University

Abstract: Women were the backbone of the early literacy efforts in 20th century Newfoundland, though little is known about their contributions, their biographies, and their commitments. This paper profiles their work with the Newfoundland Adult Education Association, drawing attention to the gendered and innovative aspects of their literacy practice: family literacy, focus on mothers, and use of musical arts.

Adult education in Canada has been concerned primarily with the history of the great male leaders such as Coady (Welton, 2001) and Tompkins (Lotz & Welton, 1997). In the case of literacy, there is a great deal known about leaders such as Alfred Fitzpatrick (1999/1920), the founder of Frontier College which educated men on the rail lines and frontier. Though most of the first Frontier College teachers such as Norman Bethune were men, and the students were men, this obscures the fact that many teachers of literacy, certainly at present, are women (Quigley, 1997). This silence about female teachers is somewhat surprising since literacy work has largely been constructed as women’s work, as an extension of teaching in the home, and of caring for the vulnerable, often in a volunteer capacity. The general dearth of historical work in adult education renders mute those women teachers who operated outside the regular school system and who did not classify as leaders in the traditional sense. This chapter takes the case of a group of pioneer women in Newfoundland (pre-Confederation with Canada in 1949) and highlights their contributions to nation building and literacy efforts in the difficult economic and geographic environment of the 1930s.

Stories of female adult educators are in danger of being told less and less in the absence of substantive historical scholarship on women and gender in our field (exceptions include Harris, 1998; McCann, 1989; McManus, 2006). Within the province of Newfoundland, the history of women educators is virtually unknown, in part because of limited archival records (Kealey, 1993) and in part because little educational history has been done there. As a response to this gap, the archival data used in this chapter show that the women literacy teachers in the Newfoundland Adult Education Association (NAEA) from 1930-1945 advanced a very gendered method of teaching that included a focus on family literacy, especially through the mother as head of the household, and through the musical arts.

Newfoundland Adult Education Association
The story begins with the formation in 1929 of the NAEA, the first of its kind in what is now Canada, though 3 years behind the AAACE (see Selman, 1992). The NAEA was established by a group of superintendents of education in St. John’s to address issues of literacy and to thereby contribute to the development of the economy in the Depression years. Speaking to the dire educational situation of the time, the first president of the NAEA, Anglican superintendent
William W. Blackall (1932) commented on the country’s high dropout rate: “statistics show that some 50 per cent of the children of Newfoundland who are attending school at the age of twelve are not there at fifteen years of age” (p. 6). Given that there were no compulsory education laws at the time, this rate of school completion is generous. The NAEA teachers were to address illiteracy by providing education from the most basic of levels (reading and writing) to high school completion.

The NAEA was funded by the Carnegie Corporation from New York which had already underwritten the formation of Memorial College in 1925, and the development of travelling libraries (English, 2011). Records indicate that there were six teachers and one Field Secretary hired at the onset. They were: Elsie May Farwell, Jessie Mifflen, Bertha Northover, Kathleen Thompson, Ida Parsons, Laura Cantwell, and Mary Maddock. By 1947, Jessie was the only one of the original group directly involved in adult education.

**Opportunity School Method**

One of the unique aspects of the NAEA was that it considered the usual teacher training from Memorial College to be insufficient for teaching adults. NAEA teachers such as Sara Coady and Elsie Farwell were sent away to learn the Opportunity School Method which had been developed by a Miss Wil Lou Gray, State Supervisor of Adult Schools in South Carolina. The relationship between Clemson and the NAEA was fostered by Carnegie, which had strong ties with this College and their method of teaching literacy (see NAEA, 1931). When Elsie came home from Clemson College in 1931, she immediately began teaching her staff what she had learned. The Opportunity School Method involved an 8-week literacy school which combined day visits and night schools; it was specially developed to meet the needs of mothers who had difficulty leaving their homes because of child care and household responsibilities.

**Women and the NAEA**

Elsie Farwell and Jessie Mifflen stand out among the original seven women in the NAEA, in part because they left historical records and in part because they are exemplars of their generation of great women who opened up the profession of adult education as an alternative to nursing and teaching children in school (English, 2011). Indeed Elsie was the first person hired by Dr. Vincent Burke, director of adult education for Newfoundland and chair of the NAEA board. Born in Fogo on May 27, 1884, she was educated at the local Anglican school and later at the Teacher’s Training Academy in St. John’s (Dinn, 1984). Having taught children for 17 years, she married in 1918 and was widowed in 1921 when her husband Richard Farwell of Eastport went down through the ice. Elsie went to University of Toronto from 1923 to 1925, and graduated with a Diploma in Social Science at the age of 41, after which she was hired by the NAEA. This position of Field Secretary made Elsie one of the best placed female civil servants in Newfoundland. She oversaw a core staff of 6, along with many other itinerant teachers, and developed a number of adult education schools in various places. In recognition of her leadership, she received the King’s Jubilee medal.

A second literacy heroine is Jessie Mifflen, born in Bonavista in 1906 (died 1994), who in retirement published memories of her years teaching children and adults (e.g., Mifflen, 1989; Tucker et al., 1985). Following teacher training and school teaching, she attained a degree from Mount Allison University, funded in part by a scholarship. After graduation, she went to work...
with the NAEA and later became the director responsible for establishing the library system in Newfoundland. In the co-written book *Yaffle of Yarns* (Tucker et al., 1985), Jessie remembers that she had become disillusioned with teaching children: “It was not, I’m afraid, due to a burning desire to educate the masses that I entered the teaching profession but simply because there seemed to be no alternative when I was ready to earn my living” (p. 86). She is honest in appraisal of her abilities with children. She writes that she “never did get to enjoy the actual classroom teaching and it afforded me no good feeling of accomplishing anything worthwhile” (p. 89). In contrast, adult literacy and library work were a joy to Jessie. In recognition of her accomplishments, she was awarded the Order of Canada and honorary degrees from Memorial and Mount Allison Universities.

It is likely that all the women had completed teaching training before their NAEA appointment. Some of the women likely taught for a few years with the NAEA and then left to get married. Others met a tragic fate. Ida Parsons (1934), a native of Change Islands, and a graduate of Bishop Spencer College, died tragically in a boarding-house fire in Harbour Grace where she was teaching an adult school. Other women who taught with the NAEA were Eleanor Coady Warren who had a BSc in Household Science from Mount St. Vincent University when she began working with the Association (personal correspondence with her daughter, Fran Warren, October, 2011). Eleanor was one of the main instructors when the NAEA had a residential school in St. John’s in 1938. Eleanor’s sister-in-law, Isabel Warren, was a teacher of weaving at that residential school for the NAEA, as well as with the affiliated Women’s Institutes. As was the case with teachers at that time, both Isabel’s and Eleanor’s formal careers ended when they married.

Women such as Sara Coady were also important figures as NAEA. Sara’s personal papers at the Newfoundland Historical Society show that she was born near Burin around 1900, held a diploma in household hygiene, and was involved in the social service aspects of adult education. She began her career teaching children and later, in the mid-1930s, became an employee of the NAEA. Another of the NAEA teachers was Elizabeth Northover, who along with her cousin Bertha, taught in a number of the NAEA schools before she left to get married in Petite Forte (personal correspondence with her daughter, Elizabeth Hayden Ryan, 2008). Although their stories are basically unknown, they were instrumental in establishing adult education as a profession in its own right.

**Innovations in Literacy Education**

It was clear from the outset that the NAEA teaching method was to be different than methods used in schools, in no small part because relatively well-educated women were employed. Of course, there were some men employed, such as Blackall and Vincent Burke, the director. As well, male navigation teachers arrived in the coastal communities at the end of the 8-week literacy program, to teach navigation to the men, but it is safe to say that it was women who constituted the core of the program. That said, the men held the senior jobs, and even the navigation teachers were paid better than the women (see English, 2011).

**Residential Education**

One of the more innovative aspects of the NAEA literacy program was the initiation of a 3-week
summer school in 1938, which was also funded by Carnegie Corporation. This residential session was for 15 female students who attended opportunity school classes around the outports. Some 9 of them were mothers and 4 were grandmothers. They came from as far away as Lourdes and as close as Brigus, and they ranged in age from 17 to 66 years. Although the impending war was to cut short plans for subsequent summer schools, the premise of the first residential school was that if women could be educated then the whole family might be changed. Indeed, the World Association of Adult Education (WAAE) was a prime promoter of this philosophy. In its 1929 Bulletin, the WAAE stressed the need for such schools as a way to relieve women of the pressures of home and family. Unsaid is that if the lower classes could be exposed to higher education and to an urban lifestyle, they were more likely to want to improve their lives. Most of the women who attended in 1938 had never been in St. John’s before; they left outport homes to listen to lectures, have tea with the governor and his wife, and hear addresses from university professors and government leaders. The best educated of the NAEA teachers were involved in the summer school: Mary Maddock, BA, who had been with the NAEA since its inception, was appointed principal; Mercedes Marshall, BA and Eleanor Coady, BSc were also on staff (Maddock, 1938).

Unlike the political Byrn Mawr summer school in Pennsylvania which was co-sponsored by labour groups (Heller, 1984), the NAEA school was a learning vacation of sorts. The author’s personal correspondence with relatives of 8 of the 15 women revealed mostly that they thoroughly enjoyed the 3 weeks and reminisced for a lifetime about their experience. In taking these women out of their everyday homes, the leaders enjoined basic literacy with class and gender elements; it is impossible to know if further summer schools would have been more political or effective.

The Musical Arts
One of the key components of the NAEA Opportunity Schools was the fostering of local music and traditions. Indeed one of the navigation teacher’s jobs was to teach folklore. Each of the night schools had a musical component, presumably allowing for singing of local songs. Teacher Sara Coady (1938) reported that her students “enjoyed the music side of the programme very much, and although we had but a few moments each day to devote to this very important branch of our work, yet we feel that much joy and harmony was brought into many hearts” (p. 2). The use of singing and music was deliberately included as an indigenous teaching method. When Mrs. Farwell explained the curriculum in her Third Annual Report (NAEA, 1935), she said,

Music and community singing is still very popular with our people. With regard to music it seems a pity that in the past people expected it to pay. But why should it show a financial profit any more than a public school library or an art gallery. Most of the people who want to hear good music cannot afford to pay for it, for music may be loved in the cabin as well as in the palace. (pp. 2-3)

Again in the Fifth Annual Report, there is recognition of how important music is in the teaching of literacy (NAEA, 1937). The writer says, “Every year, we realize more and more that that the love of music and a gift for making music, form part of our heritage.” Clearly there is recognition that music could enhance the learning experience for the local students. Similarly,
when Marion Christian reported from Isle Valen in 1940 she noted that music had a way of bringing “smiles to the eager faces and mak[ing] them happy to begin the night’s work” (p.1).

Sara Coady was especially known for using music in her teaching. Mrs. Farwell singled her out for special mention when she reported in a local newspaper that her “music evidently drove dull care away” (Field Secretary, 1935, p. 22). In addition to music, the NAEA brought in crafts as part of their teaching. For instance, Isabel Warren was employed to teach weaving to the women in the summer school. The attempt to make their literacy efforts productive and to fit into the everyday needs of the population was quite deliberate.

**Focus on Family Literacy**

Women like Jessie Mifflen, Sara Coady, and Elsie Farwell were raised in much the same conditions as the people they were teaching and they had a particular affinity for the mothers they taught. They understood not only the local conditions in terms of housing and cooking, but also the time demands on outport women, who were mostly at home with their children. In a 1930s’ setting, these NAEA teachers were enacting family literacy practices, going directly to the mothers and teaching them in ways that nurtured the family. Here is how Blackall (1932), the first president of the NAEA, described the approach:

It is not at all certain that the finest work—good as it is—is done in the classrooms. These devoted teachers are employed during the day-time in visiting homes. …women meet in little groups in their homes and receive instruction. The teacher enters the home as a sympathetic friend, and takes cheer and comfort to many a disconsolate mother. Useful knowledge concerning the management of the home, the management of the children, and the management of the mother’s health is handed across. We have many reports of these homes. They are far too sacred to be published. (p.12)

The writer of the *Eighth Annual Report* (NAEA, 1940) envisages the home clubs as a help for the “tired mother yearning for change and assistance in her mammoth task of home-making” (p. 3). Indeed, the NAEA teachers teamed with benefactors to support the formation of Women’s Institutes so convinced were they of the need to focus on women. Yet, it must be said that the intention of some of these home clubs could be a bit condescending. In a report of Field Secretary Elsie Farwell, she says “it is always a joy to see the homemakers attending the Evening Classes and the little informal clubs, for it is a proof that they want to be able to talk to their children of other things besides the weather and the day’s work at home” (Department of Education, 1942, p. 35). In fairness to Elsie, her every effort was to improve the lives of women and she sincerely wanted to focus on their betterment.

**Conclusion**

Women had an important role for women in teaching in the NAEA movement. Occasioned by a need to address dire literacy rates in Newfoundland, the NAEA became a leader in literacy, and in women’s education generally. Literacy work in the community, not school teaching, attracted the best educated women in that time, providing a career alternative for them. Their life stories and career trajectories, however brief, shed light on early literacy initiatives, and provide an alternative to the camp stories of Frontier College which focused on men. The NAEA was slowly replaced by a more formal and organized system of adult education that involved the vocational
schools in the 1950s. Ironically, this institutionalization was to remove the focus from mothers and families.

Regardless of the methods or the leaders, literacy workers still had much to do as literacy rates in Newfoundland continued to cause problems. The 1945 census showed that 25% of the adult population had less than one year of school, and another 19% had fewer than 5 years of school. (cited in Department of Education, 1948, p. 78). Yet, this example of the NAEA stands out as a major initiative in addressing literacy rates and in providing women with options. Established at the beginning of the Great Depression, the NAEA was to make great strides in addressing illiteracy. Many of its innovations in teaching such as family literacy, home connections and music are efforts that continue to be used today. Yet, much is still unknown about their lives and times.

References


Newfoundland Adult Education Association. (1931-1944). *Annual reports of the Newfoundland Adult Education Association*. GN/77/1/B Box E17, PANL.


Urban Spaces of Creation, Convergence and Collaboration

Behrang Foroughi & Christine Durant
St. Francis Xavier University

Abstract: This presentation explores two different case studies which, from different angles, investigate the importance of created space in cities. It suggests giving more consideration to space within the context of adult learning and calls for approaches in contemporary urban environments that seek out all actors involved in the complex process of place and space in the city. Comparing two wildly different case studies, this paper discusses a needed emphasis on place, through context and processes of collaboration, creation and convergence, and some emerging lessons that still need to be learnt.

Berlin, a Community Garden

Within the literature community gardens have been looked at for different purposes, in most cases for their addition to urban sustainability, to general health and wellness, to beautification, to environmental education and to the building of social capital (Rosol, 2010, Mueller, 2001, Draper & Freedman, 2010, Kingley & Townsend, 2006). They have lightly been referred to in the literature around reclaiming commons and rights to the city (Chatterson, 2010) and as extensions of active citizenship (Rosol, 2010). In part they have been constituted as both urban social movement and as forms of neoliberal service provision (Rosol, 2010). Through collective fighting for place, such as through gardens (as Paddison & Sharp, 2007 point out), community can become stronger as converging points emerge for collective struggle.

Urban gardens mark an entry point for furthering discussions on urban community spaces which, in this case, looks at one multicultural garden in Berlin. As a background, German multicultural gardens were started in the city of Goettingen in 1995 by a group of Bosnian women who wanted to do something more than drink tea together at a refugee center (Mueller, 2001). Since then multicultural gardens have spread across the country. Overall the gardens encourage community creating processes, rather than interventions aimed at immigrants and where self-determination emerges and engages in, for example, alternative economies, in new forms of communication through sharing, and through creating (Mueller, 2001).

“Ton, Steine, Gaerten” is an intercultural garden located in Mariannenplatz in the Kreuzberg district of Berlin, made up predominantly of ethnic Germans and Turks. The garden members squatted the land after trying to legally acquire the use of it, were thrown out by police, only to squat it again. Through negotiations with the city they were granted half the land they had asked for.

Kreuzberg is a unique quarter in Berlin. Activists moved into Kreuzberg in various phases due to, in part, housing speculation, and urban economic crisis. Activist history can be seen in the built environment, as well in creating a strong relationship between subculture and place, between social movement and urban planning in Berlin (Vasudeven, 2011, Sheridan, 2007)
helping to give Kreuzberg its general identity as a sub-culture quarter, supported, as well, by a strong Turkish population, who initially emigrated as factory workers during Germany’s guest worker scheme originating from the 1970s (Saunders, 2010, Sheridan, 2007). There are ongoing struggles to stop recent financial speculation of real estate and gentrification in the quarter (Scharenbery & Bader, 2009), in some social movement flyers and posters, planting gardens and trees in speculated areas have been encouraged. People are feeling pushed out of Kreuzberg and into large high rises on the outskirts of Berlin. Local discourse is concerned with the creation of periphery slums and a war on the poor. Working class people and especially those with an immigration background are the ones most impacted as middle-classes seek ‘hip’ inner city areas, a general trend in cities throughout Europe (Rérat, 2012).

The garden itself is located next to Berlin’s first squat. The garden is colourful with sunflowers growing, a variety of vegetables and flowers on small individual plots. Small gates mark the entrance and the interior is a short labyrinth of pathways. There is a table in the middle with benches, street art, and a recipe covering the surrounding walls. A sign reads “Eine andere Welt ist pflanzbar” – meaning Another world is plantable, a play on the WSF-slogan “another world is possible”. Nearby stands a sign renaming the park as Carlo Giuliani Park, an unofficial title and act of resistance. Carlo Giuliani was killed by Police in 2001 during an anti G8 protest in Genoa.

When restoring the area where the garden is located, the city wanted public parks and were against supporting a community garden on the site. An excerpt from journal notes:

A member explained: “the city is making parks for wealthy people. And they have the idea that parks should all look the same, all with turf, all the same, no diversity. The idea seems to be wherever you go in the world it should look the same. We disagree.” He points to an area across a wide street at what look like new buildings. “They want the park for them, not for us. They don’t want us in the park. They built those benches, and that was one reason they gave for not giving us land, but the benches are never used.” Metal tables with connecting metal stools dot the sidewalk. I had noticed them the last two times I had been to the garden, and no one was using them then or now. I turned towards the garden and noticed a group of people around the main table within the garden, painting banners. I asked if they were part of the garden. “No, many people come and use the garden. That is what it is here for, a place for everyone.”

Kreuzberg is sometimes lamented in local discourse as representing a disconnect between the Turkish and the German population. Too often discourse within Germany points to the failure of integration, without being particularly critical of city and state policies aiding segregation. Within a “Ton, Steine, Gaerten” newsletter is a story written by one garden member of how neighbours came together to get involved in the garden. They referred to the space as becoming a place to have coffee together, to eat and live together. In the garden, for members, it was the first time, even though Turkish and Germans had lived alongside each other for a long time, to speak and get to know each other in an open public space. A few Turkish members said that in over 30 years they had not spoken to a German outside of their apartment building complex. The author asks what is needed for community and answers “Gemeinsamkeit ist das Schlüsselwort!” - Commonality is the key (“Ton, Steine, Gaerten” newsletter, 2011).
Different events take place at the garden. Events are open to the public, and through community garden networks there are invitations to numerous events across the city. In terms of motivations some members said they wanted to know what home-grown food tasted and looked like and to share that together with their children and with friends and to reclaim knowledge. I was told it was experimenting, and that knowledge about gardening came from trial and error, sharing tips with other gardeners, and that sometimes passersby would stop and talk, sharing knowledge and advice. For some, the garden is a place to reconnect with nature and food, and as a non-consumer space. Some link their activities with food networks. Multiple learning is taking place in multiple ways.

The garden is not free of its problems, gardeners lament the occasional vandalism that takes place, suggesting that different people in the surrounding area have different ideas about how to use the place - including the possibility that the garden is seen as aiding in the gentrification that is being fought. The desire to have more space to use and to build something bigger was repeated by a number of members, expansion prevented only by the city. Comparisons were made to a very successful community garden in Berlin that hosts workshops, sells trees and plants, and has a café, offering fresh organic food at affordable prices, as the prime example of what could be a community garden, linking alternative economies, local food and jobs with garden work and place, creating economies of scale. Some gardeners told me that the idea first came from New York, and that it had captured their imagination.

The garden is connected with several other groups which are local, regional, national and global in scope. They are linked to a school, to a social centre, to the local government where there are links to voice concerns and participate to an extent in urban sustainability planning through the network of urban gardens, as well as being part of a network of intercultural gardens. They are linked to networks and social movements centred around food and to land rights with a global scope. Critical links are made between their small plots and to peasants fighting agri-business. Some of their involvements in actions have included a day of solidarity with Via Campesina International Peasant Movement, links to reclaim the fields, which saw 23,000 protesters in Berlin in January to protest against industrial farms and EU farming policy.

**Toronto, Participatory Budgeting in Social Housing**

Within a vastly different urban place setting is a different approach to articulating spatial struggles and impacting people’s engagement. The following case study represents a form of space, where engagement is initiated from above, where significant research has already been undertaken on people’s learning, highlighting some of the ongoing struggles within a particular created space connected to housing.

Toronto housing is the second largest housing provider in North America and the largest in Canada, providing housing for six percent of Toronto’s population. It includes 58,000 units, which house 164,000 tenants. Participatory Budgeting (PB) within the Toronto Community Housing Corporation (TCHC) is a state-sponsored practice of participatory social housing governance in Toronto. Participatory Budgeting (PB) is a process of collaborative management of the allocation of public funds for local needs as prioritized by citizens. This process brings citizens and local communities closer to the decision-making processes around
the public budget allocation that impact their daily lives.

The PB works in the following way: Within each Community Housing Unit (CHU), the manager develops local plans and allocates resources in partnership with the CHU tenant council. Each CHU council develops an accountability framework so that tenants can keep the TCHC accountable on decisions made. Within the Tenant Participation System (TPS), tenant representatives are also involved in budget allocation at both the CHU and city-wide levels. At the CHU level, through their input into the CHU business plans, tenant representatives have the opportunity to influence funding priorities, and at an annual city-wide participatory budgeting exercise, tenant representatives, through extensive deliberations and negotiations, allocate scarce capital dollars in areas with the highest impact on tenants’ lives.

Participation is assumed to benefit participants by providing them the opportunity to gain representation, exercise political rights and influence local decision making. It is also suggested that participation when guided by communicative action can support social consciousness and political community. Meanwhile it is also believed that participants develop a body of tacit knowledge helping them to become more informed and more engaged citizens (Abers, 2000).

In the context of PB, informal learning occurs both intentionally, as a result of conscious planning through informal paths; or tacitly, acknowledged through self-reflections on one’s experiences. Tenant representatives heavily rely on informal learning to enhance their effectiveness as advocates for their communities. Tenant’s informal learning can be classified in four categories: The first is knowledge about the political and organizational structure of social housing management and municipal governance. Second is learning that augments social, political, and civic skills of tenant representatives that help them to engage with and affect the community at large. Third is learning that enhances self-esteem and self-confidence encouraging tenants to pursue community change through political action. Fourth is learning that improves the practice of the TPS.

In a research on tenants’ motivation to participate in PB, respondents’ main reference to volunteering was as an opportunity to exercise authority in order to tackle issues in their community, as well as to educate themselves and the community on governance of social housing in their own housing unit and beyond. They view the PB as a domain where their desire to participate in decision-making over their housing welfare and their desire to develop valuable skills are mutually satisfied. Through the PB they see themselves engaged in developing competencies while exercising community management, both taking place in one (and only one) space provided.

It should be noted that it is wrong to assume that it can be objectively or technically practiced based on the TCHC’s blueprint. Staff and management have diverse perspectives and multiple experiences with regard to the concept of participation. Coupled with these various perspectives is the lack of deliberation on the meaning of the participatory process, which creates a host of challenges that we refer to as the communicative problematique. It has been the staff’s perception of the concept of participation that has helped to shape the characteristics of the participatory spaces and practices. Consequently, the PB was moulded
into a rather confusing format for the tenant representatives. Next is the formal system of participation, a format chosen to institutionalize the practice of participation in the TCHC communities, a designated structure that hosts another set of challenges in sustaining progressive community engagement. The PB tends to bureaucratize participation and thus renders it prone to such faults as slowing the pace of innovation, stratifying the communities into hierarchical structures and reinforcing existing power imbalances within the social fabric of the communities.

**Discussing Spaces**

The difference between the two spaces can be described as created/claimed vs. invited forms of space. The community garden is a created/claimed space, denoting that the space was created from below, by grassroots activities whereas participatory budgeting in social housing is an invited space, initiated from above. While they represent significantly different formations, the garden with stronger links to social movements and radical democracy, the latter, participatory budgeting, makes more connections with institutionalized participation, civil society partnerships and deliberate democracy, there are a number of commonalities amongst them.

First and foremost the spaces have been produced, they are co-created and intended to be spaces that continue to develop, both base involvement on acting rather than being served. They are both focussed on a mutual relationship of learning and active engagement of participants to impact place. Both are based on social justice, and reflect Soja’s, (1989, 2009) notions of spatial justice which include struggles for participation, for improved housing, urban land use, anti-gentrification all representing struggles to reduce spatial inequalities.

There is a strong correlation between both cases linked to learning as a motivation and acting on place, on contributing to place and participating in place. The significant of place is magnified when we think of it through other critical lenses, including Sassen’s (2006) assertion that place is where the global is played out, that in place society is socially produced (Lefebvre, 1974/1991). An example of social reproduction is played out in the participatory budgeting example, whereby public administrators maintain unequal relationships with tenants, which help to formulate hierarchies. The social production of space can also create alternatives and be counter-hegemonic, which both cases demonstrate as a goal of their efforts. Struggles and conflict exist within both cases, participatory budgeting conflicts include the conflict within this social reproduction of inequality and the impacts of bureaucracy on maintaining unequal relationships (Soja, 1989). The garden conflict is more external, struggling for place against a backdrop of hegemonic urban renewal that links to Neil Smith’s, 1996, reformation of the Revanchist City, where neoliberal policies have as a goal to displace and get rid of leftists, immigrants, and socially marginalized groups in the city. In common, both cases place significant conflict and obstacles within the context of relationships with bureaucracy, with public administration, with urban planning. (Adhering to Massey’s, 1994, call for a need for place consciousness, and reflecting Castell’s 1989 position that people must stake out place to preserve meaning and to restore control over work and residence).

Within the garden the ideas of multiplicity and of convergence are formulated as strategies to come together, in otherwise divided places, between Germans and Turkish residents, but also
for all garden members and the community at large, providing a place to converge. The garden draws on weak links and loose networks to draw people together, and this activity is furthered by linking their garden to alter-globalisation movements or what is also called the movement of movements, a convergence of movements, and clearly makes links to the world social forum, the gathering place of movements and seem to answer Whitaker, 2004, call for creation of spaces for convergence, for alternatives. Participatory budgeting, promotes other kinds of convergences that are significant as well, to shifting power. In this case convergence happens between public administrators and tenants to collaborate on just distribution of funds and to increase accountability. Strong collaboration and strong links feature more predominantly in this case and are important to the success of the endeavor, and within a much larger scale than the garden, relationships and how they are formulated are significant contributors to the depth of success, and to the depth of power shifts, which elude to collaborative learning.

Learning is a significant outcome within both places. Within the garden multiple learning is eluded to which includes social learning, place based learning with links to critical pedagogy, and possible links to citizenship learning, to learning in social action, more conclusiveness will come through the research proper. More pronounced and from concluded research tenants involved in participatory budgeting have undergone significant learning, which can be described as transformative, citizenship learning, and social learning increasing knowledge, skills and attitudes for continued action continually impacting and shaping the spaces of participatory budgeting they are involved in. There is a strong relationship between learning and continuing to create in place.

However, learning is largely focused on the participants, on the tenants, which brings up important questions. If we take place more seriously in community development learning, and include everyone in place as contributing to place, then a program of learning and engagement needs also to include public administrators. What becomes highly evident is that facilitating a tenant-driven community planning process requires a shift in the values, roles and responsibilities of conventional public servants. Rather than control by property managers and bureaucrats this calls for housing authorities to lead by stepping back and complementing managerial efficiency and formal accountability by instilling political sensitivity, responsiveness to community values, and social equity into the practice of social housing governance. It calls for new learning. Understanding the dynamism between the staff and tenants’ agency, for example, and how learning (in both cases), relationships and interactions constitute and characterize the spaces of participation is extremely beneficial to community planners and adult educators interested in exploring how such created spaces, convergences and collaborations are forged and how possibilities for participation and participatory processes contribute to active learning (in a continual process of creating for self-determination, dependent upon continual learning).

References
Chatterton, P. (2010). Seeking the urban common: furthering the debate on spatial justice. *City*, 14(6), 625-62


Massey, D. (1994). *Space, Place and Gender*. Minneapolis: USA


“All [employers] want is a number:” Language Policy and Systems of Classification Mediating Internationally Educated Professionals’ Employment Relations

Tara Gibb
University of British Columbia, Athabasca University

Abstract: The purpose of this paper is to examine how a system of classification emerges through the design and implementation of the Canadian Language Benchmarks 2000 (CLB 2000), a competency-based language framework for assessing the language proficiency of immigrants whose first language is not English.

Introduction
The integration of highly skilled internationally educated immigrants into the labour market has been a concern for Canada and many OECD nations. For internationally educated professionals (IEPs) who want to participate in the ‘global knowledge economy,’ migration to another country often involves the assessment of both their professional credentials and knowledge in the host nation’s official language(s). Existing research demonstrates that lack of facility in the host nation’s dominant language(s) has a detrimental impact on the earnings and employment participation of IEPs (Bannerjee, 2009; Chiswick, 2006). In Canada, immigrants’ knowledge of English is often measured according to the Canadian Language Benchmarks (CLB 2000), developed by the Canadian federal government. This framework is a 12-level scale of communicative competency consisting of performance tasks and outcomes. Increasingly, the CLB framework is being used to profile the English language demands for the professions (e.g. nursing, engineering, accounting) to develop profession-specific language exams and programs. This paper examines some of the textual articulations and social relations that constitute the categories of language competence outlined in the CLB document.

Theoretical Perspective
Employing Dorothy Smith’s (1999; 2005) institutional ethnography, this paper seeks to understand the tensions of how the CLB 2000 as a policy text organizes and coordinates the social relations and work activities of language instructors, language consultants, and government representatives and constitute a system of classification based on English language proficiency. Smith (2005) explained that the local and daily aspects of our lives are increasingly organized and regulated through institutions such as governments and corporations and one method for regulating people’s activities is through the proliferation of texts. The relationship between the daily aspects of life and these institutions constitute Smith’s notion of ruling relations. Ruling relations are “that extraordinary yet ordinary complex of relations that are textually mediated, that connect us across space and time and organize our everyday lives” (Smith, 2005, p. 10). Ruling occurs when local knowledge that emerges from people’s work practice is subordinated to textually discursive knowledge such as that articulated in official texts. According to Smith (2005), texts are an element of social relations and contribute to the formation of institutional realities. Investigating people’s standpoint and the ways that official texts organize their work activities form a methodology for understanding how institutional realities emerge. This paper seeks to examine how assigning quantitative values (i.e. a benchmark number) contribute to constituting this system of classification based on language
ability by drawing on textual analysis and the standpoint of language experts who are often responsible for profiling the language demands of the professions.

**Policy and Systems of Classification**

Policy problems are often targeted toward addressing issues with respect to an identified group (Scheurich, 1994). In this case, the identified group is immigrants to Canada whose first language is not English. Policies construct categories for classifying and organizing various subjectivities (Luke, 1995/1996). “These categories are not so much real qualities of the world but are products of particular cultural and historical ways of thinking” (A. Pennycook, 2001, p. 107). Indeed, remnants of Canada’s colonial history, which divided and divides citizens and immigrants along categorical lines of gender, race, class, and language, continue to echo through current citizenship and immigration policy (Bannerji, 2000; Thobani, 2007).

Bowker and Star (1999) explained that the act of classifying filters into most aspects of life and range from standardized to ad hoc forms of classification. Education generally and EAL education particularly have not been immune to creating categories by which to classify learners. Willinsky (1998) argued that these systems of classification stem from “five centuries of studying, classifying, and ordering humanity within an imperial context [which] gave rise to peculiar and powerful ideas about race, culture, and nation what were, in effect, conceptual instruments that the West used both to divide up and educate the world” (pp. 2-3). Classifying learners’ language abilities has been supported historically through the conceptual frameworks of theoretical linguistics and the sub-disciplines of sociolinguistics and applied linguistics (Parakarma, 1995). Broadly, the categories have been labeled “native speaker” and “non-native speaker” historically. However, attempts by various governments and states to ensure accountability and regulation in the spending of public funds for language education are producing new categories and systems of classification.

In Canada, the categories of listening, speaking, reading, and writing classify IEPs’ language abilities along a twelve-level scale. Scales are based on standards that make categories of people visible and while scales construct particular identities, they also make people into objects (Nespor, 2004; Popkewitz, 2004). In the following section, I examine some is and is not visible textually through the CLB document and some of the ways textual articulations about language competence emerge through social relations.

**Textual Articulations and Social Relations**

*Articulations of Competence*

Through a competency-based approach, outlined in 186-pages, the *CLB 2000* attempts to standardize English language learning and assessment across a range of learning contexts (e.g. settlement, professions and occupations, post-secondary institutions) and geographic locations (i.e. Pan-Canadian). The Preface of the *CLB 2000* explains that the development of the benchmarks is “revolutionary” and will resolve the lack of standardization by establishing a “common language” for describing language ability (p. V). Competency-based learning is the foundation of that common language and it establishes “a national standard for planning second language curricula for a variety of contexts, and a common ‘yardstick’ for assessing the outcomes” (p. VIII). A common language, in turn, will facilitate the establishment of a “portable” credential; therefore, alleviating immigrants’ frustrations in being re-assessed every
time they apply for a job, apply for admittance to an educational institution, or apply to receive a license from a professional regulatory body (p. VIII).

Each of the twelve benchmarks in the CLB 2000 lists communicative tasks and performance outcomes for each of the four language skills (i.e. listening, speaking, reading, and writing) and users of the document are expected to describe and assess the communicative proficiency of EAL learners based on these lists. “Competency statements stress what the learner can do” (p. VIII, emphasis in original). The focus is on an individual’s application of knowledge and skills through the demonstration of performance outcomes or competencies (p. VIII). A CLB competency is defined as “a general statement of intended outcome of learning” and is “directly observable and measurable performance outcomes” (p. X). As a national framework, the benchmarks “describe a clear hierarchy, or progressive continuum of knowledge and skill that underlie language proficiency” and enable learning to be clearly demonstrated on the continuum (p. VIII).

Emphasis on doing and measurable performance reflect the behavioural approach to competency. Competence is demonstrated through discrete behaviours associated with the completion of particular tasks. Successful performance of tasks, usually determined through direct observation, task-based proficiency assessment tests, evaluation portfolios, or classroom-based evaluation techniques including checklists of outcomes or anecdotal reports, determine competency (CLB 2000, p. IX).

Judgment, however, on what constitutes ‘competence’ and ‘proficiency’ is contextual. In the case of language learning, competency assumes that a standard language exists. This notion of standard language, however, is arbitrarily based on cultural and social norms (Pennycook, 2001). When this standard is articulated and adhered to, it reduces the possibility for acknowledging and accepting the variances that exist in language. The CLB 2000 attempts to acknowledge linguistic variance by explaining that proficiency should not be judged by the abstract norm of the “educated native speaker” because even within the norm, there is a range of proficiency (p. X). Even though the CLB 2000 attempts to acknowledge that a (limited) range of performance exists, there is still an expectation that speakers will speak a variety that resembles standard ‘Canadian English.’ That standard, however, is contested. Listing descriptions of language through competencies to be performed assumes a normative and static view of language. It assumes that language is objective and value-free and silences the politics of how knowledge is constituted in particular localities (McNamara, 2001; Pennycook, 2001; 2010).

Visibility and Invisibility in Policy Documents
Analyzing the purposes of policies involves not only questioning who is made visible and how they are categorized; it also includes questioning who remains silent or invisible in the policy’s textual articulation. According to the Preface to the CLB 2000, in 1992 the ministry that would become Citizenship and Immigration Canada (CIC) began consultations with experts in second language teaching and assessment, expanding the circle of consultations in 1993 to include members from post-secondary institutions, provincial governments, immigrant service organizations, school boards, and independent consultants. This National Working Group developed and tested a pilot version of the CLB before the release of the final document in 2000. Acknowledgement and thanks is given to specific members of government and the various
institutions involved. It is important to note that in the full two pages of acknowledgements, only one reference is given to some anonymous EAL learners who participated in regional workshops on the potential development of the benchmarks (CLB 2000, p. VI-VIII).

Under New Public Management discourses of citizen engagement and accountability, information-based tools, such as the CLB framework, often involve consultation processes (Pal, 2006). Consultation processes in policymaking can be appealing because they give the appearance of upholding democratic practices, however they often reproduce societal power relations (Gale, 2001; Scheurich, 1994). In this case, those for whom the CLB 2000 is supposed to ‘help’ are only marginally involved (i.e. new immigrants whose first language is not English). As Pal (2006) explained, generally consultation processes are designed to gather information and ensure the smooth implementation and maintenance of programs. These processes are not about negotiating the values of particular groups nor are they about determining the direction policy should take. These decisions are often determined before consultations begin (Pal, 2006).

McNamara (2001) explained that competency-based frameworks in language education are problematic because “they are presented to teachers as solutions to some of their curriculum and assessment needs” (p. 341). He further explained that consultations with teachers are used to validate such frameworks “to ensure their political acceptability,” but hide the managerial and regulatory functions of such policies (p. 341).

While new immigrants were only marginally present in the development of the CLB 2000, they take front stage in the opening pages of the preface. The goal of the CLB is “to describe accurately where the learner’s ability to use English places him or her within the national descriptive framework of communicative language” (p. VIII). Learning is expected to be “tailored to the individual’s abilities and learning styles” as well as “purposeful, relevant and meaningful to the learner” (p. VIII). The preface also stated that the CLB assists immigrants in “demonstrating” their language skills to employers and to registrars the language skills that are needed to “succeed.” The CLB scale enables immigrants to “compare their current level of ability in English” with the requirements of a program of study, occupation or profession. “At long last, immigrants can plot out for themselves, in advance, their own paths of language learning to attain their goals” (p. V).

Even though the policy purports to be learner centred and positions immigrants as agents, the processes of language assessment are decontextualized from the social and power relations in Canadian society. The problem (lack of standardization and portable credentials) and solution (a national framework of assessment) are articulated in such a way that immigrants are positioned as empowered agents in control of determining their learning and employment destinies. Demonstration of performance is placed entirely on newcomers to Canada while those who decide whether competency has been achieved or not are absent. The learner is expected to do all the performing with little consideration for whom, and whose social and cultural norms, are determining the ‘success’ of that performance. By merely acquiring an understanding of the benchmarks framework, it is assumed that newcomers will be able to navigate Canada’s education and employment systems seamlessly.
The Social Relations of Quantifying Learning

The standpoint of the language experts, however, reveals that the construction of competence is embedded in the social relations of the workplace and occupational groups. McNamara (2001) explained that during assessment the social construction of performance is ignored. Assessment is based on the performance of the learner and it does not take into consideration how the assessor contributes to constructing the performance environment (McNamara, 2001). I would add, however, that leading up to the moment of assessment, there are webs of social and textual relations that constitute the performance environment that remain hidden from view. The standpoint of the language experts reveals that providing employers and professional regulatory bodies with numerical representation of language competence construct language ability as easily measured.

The benchmark levels articulated in the CLB 2000 organize people’s understanding of language ability by assigning numbers to the four skills (listening, speaking, reading, and writing). Benchmark numbers are descriptors of “what a learner can do at the time of performance assessment (for placement or evaluation (exit determination)” (CLB 2000, p. IX). While benchmark numbers are meant to encapsulate what internationally educated professionals can do with the English language, the work that goes into determining what constitutes the number is complex and contested.

Participants explain that employers “want a number” because it represents an ‘objective’ measurement of improvement or indicates occupational and safety standards have been met.

I think that a lot of the training in workplaces is, they kind of want, again this is my impression, that they [employers] want to be able to measure it and it’s, I often think it’s something like safety training. You know this is where engineering companies have put a lot of energy into. Safety in the workplace, they can measure whatever training or campaign they have for safety and they can measure it at the end with reduced accidents or something like that. So, I think there’s a mindset that’s a little bit like that when they go into this idea of having language training that they can offer some training and then measure it somehow in some way like maybe the managers can report that there are fewer incidents of miscommunication or something like that. [Language expert, instructor]

Participants indicate, however, that measuring language ability is complex because many aspects of communication are intangible. Provision of a CLB level, represented in numerical form, is meant to indicate a particular level of skill and competence. Nonetheless, communication is often immeasurable as one participant explains:

Language takes time, really takes time to learn and especially when we’re talking about people already at a high level, sort of CLB 7 and above, that the kinds of improvements you’re going to see are really very limited and so it was a hard discussion to kind of say, because they were very results oriented and wanted to see real tangible proof. Like, “can you give them another test and tell me how much better they do on this test,” that kind of thing. Difficult to demonstrate and
I think some of the benefits in the long run were less tangible. Things like increased confidence and self-reporting that they spoke up in meetings more often than they had before and reports from HR (Human Resources) that they were participating in company activities more than they had before. [Language expert, instructor]

Much has been written on the elusive task of defining skill and determining measurability. In his critique or human capital theory, Brown (2001) explained that ‘skill’ is difficult to define and measure. He further articulated, “the obsession with measurable outcomes has led [human capital approaches] to ignore the process of skill formation” (p. 25, emphasis in original).

Indeed, the language experts experience a disjuncture; in trying to meet the expectations of employers and funding bodies by supplying a number through articulations of language competence in the CLB document, the process of language learning is diminished. Their discussions allude to Brown’s (2001) argument that “it is no longer helpful to think of skills as an appendage to the person who possesses them. Skill acquisition is not a technical formality. The embodiment of what it means to be skilled including cognitive, emotional, and cultural facets, also leads to a better understanding of how these are socially constructed” (p. 16).

The language experts are expected to measure competence, but experience a disjuncture between text-mediated knowing and knowing that emerges from their practice.

Discussion
Texts are an organizer of social relations and can shift local practice-based knowing toward text-mediated knowing. The benchmark levels articulated in the CLB 2000 organize people’s understanding of language ability along a hierarchy of skill that categorizes IEPs according to their language abilities. The CLB document mediates people’s understanding of language and communication as tangible and measurable performance outcomes. Communication, however, is embedded within the socio-cultural and power relations of the workplace. Attempting to measure communication according to a universal (i.e. Canadian) standard of English language ability objectifies both the processes of learning and the IEPs who are being assessed.

Understanding language as a social practice, however, points to the complexity of language and communication. However, the experiences of the language experts indicate that employers, funding bodies, and professional regulatory bodies, who have concerns about accountability and public safety, are seeking simple and objective measurements of IEPs’ language abilities. The quantitative value of benchmark levels classifies language ability into a hierarchy and makes decisions with respect to hiring and the recognition of credentials easier for employers and professional licensing bodies. The language experts’ experiences reveal that what constitutes skill for professionals to function in the workplace is difficult to define, ambiguous and contested. The struggles they encounter during the assessment processes demonstrate that the determination and assessment of skill is often of the individual and excludes the local and social construction of knowledge and skill. IEPs’ abilities to communicate in the English language become objects of study and are classified as discernable skills. Communication, however, is a social practice that is constituted through the social relations of a particular culture, workplace or profession.
References


Critical Literacies and Democratic Learning: Using Fiction Reading and Writing to Engage in Lifelong Learning Connected to Citizenship

Patricia A. Gouthro
Mount Saint Vincent University
Susan M. Holloway
University of Windsor
Erin J. Careless
Mount Saint Vincent University

Abstract: Drawing upon research from a Social Science and Humanities Research Council (SSHRC) study looking at connections between lifelong learning, citizenship, and the craft of writing fiction, this paper explore the possibilities of fostering critical literacies and democratic learning opportunities. The paper explores the concept of critical literacies, discusses some of the insights provided by participants in the study with regards to how a critical approach to understanding fiction may foster democratic learning, and discusses strategies for fostering critical literacies amongst learners.

Introduction
If, as Brookfield and Holst (2010) assert, one of the main objectives for educators should be to work towards creating democratic learning opportunities that encourages learners to pay attention to the needs of those who are less privileged, then it is important for educators to consider strategies to engage learners to think deeply and critically about the societies in which they live. A critical literacy framework (Huang, 2011; Lapp & Fisher, 2010) challenges learners to think about the social, cultural and political contexts that frame issues that they may be reading about and considers how learners may be encouraged to think about writing in critical and creative ways. Drawing upon a Social Science and Humanities Research Council (SSHRC) funded study that examines connections between lifelong learning, citizenship, and fiction writing, this paper focuses on what is meant by the term “critical literacies”, examines how fostering critical literacies is an important component of developing the capacity for active and engaged citizens, and finishes with some strategies to facilitate learning that may encourage critical literacies connected to fiction reading and writing.

Critical Literacies
Critical literacies draw attention to power relationships that exist within reading and writing texts. Lapp & Fisher (2010) explain that “critical literacy is the practice of evaluating information, insights and perspectives through an analysis of power, culture, class and gender” (p. 159). They point out the value of having learners consider how different perspectives can be explored and debated. Huang (2011) discusses how developing the capacity for critical literacies may encourage students to develop “conscious reading” skill that involves “considering multiple ways of viewing an issue” (p. 150). Some of the benefits of this are that students may then be more open to considering alternative frameworks for understanding, and may also be more motivated to write themselves as a way to express their own perspectives or viewpoints. While discussions around critical literacy often focus on learning within formal education and school-based settings (Harvard-Hinchburger, 2006; Wilner, 2005), critical literacies can also be fostered
in community-based and adult learning contexts, such as can be seen in the project by Pinhasi-Vittorio & Martinsons (2008) where they worked with incarcerated women to creatively write plays for theatre performances.

Critical literacy critiques the relationships between power, language, and knowledge. Language is understood from a critical literacy viewpoint as always embedded in historical, political, and social contexts, which influence how and why certain discourses are privileged over others. For example, author Roy Miki talks about his writing as heavily embedded in his experiences during the Japanese Internment: “I’ve had to grapple with the effects of internment, psychologically, emotionally, historically... and politically. A lot of my writing stems from it, and in part it’s the thing that motivated me to write... It has both allowed me to write and it also challenged me to go beyond it”. Through fiction, readers and writers can explore important social issues, consider historical factors that have shaped their environment, and consider alternative perspectives and frameworks for understanding.

Learning for Democracy

Adult educators often assert the importance of preparing learners to engage in democratic contexts by addressing strategies to enhance dialogical and critical approaches to learning. Bagnell (2010) takes up some of the debates around engaged and active citizenship, noting that this is often linked with learning around “knowledge such as that of the nature of democratic processes and their informing procedural values, and the skills involved in networking, collaborating, arguing, researching issues, and advocating positions” (p. 451). Learning connected to creating more active or engaged citizenship may involve participation in civil society, in community contexts, in cyberspace, or in public spaces such as libraries (Welton, 2005; Irving & English, 2011; Kranich, 2010). It may involve engagement in feminist arts-based approaches that use theatre or fabric arts/crafts (Butterwick & Selman, 2003; Clover & Stalker, 2008), or, as we argue, it may be taken up through other formal or informal opportunities for learning, such as through reading or writing fiction.

Through fiction reading and writing, there is the potential to encourage learners to explore alternative perspectives, to gain insights into social, political and cultural problems located within their country as well as within other societies, and to foster a more reflective approach to understanding how individuals negotiate their roles and identities within any particular society. Critical literacies involve developing the capacity to critically assess some of the ways in which power is infused through all learning and life contexts.

Using a critical literacy approach involves making educators aware of how certain epistemologies get counted and others get marginalized. As we prepare our students to teach in various contexts, it important that we help them to see as educators that language is value-laden and worth analyzing to better identify and comprehend ideological assumptions grounded in everyday discourses. Gee (1990, 2008) notes the meanings of words “vary across contexts” and are “tied to cultural models” and must to some extent always be negotiated in the context of social interactions (p. 10). Our everyday assumptions around language and how we interpret reality may be challenged if we are presented with alternative perspectives through reading, writing, debating and sharing ideas through the use of fiction.
Understanding the subtleties and complexities of language is important if educators are to help foster democratic learning contexts. Giroux (2005) gives an example from the US, although his point may be applicable to a Canadian context, in which he argues that citizens seem to be sometimes severed from the tools of language which could better serve them:

The United States is increasingly marked by a poverty of critical public discourse, making it more difficult for the American people to appropriate a critical language outside of the market that would allow them to link private problems to public concerns and issues (p. 3).

This capacity to make these kinds of linkages, or to develop a sociological imagination whereby students can make connections between individual problems with social structural issues, involves developing abstract and complex thinking processes. The ability to move beyond localized, personal concerns, to be able to understand broader social contexts is beneficial, if democratic learning is to occur. Through fiction, although one reads or writes a tale that focuses on the circumstances of particular individuals, through critical analysis, discussion, and debate, connections to these broader societal and cultural issues can be revealed and explored in depth.

Fostering critical language that serves to promote social justice issues, both in thought and deed, is a primary tenet of critical literacy. As Giroux points out then, “critical public discourse” is key to adult educators promoting amongst the greater population a dialogue, which beckons members of society to believe that true democracy, rather than the hollowed out version currently produced through neoliberal forces, is feasible. Similarly, Brookfield and Holst (2010) argue that social justice issues need to be at the forefront of democratic debate.

In order to take up these concerns, adult educators need to be concerned with how they can provided more sophisticated levels of understanding and analysis amongst their learners. Language, and the tools of critical literacies are important considerations. “There can be no liberation of the self or other,” says Morrell, “without tools or language to perform counter-readings of dominant texts that serve the interests of power” (p. 114). Through reading and writing fiction, learners can also explore the different nuances and meanings of words, and consider how we “paint a picture” of the world through various images, scenes, and dialogue. This knowledge can then be used in other reading and writing contexts, to foster deeper and richer literacies, to enable learners to engage critically as citizens.

The New London Group (2000) call for civic pluralism, whereby the role of the state is to “arbitrate difference” and where social order differences “are negotiated in such a way that they complement each other, and where people have the chance to expand their cultural and linguistic repertoires so that they can access a broader range of cultural and institutional resources” (p. 15). As educators, our role is to help prepare learners to participate actively as literate and knowledgeable citizens, able to work dialogically to resolve differences. This study explores some of the ways in which fiction reading and writing can help to develop the capacities of learners to understand and engage in democratic society.
Research Study
The SSHRC study includes over thirty interviews with authors from across Canada, as well as a smaller number from the US and the UK, for cross-cultural comparison. The authors range from emerging writers to well-established and recognized authors, who write primarily either in literary fiction, crime fiction, or in children/YA (young adult) fiction. Interviews from “key informants” in publishing, government and educational sectors have been included to provide insights into the programs and supports that exist to support Canadian fiction writing.

Fiction Reading and Writing
Reading and writing fiction provides many opportunities for learners to consider important issues pertaining to citizenship. Author Christine Walkle explains, “In many ways, books are like mirrors into who we are, who we want to be, who we don’t want to be.” Using a critical literacy framework, readers can debate the importance of what Canadian novels tell us about our country, whether in a classroom, a coffee shop, or at a book club. Reading fiction from a range of authors opens up discussion around the idea of a “Canadian voice” in considering who is represented in Canadian literature. Educators can introduce students to Aboriginal authors, Newcomers, writers diverse in geographic locations, age, gender, and sexual orientation. By reading fiction it becomes clear that Canadians are representative of many cultures, religions, and lifestyles. This, as literary author Emma Donoghue explains, may lead to consideration around citizenship and identity: “So having been through this immigration process twice myself, moving first to England and then to Canada, I’m really intrigued as to what that does to people’s lives and their identities.”

Reading from a broad spectrum and from different cultural and social perspectives can help challenge the taken-for-granted assumptions that we hold, thus encouraging both critical thinking and awareness. Being aware of social inequities is the first step to changing them. Educators who draw upon a critical literacy framework can build upon this awareness, by encouraging learners to think about social, political, cultural and economic factors that motivate characters’ actions, shape dialogue, and influence plot development.

Fostering Critical Literacies
There are a number of different strategies using fiction reading and writing to foster a critical literacy approach that may enhance democratic learning opportunities. By examining fiction, learners may have opportunities to reflect upon different ways for handling conflict, communication, and negotiation. Even children can be encouraged to think about why a particular character may approach a problem from a different position, and consider why conflict may arise and how it may be resolved – important dialogical skills that need to be developed as citizens in a democracy. For example, in reflecting upon how as an author she looks at plot and character development, Education professor and children’s author Kari-Lynn Winters explains:

Typically you’ll have a character that starts out wanting something, has a desire for something. They’ll do something about it, there’s some sort of action that is initiated by the character and will not sit well with another character in the book. You usually get a minor reaction, and because the character still hasn’t received their goal yet, they’re going to keep on pursuing that goal even if they don’t want it
anymore. So they're going to keep on doing these sort of actions. They might say one thing and really want something else.

In addition to discussing why a character might behave a certain way, learners can also be asked to think about why an author might have a character behave a certain way – what kind of problem is the author trying to highlight? How might the author have developed the story in a different way? Through critical questions such as these, learners can be encouraged to deepen their capacity for analysis and debate—important skills for democratic citizens.

Wilner (2005) discusses the importance of carefully designing assignments to encourage learners to move beyond simply thinking that everyone’s opinion is equally valid, so that students are challenged to think about deeper moral issues. Huang (2011) argues for the need to think “beyond the text” to consider broader social and cultural contexts around issues that are brought up in fiction writing. Canadian programs that match immigrant or rural youth with established writing mentors provide opportunities for teens and young adults to find their own “voices” and think about how their writing can explore issues pertaining to citizenship.

It is important that different voices are heard often in fiction writing, as this serves to challenge inequity on a deeper level as well. Crime fiction author Frankie Bailey discussed the lack of celebrated African American authors in this genre in particular. She believes that “it’s very hard if you’re a member of a minority group to write a book that’s going to involve only people of your group—especially when you’re writing about the criminal justice system in modern times”. Because of marginalization in society, Bailey feels that “any time you’re the ‘other’, you spend so much time observing the dominant group that you have an advantage in terms of creating characters”. Bailey’s comments reflect the argument made by theorists who argue that through standpoint epistemology, individuals who are in peripheral positions often have an epistemological advantage, in that they can view things from a unique and privileged position. Using fiction may be one way to illustrate this point for learners.

In addition to critiquing existing social orders, the New London Group (2000) are important for their work in suggesting how critical literacy plays a role in envisioning a creative forces to shape the future design of our world. They coined the term “multiliteracies” which refers to the interconnected, dialogic nature of texts that criss-cross modalities of print, technology, semiotics, orality, and visual arts, to name just a few. Or, put another way, multiliteracies is defined as the “multiplicity and integration of significant modes of meaning-making, where the textual is also related to the visual, the audio, the spatial, the behavioral” (p. 61). So within the field of critical literacy, there is interest in the aesthetics of art (including creative writing) as a form of counter-hegemony. Brookfield (2010), drawing upon the ideas of Marcuse, expands this point: “The political significance of art is that it helps us make this break with the ordinary and gives us new forms of visual and spoken language that open us to new ways of sensing and feeling” (p. 146).

Multi-literate also include media literacies, through films, the internet, and other technological forums for communication. Increasingly fiction is available not just through books, but also on e-readers, and through forums such as “fan fiction” sites on the internet where readers go in and write their own scenarios and endings for characters that they are interested in. Children’s author Peter Cumming reflects:
I can't fathom young people growing up today who really have access to the whole world through the internet. I can just barely imagine how empowering and exciting that is because I know for me that was through books. Through reading "Leaves of Grass" or Lin Yutang on "The Importance of Living" or whatever it was. It opened up whole worlds to me.

Computers provide a means by which individuals who wish to write can post their stories, exchange ideas with other interested writers, and even look at “indie-publishing” – where they may try to market their own work through outlets such as Amazon. Although the authors included in this study were all published through traditional routes, many participants discussed the impact of changing technologies on publication opportunities. At writing conferences, there is also a great deal of discussion around the significant impact of new technologies to provide alternative venues for publication and for authors to communicate with each other and with readers.

As educators, there are many ways that we can foster multi-literacies with regards to fiction. We can use the internet to explore writing sites and learn about different authors. We can consider using you-tube videos, social media and forums to encourage discussion and dialogue. Years Steven & Brown (2011) give the example of using blogging in a classroom context to help students learn about the holocaust. Irving & English (2011) look at how adults in community contexts may engage in learning related to social movements through establishing connections in cyberspace. Adult educators in community contexts can also use creative approaches to foster critical forms of learning that may use other forms of publication to support learning. For example, Cameron (2011) uses the creation of “zines” by young rural women as a form of community-based education to look at concerns related to depression.

**Final Thoughts**

There is no easy recipe to create thoughtful, critical and engaged citizens, but an important part of our work as educators is to consider the kinds of learning that will cultivate democratic capacities amongst our students. If we are to encourage the development of critical literacies, we need to think widely and deeply about our goals as educators. This research project points to some of the valuable opportunities for learning that may be developed in connection to reading and writing fiction that may foster these kinds of literacies, and ultimately, one hopes, these kinds of citizens.

**References**


Cameron, P. (2011). Using zines to explore young rural women’s “depression” as community education. *Proceedings of the joint Adult Education Research Conference and the*
Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education. OISE: Toronto, Ontario.


What do You Think You’re Doing?
An Examination of Developing a Theory and Practice of Teaching Teachers.

Erin Graham
University of British Columbia

Abstract: This paper examines some of the tensions, contradictions and opportunities that arise for new Graduate Teaching Assistants (GTAs) in the Teacher Education Program of a large, research-intensive Canadian university. This paper is organized as a case study based on my experience as a new GTA in this program. This case charts my analysis of various tensions between the University and the teacher education program. As part of this examination, I offer an analysis of the training PhD candidates receive for teaching in the teacher education program. My experiences and observations of these tensions contribute to a developing ‘praxis’ as an educator and academic.

A Dialectic of Education: Negotiating the gap between the Teacher Education Program and the Research Intensive University: Same Campus Different Planet.

This paper is based on my experience of teaching in a Teacher Education program within a large research-intensive Canadian university. In this section, I will describe some indications of a simmering tension between the University and the Teacher Education Program (TEP). I argue that this tension is also often felt in the relations between teacher candidates and the PhD Candidates who offer instruction in their program. I first describe the ‘big picture’ contradictions between the TEP and the University, then describe some of the parallel smaller scale tensions between GTAs and Teacher Candidates.

Essentially, the teacher education program is a ‘trade school’ within a research-intensive university. The program seeks to provide teacher candidates with a set of skills and tools they will implement in their careers as K-12 educators. The University, on the other hand, is “A place of mind”14, rather than practice. The department in which I am a candidate is a place of rich intellectual discovery and knowledge production. But teaching as a form of knowledge production and distribution is under-valued. Faculty are lauded and their careers advance when they produce publications and successful grant applications and other achievements related to research—but teaching itself will not necessarily advance one’s career. The University is a research-intensive institution. Research is conducted “in the field”, in laboratories, and in archival vaults. Knowledge is thus produced, and then disseminated through peer-review publications, books and lectures. Teaching as a research methodology and form of knowledge production and distribution, and the programs or courses designed to develop pedagogical theories and improve teaching practice seem superfluous to the main purpose of such a university.

This devaluation is often subtle. It is evidenced by the slender preparation and mentorship support offered to PhD candidates employed as GTAS. Preparation of PhD candidates to provide instruction in the teacher education program consists chiefly of a 24-hour Instructional Skills

14 “A Place of Mind” is this university’s motto.
Workshop (ISW) and mentorship of a tenured faculty member. Graduate students from across
the University are trained to facilitate these workshops. ISWs are not program specific—rather
they provide instruction, practice and support to new and experienced teachers on teaching skills
and techniques. New Graduate Teaching Assistants (GTAs), in the Teacher Education program
are additionally invited to monthly GTA workshops of 1½ hour in length which address different
aspects of teaching teachers. In addition to these supports, GTAs sometimes carve out the time to
meet together to talk about our teaching experiences and to trade ideas and techniques. In my
experience, Faculty mentorship support has been inconsistent. I have been fortunate to be
mentored by a professor who is passionate about teaching; and I’ve developed relationships with
other faculty who are generous to me and have offered me some helpful guidance. Some of my
colleagues have not been so lucky.

In all, GTAs are under-supported by the university infrastructure. This is not the fault of the
faculty or the teacher education office—it is a systemic problem that is inherent in the structure
of the institution that privileges research and publication over teaching and pedagogy throughout
the University. This tension is at least two-way, as well. Teacher candidates want practical skills,
and often do not see how theoretical concepts of education can help their practice. Teacher
education programs still do not adequately address the problem of connecting theory and practice
in such a way that teachers can handle the problems of teaching through theory-guided action
(Korthagen, 2006: 1021).

One GTA’s Experience—
I am a PhD candidate with years of experience in the wider field of adult education including
front line social services and feminist organizations. I have had opportunities to provide informal
learning environments and programs to adults, but I have never been a school teacher. In my
experience, public school teachers are wary of people like me, teacher educators who have little
or no experience in K-12 classrooms. We do not understand the challenges they face in relation
to Education Ministry policies, school administration demands and classroom management
issues (to name a few factors). We may have a theoretical understanding of how the system
works, but we don’t have the practical experience. I am acutely aware of my limitations in this
regard and am somewhat apologetic about my lack of experience with the very practice in which
I am offering instruction.

However, it is also true that those of us whose work and life experiences of education have been
at arm’s length from the K-12 education system have much to contribute given our broad range
of experiences and perceptions. Over the past 20 years, I have met and worked with many people
who have been damaged or abandoned by the education system. Since returning to graduate
school, I’ve encountered ideas that help me understand how these damages occur, and put them
into a larger context of neo-liberalism, colonialism, and capitalist patriarchy. Teaching in the
teacher education program is an opportunity to deepen my understanding of these operations of
domination and to investigate with others potentially liberating alternatives to the reproductive
modes of education.

Many teacher candidates are returning to school after pursuing careers in a variety of fields not
necessarily related to education. We have a lot to offer each other. I suggest, however, that we
are set up in somewhat tense, if not downright adversarial relations before we meet in the classroom.

**Theoretical Considerations**

I use as my theoretical base Pierre Bourdieu’s analysis of the education system as a reproductive institution which operates to reward and promote the values, dispositions and behaviours of the middle- and upper-classes (Bourdieu, 1984). One of the consequences of this process of political and class reproduction is to reify a mistaken conception of human potential depending on social placement. The education system, in Bourdieu’s analysis, serves in large measure to promote “a kind of chauvinism that converts privation into choice” (Bourdieu, 2001: p. 235). In addition I refer to Paulo Freire’s conceptualization of teaching as a “practice of freedom” (Friere, 1970) to develop a conceptual bridge between a critical analysis of the reproductive function of schooling, and the potential for transformative education toward shared freedom. I also draw upon research and analysis about teacher education programs in major research-intensive universities, which aims to offer some resolutions to the tensions described in this paper (Korthagen, et al., 2006).

A pivotal concept is the idea of “fear of freedom” (Friere, 1970), and how we display this fear. I argue that the tension between teacher candidates and GTAs is founded in such a fear. We crave security, and the practice of freedom comes with risk. Sometimes people mask this fear by presenting themselves as defenders of freedom (Friere, 1970: 18). How can an emerging scholar and GTA anticipate, name and deal with this fear (in herself and in her students)?

Ideally, in the University’s teacher education program, we meet together to learn theories that will improve our teaching practice. Here, the praxis of teaching teacher candidates is a form of facilitated and reciprocal learning and knowledge production. We bring with us to the classroom our memories, experiences, taken-for-granted dispositions and also our curiosity and fears. As Kathleen Weiler (2001) says:

> Both the symbolic violence of commercial culture and the structural and institutional violence of untrammeled [patriarchy and] capitalism shape the discourses through which men and women construct themselves and lead to inevitable tensions and conflicts in classrooms in which different “voices” and experiences are called forth (2001, Weiler: 71).

Within this context of structural inequity, symbolic violence and conflict, however, there are also aspects of shared history, experience and understanding within which we may develop a kind of epistemic intimacy. I think that in general, we share more in common than not; and a classroom full of teachers is an ideal setting to reveal and strengthen those connections, in order to practice freedom.

**Sometimes we are Us and they are Them. But. sometimes they are them and so are we. Sometimes too, they are us and we are us, too. But sometimes, they are ALL us—and only I am them.**

Another (closely related) form of devaluation of teaching is the propagation of judgments about the teacher candidates we teach. Before I began teaching in the Teacher education program, I often heard from other GTAs and some faculty that their students were conservative, middle-
class, and resistant to theory. Some of my colleagues also judged the teacher education program itself as static, impractical, impolitic and conservative. There are several versions of “us and them” in operation here in the ivory tower. “Our” department is progressive and thoughtful and intellectually rigorous; the faculty of which we are a part is ineffectual and complacent; the teacher candidates are conservative and naïve; and the University does not value or appropriately fund or support the work we do. These statements of course are generalizations, and often inaccurate. Nevertheless, there are grains of truth in all of them. In sum, there appears to be a central contradiction inherent within the teacher education program. This contradiction offers the possibility for a rich dialect between teacher candidates and teacher educators—revealing adversarial relations yet simultaneously opportunities for reciprocal learning.

In this section, then, I seek to interrogate the tensions between “us” and “them”, and theorize ways in which these tensions reveal a dialectal process. I argue that this dialectic is always an ongoing process in teaching; but the potential for collaborative learning is overlooked because of the ways we are all institutionalized in education. How can GTAs understand and engage with the contradictions and tensions simmering throughout the Education faculty? How can we reveal assumptions that our students hold about us, and that we hold about them; and what will we do with this information once it’s revealed? How can we (GTAs) reveal our similarities and differences (with/between teacher candidates) and use this to strengthen alliances as teachers and learners? How can we teach in such a way that will excite and encourage teacher candidates; as well as develop new knowledge and theoretical approaches to pedagogy that will inform all of our work?

I scrutinize some of these assumptions and the consequent dialect of teaching teachers through describing what I experienced as our similarities and differences. I understand teaching as (at least potentially) a “practice of freedom” (Friere, 1970), and hope to offer my students instruction that can open them to understanding their teaching practice in this way as well.

Though the education system rewards and promotes the development of middle-class cultural capital, a majority of the people in the teacher education courses I’ve taught are from working-class or “lower” middle-class backgrounds. One of the activities I use at the beginning of class is called “The Class Layer Cake” (Jochild Sherover-Marcuse, 2004). This exercise reveals systemic location according to class background which students heretofore may take as ‘natural’ or ‘normal’. It serves as a good foundation for discussion about taken-for-granted assumptions about our lives and the lives of the young people of whom they will shortly be charged with educating.

A similarly revealing assignment has proven to be the ‘teacher biography’. For this assignment, I ask students to write their life story using several benchmarks with which to scaffold their paper. I ask them to answer questions about their background, such as where they were born and raised, whether and what kind of relationship they had with their extended family; what their parents did for income; how they came to pursue a career as teachers; how long it took them to get their undergraduate degree; who their significant influences were; what are they passionate about. The insights they discover with these exercises serve as a fundamental base for further study and discussion about issues they’ll encounter in their classrooms, including disability, sexism and sexist violence, racism, the effects of colonialism, and class inequality.

The two exercises reveal many similarities and differences between us.

148
Similarities:

a.) In general, teacher candidates and GTAs had positive experiences of their own schooling. That is, we had good experiences of (k-12) schooling because in some way we ‘fit’ – we were usually not poor, usually of the dominant culture in our classrooms, usually inexperienced with learning disabilities or other disabilities that might hinder our enjoyment of learning. Or, if we did have challenges, we had adults in our lives who offered us support and encouragement, and who paved the way to University.

b.) Many of the GTAs in the teacher training program have also had some teacher training, if not experience as a teacher in a school system. Several of my colleagues are trained teachers, and some have taught in some capacity in the k-12 system, in their home countries, or ESL EFL programs. I began a teacher education program myself, many years ago. This brief experience provided me with some insight into the institution of education, and political operations of public schooling.

c.) Most of us are women, (both GTAs and teacher candidates) and have been raised to adulthood in a sexist culture that both impedes our progress and tempers our resilience (once we all get out into the real world, we see that most leadership roles in the schools are held by men—especially in Secondary schools, and of course, in Universities).

d.) Most of us are White of European descent and have been raised to adulthood in a racist culture that promotes a sense of entitlement and stokes our fear of ‘the other’ (Aboriginal people, people of colour, and especially new immigrants). The Education system, again, rewards the ‘cultural capital’ of the European, as the North American schooling system is based on European models.

e.) Most teacher candidates (not all, of course, by any means) are fairly liberal in their politics. They may not be anti-capitalist, but they generally think welfare and universal health care (for example) are good for society. They are committed to equal access to quality education. “In theory” they believe that all students should be treated equally. Because they/we are (nearly all) white, not poor, and university-educated, they are often ignorant of the race/class/gender oppression entrenched in the institution of education (and defensive of their own position/privilege). However, they are nowhere near as conservative as I’d anticipated from some of the things I’d heard from other teachers, as well as graduate and post-graduate students. They are (varying degrees of) thoughtful and open to interrogating the fundamental oppressive attitudes inherent the neo-liberal political climate.

Differences:

a. Most of the teacher candidates are working-class or second-generation middle-class. That is, their parents worked in waged jobs, did not have
university degrees and did not have access to economic or political capital or, in Marxist terms, “the means of production”. My own background is working-class, though my father had a semi-professional job and owned his business, neither of my parents had a University degree or access to political, cultural or economic capital.

b. On the other hand, it appears that most (not all) GTAs who are instructing them are from middle- to upper-class backgrounds. Their parents (and often grandparents as well) were University-educated professionals and had access to various types of capital.

c. The teacher candidates are less grounded in theory overall than the PhD candidates who are teaching them. Their attitudes toward theory vary widely from interest and engagement to disinterest and resentment. But most are in the middle, and I suspect that some are a bit intimidated by some of it.

Understanding and discussing with students the similarities and differences between us can lead to a transformative dialogue about our expectations of and for our contributions to and opportunities within education, both in the university and in the K-12 system. Some of the tensions experienced by instructors in the teacher education program of a research-intensive university arise from the importance placed on publishing and research over teaching. Teaching, however, can also be understood as a research methodology and an effective means of both knowledge production and distribution.

**Lasting Change is Glacial in its Advance**

As Korthagen, et al. (2006) discuss, teacher education programs only tenuously link practice and theory, and in general have little impact on the practices of student teachers. Teacher educator programs, in general, assume information transmission—what Friere (1970) calls “the banking model” of education—is the main aim of teaching. This is no longer the case, in theory, in the university in which I am a student (and teacher). However, the training and mentorship of GTAs and of teacher candidates follow a model that does not necessarily promote more collaborative and reflective experiential learning. Some of the GTAs, sessional instructors and faculty do attempt to teach in a way that encourages student teachers to reflect on the effect their own values and experiences can have on their practice as educators. This kind of teaching, however, as yet has little institutional support from the University, and the changes necessary to sustain more innovative practices are slow to come about. It is important to be persistent, and to continue to explore the potential that teaching has to engage in the dialectical process of education. Education must be more than a reproductive process, wherein the dominated take up the tools and attitudes of the dominator.

In combination with an analysis of teacher candidates’ practicum experiences, readings, discussion and activities dealing with various issues in education, I hope that the gap between my lack of experience with and skepticism about the education system and teacher candidates wariness of my lack of experience may be bridged by our shared belief in the liberatory potential of teaching. In my (brief) experience, both my students and I have found some ways to think about teaching that can expand our horizons of expectations in regard to teaching and learning. I hope to continue to work toward further understanding these potentials as well as resolutions to some of the tensions between teacher education programs and The University.
References


Have We Sold Out? Adult Education in a Teacher Preparation Program

Janet Groen & Colleen Kawalilak
University of Calgary

Abstract: This paper focuses on opportunities and challenges experienced when a diverse team of scholars and practitioners, within a Faculty of Education, are given the task of developing an adult education/adult learning, core course for adult learners enrolled in a Bachelor of Education, pre-service teacher education program. All adult learners enrolled in this program are preparing to teach within the traditional/formal, K-12 education system. The authors reflect on insights gained throughout this development process.

Overview

A restructuring of our Faculty of Education necessitated addressing and transcending a perceived boundary to bring adult education scholarship and practice into a two-year ‘BEd After’ degree program preparing pre-service teachers for the K-12 school system. Through a course titled, Professional Development and Lifelong Learning, we had the privilege of engaging with adult learners who had earned their first undergraduate degree from disciplines that included: kinesiology, social work, history, communication and culture, fine arts, music, and health. Beyond this diversity, they shared common ground as adult, lifelong learners acquiring knowledge and skills intended to address the learning needs of children being educated within the traditional education system. The dominant discourse positions teaching and learning in a Faculty of Education within a research and pedagogical landscape specifically geared to K-12 formal institutions of learning. Consequently, adult educators are often situated in the margins, perceived as doing other research and teaching that, in the best light, loosely aligns with and/or supports teaching praxis in K-12 mainstream education.

The authors focus this paper on critical reflections and insights gained whilst developing a Professional Development and Lifelong Learning course within a pre-service, teacher preparation program delivered, as a pilot, in the Winter 2012 semester. This mandatory course offered to 400 adult learners preparing to teach in the K-12 education system, provided a rich opportunity to tip silos into bridges of opportunity (Bosetti, Kawalilak & Patterson, 2008) where pre-service teachers recognized themselves as adult learners on a lifelong learning pathway. This course offering is also the first in Canada to be located, as a mandatory course, within a teacher preparation program in a Faculty of Education.

As we reflect on the development of the Professional Development and Lifelong Learning (PDLL) course, we do this against the tensions of stepping out of the margins into the mainstream, K-12 formal educational discourse. We step out into this larger space, thoughtfully, purposefully, and strategically, as we believe that the location of the margins for adult educators can become too comfortable and secure. We also assert that tightly held perspectives on what adult education is and where it belongs may, in fact, be perpetuating those very margins that adult educators have sought to dismantle, overcome, and transcend beyond.
Locating Ourselves
Much of our work over the past year has focused on building bridges between adult education and pre-service teacher education. In the Handbook of Blended Shore Education: Adult Program Development and Delivery (Strohschen, 2009; Strohschen & Elazier, 2009), ‘blended shore’ is a metaphor that refers to bridge building. The ‘shore’ refers to that which has often kept adult education at bay from the shorelines of ‘other’ discipline contexts, cultures, and geographical landscapes. A common misconception, across Canada, is that adult education is designed to be separate from mainstream education. Consequently, adult education resides deep in the margins of some Faculties of Education or outside of Faculties of Education, altogether. What is unique about our PDLL course offering is that it is now located within the dominant discourse of preservice teacher education. As adult educators are accustomed to being situated at the margins of a Faculty of Education, in that we are often regarded as doing other research and teaching that does not align with those who teach and learn within mainstream education, the invitation to ‘blend the shore’ between mainstream, K-12 and adult education provided both challenges and opportunities.

Pragmatic Idealists
We are adult educators, pragmatic idealists. We regard schools and their systems as spaces of potential and opportunity where adults work, are challenged, and engage in their own learning just like they would in community development agencies, business and industry, and informal contexts and learning environments. Child-centred school systems also provide rich opportunities to address the learning needs of adults who focus on teaching children. Narrow perspectives as to what constitutes a real adult learning environment disregards potential sites for adult learning and knowledge sharing. We align to adult education teaching and learning practices and to processes that give witness to the flexibility that andragogy advocates for. We also embrace a metagogical philosophy and approach to adult education that is honouring and inclusive of diversity with respect to adult learning needs within a variety of unsuspecting contexts. To elaborate, locating adult education as a field of scholarship and practice within a Faculty of Education is a tangible reminder that learning and knowledge acquisition spans a lifetime and extends within/beyond formal, educational institutions and contexts. In order to transcend and overcome some of the perceptions that have traditionally located us within the margins of our own Faculty of Education, the authors sought to explore potentialities with colleagues and adult learners who identified their scholarship and practice more specifically within mainstream education.

Conceptual Lens
We draw from some elements of Social Identity Theory (SIT) developed by Tajfel and Turner (1979) and advocate that adult educator recognize the critical importance of including diverse contexts and spaces where adult learning and lifelong learning reside. This includes professional programs like K-12 teacher education. SIT addresses how some aspects of individuals’ self-concept and identity are significantly shaped and influenced by a perceived and experienced inclusion and sense of belonging to a particular group. Belonging contributes to identity formation, esteem, and pride. Categorization is one element of SIT and refers to the ease of categorizing others according to personal identification/similarity factors or the absence thereof. Categorization contributes to fragmentation shaped by a ‘them and us’ perspective and way of viewing ‘others’ in the world. Categorization also influences our interactions with others and to
how one group perceives, values, or devalues another group and its members (Ashforth & Mael, 1989, p. 20).

We caution against a social identity within the adult educator community that has the potential to perpetuate elitist attitudes as to what constitutes true adult education practices, approaches, and legitimate, warranted membership in adult education circles. When adult educator scholars and practitioners categorize and subsequently disregard some work and learning contexts as potential sites of adult learning, based on how these align or not to social justice and community development landscapes that have traditionally informed the good work of adult educators, will this not serve to sustain the very margins brought about by an exclusive belief system and practice that adult educators have long argued against?

The Experience
Experience is, first of all, doing something; second, doing something that makes a difference; third, knowing what difference it makes.

– Eduard C. Lindeman (1961, p. 87)

Arriving at this Place and Time
Our Faculty of Education was undergoing deep structural changes that began in 2010. Prior to the dismantling of programs that served as the architecture of our Faculty, a multitude of diverse but interrelated specializations existed. These included: Educational Technology, Contexts, Leadership, Higher Education, Curriculum, Applied/Counseling Psychology, Interpretive Studies, Second Language Learners, and Workplace and Adult Learning. A new Dean and Vice-Dean focused on rebuilding our Faculty. Structural changes meant weeding out specializations no longer perceived as viable and merging others to ensure more research rigour, cohesion, relevance, and continuity. Consequently, fractures manifested as faculty members, huddled in their respective specialization groups, conspired behind closed doors, to develop strategies that positioned their specialization as more viable and relevant to the new Faculty structure and agenda. Our small Workplace and Adult Learning (WAL) specialization, made up of five faculty members, struggled to navigate and locate ourselves within this landscape of competition and fragmentation as this was a culture that no longer aligned with the philosophy, values, and principles that guided our work as adult educators.

Our WAL team was focused and collaborative. We met regularly to plan, monitor, and evaluate all aspects of graduate programs offered through our specialization. We took pride in our ability to respond, thoughtfully and intentionally, to structural and philosophical shifts within our Faculty of Education and to the needs of adult learners enrolled in our programs. Albeit small, we were a dynamic team, each with our own particular but interrelated area(s) of expertise. We were well positioned to grow our field of study and our thesis-based graduate program(s) in that all WAL team members had successfully gained research funding. Our research informed our teaching and service work within our Faculty and the greater university.

Our diverse backgrounds and perspectives, unified by a shared philosophy and vision of adult education and adult learning, contributed to healthy, ongoing team debate and dialogue. We welcomed this opportunity to share our passion and vision with faculty members located beyond our specialization and believed that our work encompassed multi-disciplinary research, teaching, and praxis. We also respected that, in times of deep change, it is human nature to hold tightly on
to the comfortable and familiar. We resisted the temptation to be fear-based and sought a path of opportunity. We critiqued our WAL specialization, its uniqueness, purpose, significance, and potential. This was also a time to transcend ‘beyond differences’ to recognize and explore common ground with colleagues located in other program areas within our Faculty. We shared a collective desire to reposition our program within the new/developing structure and focus of our Faculty of Education. It was our intention to stress the value and significance of ‘growing adult education’ across program areas and to identify synergies and linkages.

Reinventing Ourselves
‘Self Study Reports’ were submitted to the Dean by each specialization/program area. Tensions were high as faculty members sought refuge with their respective teams, hesitant to share report details with other program areas. The fear was that too much conversation across specializations, prior to submission of self-study reports would disclose secrets and strategies. Although program groups were encouraged to identify synergies across specializations, this spirit and sentiment was not evident in the overall tone and culture of the Faculty. Simply put, a desire to bridge across specializations was not visible in the day-to-day communication and interactions of faculty members. Several weeks of tension and behind closed-door speculation ensued in anticipation of the final verdict that would determine the new Faculty structure.

After a critical review of all self-study reports, we were informed that we would survive; our area was to be renamed Educational Studies in Adult Learning. This news was bitter sweet in that many of our good colleagues, in other specializations, no longer had a program area to call home. Surviving the cut had its challenges, however. This required re-envisioning our role as adult educators within a Faculty of Education, locating ourselves within the larger mandate and vision, and strengthening relationships with other program areas that had survived the restructuring; all the while maintaining the integrity and focus of our field of scholarship and practice.

Our first task was to engage in dialogue with colleagues from other disciplines to explore potential collaborations and synergies. Our greatest challenge was to locate ourselves within the pre-service teacher education (two-year BEd after program) and to provide leadership to faculty members in the development of the PDLL course designed for second semester, pre-service teacher/adult learners. This was significant in that no other teacher education program in Canada included an adult education core course offering in a BEd program. From the onset, it became abundantly clear that most within our Faculty of Education had a limited understanding of what adult education referred to, how it related to pre-service teachers in a K-12, traditional context, and why this focus was considered integral to pre-service teacher development. Although we expected this reaction, we did not anticipate that some colleagues from within our own program area would pose these same questions.

Locating Adult Education within Pre-service Teacher Education
Some colleagues within our own adult learning program area, individuals deeply rooted in adult education scholarship and praxis (locally, nationally, and internationally), expressed concern that developing an adult education course as a core offering intended for pre-service teachers might jeopardize the integrity of our work. This concern emerged, in tandem, with the ongoing discourse in the field where some contested that professional development, training and
development within workplace and human resource contexts, and vocational, employment
preparation programs were located at the opposite end of the ‘real’ adult education and adult
learning continuum. ‘Professionalizing’ adult education and ‘selling out’ our field of scholarship
and practice were cited as primary concerns.

Colleagues who resided within our Faculty of Education, but beyond our program area,
interpreted adult education and adult learning as a specific focus and approach related to formal
and traditional, post-secondary, continuing education, workplace, and vocational contexts. The
assumed connotation was that the ‘age of student’ determined them, or not, to be adult learners
and that those who taught students of this age were, by default, adult educators. To elaborate,
adult education was narrowly interpreted to be an “applied teaching practice” directly related to a
certain demographic. Others referred to adult education as ‘confusing’, too process oriented, and
‘soft’. One of our colleagues who had taught in the K-12 system prior to becoming a professor
asserted that adult education was lacking in theoretical foundation and intellectual scholarship.

After much reflection and dialogue, we realized that the limited understanding of many of our
learners, as to how adult learning would inform their own development as pre-service teachers,
was parallel to that of some of our team and other faculty members teaching in the BEd program.
Personal and professional/academic identities, formulated through associations with and
belonging to a particular group and discipline, created barriers to understanding how adult
education and adult learning spanned across these landscapes and had the potential to illuminate
synergies and common ground.

Navigating the Landscape. Several course development teams were organized to develop courses
that would comprise a new pre-service teacher education program. Ongoing dialogue across
teams provided a pathway to explore course alignments and synergies. Each team lead also
provided updates to the larger Faculty of Education at scheduled ‘Town Hall’ meetings. Faculty
members who were not formally assigned to a course development team were encouraged to
share their perspectives and resources.

The course development work of our team extended significantly beyond the task of developing
a single course offering. This was a living, breathing, iterative process and experience involving
faculty members teaching across the BEd program. The team lead worked closely with team
members at bi-weekly meetings and one-on-one, informal meetings in between. Drawing from
adult learning approaches, in support of a deepened understanding, co-creating knowledge, and
knowledge sharing, an invitation was also extended to colleagues beyond our course
development team to share perspectives, approaches, knowledge, skills, and resources. Engaging
in this type of dialogue contributed to a rich discourse, one that explored tensions that emerged
from what were sometimes perceived as redundancies and/or competing agendas. Dialogue
served as an invitation to loosen our grip on tightly held notions, beliefs, and assumptions and to
critically reflect on challenges and tensions through multiple lenses, in search of common
ground. Although abolishment of the prior, pre-service teacher education program fostered
resentments among many, some welcomed the opportunity to contribute to the new program
structure.
Time lines were tight and the task list awaiting completion was lengthy. A ticking clock, often an intrusive reminder of the significant work ahead, loomed in the background. Our priority, however, was to first create an inclusive space for our team members to share perspectives and to make deeper meaning of our own experiences as adult, lifelong learners and educators.

Through dialogue, we explored areas of interest and expertise. Diversity of voice and perspective were welcomed and encouraged. In this time of great change, team meetings provided a refuge, a trusted place to co-create community where, through dialogue, we transcended ‘beyond difference’ to a place of common ground (Kawalilak, 2004; Vella, 2007, 2002, 2001). Over time, the grip on tightly held agendas loosened and team members opened to consider how we might come together to create a course that was rich in meaningful, learner engagement. In retrospect, we are even more cognizant of the criticality of our decision to hold these first several weeks as a space for building trust and respectful relationship. We maintain that tasks ultimately addressed would never have come to fruition, in the way that they did, if this space had not been held and protected. In the spirit of adult education and practice, inclusive spaces for voices and perspectives of all team members to be heard and validated were co-created.

Reflections

Within spaces created by engaging in open, authentic dialogue, trust between members on the course development team emerged. A deepened respect for one another’s work and areas of scholarship and expertise were also experienced. The PDLL course was designed and it was now time to launch the pilot.

Four hundred pre-service teachers fixated on a large screen, positioned just so, in an amphitheatre designed to accommodate one hundred more. Four hundred pairs of eyes! A lapel microphone, PowerPoint slide hand-held device, two-computers, participant clicker technology, intended engage and capture immediate, audience response, and two graduate students standing off to the side, poised and ready, located as back-up in anticipation of technological glitches.

A handful of faculty members, seated to the side in the front row, engage in chitchat. An additional few are located, randomly, in seats beyond. The expectation from administration was that those teaching in the Bachelor of Education, pre-service program, attend all plenary sessions as a statement in support of the plenary leader and to convey continuity between the plenary and the follow-up breakout sessions where students would be grouped into smaller sections to make deeper meaning of what was addressed in plenary. We suspect that many learners enrolled silently ponder, what is an adult education and lifelong learning course doing in a pre-service teacher education program? How will it align? What is the purpose? What relevance does it have to pre-service teachers who are focused on the pedagogy in a child-centered, traditional learning environment?

This moment had been many months in the making. Bi-weekly team meetings and individual dialogues, in between, contributed to the development of this course offering locating pre-service teachers as adult, lifelong learners. As adult educators, we recognized this connection. This was an early evening class and two minutes remained before the official start of the lecture. Two minutes, a brief pause, a time to reflect on
the opportunities, tensions, and good work that brought us to this place. Going back to the beginning of this challenging process brings significant insights.

As adult educator scholars and practitioners, we recognize the critical importance of stepping beyond our comfortable and familiar, to include diverse contexts and foci pertaining to other spaces where adult/lifelong learning resides. We ponder, are we succumbing to categorizing, ergo, disregarding the good work of many being done in an array of diverse learning contexts? Do we base this disregard on how initiatives align or not to social justice and community development landscapes and initiatives? Are these the only landscapes and parameters deemed worthy and authentic? If this is our lens, will this not serve to sustain the very margins brought about by an exclusive belief system and practice that adult educators have long argued against? We respond with a resounding “yes” as we reframe our own lens of scholarship and practice from selling out to stepping in!

References
Reclaiming Lifelong Learning in a Multicultural Society: Exploring Tensions between Immigration, Ethnicity, and Citizenship

Shibao Guo
University of Calgary

Abstract: Despite the rhetoric that Canada relies on immigrants to help ameliorate its labour shortages and aging population, the very ethnicity that many immigrants are associated with is often treated with suspicion. Drawing on a case study approach, this study examines the history and development of the Chinese Cultural Centre of Greater Toronto as well as the programs it offers. The study highlights the role of ethno-cultural organizations in promoting cross-cultural understanding as well as the potential role of lifelong learning as a mediating force to ease the tension between immigration, ethnicity and citizenship.

Introduction
Despite Canada’s rich history in immigration and the strategic role it plays in Canada’s future, the tension between immigration, ethnicity, and citizenship is still prominent. Some of the debates focus on the existence of ethno-cultural organizations and their role in assisting immigrants with their settlement and integration. Despite the rhetoric that Canada relies on immigrants to help ameliorate its labour shortages and aging population, the very ethnicity that many immigrants are associated with is often treated with suspicion. In particular, ethnic organizations are often criticized for threatening national unity, diluting Canadian identity, and promoting ghettoization and separatism. It is therefore the purpose of this study to examine the tension between immigration, ethnicity and citizenship by investigating the history and development of the Chinese Culture Centres of Greater Toronto (CCCGT). The study highlights the role of lifelong learning in helping Canadians of Chinese heritage maintain their ethnic culture and promote cross-cultural understanding as well as a mediating force to ease the tension between immigration, ethnicity and citizenship.

Theoretical Framework
This study is informed by two major theoretical frameworks. The first concerns the emergence of cultural rights of minority groups, their recognition and maintenance, all as part of an expanded notion of citizenship. Going beyond the posited neutrality of the state, the rights of a community to express, maintain, and transmit its cultural identity are part of human rights. In other words, cultural minorities should enjoy a basic right to cultural recognition (Bauböck, 1996; Parekh, 1999). Furthermore, a person’s ethnic and cultural heritage must be recognized on an individual basis. Without the protection of cultural communities, however, it is impossible for individuals to assert their rights and for all to participate fully in society (Walzer, 1982). Critics tend to denigrate collective rights as restrictive of individual rights, thus threatening basic democratic values (Bissoondath, 2002). Proponents of minority group rights maintain that minority rights enhance citizenship for the demands of immigrants for poly-ethnic and cultural rights are primarily “demands for inclusion, for full membership in the larger society” (Kymlicka, 1995a, p.192). Accordingly, granting minority cultural rights would contribute to a larger sense of community and thus incorporation into the political community for both individuals and groups.
Kymlicka further argues that immigrants and their descendants can have a double tie to the state, which enables meaningful individual choice and supports self-identity whereas a refusal to grant recognition and autonomy to minority groups is likely to provoke even more resentment and hostility, further alienating them as citizens of the larger state.

The second focuses on the redefinition of lifelong learning in light of the relationship between work and citizenship. Lifelong learning is often defined as learning from the cradle to the grave. A chameleonic concept and versatile practice, lifelong learning is a highly fluid, slippery and contestable concept (Grace, 2004; Hughes, Blaxter, Brine, Jackson, 2006). Despite the claim that lifelong learning is a normative and value-laden concept as are ideas about democracy or equality (Tuijnman & Boström, 2002), there has been a growing unease around lifelong learning. The current criticism focuses on how lifelong learning has been co-opted by the market state to serve its interests. Today, responsibility for learning has been shifted solely to individuals, undermining welfare, disguising the reduction of the democratic public sphere, and working on people as objects of policy to ensure their compliance with the brave new world of flexible capitalism (Crowther, 2004). Now lifelong learning has come to be known as learning throughout the work life (Jarvis, 2006). In Canada, lifelong learning has become a guiding principle for policy initiatives ranging from national economic competitiveness to social cohesion and personal fulfillment (Livingstone, 2002). As a counter-focus to this dominant discourse, critical lifelong educators call for a more critical perspective of lifelong learning guided by a key aim to foster active, inclusive, pluralistic, and responsible citizens which accept difference and diversity (Gouthro, 2007; Grace, 2004; Johnston, 1999).

Research Methods and Data Sources
This study adopted a case study approach because as a methodology it enabled a focus on the particularity and complexity of a single case to understand an activity and its significance (Stake, 1995). The Chinese Cultural Centre of Greater Toronto was selected as its research site because it is one of the largest of this kind in North America. Two primary qualitative research methods were used to conduct this study: document analysis and personal interviews. The document analysis included the organization’s annual reports, newsletters, AGM meeting minutes, important speeches, program brochures, and information on the Web. Twenty interviews were conducted with early founders, current chairs and board members, staff and administrators, instructors, and clients. All interviews were tape recorded with the permission of the participants. Before each interview started, I assured participants that any information they gave me would be kept strictly confidential. I informed them of their right to cancel the interview at any time, or withdraw from the study before, during or after the interview. Participants were also offered anonymity or pseudonyms if they so wished. Each interview took one to one and a half hours to complete. All interviews were transcribed verbatim, although I did not expect to use all interview material. In addition to the two major methods, site visiting and participant observation were used as complementary methods to help me contextualize what was read and heard about the organization.

For the analysis of the research, a four-stage process was developed: (i) identifying main points, (ii) searching for salient themes and recurring patterns, (iii) grouping common themes and patterns into related categories, and (iv) comparing all major categories with reference to the major theories in the field to form new perspectives. The four-stage process assured that there
was frequent interplay between the data and theory. Multiple data sources and methods indicated that this study adopted a triangulation approach which ensured the credibility of the research.

**Research Findings**

**The Founding of CCCGT: Building Bridges**

One important feature of case study is that it generates reports of thick description which go beyond mere facts and surface features of the case to include details, context, and other such descriptive and interpretive elements of the case (McGinn, 2010). The thick description generated by this case study provides extensive information that readers can use to understand the history of the Chinese Cultural Centre of Greater Toronto as well as the role of lifelong learning in mediating the tension between immigration, ethnicity and citizenship. An analysis of the organizational profile reveals that CCCGT was established in 1988 to promote mutual cultural respect and understanding between Canadians of Chinese descent and people of other heritage. Its specific objectives include: to help Canadians of Chinese heritage appreciate all facets of their own culture; to help nurture a mutual respect and understanding between Chinese Canadians and Canadians of other heritage; and to help further people’s understanding and perception of Canadian heritage (CCCGT, 2012). Since its inception, it was bestowed with an important bridging role as illustrated by the founding chair of CCCGT: “So again it’s a bridge between the Chinese and the mainstream and also bridging the young with the old. So this is what we try to do right now.” He further pointed out: “Well, to promote Chinese culture and heritage and also to understand other people’s culture. Because we’re in a multicultural society, we cannot just say everything Chinese because you’ve got to learn from other people. So well also we are part of an organization called Multicultural Conservations in Ontario. We have some 16 different countries from Asia. So we have different people, well different cultural backgrounds, come to the center to learn and to share the cultures which is another reason for the building.”

**Organizational Growth and Development**

The construction of a physical centre did not start until 1996, which followed a two-phase plan. Phase one was completed in 1998 with a library, classrooms, a conference room, and an exhibition hall. In 2006, the completion of phase two provided the centre with expanded space, including a theatre which can seat 626 people and a large multi-purpose hall which can be used for sports, exhibitions, banquets, etc. A future plan is to build a Chinese garden outside the building in phase three. However, the decision to locate a physical place for the Centre required much debate. With the growth of the Chinese population in the greater Toronto areas, there is no one central area where the Chinese resided. In the past 30 years, the Chinese communities have grown from one original Chinatown in downtown Toronto to five more Chinatowns in Easter Chinatown, Markham, Mississauga, Richmond Hill, and Scarborough. In the end, the CCCGT Board decided to locate the centre at Scarborough because the City of Scarborough agreed to lease them one acre of land after much lobbying and negotiation and also because Scarborough was the residential centre for new immigrants from Hong Kong in the 1980s and 1990s. One board member explains: “We first started 20 years ago, Scarborough was the residential center for the new Chinese so to speak. Downtown was always the residential center for the old Chinese and indeed there were debates at that time on where do you put the center. But the choice of Scarborough was not a bad one because there was no place in between downtown and Scarborough where it could be located. So there’s always been a question of that. Fortunately
where we are now is very accessible from the highways, so it’s easy by automobile, even by public transportation to come to that center.”

The CCCGT was meant to be a building that welcomes everybody, not just the Chinese. Therefore, they chose a design that does not have a typical Chinese look from the outside. With the completion of the first two phases, CCCGT is in excellent shape. One of the board members commented: “So I think we are very comprehensive in terms of the elements of a Culture Center... We have everything, and do everything in here.” He continues, “I think that the second one would be the fact that we finally are able to build this center which is the largest in North America and this has provided services to not just the Chinese community but also community at large.” The initial estimation of the building was $10 million which turned out to be a lot more. The founding chair recalled: “So at the beginning we say $10 million. They thought it was a dream and actually I think with all the expenses that we’ve incurred is, is $30 million.” They managed to receive $2 million from the federal and provincial governments at each phase of the construction and the rest from fundraising and donations, particularly from the Chinese communities in greater Toronto. The chair was proud of the community support to which he offered his heartfelt thanks, “I’m proud because during the years at different stages of this, this whole history, there were different people who came in to help, people with expertise such as architect, such as developers, such as builders all this, this was needed, also fundraisers and things. So we’re lucky and thankful to those people who came in at different stage of this development, who came in which I think is very lucky and I’m very proud that I was able to get people when I needed at different stages.”

Lifelong Learning Programs for Cross-Cultural Understanding

With its mandate in promoting cross-cultural understanding, CCCGT offer a variety of lifelong learning programs and services which mainly focus on Cultural Programs for Children and Youth (e.g., language classes, Chinese Calligraphy, Chinese Brush Painting and Chinese Crafts), Special Events and Community Festival Celebrations (e.g., Chinese New Year Celebration, Lantern Festival, Moon Festival, Canada Day Celebration), Interest Classes (e.g., Line Dance, Cantonese Opera, Asian Cooking Class, Chinese Music Instruments, Qi Gong, Tai Chi). Apart from the interest classes and special occasion programs, performances like Cantonese operas, Beijing operas, kung fu shows are staged in the Centre. Exhibitions and Chinese calligraphy demonstration are also organized in the Centre. By offering such programs, CCCGT played a significant role in helping Canadians of Chinese descent maintain ethnic identities. It also helped promote cross-cultural understanding. Furthermore, CCCGT reaches out to partner with mainstream cultural organizations such as the Toronto symphony, the National Ballet and the Royal Ontario Museum to organize joint cross-cultural activities. In addition, there are programs for families that adopted children from China to assist them to expose their adopted Chinese kids to Chinese culture. Finally, the Chinese Cultural Centre is popular rental venue for birthday parties, celebrations, graduation ceremonies among the Southeast Asians. It seems evident that the CCCGT has become a “dynamic emergence” where it serves as “a testing ground for multiculturalism on a global basis”. All in all, the Chinese Cultural Centre is “a symbol for Chinese culture and heritage” and serves as a venue for both Chinese and non-Chinese to come together and learn comfortably. One board member commented: “The feeling is different if you are Chinese and go to a class that is not Chinese Cultural Centre.” This comment was echoed by a Canadian born Chinese (CBC) learner who commented that she enjoyed going to the CCCGT
to learn Cantonese which she lost when she grew up because of its relaxing and “non-judgmental” learning environment.

Lack of Public Funding and Support
Lack of funding is a common issue facing non-profit organizations in Canada. For ethno-cultural organizations such as the CCCGT, the issue is even more severe. Ethnic community organizations are often criticized for threatening national unity, diluting Canadian identity, and promoting ghettoization and separatism (Bissoondath, 2002). Owing to such biases and misperceptions, it is especially difficult for ethno-cultural organizations to receive government funding. One board member explains: “We have the most difficult time because we are a cultural institution, and the government doesn’t support cultural institutions particularly the Chinese cultural institutions. We have problem getting money from government. Sometimes on small project, like Chinese New Year celebrations, things like that you might get a few thousand dollars or a few hundred dollars which is nothing. But a capital funding they don’t, they don’t.” As a result, CCCGT ended up in debt, as illustrated by an administrator: “The reason why we have problem is because of the debt, the mortgage. If we don’t have the mortgage we have no problem. We can maintain. But because we have to pay the mortgage, so we become in debt all the time.”

The CCCGT has to rely on fundraising and donations to generate operation funds to run the Centre. Special fundraising events are held throughout the year like the imperial ball, golf tournament and wine day etc. Several board members reveal that it is also far from easy to get donations from the general public because not many people really think that Chinese culture is important. In addition, phase one of the Chinese Cultural Centre was completed and donors hesitate to donate any more, thinking that their donations may be used to pay debt. The financial recession in recent years makes the situation worse. One board member commented: “We have problem fundraising particularly this year because of the economic downturn. Everybody has trouble. So we have problem still have some debts in the Center but I think if we can sail through this year and next year I think we’ll be OK.” In addition to donations and fundraising, the Centre relies on the rental charges and program fees. Since the Centre cannot afford a lot of paid staff, it has been relying heavily on the service of volunteer workers, leaving the Centre ill-funded and under-staffed. In light of this, one board member had this to say to the government: “Well I think they should listen. They should go easy with particularly organization like this. It took so many years, so many volunteers, to work so hard to raise money to build it. But now we have problem trying to maintain it. I mean the government should, should listen, should see it, and should do something to, to help because we didn’t do it for profit, right? Obviously 20 years we did it just for the community. So the government should step in, try to help out, you know give us like an operation budget every year. So if my operation budget is $500,000, maybe the government subsidizes $150,000 or $200,000. That would mean a lot.”

Conclusion and Educational Significance
This study has significant implications for adult and lifelong education. As Jarvis (2006) argues, humanity remains an unfinished project that requires all human beings unceasingly to continue learning throughout their lives. In this view, learning is intrinsic to living, being and becoming lie at the heart of our thinking about learning and learning is the driving force of social change. According to Delors (1996), learning comprises four dimensions: learning to know, learning to
do, learning to be and learning to live together. In a multicultural society like Canada, learning to live together becomes the most important dimension of lifelong learning. It is part of the being, living and becoming of which Jarvis speaks. As our population is growing more ethno-culturally diverse, it is imperative for adult and lifelong educators to be more inclusive in order to embrace people from different ethnic and cultural background. It is evident that the Chinese Cultural Centre of Greater Toronto functioned as the “link” or “cultural broker” between newcomers and the hosting society. The study highlights the role of lifelong learning in helping Canadians of Chinese heritage maintain their ethnic culture and promote cross-cultural understanding. It also demonstrates the potential to reclaim the radical roots of lifelong education for inclusive and democratic citizenship. The study has important implications for researchers, policy-makers, and community workers regarding minority cultural rights and inclusive citizenship.

References


Walking the Talk: Applying Adult Education Principles to Influence Change

Loretta Howard
Canadian Memorial Chiropractic College

Abstract: This paper examines the process undertaken to create a Faculty Development program at a health science college in Ontario. This program is part of an initial institutional change process related to shifting teacher thinking and practice from a traditional to contemporary evidence-based model of teaching. The purpose of this exploration is to contribute to the literature by supporting the limited research that examines the efficacy of employing adult learning praxis to influence change in individual and organizational practices.

This paper is the first of a series that explores my work as a teacher-educator influencing individual and organizational change related to teacher thinking and practice. The process I utilized to create a Faculty Development program by applying adult education principles to practice is discussed. First, I describe the educational context of the Canadian Memorial Chiropractic College (CMCC) and the educational challenges we face. Next, I outline the initial methodology utilized to create the program. Finally, I analyze the process and outcomes in relation to the theoretical constructs underpinning my design, and raise implications for practice.

Background
In 2009, I assumed an administrative role at CMCC, charged with responsibilities for cross-institutional curriculum and faculty development processes. In my first few weeks of transitioning to a new institutional context, disconnects were identified at the institutional, faculty and student levels.

Institution
CMCC, a private, not-for-profit educational institution offering the Doctor of Chiropractic (DC) degree, was founded in 1945. It is one of the most esteemed chiropractic colleges in North America, and is world renowned for its innovation and extensive research contributions to the field. From a clinical and research perspective, CMCC is on the cutting edge of evidence-based practice (EBP). Conversely, from an educational perspective, the institution is firmly entrenched in a traditional medical education model and is steeped in the cultural authority of its profession. As such, a disconnect between applying EBP to clinical versus educational practices exists.

Faculty
Two disconnects are expressed at the faculty level. They involve teacher identity and teacher practice. Regarding teacher identity, if asked what they do, faculty would typically respond with “I’m a chiropractor/anatomist/pathologist/radiologist/clinician,” or any number of identities. I have not yet met an instructor who initially said that they are a teacher. Faculty typically identify as subject matter experts in their scientific disciplines, and, even though they are responsible for teaching, do not immediately identify as educators. As such, they focus on continually developing evidence-based subject matter expertise, but are unaware that their teaching practice could benefit from similar development.
Regarding teacher practice, all CMCC faculty have experienced the traditional medical model of teaching in their health science education. For some, it is the only type of learning experience they have ever had. This model is firmly rooted in the “sage on stage” transmittal perspective (Pratt, 1998). Not surprisingly, this is the practice that they embrace as they take on teaching duties. Theory classes are lecture-driven, dominated by content-rich information, and require students to play a passive role in attaining knowledge. As such, a dichotomy exists between faculty who are highly credentialed and very engaged in evidence-based research and practices in their clinical or subject matter domains, yet are oblivious to the existence of contemporary evidence-based teaching practice (Petty, 2009) in the field of higher education.

Students
A further disconnect exists between students and faculty. Due to the overwhelming amount of curriculum content students must master and demonstrate at licensing exams (over 4,200 contact hours in the four year DC program compared to 1,400-1,600 experienced in their prior undergraduate program), students have developed a strategic focus on the efficient acquisition of surface level content that they expunge every 6-8 weeks in exams. Indeed, this “binge and purge” of knowledge, a process that I liken to “learning bulimia,” is rampant within the first three years of the program and quite common in the health science and medical education fields.

Congruently, our learners are increasingly exhibiting “digital native” traits (Prensky, 2010) with a reliance on technology and expectations of instant and continuous access to resources. They also display “millennial” learner traits (Howe and Straus, 2008) including a preference for learning in groups, relatively short attention spans, and a propensity for multitasking. Class attendance is declining as many students opt for individual cramming of note service content or small group learning while faculty criticize student attendance and bemoan the learners’ lack of higher order thinking skills.

Challenges and Opportunities
Given CMCC’s educational context, which is not unique in higher education today, my task was to create an in-house Faculty Development program that encouraged a shift in educator thinking and practice from a teacher-centred to a learning-centred model (Barr & Tagg, 1995). In striving to achieve that outcome, I wanted to authentically enact my teacher pedagogy and explore the effectiveness of adult learning praxis in working individuals through a change process. I had a unique opportunity to design, facilitate and evaluate a process that addressed the identified issues/disconnects and begin a culture shift within the organization by modelling the very principles that I wanted faculty to adopt in practice. Could I “walk the talk” that I so strongly believed in to create a Faculty Development program and initiate meaningful change? To find out, I undertook a mixed methods action research process (Creswell, 2007) to document and examine aspects of the change process.

Process Design
I designed a collaborative group process that employed adult learning principles (Knowles, 1980; Cranton, 2005) as the theoretical foundation to which an outcomes-based curriculum design model (Wiggins and McTighe, 2005) was applied to achieve the intended program development outcome. Brookfield’s (1995) critical lenses were incorporated in the process to ensure the
examination of issues from all perspectives. Finally, evidence-based active learning strategies (Petty, 2009) were modelled.

**Working Group Design**

As a first step, a Faculty Development Working Group was created in which all organizational members were invited to participate. Over forty faculty, students, and staff joined the group. A project site was created in our learning management system (LMS) in which all documents and outputs were posted so that the process was transparent to all, information could be easily accessed, and all interested voices could be heard.

Utilizing Wiggins and McTighe’s (2005) understanding by design (UbD) model, I designed four group meetings, conducted over three months (October to December 2009), to achieve our outcome. This model enabled me to scaffold the work/learning process from start to finish. By doing so, I was able to identify and anticipate issues at each step of the process related to resistance and other potential emotive barriers (Cranton, 2005). I ensured that the activities I selected acted as interventions to overcome or waylay these barriers, and that I planned activities that moved all participants forward in a process to articulate faculty development needs. I hoped to increase participant awareness of the world of adult education and encourage them to begin to explore it in relation to their practice, regardless of their institutional role. In turn, I hoped to initiate the creation of a critical mass that embraced these principles and begin a culture shift within the organization.

Each meeting activity and/or discussion was captured on flip chart paper. After each meeting, all materials and group output was transcribed and then posted to the LMS so anyone in the institution could participate. This assisted us to both document our process and provide data to inform this inquiry.

**Pre-Work**

Prior to the first meeting, I wanted to increase awareness of the institutional issues we were facing and provide a broader understanding of the world of adult education as a whole. Participants were asked to review data from synthesized course evaluation surveys and CMCC’s current annual student satisfaction survey, read provided articles, and review audio video materials related to learning-centeredness, evidenced-based teaching, and current educational realities.

**Meeting 1**

In the first meeting, a context was set for our process. I introduced Brookfield’s (1995) lenses and the “rules of engagement” which I would employ in facilitating our process. Brookfield's lenses of self, student, colleague and research literature were important to present as I wanted participants to experience how these lenses could be applied to support individual and collective reflective practice. The engagement rules included being inclusive of all parties, respecting all opinions equally, welcoming all “elephants” in the room, and assuming appropriate group roles. In short, we would be having open, non-judgemental and equitable dialogue to envision how to enhance the teaching and learning process at CMCC and create a Faculty Development program to support this vision.
Next, participants were formed into cross functional groups including faculty, students, administration, and staff in each (i.e., consciously implementing a number of Brookfield’s lenses into their process). They were asked to individually reflect on and collectively discuss what ideal qualities an educator at CMCC should demonstrate. Each group presented their discussion to the larger group. The groups then worked together to identify common themes between the groups and create what ultimately became the exit competencies of the Faculty Development program.

Meeting 2
During the second meeting, the cross functional groups reviewed the competencies they generated and then organized them by faculty rank, role, and span of career. This allowed them to identify faculty development needs from entry to exit of a teaching career. It was eye-opening for many to see the span of needs articulated.

Between meeting one and three, I implemented two cross organizational surveys utilizing a web-based survey tool: one to all students (n=760); and one to all faculty members (n=110 *note: only 45 are full-time with the remainder part time). Students were asked to describe specific teacher behaviours that enhanced or detracted from their learning experience while faculty were asked what would help them to improve their practice as teachers. Eighty students (10.5% response rate) and thirty-seven faculty members completed the surveys (33% response rate).

Meeting 3
The survey results were presented and discussed during the third meeting. While the response rate from the student survey was lower, the comments mirrored those gleaned from the then recent annual student satisfaction survey in which 46% of students participated. Participants were also given a “Mission: Possible” activity in which each group was the “Owner for the Day” of CMCC and could make any management recommendations about Faculty Development processes. Each group presented their ideas, which were then collated for our final meeting.

Meeting 4
Discussion focused on finalizing the collective recommendations. From that data, a proposal for a Faculty Development program and associated policies were submitted to our institutional bodies for approval, which was granted in March 2010. The program was subsequently developed and implemented. The process and outcomes of this program are the focus of future papers in this series.

Analysis of Theory Informing Process
Did I “walk the talk” and influence change? I believe so. The literature informing my practice - adult learning, lenses on teaching, and evidence-based teaching practice - was consciously utilized in the design and facilitation of my working group process. Other than Brookfield’s (1995) lenses, which were introduced in the first meeting, I did not specifically draw attention to the principles and strategies underpinning my process, opting instead to model what “teaching for understanding” (Wiggins and McTighe, 2005, p. vi) looked like in practice.

Adult Learning
In my attempt to ground my process in adult learning principles (Knowles, 1980) I ensured that the facilitated process demonstrated respect for all, focused on solving issues in a practical
manner, promoted positive self-esteem, capitalized on the participants’ experiences, and gave space to introduce new ideas to integrate with existing knowledge. These principles were most evident in my “rules of engagement” and in the underpinning design of the process itself. I found that by being explicit about the “how” of our process, participants were more able to focus on the “what,” allowing them to achieve the intended outcome.

Given my task to influence significant change, I recognized the critical need to employ a conscious transformative learning (Cranton, 2005) lens. I had anticipated emotive and resistive aspects related to the process and attempted to apply appropriate interventions to manage myself and my participants effectively through this. There were times when rather heated discussions occurred. I believe being explicit about the intended outcome (the product) and how we would get there (the process) helped to reduce both some of the anxiety and cynicism that faculty and students felt about engaging in the process. Faculty expressed concern, particularly when I implemented the student survey that I was opening them up to “some sort of witch hunt” or “extreme criticism of their practices”. At the same time students expressed concern that their feedback would “fall on deaf ears” or would “not be acted on”.

Interestingly enough, the results of the student and faculty surveys mirrored each other. When each survey was coded and analyzed, both groups identified complementary issues related to six emergent themes: understanding learning theories, curriculum design, facilitation, evaluation, technology and professional behaviours. Within each theme student feedback and faculty needs reflected each other. For instance, student comments related to technology indicated they wanted more teachers to learn how to use current technologies more effectively, whereas faculty expressed a desire to learn more technologies. Related to evaluation, students wanted assessments to be more congruent with content taught, whereas faculty wanted assistance on how to design more effective assessments. In each of the six themed areas, both parties expressed congruent needs. When this was shown to participants in meeting three, there appeared to be a collective realization that there really was a common goal (to improve teaching and learning), regardless of peoples’ roles in the institution. I believe that this realization reduced a level of anxiety that participants felt regarding the “them versus us” idea and shifted understanding to a collective realization that we could work together to achieve a common goal.

Lenses on Teaching
The second literature area drew upon the use of Brookfield’s (1995) four lenses on teaching which I hoped would assist faculty to have greater insights, from a variety of perspectives, into both institutional and individual practices. The lenses were employed in the make-up of the small groups and in the process overall.

All parties initially demonstrated a level of discomfort working together. In the first meeting some groups had to be split up and more formally created as the tendency was to form groups of all faculty, or all administration, or all students. Yet after the meeting, many participants stopped me to comment about the “rich conversation” and that they had “never thought about what ‘good teaching’ means” (self), had “never asked a student what they thought of the learning experience at CMCC” (learner), could “not recall talking with a colleague” (other) about their classroom experiences, and “didn’t know research existed about teaching” (research). Without incorporating these lenses into the process, they might never have had these insights. By the
fourth meeting, participants evidenced greater comfort interacting with each other. Some faculty went so far as to strike up inter-departmental conversations about curriculum beyond our meetings, others openly asked students for specific feedback for their improvement, while others asked when the Faculty Development program would be ready so they could enroll.

Evidence-based Teaching Strategies

The final area of literature is related to evidence-based practice (EBP). This trend originally emerged in the health science/medical education field. It entails “making decisions about how to promote health or provide care by integrating the best available evidence with practitioner expertise and other resources” (Sackett, Rosenberg, Gray, Haynes, and Richardson, 1996, p. 312). In the past decade this trend has grown to the field of education. Groccia and Buskist (2011) define evidence-based teaching (EBT) as “the conscientious, explicit, and judicious integration of best available research on teaching technique and expertise within the context of students, teacher, department, college, university, and community characteristics” (p. 8). As such, EBT seeks to apply the best available evidence gained from educational research to the planning, implementation and evaluation of curriculum. As indicated, faculty were unaware of the existence and benefits of employing an EBT approach to their teaching practices. This vast divide between enacted evidence-based clinical and teaching practice influenced me to model EBT strategies to assist participants to connect the concept of EBP from their clinical practices to their teaching contexts.

In each meeting, I employed several EBT active learning strategies (Petty, 2009) to achieve the intended outcomes. Participants worked individually and collectively in activities that promoted critical reflection and higher order thinking. Advance organizers were used to promote pre-work and review previous meeting outputs. Specific goals for each meeting and for the process overall were articulated and outputs checked against each goal. Collaborative activities that utilized graphic organizers, employed metaphors, and included arts-based strategies encouraged participant engagement. Feedback was provided in the debriefing of each activity. Additionally, group notes were synthesized and posted on the LMS and served to reinforce group effort, demonstrate transparency, and provide immediate feedback to the process.

Initially participants were uncomfortable with a number of activities due to their applied experiential nature; however, once they began to engage in the activities, discussion levels were high and it became apparent that, even though they lacked the pedagogy around teaching and learning, participants had a lot to say about what they wanted teachers to learn.

Implications

As Brookfield (2006) infamously stated, the work of adult education is often “messy” (p. 1). This process served to remind me of both the complexities and ecstasies found in the role of teacher-educator (Howard and Taber, 2010). Navigating highly politicized waters with disparate groups, who had little knowledge of educational theories and practice, to work to and achieve a common goal in the creation of a Faculty Development program, was not without its challenges. Two outcomes from this process emerged. The first is the initiation of a shift from an ingrained transmission-based (Pratt, 1998) medical education model of teaching practice to one more congruent with a learning-centred approach (Barr & Tagg, 1995). The second is support for the efficacy of applying adult education principles to organizational practice.
I had a choice in my practice. I could use my positional and cultural authority in a top-down manner or I could enact my teacher-educator pedagogy in a bottom-up process. I chose the latter believing it would help me achieve an increased collective understanding of current educational issues, initiate a change in teacher thinking and practice, and instigate a cultural shift within the organization. My successful experience in utilizing the tenets of adult education to articulate guiding principles, designing an effective process framework, applying critical lenses, and employing effective facilitative strategies to achieve the intended outcome provides support for the viability of these methods to promote deeper learning and influence change at both an individual and organizational level.

At the micro level, authenticating the efficacy of utilizing these principles as useful tools to influence teacher thinking and practice is significant. At the macro level, this process serves as an emerging model to achieve meaningful change at both individual and organizational levels. CMCC, while smaller than many, is no different than other higher education institutions. If adult education praxis is successful here, it can work anywhere if there is a commitment to and support of authentic practice.

References


Not so Quiet After All: Two Outspoken Librarians of the Antigonish Movement

Catherine Irving & Sue Adams
Coady International Institute, St. Francis Xavier University

Abstract: This paper draws on archival studies of two women, Nora Bateson and Sr. Marie Michael MacKinnon, whose work bridged adult education and librarianship within the context of the Antigonish Movement. The authors seek to uncover their motivations to tie libraries to values of social justice and lifelong learning, and their methods of “speaking out” to promote their goals.

At a time when interest in libraries and adult learning is rekindling (Imel & Duckett, 2009), this study examines the lives of two women, Nora Bateson and Sr. Marie Michael MacKinnon, whose work bridged adult education and librarianship within the context of the Antigonish Movement. The Antigonish Movement was a social mobilization program in eastern Canada emerging from the 1930s, whose methods of collective learning and action have been studied extensively by adult educators. However, the Antigonish Movement’s role in the library movement has received less attention. The stories of these two women demonstrate linkages between the two fields.

Nora Bateson was a leader in public library promotion internationally, including the Maritimes during the heyday of the Antigonish Movement. Her librarianship was infused with an understanding of the place of libraries in lifelong learning. Sr. Marie Michael MacKinnon began her career as an educator and fieldworker and became the Movement’s Antigonish-based librarian at St. Francis Xavier University (StFX). Marie Michael’s keen understanding of the people, informed through her fieldwork, strengthened her provision of library-supported learning in the communities.

Theoretical Framework
Feminist historians have long since decried the underrepresentation of women in written history. Maack’s (1982) survey of librarianship’s historical record clearly demonstrates this imbalance—all the more glaring for such a female-identified profession. Also clear from historical study is that the adult education and library movements developed in tandem, though these parallels rarely surface in the literature (Adams, 2005; Imel & Duckett, 2009). Analyses of libraries as sites of informal adult learning can also guide historical analysis (Irving, 2010) as we examine the motivation and practices of these early educator librarians.

While adult educators are working to uncover women’s biographies in adult education (see English, 2011; McManus, 2006), the record of many women’s stories is still incomplete. Similarly, historical accounts of adult education movements share passing reference to libraries, but the library workers have not received the attention shown to the various movements’ leaders and educators. In writings of the Antigonish Movement, Sr. Marie Michael is readily acknowledged as the “lady of the books” (Neal, 1998, p.148), but the details of how her library service integrated with programs of adult education and community development is typically overlooked.
The archival research at the heart of this paper involves a critical examination of correspondence and other writings of Sr. Marie Michael, Nora Bateson and their contemporaries from several archival collections. “Feminist recovery projects” are intended to base “any claims about the value and importance of women figures on what the figures themselves have said and done” (Roof, 2011, p.524). Our understanding of women educators is deepened by examining their gendered and cultural contexts (English, 2011). This paper takes the tack that we cannot know their work until we know their biographies. In researching their lives and times, the links between adult education and libraries through their practice become clearer.

Profiling Nora Bateson and Sr. Marie Michael
While Nora Bateson and Sr. Marie Michael MacKinnon developed libraries in the same region and era, they did not collaborate directly. Of interest to their separate biographies are the contrasts and convergences of their mission and practice in librarianship and adult education. This biographical study organizes these women’s stories through three themes: 1) early motivations in social justice; 2) support of lifelong learning in communities; and 3) their “outspoken” approaches to library promotion and advocacy. To begin, a brief chronology of the two women’s lives provides context.

Biographical Sketches
Nora Bateson (1896-1956) immigrated to Canada from England in 1920 for a teaching post, but soon discovered a passion for librarianship; she devoted the next decade to developing this expertise. In 1933, Bateson was invited to establish the Carnegie Corporation funded library demonstration project in Prince Edward Island (PEI). At this time she met Fr. Jimmy Tompkins and the ideas of the Antigonish Movement. Tompkins’ persistent library advocacy led Bateson to Nova Scotia to replicate her PEI efforts—a task that was interrupted by the Second World War and ultimately hobbled by politics. Other regions welcomed her acumen as she moved on to contribute to the profession in the United States, Caribbean, and New Zealand (see Adams, 2009 for a more detailed biography).

Mary Sarah MacKinnon (1905-1991) grew up in Beaver Cove, Cape Breton, Nova Scotia. In 1927, she entered religious life with the Sisters of St. Martha. After graduating from StFX in 1933, she joined the University’s Extension Department as the director of the Women and Work program. She also worked on the Department’s library to support demand for information from the hundreds of study clubs. As the library became her primary focus, she eventually received formal library training in the late 1940s. Msgr. Smyth (1961) invited her to live at the Martha convent at the new Coady International Institute to work with the students. She continued as librarian of the Extension Department until its closure in 1964, and established the Coady library (later named in her honour), before moving to Toronto in 1972 as librarian at St. Augustine’s Seminary until her retirement (O’Reilly, 1987).

Early Motivations in Social Justice
Nora Bateson’s upbringing near Manchester coincided with the rise of labour politics and suffragism. Nora and her sisters “were expected to be career women and not marry,” (V. Osgood, personal correspondence, April 8, 2008) suggesting her family had embraced the growing feminist spirit of the day. An academic award allowed her to study history at the University of Manchester, where her professors were leaders of the Settlement Movement and...
the Workers’ Educational Association (Tout, n.d.). Pheobe Sheavyn, the matron of Nora’s Hall, was noted for progressive views and suffragist sentiments (S. Griffiths, personal correspondence, October 7, 2008). Yet, for all the feminist influences, Nora’s career options were strongly gendered. Her librarianship reconnected with education when she obtained a position with Helen Gordon Stewart (Bateson, 1945), who was developing a regional public library system in the Fraser Valley of British Columbia using adult education methods in a context of community engagement (Morison, 1952): this approach became the defining characteristic of Nora’s work.

Marie Michael’s awareness of social justice had more rural origins. Fr. Michael Gillis, her parish priest, was “a key proponent of social action in the diocese” (Cameron, 1996, p. 214), and introduced her to St.FX and to the Sisters of St. Martha. His inspiration led her to request the name Michael when she entered the Congregation (O’Reilly, 1987). Many young women in rural Cape Breton would have lacked opportunities such as Nora Bateson enjoyed, except through the Church; though, the future of a young nun at this time was also strongly gendered. Marie Michael was initially sent to MacDonald College in Quebec to study household sciences (MacKinnon, 1982).

Marie Michael’s strong community ties, fieldwork exposure and renowned ability to remember everyone she met, undoubtedly strengthened her conviction to work to improve life in the rural areas. One example of her class-awareness emerged in a presentation on the women of the Antigonish Movement with colleague Sr. Irene Doyle. When asked if her women’s programs collaborated with existing groups, she somewhat dismissively described the education efforts of a local Women’s Institute holding sessions on preparing fancy sandwiches—they clearly represented a different social class (MacKinnon & Doyle, 1990).

Marie Michael may not have had as extensive exposure to feminist ideas as Nora, but she saw sharply the gender injustice evidenced by male control of co-operative administration. The initial premise of women’s study clubs focused on domestic skills, but the primary goal was “to expose them to ideas which in turn would fit them for positions of leadership” (MacKinnon, 1982, p.9). These leadership efforts were repeatedly thwarted (Delaney, 1985).

Lifelong Learning and Community: The Role of Libraries

When Nora Bateson led the PEI library demonstration project, she integrated adult education practices she had learned from Stewart in British Columbia. As the Antigonish Movement spread to PEI, libraries were a natural complement. Nora criss-crossed the Island in a modified Chevrolet coupe, with a custom-fitted portable library to illustrate the potential of community libraries. She established strong connections with the Island’s nascent study groups (Bateson, 1933-36a). Her rousing presentations to school and church groups, Women’s Institutes, and farmers’ assemblies quickly developed rapport with community members. Her colleague John Croteau (1951) hailed Nora as “a vivid personality, intense, socially minded and with great ability,” though her popularity “did not extend to high government levels” (pp. 17-18).

Marie Michael and Irene Doyle (1990) stated, “It is hard to overestimate the importance of the small study groups.” Providing information to support these energetic groups was a daunting task. They produced countless pamphlets and the periodicals *The Extension Bulletin* and *The Maritime Co-operator*, and scoured the continent for free material produced by agricultural
extension offices and other agencies, readily adapting documents for local purposes. Portable library “book boxes” circulated among the study clubs, and books were mailed individually to members—this was a library system in microcosm.

In 1936, St.FX obtained a $30,000 grant from the Carnegie Corporation. One third of this was devoted, as Carnegie secretary Robert Lester (1936) explained, “to the development of the library in relation to the demands of the adult education program.” The Antigonish library expanded, and a second library in Glace Bay opened with small branches added in nearby communities—often in credit unions to assist member education. (St.FX Extension Department, 1944).

By the 1940s, the women’s program wound down due to chronic underfunding. The study club model also gave way to more formal training. Marie Michael and Irene Doyle (1990) recognized the criticism that this shift weakened Extension’s link to the grassroots. In 1947 Marie Michael worked to maintain that link by expanding direct library service, welcoming anyone interested in reading. In industrial Cape Breton people had access to Fr. Jimmy Tompkins’ “People’s Library”, whose activities were expanded by Sr. Francis Dolores Donnelly (Neal, 1998). Marie Michael’s priority focused on rural communities where no library service existed.

Like Nora Bateson, Marie Michael believed that exposure to library services through her program would whet an appetite for more local libraries. She shared Coady’s belief that community ownership was key. As with the development of co-operatives, people had to come together, decide what was best for their community, and work to achieve their goals. Even if a benevolent government lavished a community with a free library, it would only succeed if it was created in people’s interests (MacKinnon & Doyle, 1990). Many of the programs initiated by the Extension Department were intended to be taken over by the organizations created by the people themselves. She hoped this too would happen with library service.

Speaking Out for Libraries
Nora Bateson and Fr. Jimmy Tompkins ardently promoted libraries as “the people’s universities,” in line with a liberal view of adult education. Tompkins took advantage of Nora’s visit to Reserve Mines in 1935 to arrange speaking engagements with community groups to promote the idea of libraries. In typically vivid style, Tompkins (1935) describes the impact of the many presentations in a letter to his cousin Moses Coady:

Now we have excogitated things revolutionary and she is wild and she has set me wild...She is trying to get them standing on their hind legs for reading.

Nora’s growing connection with the Antigonish Movement led to invitations for her to speak at the Rural and Industrial Conference in Antigonish. These annual conferences attracted illustrious speakers including Charles Beard, President of the American Association for Adult Education, Ned Corbett, and Roy Bergengren, pioneer of the US credit union movement. In 1934, Nora spoke to an assembly of 200 on the topic “Library Service for the People.” (St.FX Extension Department, 1934). Her ability to inspire led to return invitations to speak in 1935 and 1936—the only speaker other than Moses Coady to score this metaphorical “hat trick.” Notably, while the
(very few) female speakers were usually restricted to the “Women’s Section” of the conference, Nora Bateson was invited to address the full audience.

Meanwhile, on PEI, Nora established a regional library system that was an integral support for thriving study clubs. She ensured her community forays received ample coverage in the local press, and embarked on a vigorous campaign of publishing in the island’s newspapers (Bateson, 1933-36b). Nora also drafted the PEI Library Act to formalize the regional library. After considerable debate the Act was passed by the legislature in 1934, and then rescinded in 1936. John Croteau (1951), commenting on Nora’s open frustration, stated, “Her trouble was that she had no awe of persons in high places; Ministers of the Crown...do not like to hear unflattering descriptions of their intellectual equipment uttered in public meetings (p.17). Croteau may have identified the underlying issue when he continued, “There was on the island no tradition of women in responsible administrative positions. Perhaps the men resented her outspoken remarks more because she was a woman than because of what she actually said” (p.18). Nevertheless, the PEI library demonstration was an inspiring success as documented in Nora’s frequent submissions to professional library publications and associations (Bateson 1934a, 1934b, 1935).

As she promoted adult education to librarians, Father Tompkins was relentlessly raising the importance of libraries to the Canadian Association for Adult Education. Articles on libraries began to appear in the CAAE journal Food for Thought.

In 1938 Nora Bateson was invited to Nova Scotia to develop regional libraries similar to the PEI model. With Father Jimmy on the Regional Libraries Commission, the two pounced on the opportunity to further their formidable collaboration. However, war intervened; Nora was seconded to the Canadian Legion Educational Service, and later undertook a library survey of Jamaica in 1944. As documented in the Jamaican press (“Rapid strides”, 1944), she spoke regularly to credit unions about the inspiring lessons of the Antigonish Movement. She returned to Halifax in 1945 to resume her library mission, but her outspoken manner once again ran her afoul of the politicians. At a public meeting she indiscreetly referred to Nova Scotia as a “library desert” (“Bateson says”, 1945) in comparison with verdant Jamaica where people were “too intelligent to swallow election propaganda” (Morning Chronicle, 1945). The Premier demanded her resignation; when she refused he dismissed her, despite protests ranging from miners’ groups to universities.

Marie Michael also made full use of the media to support adult education efforts and library outreach. She embraced radio to spread library service further by hosting a program on CJFX, “This is Your Library.” She discussed books in the library collection and encouraged listeners to write in to request books by mail at no cost to the borrowers (MacKinnon & Doyle, 1990). Early episodes reflect practical concerns of the study clubs: agriculture, housing, and handicrafts. However, she soon expanded the range to entice her audience’s broader interests. By the comments she makes in later broadcasts, this was enthusiastically taken up. Thematic programs on Scottish and Irish history, memoirs extolling the noble virtues of rural life, and travel adventures were recurring topics. Some scripts read as if they were written today, with pleas for a return to organic agriculture, or critiques of capitalist economics. She would also link to other adult education radio initiatives, suggesting books to complement Life in These Maritimes (a CJFX study club modelled program), and the CAAE’s Citizen’s Forum (MacKinnon, 1949-1951) on the CBC radio network.
Speaking out personally. Marie Michael’s libraries had an enduring reputation as friendly places (Cameron, 2000). She readily admitted her aversion to library rules as her goal was to remove barriers to people’s use of libraries: people were more important than procedures. Her adult education and community work defined her library philosophy and practice. When Marie Michael passed away, the eulogy highlighted her personal connections with people as an enduring aspect of her life and work (Chisholm, 1991). This librarian was most fondly remembered for talking. Today, as libraries strive to strengthen their roles in community life, many are now learning the lessons that Marie Michael always maintained.

Concluding Thoughts
Adult educators have the opportunity to discover anew the potential that community-focused libraries offer as partners in lifelong learning. Library learning environments are not created simply by the provision of material or programs, but through active and intentional connections. Through creative use of media, one-on-one engagement with rural residents and tireless advocacy, Sr. Marie Michael and Nora Bateson very personally demonstrate community-engaged learning.

Nora Bateson made phenomenal contributions to the establishment of libraries around the world that were infused with the library’s link to adult education and community development. Nora’s increasing roles in oversight positions perhaps took her away from the grassroots, but her early work appears to have had a lasting impression, as evidenced by her ongoing enthusiasm to spread the story of the Antigonish Movement in her later international travels. Marie Michael’s contributions to libraries appear more close to home, yet her global impact was on the memories of all who entered her welcoming library domain.

References
Bateson says Nova Scotia is a “literary desert”. (1945, April 14). Morning Chronicle, p.3.


MacKinnon, M.M. (1949-1951). This is your library [transcripts]. St. Francis Xavier University Archives (RG30-3/9-1/470), Antigonish, NS.


Rapid strides made by Issa Credit Union Ltd. (1944, Oct.3). The Daily Gleaner [Jamaica], p.11.


St. Francis Xavier University Extension Department. (1934). [1934 Rural and Industrial Conference programme]. St Francis Xavier University Archives (RG30-3/28/224), Antigonish, N.S.


179
Healthcare, Culture and Politics: How American TV Figures in Canadian Adults’ Learning about Medicare

Kaela Jubas, Dawn Johnston, Angie Chiang & Rebecca Reznick
University of Calgary

Abstract: This paper discusses research exploring popular or “pop” culture’s pedagogical function. Interested in how American pop culture is inserted into Canadian policy debates, we are talking to Canadians aged 18 to 30 about how they understand messages concerning healthcare policy in *Grey’s Anatomy*. We outline our methodology and early findings, according to the themes of the “who,” “what” and “how” of healthcare, before closing with a summary of our next steps and the study’s contributions.

Introduction
This paper outlines a study into how Canadians aged 18 to 30 understand portrayals of healthcare in American pop culture, and incorporate them into their own stances. Healthcare is vital to Canadians; indeed, Medicare is widely regarded and employed as a marker of Canadian identity, even though healthcare delivery is a provincial/territorial responsibility. Arguing that pop culture’s power lies in its resonance with fans’ concerns and experiences, we note the lack of Canadian-produced mainstream cultural portrayals of healthcare. Using *Grey’s Anatomy* to spur conversations with participants, we assert that the show works alongside media reports, political platforms and personal experiences to help Canadians learn about and position themselves in healthcare debates. We are especially interested in people in this age range, at a stage of life when they can engage with both the political and the healthcare systems in new ways. Following a review of relevant adult education scholarship, we outline the theoretical perspective which informs our research. We then describe our methodology, outline and discuss our findings to date, and conclude by considering the implications of this research.

Review of Adult Education Scholarship on Pop Culture
Relevant adult education scholarship often relies on textual analysis. Fisher, Harris and Jarvis (2008) establish how the film *Educating Rita* echoes a standard liberal message that education enables progress. They also explore more complex ideas in the show *Buffy the Vampire Slayer*, which blurs the line between formal and informal learning. For Buffy, vital lessons about herself occur outside school, and in-class learning illuminates power dynamics between young, low income students and older, wealthy faculty. Comparing versions of *The Office* from several countries, Armstrong (2008) concludes that variations reflect national discourses of diversity and work, and that pop culture helps people develop ideas about work before they enter a workplace.

Moving beyond textual analysis, Wright (2010) explores how Cathy Gale, a lead character in an early season of the British show *The Avengers*, influenced female fans’ sense of second wave feminism, and their own identity, rights and opportunities. Following analysis of *Grey’s Anatomy* and *Scrubs*, also set in a teaching hospital, Jubas (2011a, 2011b) held focus groups or interviews with undergraduate medical and nursing students familiar with the shows. Her findings echo points noted above, including that pop culture helps adults imagine what working life will be like, and that professional identity is tied to other aspects of identity. Moreover, it is pop culture’s resonance with fans’ experiences and sensibilities, rather than objectivity per se, that determines
how fans receive and accept it. Finally, Tisdell (2008) summarizes research that she conducted with colleagues. They found that members of minority groups felt affirmed by portrayals of successful people who resembled them, and hoped that such portrayals could foster social change. Although critical response was curtailed by the pleasure of cultural consumption, facilitated discussion helped participants expand “understanding of marginalized ‘Others’ in new ways and/or increase their understanding of how hegemonic processes work both in media and in society at large” (Tisdell, 2008, p. 58). These studies confirm that, whether or not cultural producers intend to convey messages or fans receive messages as intended, pop culture functions pedagogically, especially around identity construction and understandings of social life.

**Theoretical Perspective**

We adopt the constructivist premise that daily life is a site of informal and “incidental” adult learning (Malcolm, Hodkinson, & Colley, 2003; Marsick & Watkins, 2001). Knowledge, in this sense, is seen as built up by learners purposefully and unintentionally through socioculturally contextualized experiences. Cultural consumption is one way that adults learn about themselves and their world, even if that learning is explored rarely and tends to remain unrecognized (Jubas, 2011a, 2011b; Sandlin, Schultz & Burdick, 2010; Tisdell, 2008; Wright, 2010). We see learning as a holistic process which unfolds emotionally and intellectually (Dirkx, 2001). Pop culture’s pedagogical power lies largely in its emotional appeal (Tisdell, 2008). Resulting learning is complex and unpredictable, and can reiterate, reconstruct or refute hegemonic notions. We further connect cultural consumption to policy. Instead of viewing policy-making as a process based in bureaucrats’ offices and legislatures, we see it as an open process through which citizens encounter, engage with and reflect on media, politicians, pop culture and one another. Policy-making, like adult learning, is a holistic process, with personal, cultural and political dimensions.

**Methodology and Methods**

This qualitative, three-stage study is based in an interpretive/critical theory paradigm (Guba & Lincoln, 2008). In the first stage, we carried out a textual analysis of *Grey’s Anatomy*, a prime time drama about surgical residents in the fictional Seattle Grace Hospital. DVDs of seasons one through six were divided among the four members of the study team and partially transcribed. Our analysis informed development of focus group guidelines being used in the second stage, now underway. Sessions are being held in Western Canada with participants recruited through post-secondary listservs, flyers in cafes, online postings, and word of mouth. Ideally, participants have voted in a provincial or federal election, have started to look for a family doctor, and are aware of media stories related to healthcare. To accommodate as many people as possible, we offer sessions with as few as two people. Sessions in capital cities (Victoria, Edmonton and Regina) and commercial centres (Vancouver, Calgary and Saskatoon) will help us see how pop culture and healthcare “play” locally and provincially. In the third stage, participants can engage in an online discussion forum where they will explore messages and understandings further.

**Preliminary Findings**

Three themes identified in our analysis of *Grey’s Anatomy* – who deserves care, what deserves coverage, and how healthcare is organized – have focused conversations with participants. This section summarizes sessions in Vancouver and Victoria with 15 participants (13 female, 2 male). Most were post-secondary students, and two were employed full-time. Although our criteria stipulated that participants must be Canadian citizens, one person clarified that she was a long-
time permanent resident but an American citizen. Because this admission came toward the end of the session and her contributions were deemed relevant and useful, without compromising the integrity of that session or the study overall, we decided to retain her comments in our data. We introduce each of the following thematic sections with a brief segment from *Grey’s Anatomy*, to illustrate the sorts of policy-related messages that are embedded in the show.

**Theme 1: Who deserves and receives care?**

Izzie: How did Gillian let it get this far?
Addison: It’s frustrating, isn’t it? And it’s entirely preventable, and treatable if you catch it in time. But you gotta catch it.
Miranda: Which is why I wanna open a clinic. If she’d had access to a free clinic she probably would have had a pap smear every year and wouldn’t be dealing with infertility and premature menopause at the tender age of 23. (Buchman & Grossman, 2007)

In this excerpt, characters are discussing a patient who could not afford to consult a specialist and now has such advanced cervical cancer that she is terminally ill. This scenario exemplifies an issue presented repeatedly on the show: Americans who enjoy “good” jobs have adequate healthcare insurance, while many others are made vulnerable by a system based on privately financed care. Although Gillian’s end is an unhappy one, the dilemma for most *Grey’s Anatomy* patients without insurance ends more happily. Patients plead their cases and find surgeons to champion their causes, or take advantage of mutual acquaintances to curry favour with surgeons; in one case, a female doctor marries a male patient so that he can use her insurance policy. On the one hand, the show challenges the implication that deservedness of healthcare is class-based; on the other hand, it reduces a major policy issue to a matter of personal disposition and social capital. The participants saw such portrayals as problematic and unrealistic, because they show only a few patients fortunate enough to benefit from the surgeons’ philanthropy, and they avoid showing the ramifications for surgeons who step outside workplace, regulatory and policy rules.

In other ways, participants found that messages in *Grey’s Anatomy* about who deserves and receives attention reflect reality in the United States, and help clarify differences and similarities between the US and Canada. Participants agreed that the show illustrates how class status determines access to healthcare services in the US, a situation that they found objectionable. Watching *Grey’s Anatomy* helped them appreciate Canada’s Medicare framework and its premise that basic healthcare is a right; however, they thought that universal access creates issues. Finding a family physician was a common challenge for participants, and many used walk-in clinics where they could see a doctor, but might not be able to build important doctor-patient relationships. Such clinics were not seen in an entirely negative light, though; some people were studying away from home, and appreciated the convenience that clinics offered. Wait times were another issue, which participants often associated with acquaintances who had been injured in competitive or leisure sports. Finally, there was agreement that, even in Canada, social capital can help a patient find a specialist and can reduce time spent waiting for treatment.

**Theme 2: What procedures are worthy of coverage?**

Patient: Cheap son-of-a-bitch bastards are going straight to hell! Straight to hell!
Miranda: Ms Douglas?
Patient: Insurance bastards. They say the surgery’s too experimental.
Miranda: They won’t pay.
Patient: It’s a $200,000 surgery. Plus a hospital stay, plus rehab. Even if I get three jobs, son-of-a-bitch bastards! (Vernoff & Yaitanes, 2009)

Regardless of how healthcare is funded, decisions are made about the procedures or treatments to be covered. In the case presented in the segment above, a patient learns that her insurer will not pay for the spinal operation recommended by Seattle Grace surgeons. For participants in the study, such a portrayal of cost-related reasons seemed to reflect policy-making in both the US and, increasingly, Canada. Participants concurred that, in recent decades, even publicly funded and delivered services have adopted a corporate mindset, an issue discussed below; however, at least one participant wondered whether Canada’s public insurance providers might exercise decision-making in a kinder, gentler way than private insurers, and be more open to considering innovative, potentially life-saving but expensive procedures or treatments. “What I would like to think in Canada,” Javad explained, “is that because it’s...public health insurance, they would be more willing to give you more options.”

Cost is not the only factor determining availability of healthcare services. Participants noted that the values underpinning discourse and life in the nation-state are also important. Abortion, which participants agreed is controversial in the US, gains prominence in the current season when one character, Cristina, becomes pregnant and decides to have an abortion. Her husband, Owen, wants to have children, and reacts with anger and derision even though Cristina was always up front about not wanting children. Owen does not argue that abortion is immoral and should be banned; rather, he argues that Cristina should not have an abortion because he wants to be a parent, and he sees her decision to do so as selfish. The politics of abortion are reduced to a private matter, and the framing of abortion in terms of gender (in)equity is relegated to the sidelines. We have already noted how class relations are implicit in some Grey’s Anatomy scenarios, but absent in resolutions offered on the show. Likewise, gender relations are apparent and overlooked in Grey’s Anatomy’s portrayals. Participants who discussed this storyline related it to what they perceived as a relative lack of heated controversy about abortion services in Canada. Even if they themselves did not frame the storyline and broader issue in terms of gender relations, participants thought that the storyline reflects values-based differences between the US and Canada, in terms of how politics and social life are experienced and enacted.

Theme 3: How is healthcare delivery organized?
I know you all have heard a lot of rumours, and I’m sorry for that....And what I’m about to say will be hard to hear, and I’m sorry for that as well....The economic climate is, well you all know what it is. In the coming weeks, Seattle Grace Hospital will be merging with Mercy West...I wish I could tell you you will all survive the merger, but there are only so many jobs. And the board and I have some tough choices to make...I’m on your side people. I’m rooting for every one of you. (“Richard” in Vernoff & D’Elia, 2009)

In this excerpt, Dr. Richard Webber, chief of surgery at Seattle Grace Hospital, announces to the residents and surgeons that Seattle Grace will merge with a competitor. The segment suggests that healthcare infrastructure is subject to the neoliberal outlooks and imperatives that pervade
political, corporate and mainstream public discourse. Participants agreed that this mindset is increasingly obvious across organizational and even national contexts.

Disagreement within and between discussion sessions surfaced when attention turned to whether this is a positive or a negative trend. Some participants felt strongly that this shift threatens publicly funded and delivered services. In another excerpt viewed during sessions, residents and surgeons wait impatiently to see the rankings of American teaching hospitals. After viewing that segment, Javad raised the annual rankings of universities produced by the Canadian magazine Maclean’s as an example. He commented that such ratings are portrayed by mainstream media and politicians, and perceived by many citizens, as important measures of status and quality, even if the meaning of rating systems is unclear or unestablished. Similarly, Katrina, a participant who is studying to be a teacher, articulated deep reservations about the impact of provincial and federal government corporate-sounding rhetoric on the quality of public services – from healthcare to education – and the working conditions of the people who deliver them.

In contrast to those cautions, Sasha thought that a corporate mindset among public sector policy-makers and managers was sorely needed, because public sector workers have enjoyed protection even when they have failed in their jobs. In her view, publicly funded and administered services, notably healthcare, ought to be judged primarily according to their adherence to a budget, rather than patient outcome. Most participants, though, adopted a more middle-of-the-road position. They believed that Canada’s healthcare infrastructure is generally sound, despite challenges to deliver timely, high quality services in the context of funding and staffing constraints. A fairly common refrain within and across sessions emphasized a need to fund crucial public services, including healthcare, without increasing taxes.

Discussion
Participants realized that Grey’s Anatomy is a work of fiction, and entertains audience members according to the rules of its dramatic genre. Its storylines and characters create emotional, rather than intellectual, connections with fans, and ground its pedagogical power (Tisdell, 2008). In particular, participants recognized that the show exaggerates scenarios to build tension, and ignores aspects of healthcare that might bore fans. It features exotic cases and clinical procedures, even as the the immediacy with which patients are treated misrepresents a reality of waiting for test results, consultations with specialists and surgical scheduling. Despite such inauthentic representations of real-life healthcare, participants also found that the show resonated with their understandings and experiences in some important ways, reiterating a conclusion made earlier by Jubas (2011a, 2011b). As Susan, a participant in the current study explained, Grey’s Anatomy writers “set up a realistic problem but then they follow with an unrealistic solution.” By portraying scenarios with people who need and provide healthcare, pop culture does something that news media, politicians and personal accounts cannot do: It provides a vision of what healthcare does, might or should (not) look like.

Although data collection remains underway and analysis of existing data is tentative, we surmise that information from varied sources, including news media, political platforms, shared stories and pop culture, seeps into understandings of healthcare-related issues and debates. Asking participants about their sources of information and understandings helps us, as researchers, discern different viewpoints and explanations. Moreover, focus group conversations seem to help
participants appreciate how these sources of information and texts work together as they come to understand the realities, benefits, limitations and possibilities for Canadian healthcare.

Sometimes, though, focus groups have left questions unanswered and raised new questions. Traces of “common sense,” as Gramsci (1971) uses the term, are apparent. For example, even participants who could recall no specific healthcare-related political statements or media stories articulated positions prominent in Canadian healthcare debates, notably that building capacity in Canada’s public healthcare system would entail undesirable, across-the-board tax increases.

**Next Steps and Contributions**

Not only does this inquiry add to the emerging body of relevant research, its focus on policy-related learning is novel. We will continue to attend to the three themes discussed here in further focus groups and the online discussion forum, where we also will explore new and related questions. These include how *Grey’s Anatomy*’s portrayals mesh with media stories, political rhetoric and personal experience; whether the show’s optimistic, individualized resolutions to issues discourage people from engaging in policy debates; the extent to which participants connect a public healthcare policy framework to their sense of belonging and citizenship in Canada; and how participants might imagine a Canadian cultural portrayal of these issues.

**References**


Dialogues with Elders, Adult Learners and Teachers in Rural First Nations Communities – Exploring E-Learning Interest and Potential

Colleen Kawalilak  
University of Calgary  
Noella (Little Mustache) Wells, Lynn Connell, & Kate Beamer  
Bow Valley College

Abstract: This qualitative study focused on the needs of Aboriginal adult learners from selected rural Alberta, First Nations communities and on the potential for increasing access to e-learning education. Through dialogue with First Nations community members, four key themes emerged from the data: Building Capacity, Success Factors, Relationships and Learning, and Technology.

*This study was funded by Bow Valley College, ARDN, and eCampusAlberta. NorQuest College collaborated in this initiative.

Introduction
The adult education landscape continues to shift and reshape. A deeper understanding of the needs of adult learners, influx of technology to support adult learning programs, the changing needs of communities and economic influences and realities, impact and influence how post secondary institutions respond to the needs, vision, and voices of all stakeholders. This shifting landscape presents significant challenges for adult education institutions that seek to successfully navigate this rapidly changing terrain. What remains constant, however, is the commitment of leaders and practitioners to be inclusive and responsive to the diverse needs of adult learners, communities, and society.

This small, qualitative study focused on the learning needs of Aboriginal adult learners residing in selected First Nations communities within the service region of two Alberta community colleges. Researchers sought a deepened understanding of interest and readiness of Aboriginal adult learners and their rural communities to engage with e-learning program delivery. Guided by Henchey (2005) who asserted that we need research and data to know where we are now and where we want to go, researchers engaged in dialogue with learners, community leaders, and educators to gain a deeper appreciation of perspectives, opportunities, and challenges related to expanding access to college courses and programs through e-learning to rural Aboriginal communities.

The Aboriginal Centre Director (a band member from the Piikani Nation), the Director of Learner Success Services, and one research assistant, all from Bow Valley College, and one external consultant/lead researcher formed the research team. The Aboriginal Centre Director guided researchers on cultural protocol and sensitivities when engaging with First Nations communities. The external consultant/lead researcher provided additional guidance/mentoring, drawing from her collaborative research experiences with Indigenous peoples in Western Australia.

Networking with First Nations communities preceded formal research activities and provided
opportunities to explore benefits of this research for all stakeholders. Kenny, Faries, Fiske and Voyageur (2004) expressed concern that, too frequently, research in Aboriginal communities benefits researchers with little or no benefit to participants or communities. Throughout this networking phase, and in the spirit of authentic collaboration and engagement, researchers were guided by critical questions posed by Aboriginal researcher/scholar, Linda Tuhiwai Smith (1999): “Whose interests does [are being] serve[d]? Who will benefit? Who has designed its questions and framed its scope?” (p. 10). Networking included informal discussions with First Nations community members, visiting schools and meeting learners/teachers who expressed interest in adult education and e-learning, smudge ceremonies, feasts, and other gatherings organized by community members. Networking built trust and a deepened understanding of relationship elements foundational to collaboration with Aboriginal communities.

The Literature

Aboriginal learners were identified as “the most disadvantaged segment of the Canadian school population” (CCL, State of e-learning in Canada, 2009, p.86). While there was little literature focusing specifically on adult Aboriginal learners’ needs, what was often acknowledged was the lack of Aboriginal learners at a post-secondary level (Sisco, 2010; Steel & Fahy, 2011). While this trend is slowly shrinking as of 2006, only 42% of Aboriginal young adults (25-34) held post-secondary credentials compared to 68% of non-Aboriginal learners (CCL, Post-secondary education in Canada, 2009). That being said, the educational gaps appear more widely in universities, whereas Aboriginal enrolment in colleges and trade schools are now coming to par with non-Aboriginal learners (Fahy, Steel, & Martin, 2009). Aboriginal learners living on-reserves (rural and remote) experienced less educational success than their urban counterparts (Sisco, 2010; Steel & Fahy, 2011).

Lower levels of high school graduation rates among Aboriginal versus non-Aboriginal learners barriers learners from attending post-secondary education (CCL, Post-secondary education in Canada, 2009; Gruber & Coldevin, 1994; Philpott, Sharpe, & Neville, 2009; Sisco, 2010). This is significant as the quality of basic education greatly affects one’s ability to succeed in a post-secondary environment. Also, few post-secondary schools are located on/near Aboriginal learners’ home communities so learners are forced to relocate or face long commutes to attend school (CCL, State of E-learning in Canada, 2009; Steel & Fahy, 2011). Lack of reliable transportation and travel costs contribute to low attendance/drop out rates in urban-based, post-secondary schools (Alberta MLA Committee on First Nations, 2010; Steel & Fahy, 2011, Facey, 2001, Hick, 2002). In addition, many rurally located Aboriginal learners hesitate to leave their families to attend urban school (Alberta MLA Committee on First Nations, 2010). For those who do relocate, discrimination and racism continue to impact successful engagement/retention (Fahy, Steel, & Martin, 2009; Sisco, 2010). These barriers linked to increased interest in distance, online/e-learning opportunities for rural Aboriginal communities.

The absence of reliable technology in rural/remote communities was identified as a barrier to accessing distance/online education. Poor Internet connectivity and limited/no access to a broadband connection was frequently referenced (Alberta MLA Committee to First Nations, 2010; Rao & Guili, 2010; Philpott, Sharpe, & Neville, 2009, Sisco, 2010). Without access to personal, home computers, there is an increased reliance on sharing computers at local community centres (Fahy, Steel, & Martin, 2009; Hick, 2002; Philpott, Sharpe, & Neville, 2009).
Providing technological access is not enough to ensure learner success, however. Culturally sensitive approaches that attend to learning styles and linguistic traditions (Berkshire & Smith, 2000) were emphasized in the literature.

Personal motivation, past successes, and opportunities to ‘be’ with others were cited as critical success factors for those partaking in e-learning. Also noted was a strong desire among rural Aboriginal learners to achieve a post-secondary credential (Philpott, Sharpe, & Neville, 2009). The literature cited a high success rate of distance and online learning among Aboriginal learners of all ages (Philpott, Sharpe, & Neville, 2009). Also cited were equal performance rates in distance and web courses compared to face-to-face coursework (Philpott, Sharpe, & Neville, 2009). Connection with instructors via email, phone, or fax, was identified as essential to learner success (Philpott, Sharpe, & Neville, 2009; Rao & Guili, 2010). Face-to-face interaction and support, when learning online, were preferred, especially for some coursework such as math (Steel & Fahy; Rao & Guili, 2010; Philpott, Sharpe, & Neville). Opportunities for online discussions, forums, web conferences, and other forms of student interaction and synchronous learning were greatly favoured (Rao & Guili, 2010, Philpott, Sharpe, & Neville, 2009).

Methodology
Indigenous epistemology and knowledge sharing processes guided this research. This provided space for an emergence of themes throughout the data collection process. Indigenous typologies (an organic emergence of themes) provides for the creation of spaces, throughout the research process, where participants’ voices, perspectives, and responses play a dominant role in theme identification. An inductive approach aligned well to the spirit and intentions of engaging in collaborative, dialogical research with participants.

Participants
Forty-seven participants volunteered to participate in this study: 27 Aboriginal adult learners living on reserves and in program; 6 Aboriginal adults living on reserves and planning to enroll; 4 Aboriginal community leaders; 7 teachers/instructors (Aboriginal, non/Aboriginal) in Aboriginal rural settings; 3 Bow Valley College/NorQuest College leaders.

Methods/Data Collection
Dialogue was the chosen method for this study. Dialogue is a creative process and is not intent on “[getting] the participants to move toward a predetermined goal” (Bohm, Factor & Garrett, 1991, Why Dialogue section, para. 6). Dialogue is invitational. It provides safe space within which equal opportunity is extended to all participants to explore and respond to overarching research themes. Dialogue themes included: interests/experiences with adult education/post-secondary programs; awareness of program offerings (in urban and rural locations), resources/supports contributing to learner success; challenges, fears, apprehensions of prospective adult learners; preferred program delivery mediums; learning styles; technology/e-learning needs; and available supports in Aboriginal communities. All individual and focus group dialogues were audio taped.

Data analysis
Researchers paired off to listen to audio recordings. In groups of two, and while listening to audiotapes, each researcher recorded themes/topics that emerged onto individual sticky notes.
(one topic/theme per note). Each researcher of that pair then applied sticky notes generated on to large sheets of flip chart paper. Both researchers then compared what they each had documented by way of key themes and topics. Interrelationships and alignments of sub-themes were identified, reflected upon, and discussed. This resulted in sticky notes being clustered into sub-themes and then into overarching, dominant themes. The lead researcher then collected all data and repeated the process of sub-theme comparison, looking for interrelationships and alignments. Sub and overarching themes were then discussed and reflected upon, at length, with the full research team.

**Emergent Themes**

Dialogues were rich and personal. Participants shared stories of lifelong learning and experiences in traditional, Aboriginal, and non-Aboriginal learning environments. Four dominant and interrelated themes emerged from the data. This interrelatedness emerged out of the spiral, circular nature of dialogue.

**Building Capacity: Onsite Education**

Onsite education, delivered by the two participating colleges, was referred to as a significant benefit to many participants. *I like it that I can be here in my community and take courses from a college. My family is proud of me.*

Several participants expressed concerns that some high schools on reserves were viewed as substandard to urban schools. *I went to high school here and didn’t get the same as regular, city education. We need better schools. Too many drop out, hang around, and get into trouble. That’s what I did. Better high schools would fix this.* And another: *Aboriginal schools fall short. We lag behind where we would be if we were in the normal system. Although some participants expressed interest in relocating to the city, most desired more space on the reserve to accommodate larger class size.*

Community leaders identified youth leadership as a priority in support of *community building community capacity*. *Our pathway to change is to invest in the future of our people.* In the words of one community leader, *if we are to achieve the vision we have for my people, where we thrive and are self-sufficient, we need to understand it is our young people that will drive change.* And another participant, *our young people are our future Elders.* And from another perspective, *some of our Elders could be in the schools, spending time with our youth.* In addition, *more space and qualified teachers and other ways of knowing* by way of other community-based activities, *because education means many things,* were frequently cited as priorities to support learner success.

**Success Factors: Needs and Perspectives**

Participants identified a number of factors impacting learner success. Factors spanned community concerns, political influences, availability of resources, learning styles and challenges, poor attendance, inadequate funding, family struggles, addiction, technology access, and rural constraints to access resources available at urban campuses.

Transportation was cited as a main concern for those who wished to attend urban, post-secondary programs. *I have been trying to go to school in Calgary for two years now. When I was there the first time, I had good transportation. Now, the truck is broken.* ‘Main campus’ represented more
resources and more acceptance. And, for a learner who self-identified as two-spirited (homosexual), there are more people like me there. I don’t feel safe here although this is my home. Being different is easier in the city.

Lack of childcare support was another barrier to success. Even when I have transportation, I don’t have child care. If I could bring my kids to school that would be good for me. I would study more than and would have finished my course by now. And from an older, prospective learner, sometimes I need to stay home to take care of my grandchildren.

Technology challenges, availability, and not enough teachers were frequently cited. I come to school because I want to be on the computer. I can’t get Internet at home. Most adult learner participants clearly stated they learn best when they feel close/connected with peers and teachers. Other needs included: one-on-one time with teachers, a slower pace, and being able to work independently while others work in the same room. One participant shared, I need to be shown, hands on, with the teacher talking to me with her hands. I don’t read so well. Most identified oral teaching and step-by-step learning as the way I learn best.

Diversity within communities, beyond learning styles, was emphasized. Challenges included: a vast range of priorities identified within the same community and where funding should be allocated relative to needs and priorities; varied degrees of comfort/discomfort, amongst community members, on how decisions are made; varying opinions on seeking partnerships with business/industry initiatives in other First Nations communities; degrees of comfort/discomfort with ‘outsider’ professionals working on reserves and so on. In the words of one leader: We are one people in spirit but there is diversity amongst us. This is one of our biggest challenges.

Relationships and Learning: The Human Factor
How relationships significantly impact learners and learning processes received the most attention. I need to be with others when learning. With an emphasis on one-on-one teacher/student contact within a larger group context, teachers were referred to as my mentor and someone who walks with me in learning. Feeling connected to peers meant a family atmosphere here at school...the good part of family. That’s why I come. Relationships extended to mentoring programs in schools. Older and younger members of our community can mentor one another and our younger people can help with this. One college leader shared, it’s all about relationships. It all comes back to this. Aboriginal students experience limited success and it is not about delivery like video conferencing. Issues remain because sites are not properly set up like ‘Mother Bear’...running about to care for students, mitigating things.

Teacher participants addressed numerous roles/responsibilities. I provide emotional support...encouragement as much as I focus on teaching. And, all our students need support. And another, low self-confidence is the biggest barrier so I’m teacher, mentor, mother, friend, nurse, counselor.

Technology: Bridges and Barriers
Participants who had successfully navigated e-learning landscapes were eager to share successes. I had some problems coming to school. One positive is you can go to any building with a computer to do your course. That’s what I did and I didn’t fall behind. And another, I liked the
convenience of the online Adobe math course. I felt safe...no one laughed if I didn't understand. Connecting with others through technology motivated many participants. My online instructor asked lots questions. It was just like sitting around in a group here at school. And, I really liked Adobe. I could see faces; hear voices. It was better to do it here because I could be with other campuses. And, it’s like doing group work with others far away. Seeing through Skype was good for our class.

Social networking was identified as a primary motivator for learning how to use technology and Facebook as the priority social networking forum. I come to school and do my courses but I want to have time for Facebook. I like getting messages on Facebook...makes me feel remembered. Many participants had or were saving for IPods to access social networking sites. Internet access in communities was cited as a major obstacle, however. Participants frequently referred to going out to the main roads on a weekend to find an Internet connection by holding phones above their heads to catch a signal. Teachers and community leaders referred to social networking devices as 'untapped potential' in rural adult learning environments. With reliable Internet access, Facebook and Twitter could be used to post notices, follow up on attendance concerns, and share resources. One Aboriginal teacher suggested Facebook as a funeral alert to family members who resided in different locations. Another suggested ‘You Tube’ to teach drama and to conduct live labs.

Learners also shared apprehensions. I didn’t complete a module once, nobody noticed. If the teacher was here she would notice. I never finished that course. And, if you do it at home you won’t do it. I’m not motivated to do it if I’m not here...I think that if you are doing courses on computers you won’t finish them. Lots of that happens around here. One participant shared that there was no immediate help when I needed it and there’s too many online at the same time. I sit there like a dummy, quiet. And another, I think I know the instructor but they don’t know me. They can’t see me.

**In Summary**

This study confirmed interest in and potential for expanding educational e-learning access to rural Aboriginal communities. A critical qualifier, however, was the focus of all participants on supports needed for Aboriginal adult learners to succeed in adult education programs. Specifically, participants emphasized the critical need for human interaction, on-site support, encouragement, hands on learning, and interactions with other learners. Consequently, the mode of delivery was secondary to the human interaction and support needs of Aboriginal adult learners participating and studying within adult education contexts in rural areas.

To further elaborate, and not unlike best practices in face-to-face program delivery, Aboriginal adult learners who engage in e-learning will likely be successful if e-learning is supported by onsite resources and close interactions with peers and teachers. In the words of a college leader: *It is not so much about e-learning delivery. It is all about onsite resources. In other words, even face-to-face teaching will fail if these supports and a strong focus on relationships between learners and teachers are lacking. It really is all about relationships. An either/or approach regarding program delivery mediums did not emerge as the primary issue. Participants were clear, however, that technology should never supersede the most critical factor impacting Aboriginal adult learner success; that being, human interaction and engagement.*
References


Work, Learning, Inequality and the Academy

Jennifer Kelly
University of Alberta
Bruce Spencer
Athabasca University

Abstract and Introduction: The connection between “work and learning” and human resource management (HRM) as a management control mechanism have been discussed previously (Spencer, 2008). In this paper we want to link these arguments more closely to the structural and cultural practices of the Academy as a work-site that mirrors mainstream society (Kelly & Yochim, 2011) and finally to issues of inequality, (linking to the debates about the “Dominance of the 1%” and “Occupy Wall Street”).

The Purpose of this Argument

The general context

Any argument about “work and learning” in the present context should take account of the major changes that have resulted from the rise in the global importance of financial capital and the resulting crisis of 2008 (Nolan, 2011) and its after-shocks in European countries including Iceland. It can be argued that workplace learning as essentially an offshoot of HRM is therefore a party to the current economic crisis. Management education in general may be more to blame for the unquestioning acceptance of hegemonic neoliberal economic ideas but mainstream work and learning practice, teaching and scholarship has also been complicit. It has been argued that “it is an inconvenient truth that many of those implicated in the disasters that have beset Wall Street and the world’s other financial centres are MBA graduates” (Currie, Knights and Starkey, 2010, p.1-2) and we would add ditto for scholars of work and learning and indeed of the academy in general who refuse to question shifts towards corporatization and neoliberal values that are mimicked in so many of our institutions.

With reference to the HRM-workplace learning nexus, perhaps the fear is that this acknowledgement of complicity will reveal that there really is no new supportive arguments for the claimed emancipatory effect of workplace learning after all – what we have is not so much a new “progressive” HRM and semi-autonomous phenomena of workplace learning, but rather a new variant on an old theme of workplace social relations: boss and worker; human resource manager and human resources; employer and employee; supervisor and supervised; and workplace coaches or leaders and workplace learners. These are a set of economically determined social relations that sustains massive socio/economic/politico inequality globally – the dominance of the corporations and the elite; the 1%, as exposed by the “Occupy Wall Street” movement (Scipes, 2011).

Although some writers would question an assertion that the academy generally has capitulated to the neoliberal agenda and have accepted corporatization of university affairs, we would argue the above generalization is true for a majority of the academy and that these agendas and perspectives are increasingly mirrored within university culture, especially in the undermining of collegial governance within the academy.
The university context
As argued elsewhere the members of the university community are engaged in forms of learning that are neither neutral nor innocent. The problematic result of such learning is that many students, instructors, and others involved come to see the university as a purveyor of a valued commodity and, consequently, produce for themselves identities (“neo-liberal selves,” Davies & Petersen, 2005) congruous with these neoliberal ideologies (see Kelly & Yochim, 2011, for a fuller discussion in relation to university student ratings of professors).

A critical understanding of meaning-making and adult learning within the academy might also help theorists of higher and adult education (including work and learning) understand how the production of meaning at other work-sites is not a neutral process but is, rather, one with cultural and ideological effects. Many academics working in higher education, including those engaged in the scholarship of adult education, are engaged in forms of learning which are “political” rather than “neutral” and which can dovetail seamlessly with neo-liberal ideology if accepted unreflexively without challenge. This is particularly true for university administrators whose concern is to create evaluation of educational tools without regard to the cultural or political consequences.

This is particularly problematic when considering mature students or the teaching of adult education students given that adult education scholars value student experience and insight as a key component of their teaching. Understood in this way it can be seen that, for example, the connection between faculty evaluation of students (in a highly competitive neoliberal university) and subsequent student evaluation of faculty does not promote a truly dialogic adult learning environment (al la Freire, 1970). Many students of adult education have to be challenged to question deeply-held convictions, beliefs and values if they are going to be adult educators in the “social purpose” tradition of adult education (Collins, 1994; Welton, 2005): evaluation processes can work against this outcome.

The contemporary university has undergone radical transformation in neoliberal times (as argued by Davies & Petersen, 2005; Olssen & Peters, 2005; Jones, 2004; Taylor, Barr & Steele, 2002 and others). Many of these writers call for a re-stating of traditional liberal university values including critical understandings of society. However as Gary Hall (2004) argues (in relation to cultural studies but it applies across disciplines):

[the] necessity of thinking about the university…is something that has frequently been overlooked within cultural studies….All too often such ‘theoretical’ self-reflection is regarded as taking away from the real business of cultural studies…concerned with practical, material, political and economic issues in the world beyond the institution. (p.1)

In other words, many potentially radical academics have not critically examined their own workplaces as sites of power to the same degree that they may have looked at other workplaces they investigate. The reasons for this failure are without question numerous and complex. Yet given the historical connection of interdisciplinary studies to adult education (see Steele, 1997, for the link to cultural studies), and the often contentious relationship between the state and the institutionalized form of some academic studies, it is nonetheless puzzling.
However, we should not overlook the hegemonic appeal of dominant discourses, the insidious way in which they become absorbed in “common sense” understandings of the real world. As Mitchell (2003) puts it,

“those pushing a neoliberal agenda in education stress…the necessity for greater…accountability and the imperative to create hierarchically conditioned, globally oriented state subjects – i.e. individuals oriented to excel in ever transforming situations of global competition, either as workers, managers or entrepreneurs (p. 388).”

Viewed as discourse, uncritical educational practices and policies help create:

- the construction of subjectivity within certain historical, social and cultural systems of knowledge in a society. Discourse produces a subject equally dependent upon the rules of the system of knowledge that produces it. In this respect discourse is both wider and more varied than either ideology or language, different subjects being produced by different discourse (Ashcroft et al., 1998, p. 224).

### The HRM/corporate context

For nearly three decades, the term “human resource management” (HRM) has been used to describe the management of the employment relationship and is often contrasted to the early terminology of “personnel management.” The mainstream HRM discourse views the workforce as the most important asset for generating value, increasingly through the creation of knowledge, which gives organizations a potential, sustainable competitive advantage – perhaps through investments in enhanced “human capital” or through offering superior services (perhaps achieved via exploiting workers’ “emotional labour”). Starting from this premise, HRM decisions and practices are said to impact on strategic goals and need to be integrated into the organization’s strategy.

The restructuring of work and work systems is intertwined with processes of globalization, including pressure to create more sustainable work systems, which increasingly define late modernity (Bratton and Gold, 2012). Most mainstream HRM textbooks describe a range of HR practices used to attract, motivate, develop and maximize the inherent potential of workers. Finally, HRM has become the favored discourse to frame developments in globalized employment and HR practices.

For an example of this paradigm, making the case for improving Canadian productivity, the 2007 Conference Board of Canada publication, *Learning and Development Outlook: Are We Learning Enough?* (Hughes & Grant) argues:

“Canada’s productivity is lagging behind that of its competitors. One strategy Canadian organizations are using to meet these challenges is the renewal and upgrading of their workers’ skills. By spending on TLD to build workers’ skills, organizations seek to create enough additional human capital to make themselves more competitive. (p. 1)

But they also report low spending rates on training, learning, and development (TLD) by Canadian organizations because most companies’ training needs are modest – which is a reflection of the nature of most work and capital investment in Canada: few skilled workers need apply. It is also interesting to reflect on the key argument that “Canada’s productivity is lagging behind that of its competitors” in the context of the closure of the Caterpillar Electro-Motive plant in London, Ont., on Friday 3 Feb 2012, costing 450 workers their jobs. Manufacturing jobs are the most “productive” in Canada, that is because the machinery and technology that supports
each job results in high value output, particularly compared to service jobs – close down manufacturing and “Canada’s productivity” falls – the fall in productivity has little to do with “investments in human capital” or “workers skills.”

The work culture context
To ignore power and authority at work is to ignore the realities of what it is to be an employee. Power determines structures of control and organizational culture. Organizational culture is largely shaped by senior management, and learning about that culture is learning to accept the organization’s values and goals. It is worth repeating that this perspective is also evident in Senge’s (1990) early claim that these new HRM policies create a “sense of shared ownership” and control of the enterprise (p. 13). This perspective was restated more recently by Eric Newell (former chairman and CEO of Syncrude Canada Ltd. and chancellor of the University of Alberta) when he commented, “really, what we are trying to do is engage people to get them thinking like owners of the business” (quoted in Schwind et al., 2007, p. 471).

All this may appear innocent but a “sense of ownership,” however, is not the same thing as workers actually owning and controlling (or collegial governance in academic institutions). It is also indoctrination. John Storey, a leading business school professor in the U.K., has commented that the “management of culture” has become a distinguishing feature of HRM, and dates the “remarkable trend” away from “personnel procedures and rules” to the “management of culture” to be the early to mid-1990s (2001, p. 8). Developing a “strong” culture in which workers develop a fierce loyalty to the organization offers the possibility of closing the “commitment gap” in the employment relationship. In other words, the adroit management of culture through “innovative” HRM work and learning practices is perceived to be the key to unlock the Pandora Box of consensus, flexibility and commitment (Storey, 2001). Critical workplace scholars have argued that a robust corporate culture provides behaviour ‘scripts’ for workers to follow. These ‘scripts’, written by management, reflect the big issues of productivity, flexibility, and commitment, and can be used to capture and manage workers’ emotional labour (Du Gay, 1996). In this optic, workplace learning needs to be understood as a new HRM control strategy, not a value-free activity.

The inequality, “Occupy” and plutocracy context
Inequality is endemic in free market economies; it is supported by neoliberal economic ideologies and institutions such as the World Bank and the IMF. Countries that have tried to moderate inequality come under pressure; for example when Sweden sought IMF support they were told to not only cut social services and lower their minimum wage rates but to also abandon the ratios that had limited top incomes: the bogus neoliberal argument was that more inequality leads to greater economic growth (Institute for Global Futures Research. 2000). The steady rise in CEO salaries has been noted for some time:

From 1970 to 1999, the average annual salary in the U.S. rose roughly 10 per cent to US$35,864, says Paul Krugman, a professor at Princeton University. At the same time, the average pay package of Fortune magazine’s top 100 CEOs was up an astonishing 2,785 per cent, to US$37.5 million. “There is no rationale but avarice and greed,” says [John] Crispo [1] “I believe in the pursuit of self-interest, but look at what they do: they rob us blind.” (Macleans, 2002, p.1).
A report by the Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives points out that in 2011 the top Canadian CEOs made 189 times more than the average Canadian compared to 105 times in 1998. “By 12:00 noon January 3 (2012), the first official working day of the year, Canada’s Elite 100 CEOs already pocketed $44,366 – what it takes the Average Joe an entire year, working full-time, to earn” (CCPA, 2012).

One of the drivers behind increasing income inequality has been the increasing shift in developed economies away from industrial capital to finance capital that began in the mid to late 1960s. Finance capital had always been attractive; it offered the opportunity to move funds around and make money without the messy business of producing something useful or even offering a real service (jobs in “The City” can be very lucrative without producing anything of worth). However from the late 1960s large corporations saw the opportunity to move their funds out of manufacturing and into finance and when manufacturing had to take place it increasingly became out-sourced – encouraged by government policies in Thatcher’s Britain and Reagan’s USA. This led to ever-increasing CEO rewards, boosted share-prices and reduced wages to workers as well-paid jobs vanished (described as the shrinking of the “middle-class” in the USA). The predominance of a largely unregulated financial sector also led to the financial crisis of 2008 and in most countries to taxpayer bailouts for banks, and bankers, and more loss of jobs for workers.

What the Occupy movement has achieved is to focus popular attention on the small elite – the 1% – that benefit from this massive inequality and on the power of corporations to influence public policy. The Movement has lifted the veil of liberal democracy to reveal a glimpse of the entrenched plutocracy that governs most Western societies – with the USA being the prime example, but with Canada close behind. The Occupy Movement has provided the opening for a more thorough discussion of democratic responses but clearly needs to link to other progressive movements and causes: if change is to take place the majority population will have to shed dominant hegemonic values and beliefs and aware educators will have to play their part in that process – And the starting point for academics may be the academy itself.

(Developments in Iceland provide an interesting example – largely ignored by Western media – a referendum determined that the people would not pay the debts created by the banking crisis; they would arrest the bankers; re-write the constitution using social media; and instructed the government not to comply with IMF requests for cuts in social programs. Stryke, 2011.)

**Implications for Adult Education Theory and Practice**

We think the implications for adult education *work and learning* theory flows from the analysis but we also want to focus on our practice as educators in our institutions and hopefully provoke a discussion around a critical evaluation of our relationship to the academy as a work-site drawing on understandings of mimicked neo-liberal practices and counter-arguments for equity and collegial government.

So in addition to urging colleagues to take account of the broader economic and social contexts surrounding *work and learning* and think through the implications of workplace learning for power relations at work and in society we ask you also to reflect on the academy as a work-site. For example, increasingly within universities the neoliberal hierarchical tendencies are overcoming the quasi-democratic university traditions of decision-making; and the corporate-
influenced values and practices are pushing aside more considered critical scholarship and more egalitarian peer practices: and these changes are taking place with the silent acquiescence, if not consent, of the faculty.

In addition to points we have raised earlier and elsewhere two simple examples will serve for discussion:

1) At Athabasca University the President has a remuneration package approximately 5 times greater than the norm for senior professors and the President’s salary has been increasing 3 times the rate of salary settlements that he (and the Board) has been signing off for staff. This is to be contrasted with the norm just 15 years ago that the Presidents salary would be set at just 1.5 times that of the highest paid academic. The justification offered today is that a President should now be in step with salaries of other Presidents and other CEOs of similar sized organizations.

The salary and benefits for the President of the UofA was reported at over $1m in 2010/11, (UBC, 2011) twice that of AU’s President, but the justification is the same – she needs to keep pace with CEO salaries of major corporations.

2) At Athabasca University the faculty association negotiated away the possibility of a double increment more than 10 years ago – leaving a more egalitarian possibility of either a 1 or a 0. The net result is a more harmonious faculty – less “brown-nosing” – and a recognition that faculty do not need annual financial incentives to perform their job at the highest level.

At the UofA increments can increase at half-increment steps (some are arguing for introducing quarter-increment steps) from 0 to 2 full increments (possibly 3 in some Faculties). What this does is mimic the differentiation possible in private-sector employment, distort workload priorities, increases inequality and discord within a homogenous category of staff, and sucks staff into accepting hierarchical reward systems and neoliberal values. We suggest the UofA system is the norm for most universities.

(Parts of this paper draw on work in preparation jointly with John Bratton)

References
Encroaching on and Destabilizing my Haven: Blurring Boundaries Between School and Home for Women Learning Online

Jennifer H Kelland
University of Alberta

Abstract: This project explored how women mediate tensions when learning online. Using photo-elicitation interviews and an online focus group, this paper explores how twelve women negotiate boundaries between home, school and work lives. These women describe blurring boundaries as they bring schoolwork into their homes, find time and space for schoolwork, struggle to separate school and work, and pursue studies outside of traditional classrooms. While they found it more comfortable and convenient to study at home, they also felt more restricted. Their continual negotiations to find time and space for learning raises questions about the value of education in comparison to work and home responsibilities.

Purpose of the study
This research project examined how women mediate tensions when learning online. This paper explores specifically how women negotiate the blurred boundaries between their home, school and work lives and responsibilities. With new technology increasingly allowing schoolwork to move into the home, the boundary between what is school and what is home is constantly shifting. As a result, the responsibility for finding time, space and resources to study is shifted to the student and the home (Richard Edwards & Miller, 2000). In addition, women, who are often also working and raising families, are absent from on-campus classrooms.

Theoretical Perspective
Some of the key concepts of poststructural feminism are particularly useful in this conceptual model: Recognizing and valuing the diverse experiences of female learners and acknowledging there are no universal truths (Hayes & Flannery, 2000; Strega, 2005); recognizing that discourse shapes individuals and groups by defining what is acceptable and unacceptable for individuals and groups within continually changing social structures (Flannery & Hayes, 2000); and providing a foundation for social justice work, thereby allowing for questions about how power relationships and social structures influence learning and learners (Strega, 2005). Overall, poststructural feminism acknowledges that social interactions and structures shape learners’ experiences, and, further, examines how learners interact with, and in, those structures. This theoretical perspective acknowledges there may be many different truths that coexist simultaneously, thereby allowing for the possibility of points of tension. These points of tension have the possibility of being resolved through negotiating shared meanings or understandings, but they may continue to exist, while shifting and changing as contexts change.

Relevant Literature
As women negotiate competing and sometimes contradictory demands on their time and energy, they experience points of tension. In this research, tensions are the “messy spaces where complexities, contradictions and competing ideas, actions, expectations, values and emotions interact to produce opposition and opportunities” (Kelland, 2008, p. 196). Other authors
approach these tensions by referring to the need for students to “juggle” their activities, which can produce either “synergy” or “collisions” (Kazmer & Haythornthwaite, 2001, pp. 516, 517, 526). They describe how “women experience physical and emotional pushes and pulls when balancing demands on their time and energy” (Cragg, Andrusyszyn, & Fraser, 2005, p. 35). In response to these tensions, students feel the need to adopt uncomfortable and/or unfamiliar behaviours in order to succeed academically (Burge, 1998). Researchers describe how women feel a “double bind” (Gordon, Iverson, & Allan, 2010, p. 86), work a “third shift” (Kramarae, 2001) or are pulled between competing “greedy institutions” (Rosalind Edwards, 1993). Their efforts can be compared to the experiences of teleworkers who are also negotiating blurred boundaries (Dholakia & Zwick, 2004; Mirchandani, 1999). In order to mediate these tensions and the blurring of space and time between home, work and school, learners respond by reconceptualizing time and place, and community, in learning contexts in order to meet their learning goals (Kazmer, 2005; Servage, 2007; Thompson, Kelland, & Lawlor, 2007).

Research Design
Specifically, my research question asks: How do women learning online mediate tensions in the learning environment and their own personal contexts? Subquestions ask: What tensions do women face when learning online? What strategies do they use to address the tensions? And, are they able to find ways to balance or overcome these tensions?

To answer these questions, I explored the experiences of female learners using two qualitative research methods: Photo-elicitation interviews and an online focus group. Both methods reflect my poststructural framework by engaging the women in identifying what was meaningful for them and sharing their experiences (Clark-Ibáñez, 2004; Frohmann, 2005; Taylor, 2002), and by creating “polyvocal texts” (Kamberelis & Dimitriadis, 2005, p. 888) that acknowledge the diversity of their experiences (Madriz, 2000). By combining these methods, the data included different perspectives including face-to-face and online components; one-to-one and group exploration; oral, written and photographic expression; and collaborative knowledge construction (Creswell & Maietta, 2002).

In the first phase, six women were invited to participate in individual interviews, which examined their experiences through a discussion of photographs they had taken that represented the tensions they experienced as online learners. The photographs served as “starting-points, rather than finished end-products […] [to] explore feelings, attitudes and beliefs and stimulate additional creative expression” (Weiser, 2001, PhotoTherapy section, para. 11). Each participant ultimately shaped the conversation as she communicated what was significant to her (Hurworth, 2003; Taylor, 2002). In the second phase, a different group of six collaborated in an online focus group where, as a group, they reflected on their experiences as learners in a dynamic and collaborative analysis (Mann & Stewart, 2000). The online focus group offered practical benefits (Burton & Bruening, 2003; Cook & Rule, 2001; Gaiser, 2008; Kenny, 2005; Rezabek, 2000; Stewart & Williams, 2005), while creating connections between the participants’ learning contexts and the research context (Orgad, 2005). The interview data and descriptions of the photographs and focus group transcripts were analyzed by looking for patterns and themes.
Findings
Learning online seems to blur the boundaries between home and school (Richard Edwards & Miller, 2000; Servage, 2007). It brings school into the home and, in some cases, into the workplace. Activities that previously occurred outside of the home, like attending classes and meeting with classmates, now occur in the home. While learning activities historically required that all students gather in classrooms, “physical presence at particular times in specific spaces is no longer central to pedagogic practice” (Richard Edwards & Miller, 2000, p. 128). The women in this study described the blurring of boundaries between school, home and work as they brought schoolwork into their homes.

Being at home means learners can create a learning environment that suits their needs with all their resources accessible:

*I love having my creature comforts. If the classroom’s too hot or too cold I don’t have to have those worries. I can adapt it. I don’t have to go, be starving and find food on campus or pack a lunch. It’s all here.* (Nicole – a pseudonym)

*Now I’m very busy outside of the home but this is my little haven. This is my space. So I can put on some nice little quiet music.* (Cynthia)

But in other cases, losing the clear distinction between home and school means the peacefulness and separation of home is replaced by the demands of school. Nicole talks about losing the feeling of her home as a retreat: “because it’s becoming, during the school year, a place of work rather than a retreat or a place of solace.” Similarly, Cynthia shares how, when her schoolwork gets very intense, and she is not leaving her house very often, her feeling of home shifts: “I had never done that before and I just realized I was almost, the house was almost becoming too much of a cocoon and too much work.” The way they feel at home and their feelings about how a home should feel are influenced by bringing school into the home. “Home” is no longer separate from the outside world, so it can no longer offer a retreat.

Women in this study describe how the distinction between home and school is blurred. Sometimes it feels like the schoolwork is interfering with their home lives by demanding space and resources while at other times, it feels like their personal lives are interfering with their schoolwork:

*Basically every surface as well as the floor...I have piles going.... And they're not chaotic to me ... I know what each stack is and they can't be moved. So it gets to be a problem where ... you don't have a place to eat or walk and things like that.* (Nicole)

*For me home is where I associate schoolwork and ... when I am stressed, like I am right now... I leave it behind. I go out and I have an hour to myself.* (Amy)

In both these situations, learning at home means that school and home are competing for time and space; the lack of distinction between the two means that they cannot be separated and that one can be seen to be “encroaching” on the other. Over time, the comfortable “haven” of home becomes a contested space where school and home responsibilities place demands on the women, who cannot get away from either set of demands by “going home.” Women lose the privacy of their homes, and the associated sense of comfort and quiet.
These women make time and space in different ways; however, they do not always feel their situations are ideal. To make time for studying with minimal impact on their families while also completing their other responsibilities, these women work early in the morning or late at night, or both:

*I study more at night. Little pieces at a time and then sometimes when I’m at the end, it’s kind of crunch time so I’m doing a little bit more, but usually at night. Or sometimes I like to get up early in the morning and do some, but I work full time.* (Amy)

*Well, I loved learning online, and I wanted, quite frankly the flexibility, because if I’m up at 3 in the morning, and sometimes I mark papers, or I respond to e-mails, and that opens up time to do a lot more of the family stuff that I want to do.* (Cynthia)

*I did most of my work on the computer probably early in the morning at 5 o’clock ... I only sleep 6 hours a night so that’s kind of a bonus, and because that was an easier time for me to concentrate.* (Sharon)

*My strategy became that I learned to work at night. It is a very peaceful time, and I found I could work well then, although I would eventually crash for a day every once in a while.* (Barbara)

They negotiate their schoolwork schedules with family members:

*During my first years of study, we only had one computer. ... I found myself perpetually negotiating computer time. We resolved some of the problem by getting another computer. They often wanted the computer right after school, so I waited until they were doing homework or in bed before I began my studies.* (Karen)

*My husband stays up a lot later than I do and so he would go online. So his MSN account (that was before Facebook) and stuff like that ... he would get in touch with his folks later at night.* (Debra)

Some women use laptop computers to give them more flexibility:

*So I kind of move all around [with my new laptop]. I’d say I don’t really have ... one particular place. But I think that also has to do with the living arrangements and how it’s set up. If I had an extra room that I could just put my desk in that, I’d be set.* (Amy)

*And I did [my schoolwork] anywhere [with] my laptop... I might be downstairs in my house on my bed typing out something if there’s too much action upstairs, or at work I could use my own computer.* (Sharon)

*I used both a laptop and desktop and preferred the laptop for its portability. When my modem stopped working at home, I took my laptop to the public library so that I could continue to do my course work.* (Tracy)

Finding a suitable study space has an impact on other members of the household:

*I always studied downstairs in our family room, which is where ... the desk... and the*
computer and stuff is set up. And there was more ... space to spread out and ... my husband, of course, watched TV down there or ... listened to his music or whatever. So he was always doing that with headphones and... if he... made a little bit of noise I'd go, “but I’m focusing, I’m concentrating. You can’t do that.” (Debra)

And so sometimes my husband will want to be watching TV and then I can’t concentrate to the sound of it I’m always asking him to turn it down... And sometimes I’ll be working, I’ll bring the laptop to another room but then [I] still hear these noises so it’s just I guess the collision of entertainment and music and sounds and I guess being in a social place... Most of the time he doesn’t [watch TV] anymore ... we found out pretty quickly that didn’t work so he just knows not to. ... So I think he’s compromised in that way to not turn it on while I’m working. (Nicole)

Finding time and space for schoolwork is a continual negotiation with members of their families and households to have access to shared computers or to have a quiet space to work (Kazmer, 2005). In some cases, especially when their children need the computer, these women’s work gets pushed to late at night or early in the morning when there is less demand for the computer. In Karen’s case, she even quit her teaching job so she could do schoolwork during the day when her family is away from home.

While the women in this study found it both more comfortable and convenient to study at home yet they also felt more restricted and pressured. They had to negotiate with their families to fit schoolwork in to the time and physical space of their home lives while considering the needs of other family members. Some women chose to quit their jobs in favour of more flexible work because their jobs interfered with their schoolwork, others scheduled their schoolwork early in the morning or late at night, and others used laptops and computers at work to give them more flexibility.

Conclusions
While Stalker (2001) affirms there are “tensions between women’s roles in the public sphere of formal, institutionalized education and their roles and responsibilities in the private sphere of the home and relationships” (p. 289), these women are experiencing more than just tensions. Some are experiencing their home life “encroaching [on] and destabilizing and getting in the way of and distracting” them from their studies (Michelle), and some are experiencing “get[ting] lost in all the schoolwork” (Amy). One is left wondering: Is education so important that these women will give up sleep, family time and other responsibilities to fit it in, or is education of such limited value that it comes after the demands of work and household commitments?

Implications for Adult Education Theory and Practice
Many women are trying to balance multiple activities, often with competing priorities. Online learning is often seen as way to “fit” school into a busy schedule, but the impact often shifts the location of learning to the home, while shifting increasing responsibility to the individual learner. Educators need to be aware of how women continually negotiate to find a place for schoolwork in their lives. This study helps to identify and describe the contexts in which women learning online complete their schoolwork, thereby unpacking what has previously been a “black box” (Servage, 2007, p. 563).
References


Cook, R. S., & Rule, S. (2001). When face to face won't work: Internet-based focus groups. *Growing Partnerships for Rural Special Education Proceedings* (pp. 269-274). Retrieved from ERIC database (ED453039)


Two Worlds, Four Directions: A View of Adult Education, Communities, and the Just Learning Society

Paul Kolenick
University of Regina

Abstract: The ‘two worlds’ metaphor is explored through the lens of the Indigenous ‘four directions’ as a way of understanding the practice of adult education as university-based practice when framed, however, as community-based education. The two worlds of academia and community are considered principally through Hannah Arendt’s dual conceptions of the ‘vita contemplativa’ and the ‘vita activa’ in view of the practice of adult education, as a university-based practice, in relationship with communities (particularly, Indigenous communities) that is reminiscent of Welton’s more recent inquiry of the just learning society.

Two Worlds, Four Directions
While facilitating a graduate course a short time ago for the Community-based Master of Education program at the University of Regina, I was introduced at some point in the conversation to the metaphor of ‘walking in two worlds’ as part of an Indigenous philosophical worldview, and later, wondered how this metaphor might apply to my life in adult education. What follows is a brief, personal exploration of the two worlds metaphor as it relates to my practice as an adult educator (and learner). I raise the question about the practice of adult education as situated within the institutional space of post-secondary education (i.e., universities) in its relationship with communities, and notably Indigenous communities. In this sense, Spivak’s perspective on subalternity, and particularly Arendt’s conceptions of the ‘vita contemplativa’ and the ‘vita activa’ serve as ways of understanding educational practice in light, however, of Welton’s more recent inquiry into the notion of the just learning society and its implications for adult educators.

Along the Wascana trail, nearby the First Nations University of Canada, one will find the Four Directions. This figure, as it stands, is reflective of a thoughtful and balanced approach to life and learning. In Reclaiming Indigenous Voice and Vision, Marie Battiste (2000) offers a unique characterization of each of the four directions as parts of an interrelated dialogue on colonialism and its implications for Indigenous education. I draw upon the dialogue of the four directions as a way to develop my own holistic understanding of the two worlds metaphor and its implications for my practice in adult education, particularly as it may implicate Indigenous communities and peoples.

The West: Pax Britannica
I begin this exploration in the west then with a brief account of the process of colonization on the Canadian prairie and its effect on Indigenous peoples and education. While Battiste (2000) points out that the direction of the west is generally an unconventional place to begin from an Indigenous point of view, it serves as a way of “mapping the contours of the ideas that have shaped the last era of domination underpinning modern society and the various faces of colonization as it is maintained in the present era” (p. xxiii). In that way, Hampton (1995) depicts the western direction as most closely associated with the autumn season as the end of summer,
and consequently, the precursor of winter as reflective of the “coming of Western civilization (meaning Western European), with its Western forms of education, to this continent the autumn of traditional Indian education” (p. 31). Through the western direction, the question may be raised about adult education, as educational practice situated within the world of universities and academia, as possibly one of the faces of colonization at play in the modern era.

The western direction is reflective perhaps of the Pax Britannica (i.e., ‘British Peace’) which spanned most of the nineteenth century up to World War I, a period of history marked by “the greatest extension of direct colonial rule in modern times” (Roberts, 1992, p. 764). To satisfy its license for exclusive trade, following the merger with the Montreal-based Northwest Company in 1821, however, the Hudson’s Bay Company used missionaries to provide schooling, as this was viewed politically at least in part as a way of quieting the critics among the British public (Littlejohn, 2006). The schooling of Indigenous people had changed little by the time of Canadian Confederation, when it was conceived that an “educated Indian was someone who had become an economically self-sufficient Christian member of Canadian society, one who had abandoned the customs, habits, religious beliefs, values and economic base of one’s forbearers” (2006, p. 69). Such was the course taken by this colonial endeavor upon Indigenous education that resulted, for instance, in the vocational training programs of Indian schools and the assimilationist project of the Canadian residential school system. The history of colonialism in North America of the nineteenth century, perhaps long forgotten by some, has had (and continues to have) considerable effect on Indigenous communities.

The North: Coyote’s Eyes

The northern direction is the home of winter and a source of knowledge and wisdom, and may be thought of as a way of diagnosing the effects of colonialism upon Indigenous communities (Battiste, 2000) with implications for the practice of adult education. Through the north, I explore the metaphor of the two worlds with respect to the practice of adult education as a university-based practice in its relationship with communities, and notably Indigenous communities.

The work of adult educators as situated within universities, or within academia, is characterized for the most part by classroom teaching, and significantly, the production of what is generally referred to as scholarship, or more commonly, as research. In that respect, Spivak suggests that the importance attributed within the academy to the written word (i.e., scholarship) may be associated, at least in part, with the taking on among academics of the historically-granted role of representation, of speaking willingly or not in authoritative ways on behalf of others; as she puts it, “the worlding of a world on a supposedly uninscribed territory ... the imperialist [and consequently, colonial] project which had to assume that the earth that it territorialised was in fact previously uninscribed” (1990, p. 1). This act of representation, as Spivak describes it, poses a fundamental problem for adult educators within academia as it contradicts the essential spirit of adult learning, as Burton and Point (2006) suggest in considering the historical roots of Indigenous education in Canada, that confounds “the most commonly held belief about adult education—that it arises from within the learner and the learner’s community” (p. 47).

Adult education as academic practice might well be considered a world of its own when compared to the lived experience of Indigenous communities. This has implications for adult
education, especially when situated within academia, as noted by educator, Ernest Boyer (1996, p. 14; cited in Kasworm, Sandmann, & Sissel, 2000, p. 459) who observes that, “Increasingly, the campus is being viewed as a place where students get credentialed and faculty get tenured, while the overall work of the academy does not seem particularly relevant to the nation’s most pressing civic, social, economic, and moral problems.” In that regard, however, I find this excerpt of Archibald’s (2008, pp. 8-11; cited in Tafoya, 1982, pp. 21-22) sharing of the Indigenous story of the Coyote’s Eyes as particularly instructive.

“Eenee snawai, I’m just pitiful,” Coyote cried.

“Why are you so sad?” asked a small voice, for little mouse had heard him.

“My dear Cousin,” said Coyote, “I’ve lost my eyes ... I’m blind, and I don’t know what to do.”

“Snawai Yunwai,” replied Mouse. “You poor thing. I have two eyes, so I will share one with you.” Having said this, Mouse removed one of his eyes and handed it to Coyote. Now Coyotes are much larger than mice, and when Coyote dropped Mouse’s eye into his socket, it just rolled around in the big empty space. The new eye was so small it only let in a tiny amount of light. It was like looking at the world through a small hole.

Coyote walked on, still feeling sorry for himself, just barely able to get around with Mouse’s eye. “Eenee snawai, I’m just pitiful,” he sobbed.

“Why are you crying, Coyote?” asked Buffalo in his deep voice.

“Oh Cousin, began Coyote, “all I have to see with is this tiny eye of the Mouse. It’s so small it only lets in a little bit of light, so I can barely see.”

“Snawai Yunwai,” replied Buffalo. “You poor thing. I have two eyes, so I will share with you.” Then Buffalo took out one of his eyes and handed it to Coyote. Now Buffaloes are much larger than Coyotes, and when Coyote tried to squeeze Buffalo’s eye into his other socket, it hung over into the rest of his face. So large was Buffalo’s eye that it let in so much light, Coyote was nearly blinded by the glare ... everything looked twice as large as it ordinarily did. And so, Coyote was forced to continue his journey, staggering about with his mismatched eyes.

The image of Coyote stumbling along with mismatched eyes is suggestive perhaps of the differences between the worlds of adult education, as university-based practice, and the traditional knowledge of Indigenous communities that exists beyond the realm of academia. As Archibald (2008) aptly observes, Coyote has not yet learned to move back and forth between his mismatched eyes. This story is in ways reminiscent of Arendt’s (1978) depiction in The Life of the Mind of Socrates as someone who was able to move back and forth between thinking and acting, while “being at home in both spheres and able to move from one sphere to the other with the greatest ease, very much as we ourselves constantly move back and forth between
experiences in the world of appearances and the need for reflecting upon them” (p. 167). In that sense, Coyote is given the challenge of making the eyes work together in harmony and balance, in order to have a clearer perspective. Like Coyote, adult education as university-based practice may be in need of a better sense of balance between the worlds of academia and those of communities perhaps well beyond its reach.

The East: Subalternity, Public Spaces and the Just Learning Society

The east is the direction of spring and the rising sun, a place of beginnings that offers the possibility of healing through awareness, understanding, and the pursuit of respectful relationships (Battiste, 2000). Through the eastern direction, I draw upon Spivak’s work on subalternity as a way of understanding adult education in relationship with communities, and particularly Indigenous communities. I look further, however, to the potential of adult education as an educational practice situated within the public sphere, mindful of the notion of the ‘just learning society’ described by Welton (2006) as comprising the ‘pre- eminent social movements of the early twentieth century—labour, cooperative, farm, women—[that] created learning infrastructures to counter the desolation of the mediocre common schools and nothing much for adult learners” (p. 24). This vision of a just learning society, as Welton reports, is documented through well-known works such as Moses Coady’s chronicle of the Antigonish Movement set in response to the social and economic trials faced by the Maritime region of Canada at the turn of the twentieth century.

Similar misfortunes of a global scale, however, continue to concern the subaltern (or at least, those studying the subaltern). Taken from Antonio Gramsci’s analysis of the subaltern classes, Spivak describes the world of subalternity as “the margins (one can just as well say the silent, silenced center) of the circuit marked out by this epistemic violence, men and women among the illiterate peasantry, Aboriginals, and the lowest strata of the urban subproletariat” (1999, p. 269), and notably as “those removed from lines of social mobility” (2004, p. 531). Spivak (1988) once inquired, however, can the subaltern speak? Her reply: the subaltern cannot speak, at least not within the confines of a Eurocentric worldview; or as Young (2004) suggests, “it was never the case that the subaltern could not speak: rather that the dominant would not listen” (p. 5). A similar concern is raised by Brigham and Gouthro (2006), who maintain that adult educators who conduct cross-cultural research, for instance, need to be conscious of their own positionality, referring much like Spivak to the advantages that academics, and particularly Eurocentric academics, may have “over others in a society because of their particular characteristics, such as their race, social class, gender, or sexual orientation, that situate them in a more powerful position” (p. 87). These differences (as advantages) raise the problem, as Coulter and Wiens (2002) suggest, of the immediate need among educators, as members of a privileged academy, to accept the responsibility for “traveling to all relevant viewpoints, especially those unlikely to be in the public world, and attending to those perspectives” (p. 18). In a similar way, Disch (1994) considers the need for educators, as academics, to move beyond their own positionality; as she puts it, “To visit, in other words, you must travel to a new location, leave behind what is familiar ... [thus] permitting yourself to experience the disorientation that is necessary to understanding just how the world looks different to someone else” (p. 159). Adult educators, as members of the academy, enjoy a privileged view. Yet, as Spivak among others suggests, this privilege is enjoyed at a loss when it leaves educators with a diminished capacity to comprehend the worlds of others, especially as they may experience them.
A better appreciation for this sense of loss, characterized perhaps as a distance of social and economic proportions between worlds, may be acquired through an examination of Arendt’s distinction drawn between thinking and judging, the domains of the ‘vita contemplativa’ and the ‘vita activa.’ The former is reflective of a relatively private world of philosophy and thinking, described as the “self-sufficiency of the sage” (Taminaux, 2000, p. 170), yet more definitively as “withdrawal from the active life and studied abstention from participation in its futile struggles and excitements, for the purposes of contemplation and philosophical meditation” (Hirschman, 2002, p. 7). By contrast, the ‘vita activa’ is essentially a public space suitable for dialogue and deliberation on matters of concern to people, that is reflective of “the human capacity for political speech and action” (Villa, 2000, pp. 7-8). As public space, Arendt describes the vita activa as the “space of appearance [that] comes into being wherever men [sic] are together in the manner of speech and action” (1958, p. 199), that is reminiscent in significant ways of Welton’s (2005) more recent study of the notion of a just learning society. In his inquiry, Welton draws upon the perspective of Habermas on the lifeworld as a public space in which people may share and deliberate upon matters of common concern—and as Habermas suggests, this process will result ideally in an agreed upon and rational consensus; and yet, Arendt’s view of the public realm with its attention to human plurality, as an alternative to consensus-making, however, may speak more to the point among adult educators with interests particularly in the richly textured, yet uneven and heterogenous contexts of communities. Kelly (2006), for example, raises questions about the nature of the consensus-making process. In terms of building community, the point is raised in particular about who may speak authoritatively on behalf of communities. What does it mean, for instance, to have reached a consensus within community? And in that process, whose voice matters? Whose voice does not? These types of questions are especially significant when one considers the heterogeneity of perspective and experience that may be found within community, and the potential for relationships of power found within the social and economic texture of community, associated possibly with differences of race, gender, sexuality, ableness, or culture that may not be readily apparent through the process of consensus-making.

The South: Community-based Education at Ground Level

The south is the direction of summer, “home of the sun, and the time of fullest growth” (Hampton, 1995, p. 228; cited in Battiste, 2000, p. xxiv), that is suggestive of visions and re-awakenings. There is potential in communities, particularly Indigenous communities, as public spaces set beyond the world of universities and academia for the practice of adult education as a community-based practice as envisioned through the ideal of the just learning society.

As Maxine Greene (1995) points out, communities cannot really be formed through rational formulation, nor can they come into being through edict. This is what Corson (1998) seems to have in mind with respect to community-based education as a form of social action that allows people “to become meaningfully involved in shaping their own futures” (p. 240), reminiscent perhaps of Habermas’s notion of the lifeworld with its interest in the attainment of consensus. Yet this view of community-based education is also mindful of Arendt’s vita activa as the public space of appearances with its attention given to the support in particular of human plurality. Returning to the two worlds metaphor, Indigenous communities remain as worlds significantly distant and perhaps unknown to the world of adult education as academic practice. The vision of the just learning society, however, offers a way of seeing and understanding communities at the ground level with a better view of their inherent heterogeneity. The vision of adult education as
the just learning society is as relevant today as it was a century ago to the practice of adult educators, especially given its potential for a more closely considered understanding of communities as distinctly heterogenous public spaces in their own right.

References


Moving with the Movement: Collaborative Building of Social Movement Learning Participatory Action Research Spaces in Ada, Ghana

Jonathan Langdon
St. Francis Xavier University

Abstract: While participatory research methods, especially participatory action research, are a recognized approach to the study of social movement learning, the way in which this participatory relationship is framed and designed has deep implications on the collaborative nature of the research. Studies overly framed and designed by academics, as opposed to mutually designed with movements, run the risk of mining movements for information as opposed to contributing to their goals and learning. This paper describes a co-owned design process, based on established relationships, with a social movement in Ghana where being based in movement-articulations helps the research move with the movement.

In 2004, in a meeting to develop a series of social accountability processes that would later emerge as a publication entitled, “Community Voices” (Gariba & Langdon, 2005), Kofi Larweh, the station manager for Ghana’s first community radio station – Radio Ada – told the author of a struggle in his hometown that is the basis of this paper. He described how the artisanal salt production process in Ada was being transformed away from communal access to individual control through social and economic pressures. Over the coming years, the author would work with Larweh, as well as a number of other Ada based activists who formed part of a resource-defense movement called the Ada Songor Advocacy Forum (ASAF), to deepen discussions around this resource and what they were trying to do to stem the tide of neoliberal incursions. During the course of these discussions, this group began to explore building a collaborative process that would at once study and create a space for the emergence of reflections and learning on these engagements. This paper describes how this dialogue and eventual process emerged, and why, ultimately, this type of relationship-first and movement-owned process is important, not only in terms of contributions to research on understanding movement learning, but more crucially in contributing to movement goals.

In the sections that follow, the context of this movement/struggle is introduced, along with a more detailed description of the process that has helped enable the research described to “move with the movement”; key to this is the notion of research contributing to movement praxis (action and reflection). The paper will conclude by discussing how this approach to design has deep implications for research with social movements. Before both of these sections though, some exploration of the literature on social movement learning and the arguments in favour of movement embedded research needs to be introduced.

Participatory Research on Social Movement Learning
Participatory and collaborative research approaches have been identified as being an important and synergistic method for studying social movement learning (SML) (Hall & Turray, 2006). Yet, the way these approaches are framed and, ultimately, constituted has deep implications on the nature of the collaboration – whether it replicates extractive forms of research that mine movements for data, or it parallels and reinforces movement processes and deepens movement
reflections, leading to what Foley describes as a “complex ... basis for future strategies” (1999: 143). Key to this process of framing and constituting participatory research is the research design process. As Kane (2001) and Choudry & Kapoor (2009) note, it is the way research relationships are formed, and the way these relationships are embedded in movement-articulations that determine whether the research is positioned to be a synergistic addition to movement processes – a moving with movements – or an extractive process for academic purposes.

Hall (2005) and Fals-Borda (2006) have recently written reflective pieces on the history of participatory research and its connection with adult education, in the case of the former, and, in the case of the latter, its connection with an anti-Eurocentric desire to stop the studying exotized ‘others’, and rather generate spaces of mutual meaning-making. Fals-Borda (2006) also notes how participatory action research (PAR) – a term he coined – has become institutionalized in thousands of research bodies, and yet there is very little acknowledgement of the Southern origin of term. Fals-Borda expresses a worry much more forcefully articulated by Jordan (2003) that PAR is being co-opted away from its desire to make research mutually constituted and owned by researchers and communities/groups/movements. Jordan (2003) notes how this cooptation, exemplified by the World Bank’s adoption of the term, runs the risk of turning action-research processes designed to help marginalized communities gain better control over their own definition of reality, into a mere stabilizing process of “inclusion” without any substantive changes in power dynamics. Vincent (2012) has shown how participation is often used by those external to communities to construct collectivities that undermine histories of struggle – further evidence of the importance of working from within locally constituted movements.

Nonetheless, Hall & Turray (2006) reveal how integral participatory research processes have been, and continue to be for movement research in adult education circles. This stream of research, known as social movement learning, has a strong tradition of participatory collaborative research, and yet, as Walter (2007) has pointed out, the majority of these studies are dominated by Euro-American dichotomies drawn between Old Social Movement (Marxist and labour movements) and New Social Movement (identity based movements, such as LGBTQ) theories of organizing (c.f. Holst, 2002; Finger, 1989; Holford, 1995). Kapoor (2008) has underscored the dangers of assuming the portability of this dichotomy in Southern contexts. He, like others (c.f. Foley, 1999; Walters, 2005), advocates a strong connection to context when analyzing social movement learning. This echoes warnings of Eurocentric dominance in critical theories by Afrocentric writers, such as Mamdani (1996) who argues for using context rich approaches to analyzing African phenomena.

Drawing these strands of thought together, Choudry & Kapoor (2009) have argued that participatory research, and PAR in particular, must be owned by the movements at the centre of social movement learning studies, rather than being used by academics – especially in the North – carrying out studies ultimately more concerned with extracting information than in responding to movement needs and priorities. They note that the relationships that frame such research, along with the way in which the research is conceived (i.e. is it owned by the movement from the outset) is critical to avoid this type of extractive relationship. This echoes Fine (2007) and Fine et al. (2004) who have expanded on the importance of mutually defined and owned participatory processes and goals, especially in contexts of struggle. In turning to discuss the context of the struggle, and movement at the center of this research, it is important to note that the Ghanaian
example expanded upon here represents an important addition to social movement learning discussions as research on African movements is severely lacking in the literature (Hall & Turray, 2006)

The Struggle for Communal Access to a Salt Yielding Lagoon
While many have written of Ghana’s (e.g. Baofo-Arthur, 2007) impressive emerging democratic tradition, Ninsin (2007, p. 87) provides a critical account of this emergence, calling the version of democracy in Ghana “elitist.” Ninsin documents the way in which neoliberal market-led processes were not questioned in the democratization process, despite them forming a major part of the struggle that led to this change. Echoing this analysis, Abrahamsen (2000) has effectively documented how mobilization around the growing penetration of global capital through neoliberal access to resources was a major source of mobilization prior to the return to democracy in Ghana, and has continued to be a key rallying point for social struggles since. The Ada Songor Advocacy Forum (ASAF) emerges from a history of struggle to defend communal access to West Africa’s largest salt producing lagoon – a struggle that is under greater and greater internal and external market-based pressures (Langdon, 2010), which has far reaching implications considering the salt yield from this resource is a critical part of livelihoods in this area (Amate, 2000; Manuh 1994). The history of struggle goes back to pre-colonial times (Amate, 2000), with a contrast between local natural resource management that restricted no one from winning salt, and yet was constantly under pressure from outside forces aiming to seize the resource from the Dangme people who have been its custodians (Manuh, 1994). This history of conflict was renewed in the post-independence period, especially heightened by the impact of Ghana’s major hydro project, the Akasombo dam (Manuh, 1994). For a period of fourteen years, a company managed to completely take over the salt resource through duplicitous tactics, leading to major local mobilization and resistance and finally a return to access for the population (Manuh, 1994; Ada salt cooperative committee, 1989). It is this last instance of mobilization that informs the latest instance of movement mobilization, the ASAF.

The ASAF has emerged from the latest challenge to communal access, described to author initially in 2004. This challenge is from within rather than without, and echoes pressure on communal assets resultant from neoliberal natural resource pressures, where all aspects of life become increasingly commodified (Vincent, 2012). The community is being fractured through a balkanization of the resource, as enclosures of salt-pans are being built and claimed by individuals – forcing especially women into alienated labour relations as opposed to owning their own production under communal access. This internal challenge has put pressure on the ASAF, as in the past the movement could easily identify those who threatened communal access as they came from outside the community (Ada Salt Cooperative Committee, 1989). Therefore, this is a time of flux, introspection, and dialogue on what to do to try and deal with this latest challenge. At the heart of these questions were questions over the very composition of the largely older male dominated movement – especially considering it is women and young men who are most impacted by recent changes within the lagoon. It was into this complex time of soul searching that the author and colleagues involved in other movement contexts in Ghana were invited to begin working with the movement on documenting this learning, as well as contributing to its deepening.
Beginning in 2008, during doctoral research on broader processes of movement learning in Ghana since its return to democracy (c.f. Langdon, 2009a; 2009b; 2011), the author, along with a core group of activist-educators associated with this study, was invited to meet with members of the Ada Songor Advocacy Forum (ASAF). This meeting took place at the local community radio station, Radio Ada – a major ally and at times partner of the movement. These discussions, while contributing to the doctoral study, also outlined a desire for future collaboration on research that would both deepen understanding of the movement learning processes and contribute to the movement’s own self-reflexivity and, hopefully, strategies. In 2010, with access to a small grant for a collaborative research design process with the movement, a series of discussions began on a longer research relationship. While a successful SSHRC proposal, and now project, emerged from this process, what is ultimately more important to the movement membership is that the design process itself was quickly reconstituted by movement membership to be a reflexive process in and of itself, where a study of social movement learning was only one feature of the emergent movement agenda. Foundational to this emerging vision was a mutual education process that not only formed the basis of the research study to follow, but a conceptual mutually-constituted understanding of the struggle at hand and the important lessons from the past to move forward. So, while the design process asked, “what themes and processes should frame a potential longer-term study of movement learning in the Ada movement?”, this question was reconfigured to focus on “how do we achieve a similar and collectively determined understanding of what our struggle is today and the best way to tackle it?” In this sense, what was originally envisioned as a movement research conversation, became in and of itself a part of movement processes. As such, this synergistic parallel structure, where movement research and movement processes feed the one into the other, exemplifies the call for research embedded in movements.

As an indication of the strength and rootedness of this research, the first year of the new study met an instant challenge when connecting with ongoing movement activities – as it moved along with the movement. The repercussions of the 2008 discovery of oil in Ghana upon the salt sector only became apparent last year, as the central government began making moves to expropriate the resource in order to turn it over to a petrochemical processor (various different salts are important components of petrochemical processes) (c.f. Hinestroza, 2001). The ASAF shifted from focusing exclusively on the internal balkanization of the lagoon, and began to also mobilize against this external threat. Despite plans for a more introspective research process, by being grounded in a mutual design and ownership process, the research easily moved alongside this new thread, and helped deepen reflection and dialogue processes on how to best contest this latest move, even as the emergent learning in this new context was documented. Of critical importance for the movement, this reflective process was understood as being a pivotal component in the successful suspension of the expropriation attempts.

Parallel to this reconfiguration of movement focus, the reflective process that emerged even in the design process has helped connect struggles of the past to the present. For instance, the conflict with the company over the 1970s and 80s (Ada salt cooperative committee, 1989), and subsequent regaining of communal access to the resource without guaranteeing this access was connected to the recent rise of the balkanization of the resource. Further reflection led movement members to point out that women’s exclusion in prior mobilization around defending the communal access undermined its potential impact as they have the most to lose. This led to a
major shift in movement mobilization, as much more emphasis was placed on addressing this power imbalance within the movement – a process still ongoing but rooted in movement reflections and strategic revisions. This link between movement reflection and actions is indicative of the synergistic relationship between a mutually-owned research process and movement praxis.

Conclusion
With these examples in mind, a framing process that builds strong relationships of dialogue, along with a design that allows for research to ‘move with the movement’ helps not only the research to contribute to improved strategizing and movement articulated goals, but also makes for better, more dynamic research. Dynamic, mutually-owned research helps capture the shifts and changes that struggles with neoliberal resource exploitation engender, which is both an important site for reconfiguring movement goals, as well as adding an inside view of these shifts to social movement learning literature. At the same time, this dynamic process also contributes to movement reflections on power within its own membership, and to make the movement itself, as well as the research, more deeply owned by those most affected by the loss of communal access.

In this sense, enacting Choudry & Kapoor’s (2009) call for movement situated research means locating research in the middle of movement action and reflection processes, rather than merely documenting them from the side. After all, the best place to be able to document as well as contribute to social movement learning is from the middle of its ongoing processes. The slippage between documentation and being part of the actual reflection process reveals how research can contribute to movement praxis (action and reflection). This slippage also helps ensure that power dynamics within the research relationship are also subject to reflective processes, as they are visible and not trying to remain unseen/hidden. Having the design of this research process claimed from the start by the movement, as well as the way it was reconfigured to match shifts in movement focus, even as the process helped draw out reflections on the past that connect today’s movement with those most affected by threats to communal access, all underscore the way participatory action research is most synergistic and rooted if mutual-ownership begins from the outset.

Thus, this paper shares an important example of how placing movement articulation at the middle of a collaborative research design process made not only the research methodology, but even its design respond to movement needs and priorities. This approach to framing participatory research represents an important contribution to modalities around building research processes that are collectively owned by movements and researchers, and that undermine traditional Euro-American theoretical dominance – an important point of departure for any participatory research, but especially relevant for research in the Global South in general, and Africa in particular.

References


Entrepreneurial Learning in Different Intercultural Contexts: A Case Study on Germany and Canada

Anna Laros
University of Education, Freiburg, Germany

Abstract: The following paper shows my development of a grounded theory on the learning processes of female immigrant entrepreneurs. It reports on the initial findings of a case study in Germany and in Canada. It outlines reciprocal central aspects of the learning process and their different forms of realization. The results are discussed on the basis of transformative learning theory.

1. Introduction
Immigration to Germany has a long history; the immigration that plays the biggest role for the recent discussion on migration research has been initiated by the recruitment of so-called guest-workers. It reached its peak during the waves of recruited guest-workers after the 1960s which was followed by family reunifications after the ban of recruitment. One result is that Germany now has many citizens with a migration background. This external category determines people’s chances in life in different ways. “People with a migration background” is German terminology to describe people who have a foreign background. This includes people who are born outside of Germany, people who moved to Germany after 1949, and people who have one foreign parent (Statistisches Bundesamt 2012) Researchers have recognised the potential and the diversity of this group for some time now (see Westphal 1997, p. 63). The development of migration research and the development of integration strategies were held back for a very long time by the German policy that “Germany is not an immigration country.” German politicians powerfully promoted this statement up to 2005, creating over 40 years of denial of the immigration reality. One main issue today is the support of immigrants’ participation in the German labour market (Plahuta 2007, p. 2).

Focus is increasingly given to specific target group for their supportive activities: immigrant female entrepreneurs. Most existing research on immigrant female entrepreneurs endeavours to identify the potential of this target group for political decision making and for the German society in general (see Kontos 2003).

This short introduction into Germany’s immigration reality outlines different issues that have been built up over a long period of time. The categorization of people as “people with a migration background” as well as the long-promoted statement of Germany not being an immigration country, are just the tip of the iceberg. This case study compares my first initial findings from Germany with a country that provides a completely differing immigration reality: Canada. As Canada was the world’s first country to adopt a multicultural policy in 1971 (Citizenship and Immigration Canada 2012), it differs greatly from Germany in its acceptance of foreign citizens.
However, one aspect that seems to be an external category determinative of an immigrant’s chances in the Canadian labour market is the so-called lack of “Canadian experience.” Immigration is an inherent part of Canada’s self-conception whilst in Germany immigration is often related to challenges and issues like structural, institutional and personal discrimination. Even though these aspects were also mentioned by interviewees during my field research in Canada, the Canadian context provides a historically established difference to that of Germany. The following paper gives (2.) a short overview on my study. It provides (3.) an overview on the two cases and outlines (4.) my initial findings concerning the learning processes of immigrant female entrepreneurs in Germany and in Canada. The discussion of my findings and an outlook (5.) will complete this paper.

2. My Study
My research study focuses on learning processes. The subject is the differentiated proceedings of the learning processes of female immigrant entrepreneurs in Germany and in Canada. A theory of the learning processes of female immigrant entrepreneurs does not yet exist. Therefore I am proceeding with the methodology of grounded theory (see Corbin & Strauss ³2008) in order to develop theoretical implications. To receive insight on a women’s perspective, I have so far conducted narrative-style interviews (see Schütze 1976) with 10 entrepreneurs of different nationalities, fields of work, and migration backgrounds (first or second generation), six of them in Germany and four in Canada.

The focus of this paper is to outline the learning of entrepreneurship. The main thesis is that the learning of entrepreneurship does not only include economic-specific knowledge, a concept of entrepreneurship does not exist, and it is rather influenced by cross-cultural experience and vice versa.

Aspects of the theory of the learning process include the community, the entrepreneurial spirit, ethnic attributions and the range of perspectives. These aspects facilitate participation and integration. They are individually realised differently, which is outlined within the following case-study.

I have chosen two cases, which I am going to use to exemplify my initial findings on the learning processes after a short overview on the two cases. However, I am still in the process of learning about Canada and its complex theories concerning immigration, inclusion and exclusion. Many people take Canada as a best-practice example, but there exists internal critics on the country’s own brand of discrimination. However, as an outsider, I can only view the Canadian practices and social reality from a German perspective. I am viewing the Canadian practices and social reality from a German perspective. Due to the early stage of my study, the current results have to be seen as preliminary. They need to be substantiated by further data and investigated in depth as my study continues.

3. Overview of Two Cases
Both cases are immigrant entrepreneurs who worked as employees until they launched their companies. They never had language issues concerning the language of their immigration country.
3.2 Case 1: Catherine - an Indian Entrepreneur in Canada
Catherine is an Indian cook who owns a restaurant in the centre of a huge Canadian city, who
immigrated to Canada for private reasons. Today, she is a successful entrepreneur and her
restaurant is well profitable. As an employer, she prefers to hire Caucasians so the customers –
who mainly are white Canadians – can identify with her company. As an entrepreneur, she
participates in her community.

3.1 Case 2: Lisa - a Russian Entrepreneur in Germany
Lisa, a Russian-German teacher who has a doctorate in German studies and who used to work at
a university in Russia, immigrated to Germany for private reasons. She reported experiences of
exclusion as she started applying for a job -- neither her diploma nor her qualifications are
recognized in Germany and she reported feeling rejected because as a result of her Russian
accent. Focusing on her own ethnicity, she created opportunities by launching a language school.
Today, she is the owner of two language schools that offer a varied set of language classes.
As an employer, she gives people with a migration background a chance at employment so they
do not experience the exclusions as she did. As an entrepreneur, she facilitates her customers’
participation in the German system. She criticizes the German societal context, and creates a
different social reality in her company which is inclusive.

4. Initial Results
The different social, societal and structural contexts are playing a role within the learning
processes. Both entrepreneurs have a different range of perspectives that is realized through their
attitude as employers (assimilation versus vs. inclusion), their entrepreneurial spirit (community
versus. an inclusive society), and their view of integration. I am first going to report on the case
of Catherine (Canada) which is followed by the analysis of Lisa (Germany).

4.1 “The restaurant really gave us a channel to be more active in the community and to reach
out far more, for sure”
Catherine’s range of perspectives includes her participation in her community. This becomes
obvious in her attitude as employer as well as within her entrepreneurial spirit.

4.1.1 “Being an employer” Catherine’s range of perspectives concerning her integration,
participation, and assimilation is focused on her community. This becomes further outlined in
her behaviour as an employer. She reports on the diversity of her employees and her categories
for hiring somebody:
“… it's a mix of people … they definitely have to be more mainstream, because my
customers are more mainstream … language would be a requirement without a question,
they would be people that understand because we have a group of people that are coming
and are slightly older we have a group of people that are coming in with families so we
need people who are aware of these things.”
As an employer, Catherine hires people with different nationalities. When choosing her
employees, she makes sure that she chooses people to work for her that “are more mainstream,”
so the customers, which are mostly white Canadians, can identify with them. Here, ethnic
attributions become central. Her customers are the people who live in her community--where she
lives and where her restaurant is located. The assimilation to her community plays a significant
role when she outlines that she likes hiring Caucasians to specifically distance her company from
an ethnic economy. Her expression ”they would be people that understand” hints at the so-called
“Canadian experience.” The lack of “Canadian experience” is often mentioned as a criterion for not hiring immigrants. “Canadian experience” seems to be a mutual way of excluding immigrants from the employment market for reasons that mostly seem to have to do with soft-skills (e.g. cultural practices and traditions).

4.1.2 Entrepreneurial spirit “participation” and integration As a business woman, Catherine developed an entrepreneurial spirit which is not motivated by economic success. This spirit focuses on people in her community and makes her feel integrated.

“... You reach out to events in the community, and that makes you part of it ... a year ago there was a house fire, I don't know who the people are but ... I called them up I said we have a restaurant we cook well, anytime ... so that makes you really feel that you are part of this community and the greater country as a whole ... the restaurant really gave us a channel to be more active in the community and to reach out far more for sure.”

By offering needy people from her community use of her company’s’ product without any economic gain, Catherine can engage people with her entrepreneurial spirit and thereby feels like a part of, not only of her community, but also of “the greater country as a whole.” This is her way to become a part of Canada, not only as an entrepreneur but also as an individual. In this way, we can easily see just how much entrepreneurship offers opportunities for integration within a larger community. However, Catherine views the process of integration as a mostly individual-driven process:

“I think at the end of the day an immigrant is anybody you know coming to a different country-- it's all about you it's all about what you want to do. Are there going to be challenges when you go to a different country for sure ... the question is how, as a person, are you going to overcome that, this is key to somebody being successful, in enjoying their life and having a good time.”

She points out, that immigrants should take responsibility for their own happiness. Careful not to criticize the challenges that the Canadian context can create for immigrants, she highlights that it is up to each individual to overcome challenges “and having a good time”.

4.2 “I really do a lot when I know that somebody’s destiny is depending on the results of an exam”

Lisa’s range of perspectives includes opportunities of participation within the German system. She had issues herself of receiving opportunities of participation, and she wants to facilitate other immigrants participation in Germany. This becomes obvious in her attitude as an entrepreneur as well as within her entrepreneurial spirit.

4.2.1 “Being an employer” When choosing her employees, Lisa has the excluding attitudes within the German system in mind and she specifically wants to give people with a migration background a chance in the employment market. As an employer, she turns around her own experiences of exclusion when she gives immigrants a chance.

“I applied and I always received a ‘no’ ... after I had received the first 60 applications, I understood, if you are an employer and you receive applications from Germans as well as from German teachers with a migration background, then I have to give the immigrants a
chance to convince me to hire them. If I wouldn’t look at their applications, I exclude them.”

Being an employer has made her understand her own experiences of exclusions. “After I had received the first 60 applications, I understood”. She saw that many people are applying for jobs, not only immigrants. Furthermore, she understands how easily an employer can be inclusive. She creates an inclusive environment within her company by giving people with a migration background a chance to become her employees.

4.2.2 Entrepreneurial spirit “participation” and integration Lisa participates in an inclusive social reality. She views the German system critically and thinks that there are many exclusive structures that restrict an immigrant’s access to gainful employment. Therefore, her attitude is different. As an entrepreneur, she creates her inclusive reality within her company and takes responsibility for her clients. Her perspective is the German system.

Her entrepreneurial spirit is focussed on avoiding exclusion and supporting immigrants to have chances of participation in Germany. Her entrepreneurial spirit is not only focused on economic success but also on responsibility for other immigrants’ opportunity to participate in Germany.

“We have a young man from Gambia … He took a literacy class … he is so slow and during the exams, there are time limits. The teachers told me if we had five hours instead of one and a half, he would pass [laughing]. He is slow, by now, he knows how to read and write, but while others read two pages, he has read one sentence … I allowed him to attend the class one month for free … I have a certain responsibility.”

In this case, she supports her customer’s participation in the German system by allowing him to attend classes for free. Lisa feels responsible for the young man and is acting not out of economic success, but out of a sense of ethical duty. She views herself as a part of Germany through being an entrepreneur in Germany.

“I am not working on the moon [laughing]. I have a network here … I am in the middle and therefore a part of the society. I integrated myself with force and power into this society even though the most people did not want that [laughing].”

It becomes obvious that her integration as a person and her integration as entrepreneur are two different things. While the integration as entrepreneur seems to occur in passing, her integration as an individual required “power and force.” As an individual, she had to fight for her integration against the majority of society. As an entrepreneur, she is being viewed for her job and for what she is doing. Therefore, she does not make excluding experiences for her migration background. Thinking about integration she questions the majority society and sees the issues not in the individuals but in the greater context.

“For me it is a question who does Germany need? Do our cleaning personnel necessarily need to have two university degrees? There are people who could be useful for this country and they are cleaning toilets. We have a very huge problem in this country. We have overqualified people who are not needed here. I have a lot of immigrants in my school who are willing to integrate, but I am not sure if the German society wants that.”
To her, integration is a reciprocal process and the majority society of Germany is the problematic aspect of this process:

5. Discussion and Outlook
The study shows that learning process of female immigrant entrepreneurs does not only include economic specific knowledge. Instead of only one prevailing concept of entrepreneurship, we have to deal with different, more multifaceted concepts which always show a certain combination of entrepreneurship and migration aspects.

It reinforces what Mezirow (1990, 2000) outlines within the theory of transformative learning: Within learning processes that involve the learning of a new role – which is in the present paper the entrepreneurial learning – the reorganisation of existing meaning perspectives exceed the economic sphere and include the person within her different environments.

Different aspects become central to learning process: the community and ethnic attributions, the entrepreneurial spirit and the range of perspectives. These aspects are realized differently and through a reciprocal process. They determine how the learning process of the female immigrant entrepreneur is internalised. As it was outlined in the case studies, different strategies can evolve, such as in Catherine’s case the assimilation, or in Lisa’s case the constructive change.

There is a level between the individual and the society that facilitates integration – the community. Both presented cases outlining a reference to their community but it is concretized differently. For Catherine, the local social context becomes central. Ethnic attributions become relevant when she describes the local context that she assimilates to as mainstream and Caucasian. Ethnic attributions become part of her identity, where integration happens linguistically. Ethnic attributions become relevant when she says “white Canadians,” but this attribution is ambiguous. This term describes a diverse range of people.

For Lisa, a more abstract concept of the community becomes central. She is not referring to her local social context. Ethnic attributions become relevant when she creates a bipolar concept of ethnicity: German versus non-German/ German with a migration background. Furthermore she refers to her own ethnicity (this aspect has not been outlined within the present paper). The different conceptions of the community could be connected to the different economics, Catherine’s restaurant and Lisa’s language school. Catherine receives her customers from her local community while Lisa does not. Furthermore the two are entrepreneurially active within two different political contexts. Both entrepreneurs take responsibility, while Catherine focuses on the people in her community, Lisa focuses on her customers in the context of participation opportunities in Germany. She does this within her company as an entrepreneur. The entrepreneurial spirits as well as the referring range of perspectives are different in the presented cases; they are influenced by the other mentioned aspects (community and ethnic attributions) and vice versa.

The determining Canadian category of the “Canadian experience” which was mentioned at the beginning seems to be a more fluid concept than the German category of the “migration background.” The migration background is something people can never overcome. The reciprocal aspects of the learning process do not happen statically. Due to the limitations of this paper, it has been outlined as such but within my study, I could so far outline four different
learning phases over which the women further develop and differentiate their central meaning perspectives: 1. Launching-preparation-phase, 2. Identification and activation of opportunities, 3. Initial entrepreneurial activity, 4. Being an entrepreneur. The aspects presented in this paper are mostly related to the fourth phase, the phase of “being an entrepreneur”. Within this last phase, the company has been well profitable and the financial situation offers opportunities to develop the entrepreneurial spirit. Lisa for example describes her company during this phase as a “school for life.”

These four learning phases put a multifaceted view on transformative learning theory through outlining interdependencies among different aspects within the learning experiences of female immigrant entrepreneurs. For adult education, the grounded theory of the learning processes which I am developing within my research could have implications for unsuccessful entrepreneurs, people who are interested in launching a company, unemployed people, et cetera - both immigrants as well as the general population.

References
Economic and Educational Inequalities and Support for Occupy Movements: Some Recent North American Evidence

D.W. Livingstone
University of Toronto

Milosh Raykov
University of Alberta

Abstract: The recent emergence of Occupy movements around the advanced capitalist world suggests widening perceptions of serious inequities and injustices and willingness to be involved in actions to change them. This paper will draw on evidence from a series of Canadian and U.S. opinion surveys of economic oppression, educational inequality and class consciousness, as well as support for Occupy movements, to assess the strength of these attitudes.

The existence of revolutionary ideas in a particular period presupposes the existence of a revolutionary class.

Karl Marx and Frederick Engels. The German Ideology.

Introduction

The purpose of this short paper is to explore whether recent expressions of criticism of this system expressed most dramatically by Occupy protests in several countries might be indicative of the beginning of a rapid change of basic features of capitalism or transformation into a different economic system. A compelling case can be made for the view that the capitalist epoch of production is rapidly reaching limits to the continuing growth (of the overall size of the economy and the quantities of energy and material goods flowing through it) that has been its defining characteristic. Three primary factors block further economic growth: depletion of basic resources including fossil fuels, minerals, food and water; negative environmental impacts from extraction and use of these resources; and financial disruptions of monetary, banking and investment systems due to failure to adjust to resource scarcity, soaring environmental costs and enormous government and private debt. Richard Heinberg (2011, p. 4) concludes from a recent review of the empirical evidence that: “we are seeing a perfect storm of converging crises that together represent a watershed moment in the history of our species. We are witnesses to, and participants in, the transition from decades of economic growth to decades of economic contraction.” More specifically, the “Great Recession” starting in late 2007, characterized by home mortgage foreclosures contrasted with government bailouts to private corporations deemed “too big to fail” and lucrative executive benefits packages, was the immediate provocation for the Occupy protests driven by a sense of the need for a more just alternative way of organizing society.

The general theoretical perspective that informs this research posits an intimate connection between power and knowledge. Those dominant economic classes who own and control the major means of production, including large private financial, industrial and mass
media corporations, have had very substantial opportunities to communicate their views as universal knowledge to subordinated classes. Those who lack control of the means of production have been subjected to forces of socialization serving to convince them that established hierarchical institutional forms in which they are subordinated are natural or inevitable. However, there is a growing contradiction in advanced capitalist societies between the concentrated privatized ownership of large corporations and the increasing socialization of the forces of knowledge production (e.g. widening access to advanced education, the internet). While powerful capitalists remain intent on protecting their property rights and asserting the sanctity of profits over workers’ rights, widening access to strategic knowledge enables subordinate classes to develop more oppositional forms of class consciousness and critical attitudes beyond capitalist hegemonic ideologies. The awareness that people have about feasible or preferable ways of organizing economic life continues to be related to the extent of power they have to maintain or change such ways of life. But when alternative forms of life begin to be seen as needed, the previously inevitable can become intolerable. As de Tocqueville (1947, p. 186) observed: “The evil, which was suffered patiently as inevitable, seems unendurable as soon as the idea of escaping from it is conceived”. The post-World War II period of economic growth was probably the most sustained in the history of capitalism, with significant gains by working class people in wages and benefits, educational attainments and general living conditions. Rising expectations were then followed by further gains in educational attainment coupled with stagnant wages and underemployment. As Morton Deutsch (2006, p. 26) observes: “a very effective way of enhancing the sense of injustice of the victimized is to increase their education and little else”.

The recent Occupy protests predominantly in North America and Western Europe suggest a widening array of people may both perceive serious inequities and injustices and want to be involved in actions to change them. Broad popular sentiments of dissatisfaction with current conditions are a prerequisite for sustainable change movements. But such sentiments also have to be deeply grounded in the material conditions and consciousness of those most directly experiencing such inequities in order for the oppressed to be moved to act on their own behalf. So, the specific question we address is this: *Is there evidence of a major shift in popular attitudes toward economic and educational inequalities and interest in social justice movements to address them?*

**Empirical Findings**

The evidence from surveys of public attitudes will be presented under four themes: perceptions of inequities of wealth and political power; perceptions of educational inequalities; expressions of class consciousness; and, finally, support for the Occupy movement.

**Inequities of wealth and power**

Research in Canada and the U.S. has confirmed that wealth inequality is at historic highs and has increased rapidly in the past generation (Yalnizan, 2010). For example, the richest 10% of Canadians had over 58% of the net wealth in 2005 compared to about 3% of the wealth for the bottom 50% of income groups; the richest 1% took a third of all growth of incomes over a recent decade and the top 20% saw their household incomes increase by nearly 40% between 1980 and 2009 while the bottom 20% had theirs drop by over 10%. Perceptions of wealth inequality reflect increasing awareness of these conditions. In 1990, about two-thirds of Canadians felt that the gap
between rich and poor had widened, while by 2006 this belief in a widening gap was held by three-quarters of Canadians. In addition, about two-thirds thought that only the richest Canadians had benefitted from recent economic growth and those in the lowest income group were most likely to believe this (Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives, 2006). In October, 2011, as Occupy Canada protests were occurring around the country, over 80% agreed that gap between the rich and poor has grown too large in Canada, and that corporations and the rich have too much influence over public policy and politics in Canada (Abacus Data, 2011). In December, 2011, two-thirds of Canadians expressed the view that the income gap between the wealthy and the rest was larger than ever. Over 80% thought that governments should take measures to reduce this gap, with those in the highest income group least likely to agree (Environics Institute, 2011).

U.S. patterns of wealth and political power are even more inequitable than in Canada, with some estimates suggesting that the top 1% of Americans hold half of the wealth (Norton & Ariely, 2010). Opinion surveys in the 1940s found that 60% of Americans agreed that there was too much power in the hands of a few rich people and large corporations; in the late 1980s, 75% felt that the rich were getting richer and the poor were getting poorer (Pew Research Center, 2011). In November, 2011, 80% said they believed that Wall Street and large corporations had too much influence in politics today while 74% thought those who were not wealthy had too little (Center for Public Opinion, 2011). Nevertheless, another late 2011 survey found that a small majority of Americans (55%) still thought that the economic system was fair, in contrast to majorities of low income (56%) and unemployed (70%) who felt it was unfair. A more in-depth study of Americans’ views on wealth inequality has found that most people greatly underestimate its extent, that their preferred distributions of wealth are even more equitable than their low estimates of actual distributions, and that preferences for more equitable wealth distribution are shared across all social backgrounds (Norton & Ariely, 2010). This study suggests that Americans may have higher tolerance for wealth inequities than many other countries because of ignorance of the extent of the gap mixed with high optimism about their opportunities for upward mobility. It should be noted that this study was done with 2005 data which may not reflect the more recent views of the lower income and unemployed cited above.

Overall, opinion survey data suggest that both Canadians and Americans have fairly widespread and long standing views of the existence of inequities of wealth and power in their countries but are becoming more aware of increasing wealth inequities.

Educational inequalities

Since at least the end of WW II, advanced formal education has been promoted as the major means for upward mobility in advanced capitalist societies. In North America, post-secondary institutions expanded very rapidly from the 1960s onward and by the turn of the century the majority of youth cohorts were completing either a university or community college program. As a consequence of increasing general accessibility, the gap in the chances of children from rich and poor families to complete post-secondary education narrowed through much of this period. For cohorts born before 1931 in Canada, those from professional families were over 9 times as likely to complete a university degree as those from industrial working class families; 15

15 In spite of a generally assumed high level of economic development, analysis of the most recent Canadian Community Health Survey (Statistics Canada, 2010) finds that about 40% of the lowest income group in Canada experiences some form of food insecurity.
for cohorts born between 1951 and 1970, the difference had declined to about 4 times as likely (Livingstone, 2004). This continuing gap may represent a great waste of the talent of children from working class families, but as long as the gap was declining it suggested grounds for optimism. In recent decades, stagnant incomes and mounting debt loads coupled with substantial increases in tuition fees have made universities virtually inaccessible for children from lower class families (MacDonald & Shaker, 2011). There is now a widespread sense of the educational inequality facing these children and their families. A series of Ontario attitude surveys has found that in 1998 two-thirds of the general public thought that those from lower income families faced worse chances of getting a post-secondary education than students from upper-income families; by 2009 this view was shared by over three-quarters of the public and by clear majorities in all income groups. Over this same period, recognition that aboriginal students have a worse chance than white students of getting a post-secondary education increased from about a third to 60% of the general public (Livingstone & Hart, 2010).

Since the youth protests of the 1960s there has been concern among powerful groups that the rising expectations of highly educated young people who could not get the sorts of rewarding jobs they anticipated and who faced the prospect of continuing underemployment could become a serious threat to the existing social order (e.g. O'Toole, 1975). Numerous aspects of underemployment have continued to increase since that time. Underemployment is becoming more common among managerial and professional employees but it is even more likely that those in industrial and service working class jobs now have educational qualifications they are not recognized for (see Livingstone, 2009). For the most part, it appears that underemployed young people became caught up in an educational arms race competing against themselves for diminishing job rewards, with relatively little interest in social protests beyond those for continuing access the higher education. In light of a growing sense of educational inequalities and mounting underemployment, how long can this preoccupation continue without leading to growing support for revolutionary ideas?

Class consciousness

As Marx suggested, the existence of revolutionary ideas presupposes the existence of a revolutionary class. For orthodox Marxists, revolutionary hopes have been pinned on the working class, especially the industrial proletariat. What recent signs are there of the development of revolutionary class consciousness? Class consciousness can be conceived of in terms of at least three levels: class identity, oppositional consciousness and hegemonic consciousness (cf. Mann, 1973). Very briefly, a revolutionary working class consciousness involves identifying as playing a distinctive role with other workers, perceiving capitalists as enduring opponents and having a vision of an alternative society to be achieved through struggle with these opponents. Conversely, capitalist class consciousness involves identifying as a member of a ruling or upper class, perceiving ownership rights as superior to workers rights and commitment to a society that defends the priority of these property rights. We will look at findings of a series of Canadian national surveys that have explored this issue in 1983, 2004 and 2010 (Livingstone & Scholtz, forthcoming).

Over the past three decades, the main shift in the Canadian class structure has been the decline of working class jobs and an increasing proportion of intermediate managerial and professional employee jobs. Correspondingly, there has been a decline in the numbers who identify as working class and increase in those who identify themselves as middle class.
However, throughout this period majority support has been expressed for the rights of organized workers to be protected during strikes versus management rights to hire replacement workers, as well as for the view that corporations benefit owners at the expense of workers and consumers. While working class identity has declined and mixed views on workers’ rights and owners’ fights are quite common, consistent working class supporters have outnumbered capitalist supporters by about 3 to 1 throughout this period. Contradictory mixtures of class identities and views on owners’ and workers’ rights are commonly expressed by those in most class positions. But two patterns in relations between class consciousness and class position have been clear. Large and small employers have exhibited strong capitalist class consciousness, while the declining numbers in the industrial working class continue to be most likely to hold oppositional working class consciousness. Furthermore, hegemonic class consciousness remains strong among employers and those in the highest income groups-- in the sense that strong majorities deny the possibility of a society running without the profit motive-- whereas only among the industrial working class has there been a majority who agree with the possibility. So, only the ruling capitalist class expresses a coherent hegemonic class consciousness, but many in the remaining working class retain an oppositional working class consciousness and many others express support for workers’ rights. The preconditions exist for the wider emergence of revolutionary ideas in the current class structure.

A recent U.S. survey taken in the wake of the Occupy movement in December, 2011, offers suggestive evidence in this regard. Two-thirds of Americans now say there are strong conflicts between the rich and the poor, compared to less than half two years earlier. Class conflicts now tend to be more common that conflicts between immigrants and native born or between blacks and whites. The perception of strong class conflict has risen to a majority in all income groups, all age groups, for all levels of formal education, all political party orientations and ideologies. As the pollsters observe: “These changes in attitude over a relatively short period of time may reflect the income and wealth inequality message conveyed by Occupy Wall Street protesters…[but] may also reflect a growing public awareness of underlying shifts in the distribution of wealth in American society” (Morin, 2012 p. 2).

Support for the Occupy movement

When the Occupy movement emerged in late summer 2011 in the wake of the fallout from the “Great Recession” that began in late 2007, it was largely organized via the social media that have rapidly become the main vehicle for mobilizing protest movements around the globe. There has been a coincident decline in the legitimacy of mass news media. Pew Research Center surveys (2011) have found that since the late 1980s skepticism about mass media reports has increased greatly, so that two-thirds of Americans now think stories are often inaccurate and 80% feel that reports are often influenced by powerful people and organizations. So what have most people made of this movement that they have so far still learned about mainly through mass media? An early days October 2011 Gallup poll found, not surprisingly, that over half of Americans did not yet know enough about it to offer an opinion; the highest support came from unionized workers; most of the quarter of the population that already supported Occupy felt that the U.S. economic system was unfair, whereas most of those who then opposed Occupy or did not know enough about it thought the economic system was fair (USA Today/Gallup Poll, 2011). A bit later October 2011 Canadian survey found that about 40% were favourable to Occupy, 20% unfavourable and the rest did not know enough (Abacus, 2011). An international survey in
November 2011 found that over half of Canadians sympathized with Occupy compared to 45% of Americans (Stechyson, 2011). So, in spite of the fact that traditional mass media frequently trivialized the protests of the Occupy movement, ridiculed its highly participatory structure and diverted attention to secondary issues like street cleaning, the movement appeared to increasingly resonate with a growing portion of the population in North America.

At the time of writing, the Occupy movement continues to undertake more concerted and consolidating activities across several regions in terms of street actions, ongoing local initiative and demands of government focused on several main objectives. These include re-empowerment of people and communities, reigning in corporatist privileges, debt forgiveness and banking reform, wealth and income redistribution, universal health and education access and food security, decent jobs and a sustainable economy, peace and social justice (Haque, 2011). These may be halting steps but the objectives are in tune with the growing popular perceptions of inequities of wealth and power, and of educational inequalities; they also resonate with the continuing oppositional working class consciousness of a working class core and a plurality of other wage and salary earners. Labour unions have been among the valuable supporters of Occupy protests in many areas.

Concluding remarks

It is now 6 months since the launch of Occupy Wall Street. The Occupy movement has clearly had a rapid impact on public opinion, tapping strong sentiments of frustration at growing inequities. The widening of public discussion of such inequities and needed economic reforms has been a major achievement. The tactics of occupying specific locations for substantial periods have initially been very effective, although such tactics may have to be revised to sustain larger scale mobilizations. But at least the prospect of progressive social movements resisting mounting neo-liberal austerity measures and fighting for the social justice objectives they share with the Occupy movement is a more open question than it was 6 months ago. The empirical findings here offer some resources of hope for constructive popular education practice in relation to current progressive social movements.

Acknowledgements

Funding for this study was provided by the Canada Research Chair in Lifelong Learning and Work award and a Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada (SSHRC) postdoctoral research award #756-2010-0481.

References


Advocating for Reflection: Serving Adult Learners

Geraldine (Jody) Macdonald
University of Toronto

Abstract: Adult educators in health professional programs are challenged by ongoing demands to integrate new knowledges into the curriculum, to prepare learners for evolving entry-to-practice competencies, and to ensure that new graduates are prepared to practice safely. This presentation argues that academic leaders have a key role in advocating for increased time and space for reflection, a key component of the learning process. When learners have time to reflect upon their learning they are able to construct new understandings and identities. Two specific learner centered examples are highlighted, simulation debriefing and freeing space and time for reflection.

Reflecting on Context
For the past twenty-five years I have taught in our undergraduate nursing program. Initially the program was offered as a direct entry program, with students coming directly to us in their first year of university. Fourteen years ago our program shifted to a second-entry program. All students now have university education, most have completed a full degree, and some have completed graduate degrees. The shift from the direct entry to our second entry program had a surprising impact on our teaching approach. Our second-entry students prompted a shift to a more learner centred teaching approach supported by social constructivism theory (Blumberg, 2009; Weimer, 2002). Their past experience and learning was an important part of their strength. The practice environment has been constantly shifting, with trends including shorter stays in hospital, more acuity in patients in hospital, increasing use of complex technology, and a shift to interprofessional practice expectations. Our curriculum shifted as well. We introduced low and high fidelity simulations in the program without knowing what components were crucial to include. We also increased the course load for our senior year students. Faculty began to notice an increase in senior student distress, one that was very concerning. It seemed that our health professional program was undermining the health of some of our students. Senior students were being kept so busy that they had little time to reflect upon what they were learning and this was of great concern to many faculty members, including this author. It did not support Schon’s (1987) classic theory on reflection-in-action and reflection-on-action. I decided to focus on supporting reflection feeling that my point of power was with the learners that I engaged with in my own practice. First I went to the literature to ensure that my social constructivist theory/pedagogy/androgy was current.

Social Constructivism
Adult educators in professional programs are challenged by ongoing demands to integrate new knowledges into the curriculum, to prepare learners for evolving entry-to-practice competencies, and to ensure that new graduates are prepared to practice safely. Health professional educators are recognizing that approaches to learning are shifting (Berragan, 2011). In an effort to support effective learning that prepares students for a rapidly changing clinical practice environment, Berragan (2011) argues that the traditional focus on individual learning has shifted to a focus on social learning that facilitates health professional students constructing knowledge, meaning, and professional identities. Social learning involves learning with peers in community, learning about
context, engaging with patients/clients, and reflecting upon how it feels to be a health professional such as a nurse (Berragan, 2011). Social constructivism learning theory supports a learner centered learning approach (Beck & Kosnik, 2006; Blumberg, 2009; Weimer, 2002).

Social constructivism is founded upon key principles including that knowledge is constructed by learners, is experience based, is social in nature and people are assumed to be holistic, with connections between the different components of the person (Beck & Kosnik, 2006, p. 9-14). Social constructivism is “a passionate approach, involving the whole person: thought, emotion, and action” (Beck & Kosnik, 2006, p. 8). Constructivism argues that people create their own understandings, by integrating their previous experience/knowledge with new learning, within specific contexts, including crucial social contexts practices (Beck & Kosnik, 2006, p. 2; Peters, 2000). Learning is increasingly being referred to as a cultural experience which focuses the student on thinking about their professional practice, practising related skills within supportive learning communities (Berragan, 2011, p. 661). This shifts the focus of student learning away from a content driven, teacher directed process, to one that is interactive, social, and thoughtful, one that “requires reflexivity” (Berragan, 2011, p. 661).

This reflection on social constructivism helped me to identify two key approaches that I could take to support a reflective practice in my students. The first was to reflect upon the debriefing experiences of the students in the emergency preparedness simulation in my senior year course. The second was to advocate to reduce our clinical practice hours in order to support a more reflective learning experience. Highlights of each follow.

**Simulation Debriefing**

Current best practices in simulation learning identify three key components. The simulation begins with a short briefing, and is followed by the active component of the simulation and then the debriefing (Decker, 2007; Neill & Wotton, 2011; Shinnick, Woo & Mentes, 2011). Debriefing is considered to be a crucial aspect of the simulation (Neill & Wotton, 2011), one that involves time for students to reflect upon their communication, choices, and actions (Decker, 2007). Debriefing best practices are beginning to emerge in the literature but it is clear that additional research is needed (Neill & Wotton, 2011). Debriefing is considered to be a formative assessment involving discussion between students and the faculty facilitator(s), resulting in constructive, formative feedback (Neill & Wotton, 2011). Debriefing works best when it is more structured, follows immediately after the simulation, is conducted within a safe and trusting environment, utilizes open-ended questions, and incorporates two to three times as much time as the active simulation scenario (Neill & Wotton, 2011).

In reflection, over the past three years, we have significantly enhanced our emergency preparedness simulation including building in key time for debriefing. We have created structure through written, open ended questions that guide the debriefing, while remaining flexible so that the facilitator can focus on the students’ priority answers. Debriefing typically takes 35 minutes, immediately following a ten minute active simulation. We create a supportive, and trusting environment and our evaluations are consistently extremely positive. As we introduce more simulations into our curriculum, in an attempt to reduce the theory-practice gap that is so problematic (Benner, Sutphen, Leonard, & Day, 2010).
Freeing Space and Time for Reflection

The curriculum changes which moved two key courses into the second year of the program contributed to student stress in the senior year. The change was to alleviate stress in the initial year of this two year program. While the students in the initial year likely appreciated a lighter load, the students in the senior year were not well prepared for the stress. As a clinical faculty member I could appreciate that our students didn’t have enough time to reflect on their day to day practice, or to complete their reflective practice papers. I decided to advocate for a reduction from three to two clinical days in our thirteen week term, a total reduction of thirteen clinical days. I began with the faculty team members who were not wildly enthusiastic, but over time we agreed to support this initiative. Then I had to take it to the Undergraduate Chair for discussion and placement upon the UG Committee meeting for discussion. The first year I presented this to the UG committee, it was turned down. However, I persisted and the following year was able to obtain permission to pilot this in our 2011/12 academic year. So far, fall final and winter midterms evaluations have been consistently positive. The students appreciate the time off, and confirm that it supported them to spend more time thinking and writing their papers. They strongly recommended that the reduction be continued into the future. Faculty were positive and preceptors were mostly positive, with just a few who wanted more time with the students (perhaps to complete their work?). The student papers have not improved dramatically, but fewer students requested extensions, and fewer students seemed overwhelmed by writing the papers. We were able to add in a political action component to the seminars and papers that had not been in the assignment previously, and that was significant as preparing for political action is a key learning in the course. Faculty have now agreed to make the change from three to two clinical practice days a permanent change. The entire process took approximately three years, and it may not have been the ideal choice to balance the curriculum, but it was an approach that I was willing to support as I could see that no one else was willing to give up time or content. Ideally a complete curriculum revision will be conducted, resulting in a transformation of the curriculum, but at the moment that seems far away.

Conclusion

Shifting from a content driven, teacher centered approach, to a learner centered approach is the current challenge in the academy. Social constructivism supports active, engaged, learners who are able to learn from and with each other including reflecting together on their experiences. Two approaches to facilitating reflection were identified, one simulation debriefing and the other reducing total clinical time in a course to provide more opportunity for thoughtful reflection and the writing of academic papers. This presentation argues that academic leaders have a key role in advocating for increased time and space for reflection, a key component of the learning process. When learners have time to reflect upon their learning they are able to construct new understandings and identities. Health professional learning is all about reflecting in and on action, creating meaning, making connections, linking new learning to old learning, and students developing their health professional identities. Advocating for enhanced reflection time has served these adult learners well.

References


**Public Pedagogy and Policies of “Conditionality”: A Comparative International Analysis.**

Scott MacPhail  
Mount Saint Vincent University  
Robert McGray  
University of Alberta

**Abstract:** Conditionalities are most broadly defined as the provisos that are to be met by a country when borrowing money from the International Financial Institutions (IFIs). Increasingly, they have proven to have far reaching consequences for countries entering into agreements with The World Bank, the International Monetary Fund, and the World Trade Organization. These consequences are often mistakenly believed to be primarily financial. Instead, we suggest that the ramifications of accepting conditionalities have had profound consequences for learning. This research attempts to illuminate these consequences by asking how conditionalities enable or constrain public pedagogy.

**Introduction**

Research into the relationship between education and globalization is not new: present day complexities, however, provide an increasingly difficult task to articulate robust explanations between complex systems like political economy and public pedagogy. In the face of this complexity, it must be asked how the social sciences can explain the pedagogical implications of globalization. Indeed, there are many critical approaches in the field of education aimed at illuminating this connection. In his work detailing the consequences of the policies of the IFIs in the Caribbean, Hilbourne Watson (2000) points out that there are a number of specific policy mechanisms that actualize the process of globalization through private capital. He notes that it is through the triumvirate of *structural adjustment plans, conditionalities, and authoritative praxis* that the Bretton Woods organizations leverage concrete policy tools for the intervention of capital into everyday lives. By drawing our attention to these policy tools, Watson is able to investigate how these policies of globalization actualize. As such, we are reminded that many of the Bretton Woods institutions have definitive and concrete policy mechanisms which enframe our daily lives. It must also be asked how these policies, and policy mechanisms, articulate with lifelong learning.

The theoretical framework for this study is derived from a dialectical materialist framework based in Critical Realism (Archer, 2001; Propora, 1998; Sayer, 2000). The result of this framework is an investigation which stresses the constitution, and re-constitution, of societal relationships which circumscribe pedagogical acts. As such, the features of what Donovan Plumb (2008) describe as the informal contexts of adult learning occupy a central role in the analysis. The theoretical framework that Propora articulates, we argue, is a key aspect in understanding how policy tools such as conditionalities operate. While much of the literature speaks directly to the ramifications of conditionalities for formal education – primarily primary education and vocational skills training – it is Propora’s work which elaborates a framework of the ways in which learned behaviours moderate patterns of public pedagogy and social life.
The following research is organized in two main sections. First, we elaborate a history of the concept of conditionalities. Second, we review the connection of these conditionalities with public pedagogy. The second section is contextualized by a theoretical framework of Critical Realism and its strength in investigating the informal structures with are produced and reproduced by policy mechanisms.

A Brief History of Conditionalities

Although momentum for conditionalities can be traced back to the Bretton Woods Accord of 1944, they did not become entrenched in IFI policy until the 1970s and 1980s. The IFIs grew out of a time of crisis as the allied nations were concerned about the reconstruction of the world economy at the conclusion of World War II. The main focus at the meeting was the reconstruction of a Europe which would allow for America to have markets to sell their product, as well as having countries produce product for the American consumer. Once Europe – at least the zone under American influence – was reconstructed in the American economic image, it was desired to rebuild the rest of the world in their economic image and stem the development of communism.

Conditionalities are used as a form of policy collateral by IFIs to ensure that the money they lend will be repaid. The logic behind them is that debt, or the inability to afford the cost of necessary infrastructure, is indicative that a nation’s economic system is unproductive – thus necessitating correction. The goal of conditionalities is meant to create a trajectory on which a country is meant to move. Dreher (2002) points out that in the genesis of the Bretton Woods institutions, there was no consideration of intrusive conditionality now common under the international financial institutions (IFIs) programs. The IMF should provide short term balance of payments (sic) credits and stabilise the post war financial system. The Bank was founded to promote long term growth in its member countries. However, over time, with the evolution of the IFIs, conditionality gradually increased and became inseparably associated with their loans. (p. 7)

Dreher continues to detail that in the beginning of the IMF, it was the United States who was the sole interest in establishing the policy of conditionality: something that was desired in the case of “misbehaviour” (p. 8). While misbehaviour might be interpreted today as a violation of financial ethics, at the time of the conception of the IMF misbehaviour was described as occurring “if the Fund’s resources would be used to finance capital flights or rearmament” (Dreher, p. 8). Obviously, the reference to rearmament in this context conveys the gravity of international finance in post war Europe.

As the transition occurred from the post war period, Heyneman (2003) notes that European infrastructure had to be reconstructed whereas third world infrastructure had to be constructed for participation in burgeoning market economies. Initially, the infrastructure that had to be constructed was geared towards solid material forms such as bridges and dams. The funding needs eventually changed to training people to work in industry, such as the trends toward human capital development (Spring, 1998). This highlights a fundamental shift from reconstruction to development – specifically for the field of education.

While Buria (2003) notes that the IMF linked policy and loans in 1952, and again more formally in 1969, conditionalities, as noted above, would not actually become entrenched in IFIs until the
1970s and 1980s. It is in this period where the most substantive developments in defining conditionalities occur. The post war forays into national economies were tempered by Keynesian Economics which focused on a strong social welfare network. But it was another time of crisis – stagflation of the 1970s – that brought about a shift from industrial based economy to the knowledge economy. As such, the nature of the relationship between IFIs and nation states would also change.

It was also during the 1980s that Buria comments that the IMF was “expanding the scope of conditionality into fields that previously had been largely outside its purview” (p. vii). Of note at this time were the conjoined shifts in the world economic order from Keynesianism to neoliberalism as well as a shift from an industrial economy to a knowledge economy. Mundy (2002) paints a picture of the Bank as a constantly evolving entity which either picks up, or becomes an outgrowth of, popular economic discourses.

By the mid-1980s, however, the Bank began to assume a more distinctive role in the new world of policy-based adjustment lending. It did so at least in part as a response to the emergent consensus among its leading members (especially the US) that the unfolding debt crises in developing countries was a result of government failure and inefficiency, particularly the failure to provide a supportive environment for private sector led growth.

(p.487)

In a forward to a World Bank publication in 2005, James W. Adams, a vice-president at the World Bank, highlights that conditionalities also “became a controversial concept after international financial institutions, particularly the International Monetary Fund and the World Bank, provided policy-based lending to help developing countries adjust to the debt crisis of the 1980s” (Adams in Koeberle, Bedoya, Silarsky, & Verheyenp, 2005, p. vii). Neoliberal conditionalities would be concerned with profit making and cut backs to social programs. In addition, the increasing emphasis on the knowledge economy would shift conditionalities to orient policies which would aid in the development of a knowledge based economic structure.

Referring to the IMF, James Boughton (2006) describes the current policy mechanism of conditionality as a relatively simple process:

The IMF extends credit to countries with an external imbalance, conditional on the country’s commitment to implement economic policies that will restore equilibrium. That conditionality serves two purposes. First, it ensures that the IMF’s financial resources are used for the intended purpose, to the benefit of the country. Second, it ensures that the IMF will operate as a revolving fund for the benefit of all member countries (p. 19).

The problem, as Boughton points out, should be evident. He asks, “If the intended purpose is to benefit the borrower, then why is conditionality necessary?” (p. 19) Oliver Morrissey (2005) offers a more nuanced description of conditionalities as an actual mechanism:

Conditionality has acquired a stronger meaning than this literal interpretation. First, it is applied to conditions on policy reform (as distinct, for example, from fiduciary conditions on accounting for the use of funds). Second, it refers to the use of financing to leverage policy reform, that is, to impose particular policies, which need not be the policies that would freely be chosen by the recipient. Third, the conditions tend to be many and wide ranging, applying not only to most areas of economic policy but also to aspects of governance and political processes. Fourth, at least in principle, the conditions are enforced, in the sense that failure to meet the conditions to a satisfactory extent typically
means that funding is not released. Taken together, these capture the meaning of conditionality as a *mechanism* to leverage policy reform. (p. 237)

Over time, conditionalities would serve as a policy mechanism implicated in the production of the much maligned Structural Adjustment Programs (SAPs).

**Conditionalities and Public Pedagogy**

As highlighted in the previous section, the past few decades have seen the transformation of conditionalities from fiduciary policy mechanisms to broad social reform projects. There is little evidence that this trend will slow, or that conditionalities will be divested of their expansive scope, anytime soon. It is worthwhile to note a caveat to this statement. This caveat is the nature by which China, as an individual state, is granting loans and development projects to other countries. Pieter van Dijk (2009) notes that under the Beijing consensus, China has significantly parted ways with the Washington consensus – specifically the World Bank and the IMF – and provided avenues for unconditional aid in Africa. The term *unconditional* is a curious term in this context as it refers to the lack of formal policy reforms; what it hides away are the informal obligations of receiving a gift (or a loan) and reciprocity. The case of China notwithstanding, it is the IFIs’ use of conditionality to reform public pedagogy that we wish to turn our attention to next.

While the term *public pedagogy* refers to a vast matrix of sociological concerns for learning, it is Henry Giroux (2004) who uses it to describe the contemporary context of formal and popular learning. Specifically pertaining to the current domination of neoliberal politics, Giroux is especially critical in his assessment of market pressures and the constraints on learning. At the same time, he has ventured on a larger project of understanding the powers and potential of learning. We utilize the phrase public pedagogy to draw attention to the broad implications that conditionalities can have on learning and the creation of the public sphere. Included in this are not just the aspects of loans, and conditions on those loans, directed at the formal avenues of learning, but the subtle structural ramifications that shape the contexts of our everyday lives. This includes the manner in which conditionalities have re-negotiated the conditions of citizenship education for adult education. Also, an increasing concern for adult education in the context of these policies is the increasing emphasis on what Rankin (2001) refers to as a strategy of neoliberal gender reforms. For example, recent public ire at conditionalities, and the negative socio/economic impact that they are having, has caused the IFIs to reconsider their conditionalities and the way they package them. As such, conditionalities are now being packaged by groups like the IMF as so-called flexible credit lines – the local targets of much of the credit boom have been focused on women’s groups.

The nature in which conditionalities interact with formal education projects can often be seen in the explicit policy language of documents and agreements like the appraisals for specific loans. Likewise, researchers such as Samoff & Carroll (2004) have shed light into the nature of formal education and conditionalities – their work examines higher education in Africa. Our focus on public pedagogy is an attempt to link the policy mechanisms of conditionalities to the nature in which people learn informally.

Admittedly, this task is not an easy one. The formal links can be identified through a number of mechanisms such as the trends of policy literature, policy analysis, and interviews with key
stakeholders and government officials. Theorizing the connections to informal curriculum of everyday life proves to be more difficult. As such, we utilize Douglas Porpora’s (1998) framework to explain how conditionalities, as policy structure, interact with our lives. Porpora traces many sociological trends – some of them very subtle – in the ways in which social structures have causal powers. His “conception of social structure as systems of human relationships among social positions,” (p. 343) points to a complex, and sometimes long standing, pattern of activity. For example, he notes that social structures do not operate “over the heads of human actors. Instead, social structure is a nexus of connections among them, causally affecting their actions and in turn causally affected by them” (p. 344). As such, conditionalities can be read as a policy mechanism which mediates relationships as part of a larger system. These relationships, as per Porpora’s concerns, play out over a framework of social positions. As he further elaborates, “the causal effects of the structure on individuals are manifested in certain structured interests, resources, powers, constraints and predicaments that are built into each position by the web of relationships” (p. 344). It is our argument, in part, that these structures can be conceived as very real manifestations of the resources which have causal powers. As with any structure, they do not necessarily perform the function of which they are described. Instead, they generate and restructure social lives. If we interpret conditionalities through such a framework – especially as they relate to broad pedagogical questions – we necessarily query the causal properties of these systems across the historical spectrum of human relationships. To add another complex level is to consider that nation-states also have disparate relationships to the IFIs – some with much more power than others. Put another way, the divergence of the nature of human relationships – Porpora suggests this is exemplified through the classic Marxist example of class – takes on another complex twist when we consider that class, as it relates to profit, can be applied again to wealthy and impoverished countries.

In light of this theoretical basis which posits conditionalities as a policy mechanism involved with the constitution of social structures, we have identified a number of themes which mediate public pedagogy. We suggest that the conditionalities impact public pedagogy in four key ways:

1) Neoliberalization – McDonald and Smith (2004) posit that the World Bank was instrumental in turning South Africa towards neoliberal economic policy in the post-apartheid years. Since the end of apartheid they suggest that, “the country has witnessed a dramatic shift to neo-liberal policies of trade liberalisation, financial deregulation, export-oriented growth, privatisation, full cost recovery and a general rolling-back of the state” (p.1461). They point out that municipal governments are forced to expand their roles on both local and global scales because of the intervention of international companies and organizations.

2) Privatization – The Jubilee Report (2008) reveals the harmful effects that privatization, as a conditionality, has on debtor nations. In Nicaragua, privatization of the electricity caused pricing to rise 200%; in Zambia, IMF conditionalities on the restriction of public spending left it “unable to employ 9,000 desperately needed teachers” (Jubilee Report, 2008, p.3).

3) Financialization – With the push towards neoliberalism there has been a concurrent shift to measure education in terms of how it contributes to the economy. This has been created most profoundly through the introduction of human capital development. For the World Bank, "education deserves," Mundy (2002) notes, "to be seen primarily as an investment, and that
primary education provides a particularly high rate of return when considered in relation to its cost" (p.489).

4) Standardization – Ultimately, conditionalities will be set in accordance with the economic vision for the economic world order – creating, in part, a global public pedagogy. Standardization often crops up in the documents which countries applying for loans or loan extension must submit to the IFI's to show that they are working to satisfy the conditions which have been or will be laid out for them. In the Georgia: Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper Progress Report (IMF Country Report, 2006) the, "harmonization of Georgian education system with the European standards" is noted as well as "preparation of programs for commercialization of science research results and its synchronization with the comparable European programs" (p.26).

Conclusions
While there is a dearth of research about conditionalities, and even fewer examples of how conditionalities influence education, this does not reflect the prevalence and influence which the policy tool leverages. We have attempted to trace some of the ways in which conditionalities influence public pedagogy – a phrase we adopt to refer to the formal and informal processes of learning. While our work points to a number of financialized trends, the consequences of the connections between pedagogy and conditionalities are still being played out.

References


The Production of Neoliberal Subjects through Employment Training Programs: A Comparative Analysis of Workers’ Training Programs in Kolkata and Toronto

Saikat Maitra
University of Texas at Austin
Srabani Maitra
York University

Abstract: Based on Martin Heidegger’s conceptualization of ‘standing-reserve,’ we suggest in this paper that what employment training programs do in the context of neoliberal capitalist production is the creation of an essential quality of human-ness that has to be harnessed, its potentialities tapped and amplified through training. Lying squarely within the ambit of modern governmentality that takes the substratum of life itself as its field of intervention, these programs continually produce affective forms of communicating subjectivities – so that becoming a worker is inherently tied to becoming a subject, whether a citizen-subject or a consumerist subject.

Introduction
In his celebrated essay “The Question Concerning Technology”, Martin Heidegger suggests that “the essence of technology is by no means anything technological” (1977, p.4), but rather such an essence inheres in the “setting-in-order”, “challenging” and “setting upon” of nature as a continuous store of energy and of resources that must be made to yield itself to the technological manipulations of man. Thus, nature becomes in Heidegger’s terminology a ‘standing-reserve’ of technology linked to industrial capitalism which draws its life-blood of resources, forms of energy and vitality from this inexhaustible domain through ordering and extraction. The natural landscape is from this essence of technology, a striated zone of mineral resources, of coal-fields for example, that must be extracted through technological means, converted into energy in order to drive the turbine in a factory and so on. “The setting-upon that challenges forth the energies of nature is an expediting…It expedites in that it unlocks and exposes. Yet that expediting is always itself directed from the beginning toward furthering something else, i.e., toward driving on to the maximum yield at the minimum expense” (Heidegger, 1977, p.15). Gyan Prakash, in his reading of Heidegger’s essay draws attention to the idea of the political, its relations of force that is constitutive in the very understanding and “enframing” of nature as a zone of extraction completely manipulable to various exigencies and hierarchies of power that in the end determines the understanding of nature itself (1999). However, writing in the 20th century, Heidegger cautions us to something else that is enmeshed within this domain of nature that is outside the cultural-technological calculation which must be mastered, controlled and made the ‘standing-reserve’ for interventions. Heidegger (1977) writes, “Only to the extent that man for his part is already challenged to exploit the energies of nature can this ordering revealing [of nature as a field of extraction] happen. If man is challenged, ordered, to do this, then does not man himself belong more originally than nature within the standing-reserve? The current talk about human resources…gives evidence of this” (p.18).
In this moment of contemporary neoliberal capital, how does the human-life become naturalized as a domain of intervention that can be manipulated as resource, or ordered to be on reserve for the extraction of value, is a theme we wish to pursue in this paper. Through comparative perspectives on worker training programs, relating to the emerging organized retail industries of Kolkata in India and the employment training programs for immigrants in Toronto, Canada we focus on how employment training programs seek to implant in would-be workers not any specific set of skills, but a generalizable set of social skills, tendencies and abilities that are potentially present in all human beings. In Kolkata, Saikat as part of his Doctoral research interviewed 5 corporate trainers, 3 retail managers and 40 retail workers (both men and women) who were working in various shopping malls and upscale cafes. Srabani, as part of her SSHRC funded Post-doctoral research interviewed 35 South Asian immigrants (both women and men) who were presently enrolled in or had recently completed employment training programs in Toronto. Interviews were also conducted with 10 key informants such as coordinators, employment counselors and program instructors in various government funded organizations that provide employment related training to immigrants.

Taking up Heidegger’s analogy of how technology ultimately reduces and frames nature as a reserve, for instance, of coal trapping energy that can be transformed into multiple other forms, neoliberal capitalism in the present, increasingly attaches itself to an understanding of life as a circumscribed field for the extraction of value. In such a category of thought, the forms of social life, the vitality inherent in the prospective worker can be drawn on for the purpose of valorization where training programs emphasize the potentiality of human capacities inherent in each worker that needs to be controlled and channelized to achieve particular ends for the purpose of being a productive subject. In this we do not take contemporary capitalism as a chronological form that has supplanted the earlier mode of industrial manufacturing whose primary zone of extraction was nature, as an outside of human life. Rather our argument points to how various co-existing modes of production today from industrial manufacturing to service based industries attach themselves in various degrees to the plane of human life itself where training programs generate as well as modulate this notional quality of social life along particularized networks.

Furthermore, in our comparative emphasis, we do not wish to posit the type of training program we encounter in India or the global South as an earlier, yet to be fully articulated model of capitalist training, that we encounter in the context of developed nations like Canada. The point of this paper is to suggest how training programs are often circulating mediums of subject formation demanded by the imperatives and contingent conditions of capitalist development across the globe. This commonality and circulation of the techniques of subjectivity formation, cutting across national or geographical boundaries, do not mean that older/colonial discourses of gender/ethnic/class or racial hierarchies pertaining to various kinds of bodies or subject positions have been effectively displaced. Through our reading of training program prerogatives, we suggest that the notion of life and its abilities that training programs generate in the context of soft-skill learning in particular, remains heavily influenced by these hierarchies and stereotypical assumptions of desirable/undesirable bodies, forms of socialization and modes of habitation that often are naturalized in the course of training programs.
Production of the Worker-Subject through Training

The Toronto scenario

“You know most of the immigrants who come from third world countries, they do not know the work culture here in Canada. The way they [immigrants] talk or the way they dress... I always tell them it is not going to get them job here. They are no longer in their own country. They need to learn the Canadian way...that is why training is so important.”

This comment, made by an employment counselor of a reputed Government funded organization in Toronto that offers various training programs for immigrants so that they can successfully enter the Canadian labour market, marks the category of the “immigrant” as somehow radically different from the normative ideal of a Canadian citizen. The successful integration of a newly arrived immigrant, especially the immigrant of colour into the Canadian labour market, is indistinguishable from the process of imbibing the normative associations of a Canadian citizen-subject- an induction into Euro-Canadian norms and values. As scholars such as André Gorz (2010) have argued, present forms of capitalist work increasingly revolve around a huge investment of the worker’s intellectual, social and cultural means of belonging such that becoming an worker is often inextricably tied to becoming a subject. This is, however, done not through the more coercive tendencies of inserting the worker body into monotonous routines of industrial or factory type disciplining. Trainers, with their emphasis on the level of ordinary living such as the style of dressing, ways of interaction, modes of greeting or work-place socialization, replicate the gendered and racial assumptions of those who “properly” belong to the normative community of Canadian citizens in order to eradicate certain traits or cultural affiliations of immigrants of colour that stand in their way of assimilation. This reproduction of Canadian identity through modulation of the subjectivity formation of the immigrant worker can operate only by an uncritical naturalization of the forms of citizenship or the ideal subjectivity which anchors this citizenship where contentious issues of racial or cultural difference is from the beginning abrogated (Ong, 1993, 2003). However, if citizenship is one of the ways in which the domain of life becomes integral for the crafting of an worker identity, training programs also inherently relate to qualities which are seen as internal or fundamental characteristics of all human beings, that nevertheless, must be evoked and heightened through training mechanisms. To highlight this function of training we turn to a small ethnographic vignette from Saikat’s fieldwork in a large food-based retail chain in Kolkata for which we will use the pseudonym of Globofood.

The Kolkata scenario

The dimming of the lights raises the anticipation quite a bit, it is the thrill of the theater just before the film flickers on screen. “Perhaps they will show Dabangg”, Joyjit from the Electronics section quips, more as a joke referring to a recent high voltage action film that most of the young workers at Globofood have seen more than once already. Then the screen comes alive, there are 3 short film snippets, rip-offs from the Discovery Channel or something similar. The first one is about a group of mountaineers struggling through icy weather along a cliff-side till one of them slips and starts hurtling down the rock face. It seems a sure death till a couple of his buddies grab hold of him and after some difficulty hauls him up. The second one is a reconstructed battle scene with a group of horsemen charging a much larger phalanx of opposing soldiers. Given the odds in number, the horsemen are initially reluctant to attack till the leader extorts them and leads from the front by galloping along all by himself. Soon the others join him
and victory is achieved. Finally, the third one shows a lone athlete staggering through what looks like the end section of a marathon run. He is all but ready to give up, his close-up face a mix of streaming sweat, exhaustion, gasping breath. But he doesn’t and manages to cross the finish line.

Three events, three compositional scenes, which on the face of it seems to have little to do with what we have been doing for the last two days.

There are 17 of us, 16 floor level employees drawn from various departments of Globofood, the largest food-based retail chain in Kolkata. Plus there is me, the anthropologist with the permission to do my participant observation routine as a regular worker in Globofood’s Customer Service Desk. This is the second day of the Star II program – the more advanced training and up-gradation workshop that Globofood conducts for its floor level employees usually referred to as the CSAs or Customer Service Attendants. Globofood has a slogan for the top three qualities that it determines as crucial for retail work – *All it takes is TLM* – with TLM being the acronym for Team-work, Leadership qualities, Motivation or self-motivation to be more precise. The three clips screened generate visual metaphors for these intangible attributes, creating points of reference to which the trainee workers can come back as a stable set of references. These training programs depict the immediacy of certain tones of emotion, capacities and forms of interaction which effectively constitutes the terrain of work for an organization like Globofood.

Work, therefore, assumes the shape of socialization, of interactive communication, sharing, being able to reach out and whose value is crucially located in the terrain of affect “if affect is defined as the ‘power to act’” (Negri, 1999, p.79). The valorization of work for the extraction of surplus value works therefore, through the continuous intervention on the terrain of life, of a generalized capacity to produce social skills where the main purpose of labour in the context of retail/service spaces is to evoke and communicate to the customer the passion or a taste for consumption (Hardt & Negri, 2000). Each of the elements of team-work, leadership attributes and self-motivation become, therefore, the critical ways of interaction with customers, with other workers and with the environment of the retail space itself for the individual worker to produce the necessary ‘feeling’ of desire that induces the customer to buy. In this interactive paradigm of service labour, the focus of production is not decipherable in terms of the number of commodities produced per unit time, but ultimately production is impossible to separate or mark out from the re-production of the worker as a social individual bringing a host of social skills, communication practices, forms of interaction, local knowledge and so on. Training provides a mode of capturing this social reproduction and channelizing it along particular circuits of what is desirable and what is not.

**Self-production as labour**

In analyzing the training programs geared at socializing individuals to adopt certain soft skills, what was most significant was how through these programs the trainers often manipulated the desires, attachments and anxieties within workers, thereby governing them to internalize the practices deemed necessary to be a productive worker in the neoliberal labour market. In the Canadian context, for example, most of the immigrants interviewed for the project were highly educated with university degrees and professional experiences, who have come to Canada along with their spouses in expectation of an improved quality of life and socio-economic opportunities. However, given the gendered and racialized nature of the labour market that exists in Canada (Reitz, 2004), none of the interviewees could get into a job that was commensurate with their previous educational or professional backgrounds. One of the reasons, therefore, that
the interviewees attended various training workshops, was with the hope of getting into “proper” employment and connecting to the right network to facilitate their labour market entry. It was such feelings of hope coupled with uncertainty about their future prospects that were consistently manipulated throughout the various workshops to subtly regulate the worker subjectivity. Such manipulation was evident in how the trainers created within the immigrant workers a heightening sense of “lack” and an “urgency” to overcome such lack as essential to gaining employment. Pun Ngai, in her ethnographic study of the “dagongmei”, the transformation of rural women migrant workers into “industrial bodies” (p.14) under the post-socialist conditions of state and capitalist forces in China, explains how this practice of constructing workers as deficient, serves the global capitalist interest of creating “willing” labour. As the workers start to internalize their past lives and identities as deficient and incomplete, they end up conforming to self-subjectivization. They do so because they want to overcome their “lack”, and want to successfully integrate “into the collective will of the hegemonic construct” (Pun, 2005, p.114) so that they are not discriminated against. Such transformation, therefore, involves the dual process of displacement and replacement that produces anxiety, uncertainty, and pain for individuals in their daily struggles, and drives them towards a self-technologizing project, helping to accomplish a hegemonic construct” (Pun, 2005, p.132). In case of the South Asian immigrants interviewed for the project, such discourse of ‘lack” or “deficiency” was hinted at by many trainers who consistently pointed out the necessity for immigrants to learn the socio-cultural norms of the Canadian labour market in order to be successfully employed. In the various training and information they received, rather than emphasizing immigrants’ present skills, customs or values, agency trainers consistently pointed out the need to be “Canadian” in order to be employed successfully. As part of this Canadianness, most agencies emphasized bodily deportments and presentability as the key to preparing oneself for the job market.

Such training and modifications, therefore, are also instrumental in controlling the “affect” or the “conscious subjective aspect of feeling and emotion” (Foucault, 1978). Workers, however, are not forced to adopt such techniques of self-management but are “encouraged” to adopt certain normative and hegemonic practices (Foucault, 2008) in the name of soft-skill training. The drive to self-fashion their personas, means of socialization and subjectivities are not achieved by any overt disciplining or coercive means, rather the motivation to attain a particular worker-identity is made desirable so that the individual worker actively incorporates the ideals disseminated during training programs. For most organized retail workers in Kolkata coming from often very under-privileged backgrounds, desirability is evoked by highlighting during training the ways of attaining a proximity to global cosmopolitan life-styles that work makes possible for the employees. By repeating the need for cleanliness, regular practices of hygiene including the use of deodorants or hand-soaps, the focus on a deportment that characterizes the workers as part of a larger corporate identity, training programs seek to bring to the workers self-voraziation of their subjectivities based on their relationship to work. It is the everyday practices of work, how they speak, interact with customers or colleagues, inculcate habits of consumption like possession of cell-phones and so on that generate the intimacy of a class mobility that otherwise in more economic terms remain completely blocked for them. It is this luminal zone of performing certain traits of a more upwardly mobile class while remaining effectively denied from it that constitutes the basis of desire for these workers that training programs seek to manipulate and heighten.
Conclusion
Training programs thus mobilize fluid paradigms of race or class identities that are shown to be normative and desirable. Moreover, the workers are invited to strive for such identities and the capacities they connote as these capacities are supposed to be present within the very natural tendencies of the workers themselves. Success or failure is not only naturalized but shown to be completely within the individual ability of the workers rather than locatable in anything outside of their bodies or subjectivities. What the emphasis on individual life as a standing-reserve enables is the understanding of the individual as an enterprise, as a potential node of profit, value and development that every individual carries within her/himself and which training tries to reveal more powerfully. In this notion of the individual as an enterprise, what is lost are the actual structural impediments that block the workers’ integration into the labour market which is shown to be completely unbiased and based entirely on enterprise, skill and ability to compete. The virtual potentialities of life that training programs make immediately possible erase out the very real problems of race and class (to mention just two of the myriad nodes of structural discrimination) that increasingly inhabit the neoliberal global market today.

Bibliography


Interdisciplinary Learning and Collaboration within a Group of Adult Researchers: An Instrumental Case Study

Angus McMurtry, Assistant Professor
Chatalle Clarkin, PhD Student
Francis Bangou, Assistant Professor
Emmanuel Duplaa, Assistant Professor
Colla MacDonald, Professor
Nicholas Ng-A-Fook, Associate Professor
David Trumpower, Assistant Professor
University of Ottawa

Abstract: This paper examines the growth, development and dissolution of an educational research group as a case study of interdisciplinary collaboration. Data in the form of written participant reflections, as well as documentation of group activities and meetings, is interpreted through the lens of existing literature on interdisciplinarity. A number of themes arose from this research which may be of use to those considering similar interdisciplinary initiatives.

Introduction and Purpose
In recent years, many universities and granting agencies in Canada have placed greater emphasis on collaborative interdisciplinary research among faculty members. However, what it means for research to be interdisciplinary, and the factors that enable or constrain interdisciplinary learning and collaboration, remain poorly understood (Ostreng, 2010; Repko, 2008).

To contribute to a better understanding of these issues, this case study examines the experiences of an interdisciplinary research group established in the Faculty of Education at a large Canadian University. This group has, for the most part, failed to accomplish its goal of mutual learning and research collaboration. This paper explores the ‘lessons learned’ and how they link to existing literature on interdisciplinarity.

Context and Research Design
In 2007, the authors of this paper (except Clarkin) accepted an invitation from the dean of their faculty to participate a collaborative research group. Expertise within this bilingual group ranged widely, encompassing distance education, electronic portfolios, interdisciplinary theory, curriculum studies, educational assessment and evaluation, math and science education, history education, health education, and social-cultural learning theories. The group’s aim was to bring this varied disciplinary expertise to bear upon two related subject areas: Emerging technologies and interdisciplinary education. The group eventually became known as NETIE (Network for Emerging Technologies and Interdisciplinary Education).

Besides its innovative research objectives—which combined many of the foci listed above—NETIE had a career-related objective. Most of its members were new, untenured professors. Joining the group was seen as a way to facilitate access to leading-edge research projects, applications for funding and publications.
One of NETIE’s concrete research goals—and the focus of this paper—was to study of its own emergence as an interdisciplinary research collective. Instrumental case study was chosen as an appropriate design, since the group’s aim was to make use of multiple perspectives to construct a deep and holistic understanding of a complex social phenomenon, and to thereby provide insight into a wider issue—in this case interdisciplinary collaboration (Denzin & Lincoln, 2003; Yin, 2009).

Data on the authors’/participants’ experiences was collected in multiple ways. The primary sources were a series of semi-structured, open-ended written reflexive responses collected at three points in time: At the group’s formation, at the midpoint of active collaboration, and one year following the group’s dissolution. The first two rounds of participant responses were made available for all to read and discuss. The purpose of the third and final round was for participants to review, critique and elaborate on preliminary themes identified during the thematic analysis of the first two rounds.

Other data sources included NETIE meeting minutes and joint grant proposals. These documents were studied for a few reasons. First, they provided insight into plans, timelines and progress made by the group during the time it was active. Second, they were reviewed for signs of emerging collaborations. Third, the documents served to triangulate data collected from the participants’ reflexive responses.

All data was analyzed using constant comparison to identify themes and patterns related to two main issues: 1) Whether or not interdisciplinary collaboration truly occurred, and 2) The factors that enabled or constrained such collaboration. To reduce bias, the analysis was carried out by a researcher (Clarkin) who was not a NETIE member.

**Theoretical Framework**

Analysis of the data was framed by existing theoretical and empirical literature on interdisciplinary learning, research and collaboration. Not surprisingly, this literature comes from a wide range of sources, including work associated with the Association for Integrative Studies (Repko, 2008), European Transdisciplinarity (Østreng, 2010), Team Science writings (Stokals, 2008), and the rapidly growing field of interprofessional education (Journal of Interprofessional Care), as well as other influential interdisciplinary thinkers such as Klein (2005) and Petrie (1976).

**Whether or Not Interdisciplinary Collaboration Truly Occurred**

Interdisciplinary approaches are most often necessitated by complex, ‘real world’ problems that cannot be reduced to a single dimension or disciplinary perspective (Newell, 2001). While individual disciplines may contribute theories and methods suitable to a specific portion of reality, their narrowness may threaten exploration, invention and breadth (Lattuca, 2002). Interdisciplinary research is thus a necessary consequence of, and compliment to, disciplinary specialization. It attempts not only to juxtapose differing disciplinary perspectives (mere multidisciplinarity) but also to integrate them into larger, more encompassing perspectives (Klein & Newell, 1997).

---

16 See [http://www.units.muohio.edu/aisorg/](http://www.units.muohio.edu/aisorg/)
What makes interdisciplinarity challenging is that disciplines’ theories and methods often conflict or are incommensurable (Schon & Rein, 1994). As Petrie (1976) writes, “[q]uite literally, two opposing disciplinarians can look at the same thing and not see the same thing” (p. 11). Further, one cannot—and should not—attempt to avoid or eliminate these differences, tensions or conflicts, as “[t]hey are part of the character of interdisciplinary knowledge negotiation” (Klein, 2005, p. 45).

Interdisciplinarity therefore involves the integration of often incommensurable disciplinary insights (concerning a specific issue) into a coherent whole, through an overarching concept, theme or metaphor (Newell, 2001). For example, the concept of ‘patient-centred care’ has been used to integrate the diverse biological, psychological, social and ecological factors relevant to human healthcare.

What this sort of integration actually ‘looks like’ within collaborative groups is not as well covered in the literature (Franks et al., 2007). Many authors, however, have argued that it occurs when disciplinary viewpoints come together and interact in such a way that ‘the sum is greater than the parts’ (Drinka & Clarke, 2000; Newell, 2001).

More concretely, this means that group members elicit, build on and challenge one another’s ideas over time. As they do so, they produce new collective knowledge that exceeds the sum of what they knew previously as individuals—knowledge that could not have been predicted in advance of their collaboration. And this collective knowledge is embodied in the academic papers, action plans, group practices, processes, inventions and so on that the group produces (McMurtry, 2010; 2011).

**Factors that Enable or Constrain Interdisciplinary Collaboration**

The factors that either enable or constrain collaboration—in accordance with the most recent and sophisticated writings on interdisciplinarity—are divided into multiple levels, from smaller scale personal and interpersonal factors, to larger scale institutional and epistemological issues (Stokals, 2008).

Personal factors that influence collaboration include the breadth of group members’ interests; disciplinary competence combined with a recognition of its limits; a feeling of power, accomplishment and commitment; intellectual openness and flexibility; and trust and respect for teammates with differing perspectives. Interpersonal or group level factors include communication, a balance between diversity (or specialization) and common ground, and the presence of structures such as rules for resolving conflict (Drinka & Clark, 2000; Kessel & Rosenfield, 2008; Petrie, 1976; Schon & Rein, 1994).

Several additional concerns arise at the intuitional level. In universities, disciplinarity refers not only to the organization of knowledge, but also (and perhaps even more strongly) to the “political institutions that demarcate areas of academic territory, allocate privilege and responsibilities of expertise, and structure claims on resources” (Lenoir, 1993, p. 82, italics in original).

One consequence of this situation is that criteria for promotion and tenure typically favour narrow disciplinarity and are “manifestly inequitable” when applied interdisciplinary scholarship (Pfirman et
al., 2008, p. 6). Second, interdisciplinarity tends to threaten disciplinary hierarchies and other established power structures (Henry, 2005). As a consequence, interdisciplinary activities are often avoided, disrespected or repressed within the academy (Sumner, 2003).

To mitigate these barriers, authors emphasize the need for institutional recognition and support for interdisciplinary activities (Petrie, 1976). This need is especially urgent where faculty are employed within a single, traditional faculty or department (Klein & Newell, 1997).

Finally, interdisciplinary collaboration is affected by epistemology. As we saw above, disciplinary perspectives are often incommensurable or in conflict. Genuine interdisciplinary research attempts not to minimize or ignore these differences, but rather to recognize, harness the power of, and negotiate among them—with a view toward integrating them into a larger, more encompassing perspective.

A number of enabling factors for epistemic integration have been identified. The first is some sort of conceptual framework (Kessel & Rosenfield, 2008). Another is having practical, ‘how-to’ models for integration; these models typically include steps like defining a question, determining relevant disciplines, negotiating roles, identifying conflicts, creating common ground, and so on. Several researchers linked to the Association for Integrative Studies have proposed and tested such ‘how-to’ models (see, for example, Szostak, 2002).

Perhaps the most important epistemic factor is having a specific, concrete focus (Franks et al., 2007; Petrie, 1976). As Schon & Rein (1994) write, it is difficult to imagine how, from a purely intellectual point of view, disciplinary conflicts could ever be resolved; but in the “fruitful mire” of situated practice, people do find ways to get things done (p. 176). Researchers must immerse themselves in concrete problems and find ways to both articulate and integrate their differing—and frequently discomforting—disciplinary perspectives. As Petrie (1976) warns, interdisciplinarians must avoid the temptation to retreat to pleasant and uncontroversial topics:

Failing to realize the significant differences in cognitive maps and yet faced with the necessity for communicating with each other on some level or other, the participants retreat to the level of common sense which is shared by all. But ipso facto, such a level cannot make use of the more powerful insights of the disciplines. (p. 12)

**Findings**

As described above, this study sought to address two specific issues related to NETIE: 1) Whether or not interdisciplinary collaboration truly occurred, and 2) The factors that enabled or constrained such collaboration. Data analysis was framed by existing literature on interdisciplinarity. Statements or other evidence that exceeded or disconfirmed these categories were also sought. Five major themes emerged from the analysis; representative quotes, drawn from across the various participants, are used to illustrate each.

**Balancing Disciplinary Diversity with Common Group Identity, Mission and Other Structures**

NETIE participants perceived a great deal of diversity in disciplinary expertise and experience within their group. For instance, one wrote,

Certainly having statisticians, programmers and bilingual educators on the team will lead to times and opportunities where our strengths will complement each
other and it will be beneficial to collaborate on various research grants and projects. However, many also noted the lack of sufficient common ground in terms of research interests, identity and mission:

- I think that our group has a lot to offer in terms of prospective projects together. But we need to find a way to effectively harness our expertise, and I guess, commit to working with one another.

- So far, our ideas and plans for NETIE are very vague and diverse. Although our mission statement and this [reflective response] may help, we are still a long way from having a unified vision and plan for implementing it.

Many participants would have liked more common group structures, but differed widely on the sorts of structures they sought. Suggestions included regular meetings, common readings, a methodical approach to group tasks, and a model for understanding how collaboration should take place (everyone contributes to every project vs. people form smaller sub-groups for specific projects). One participant summed up the various concerns related to this theme:

- [T]he largest challenge is for us to find our space of comfort where we can grow as a group…However, the diversity of our domains of expertise, epistemologies, discourses, life experiences, personalities, careers, and interests make me feel that at times we speak different languages…

**Attitudes and Relationships, Including Respect and Mutual Learning**

NETIE participants’ spoken and written statements, as well as their previous research and experiences, showed flexibility and openness to interdisciplinary collaboration.

- I am hoping to get back into collaboration around the use of emerging technologies in education…and network with people involved in interdisciplinary research and education…I am impressed with the credentials of those involved in NETIE.

- Because my area of research is not educational technology, [NETIE] can provide much needed expertise…a venue to discuss my research and obtain feedback…good advertising in order to attract contracts and collaborative opportunities.

While one participant commented on how another’s deep experience with educational technology had influenced his own pedagogy and research, there was little other evidence of disciplinary interaction or influence. Participants did not build significantly on one another’s contributions. “Re interaction or mutual influence in ideas, I think there was very little,” said one. This finding is supported by the fact that NETIE no longer meets and has no active research projects or successful grant applications or publications (with the exception of the current paper).

A number of participants attributed this lack of intellectual interaction to institutional factors. These included a lack of faculty support for proposed NETIE initiatives and the pressure on young professors to publish in their disciplinary specialty (these institutional and career-related concerns are deal with more fully below).
Two noted that, in spite of participants’ apparent openness, the challenges and discomfort posed by different interests, theory and methodologies presented a significant barrier to collaboration: “the diversity, and what could have become an asset...also made it more difficult”; “people don’t always really want to bring in other theory perspectives, because it complicates things for them (work-wise and thinking-wise)”.

Tangible Progress, Concrete Focus and ‘Organic’ vs. ‘Mandated’ Collaboration
Virtually all NETIE participants expressed frustration at the lack of tangible progress on group tasks. As one wrote,

I think the biggest challenge/problem facing NETIE is getting started with concrete activities. We have been spending lots of time ‘getting to know each other’, trying to find the perfect project in which all or most all of the NETIE members have an interest, and coming up with a unanimous vision...My fear is that we are getting bogged down and not accomplishing anything. After a year, we don’t have a website. We haven’t begun a regularly scheduled, formal series of research presentations...And, to my knowledge, we haven’t yet taken advantage of each other’s expertise.

While some echoed this call for a concrete research project to drive collaboration, others felt it was more important to first learn more about one another and come to an accord on ideas and research goals:

[C]’était peut-être une erreur, d’aller tout de suite au concret, sans être d’accord dans les idées et les objets de recherche communs. La société utilitariste nous pousse aux choses concrètes, mais il vaut mieux réfléchir avant.

Some participants came to believe that interdisciplinary collaborations cannot be ‘mandated’, but rather must emerge organically from the shared interests of two or more researchers. Others pointed out that while everyone was invited by the dean to join the group, no one was compelled to do so; indeed, everyone originally joined based on perceived shared interests. One participant reflected that mandating interdisciplinary collaboration may not always be a bad idea, since people will otherwise tend to avoid collaborating with those who have significantly different perspectives.

Career, Institutional Demands and Commitment
NETIE participants—most of whom were new, untenured professors—were reluctant to commit to projects, due to concerns about whether their efforts would produce tangible academic results that would advance their career.

One problem of any committee is getting members to participate. This is especially true when members are under pressure to publish and obtain grants in order to get tenured... in order to have members make NETIE a priority it will need to contribute to improve their curriculum vitae with regard to obtaining grants and publishing...

A related concern had to do with specialization. Many participants were unsure whether NETIE’s interdisciplinary projects would be recognized as relating to their official concentration.
[T]hat was a question I had; how could I use this for my CV?...I had to always make a point of having my area integrated into the plans and projects. It was something I had to be vocal about.

I think this comes down to the institutional demands for us to publish within our individual fields of study.

There concerns were linked with to two other perceptions: One, that there was insufficient collective commitment or investment in NETIE; and two, that individuals’ contributions (efforts or disciplinary perspectives) were not being sufficiently recognized.

Because we all have different agendas, and priorities, I haven’t felt a sense of true collective investment in the project and I think that might be one of the biggest challenges in the future.

I would argue that my ‘disciplinary’ perspective…was something that people were generally friendly and open about, but there was not a great deal of ‘follow through’

*Expertise and Training in Interdisciplinarity*

One final theme only emerged once NETIE had dissolved and participants had a chance to reflect on previous comments. Several observed that it might have been valuable to consider previous “training in terms of working on interdisciplinary teams within a research setting.” As one concluded, “interdisciplinarity is like a discipline in itself. It does not happen simply because people with differing expertises get together. Integrating perspectives is difficult!”

*Implications for Adult Education Theory and Practice*

Interdisciplinary collaboration is being increasingly promoted in many Canadian universities, as well as in workplaces like hospitals and community clinics (Nolte & Tremblay, 2005). Such collaborations demand significant effort and learning on the part of the adult professionals who work in these settings. There remain, however, relatively few empirical studies on interdisciplinary collaboration, especially within social science settings like an education faculty. Even rarer are studies where failure is both acknowledged and seen as an opportunity for learning. The rich and detailed literature review and findings provided by this case study will therefore provide valuable guidance to those in education and elsewhere contemplating interdisciplinary learning and collaboration among adult professionals.

*References*


Learning Old Jobs in New Sectors:  
The Professionalization of Housekeeping Services

Kiran Mirchandani  
University of Toronto  
Sanjukta Mukherjee  
DePaul University  
Shruti Tambe  
University of Pune

Abstract: This paper reports on fieldwork conducted in 2010-2011 on the housekeeping sector in India. Women and men employed in this sector have traditionally occupied informal, stigmatized, and poorly paid jobs. The demands of transnational software firms and call centers have dramatically altered this sector, since these firms profess to hold completely different (and explicitly "Western") approaches to cleanliness. Firms market themselves on the basis of the clean, well-maintained work environments they provide. Maintaining such environments are said to require housekeepers with a “more professional” orientation to their work.

Service Workers in the Global Technology Firms

Neeta leaves her home every morning for her twelve hour shift at 6.30 a.m. She walks for 20 minutes to get to work. She is proud to be gainfully employed although she complains that in spite of the Equal Pay for Equal Work Act she is paid Rs.700 less than her male colleagues. She has heard that she is entitled to receive employer contributions to her provident fund (pension), but does not know whether she has a P.F. account. She does not raise these issues as she notes that, “there should not be any complaint about your work... this is the most important thing about my job.” Neeta, like other housekeepers working in transnational corporations, which have mushroomed in India, occupies the ambivalent position of privilege and precarity as her occupation is professionalized. Neeta’s on-the-job learning involves not only understanding the tasks she is required to complete but also requires that she makes sense of the social norms which traditionally characterize the caste-bound, low status and informal housekeeping sector in India.

In recent years, service work has become "tridable across international borders" (Van den Broek, 2004:59), operationalized through the growth of software firms and call centres across the world. There has been significant media, policy and academic interest in the global service economy and its workers. As Sassen notes, however, constructions of the global economy in terms of enabling technologies or transnational organizational structures mask "the actual material processes, activities, and infrastructure crucial to the implementation of globalization" (2002:2). In line with this, the primary objective of this paper is to explore the work experiences of auxiliary workers (specifically housekeepers) who scaffold the transnational information technology (IT) industry in India. Auxiliary workers are those who provide transport, cleaning and domestic services to support the workers engaged in relatively higher skilled, high tech, transnational service work. Unlike the increased visibility and veneration of the IT professionals and their contribution to India’s economic success, to date, there has been no research on these lower level workers who support the high tech professionals, and little is known on how they
access their jobs, how class, caste, gender and ethnicity structure their lives, and how new subcontracting regimes heralded by neoliberal globalization affect their work and life. Without in-depth knowledge of this key group of workers, the articulation of neo-liberal capitalism in its informational mode would be incomplete. Also, without knowledge about how reformulations of labour practices are integral to transnational service industry, understanding of the impact of the growth of transnational services sector in India, and globally, remains partial.

IT related outsourcing has been celebrated by governments, global companies and the media as providing the opportunity to 'leapfrog' India into a post-industrial service economy and resolve the problem of widespread unemployment" (Vasavi, 2008). The former Prime Minister Atal Bihari Vajpayee has remarked, for example, that ‘IT has... given us a developmental tool powerful enough to banish poverty and backwardness, and to make India a land of opportunities for all...’ (Mukherjee 2009). Some economists have predicted that the growth of the IT sector "creates indirect employment opportunities for the less skilled and less educated" (Chanda, 2005:6). However there is little systematic knowledge on the everyday lived experiences of these less skilled workers.

This paper reports on fieldwork conducted in 2010-2011 on the housekeeping sector in India. Women and men in this sector have traditionally occupied informal, poorly paid jobs. The demands of transnational software firms and call centers have dramatically altered this sector, since these firms profess to hold completely different (and explicitly “Western”) approaches to hygiene and cleanliness. Firms market their workplaces on the basis of the clean, well-maintained environments they provide. Maintaining such sanitized environments are said to require housekeepers with a “more professional” orientation to their work.

As a result of this trend, housekeeping activities and their management has emerged as a complex web of subcontracting relationships. In some cases, large, transnational cleaning firms have emerged, (or European/ American firms have expanded their business in India). These firms bid for cleaning contracts at multi-national companies in India and recruit and train workers, either directly or through smaller subcontractors. Many subcontractors have emerged within India and these subcontractors in turn hire local workers and train them to adhere to specific organizational requirements of the hi-tech sector. In some cases, local firms have redesigned their systems to meet the requirements of transnational firms; these firms too often have multiple subcontractors. In many cases, contractors or subcontractors have complex relationships with regional political candidates or with builders. In an attempt to map these relationships, interviews were conducted with subcontractors as well as front-line housekeepers. The aim of our project is to trace the impact of the growing professionalization of jobs on workers’ daily lives and working conditions.

IT spaces are notable for their high levels of cleanliness and extremely ordered physical environments with western architectural designs and related choices. Most software parks and high-tech parks are highly guarded and spruced up spaces. These workspaces are considered ‘posh’—suggesting these are dust free, full of light, and completely air conditioned. Workstations and washrooms are in pristine condition, as are the recreational spaces. Cleaning staff are required to present themselves as “professionals”—uniformed (in case of cleaning staff), well groomed and disciplined. These new hi-tech spaces have thus introduced new standards of
hygiene and cleanliness as well as created the demand for a new kind of “professional” housekeeper. Housekeeping occurs round the clock with modern cleaning tools and supplies to uphold these new standards of cleanliness. Aguiar and Herod (2006) note that cleaners inhabit a contradictory position in the global economy - traditionally small and informal cleaning companies have been replaced by "professionalized" cleaning service firms, which subcontract services to large companies. Yet, these subcontracted firms still maintain some of the inequities long associated with this kind of cleaning work structured by specific class, caste, gender and other power hierarchies. This paper also shows that ‘local’, ‘informal’ companies are re-incarnating themselves as ‘professional’ firms and existing large firms are expanding their business activities in new locations. In particular, we examine the impact of this trend on workers’ lives through interviews with company facility managers, subcontractors, trainers and workers.

Methodologically, this project brings together the qualitative traditions of institutional ethnography and life history analysis. There will be three sources of data being collected for this project: interviews with workers (housekeepers), interviews with key informants (policy makers, subcontractors, union representatives and worker advocates) and analysis of documents (laws and organizations policies). All three forms of data are being collected simultaneously although the focus of analysis is different for each. The analysis of the interviews with workers focuses on identifying the “ruling relations” which structure workers’ personal and work experiences, that is the key organizations and policies which determine the nature of their work and the challenges they face and how their personal lives are also structured by these organizations and policies. Interviews with key informants serve to provide context, history and understandings of the structure of employment (such as subcontracting arrangements) which characterize the jobs of workers in India’s new economy. The analysis of policy focuses on the regulatory regimes within which workers’ jobs exist and highlight how neo-liberalism has reshaped labour policies.

Caste and Professionalization in the Housekeeping Sector in Pune City

Sonia (a pseudonym) has been employed as a cleaner at a large IT company in Pune for the past year and a half. She migrated from Mumbai with her husband and four children in search of work. Her contract is with a subcontractor and she got her job through a friend who was already employed as a cleaner with the company. She works from 7am-7pm and earns Rs 5,800 per month which is Rs 800 more than the legislated minimum wage. Although she would not have generally considered cleaning work due to the negative caste associations with this work, she says that she does not think of the job as “shameful” and feels she has to do it to ensure a better future for her children. Using her income, they are able to pay school fees. She has not informed her in-laws or neighbors about the exact nature of her work. Her training was hands on, where she was taught by the supervisor how to use the chemicals, brooms and mops.

Pune is a medium sized Indian city and emerged as a major industrial centre in the 1960s. Automobile, chemical and engineering manufacturing activity dominated this period alongside a booming allied small scale industry. Major Indian and international players started their plants in Pune. This attracted migrant skilled and unskilled workers from across India. Despite this period of economic change, the Indian caste system continued to regulate and define occupational choice. The lowest caste groups have historically been relegated to stigmatized occupations, such
as cleaning. Not only have certain occupations been historically considered low status and undesirable but the people practicing these occupations have been treated with condemnation. Even today the relationship of caste and occupations continues. Caste and class overlap, compelling certain people to work in the same professions as their predecessors. This explains why in the present study we found that many of the frontline housekeepers were from ‘Dalit’ or other so-called lower castes. Cleaning also has a gender dimension given women’s assumed natural inclination towards housekeeping. Housekeeping jobs are considered appropriate for women.

In the past decade, India has seen the revamping and unprecedented expansion of the housekeeping sector. Traditionally, cleaning jobs were performed by small contractors who in turn hired workers from the lowest caste for jobs, which were widely recognized as least desirable and most stigmatized. With the IT boom since the early 2000s, multinational full service property management firms have emerged (such as Property Solutions India Private Limited). They offer a comprehensive range of services. Many IT companies hire such large corporations to take care of all their cleaning and property maintenance needs. They sign a “service contract” annually. Companies provide building repairs, solve electrical problems as well as provide what is referred to as “soft services” such as housekeeping. Company marketing brochures depict uniformed, gloved women and men cleaning with modern and “glamorous” cleaning equipment like vacuum cleaners and as using latest chemicals as solutions. This depiction of housekeeping exists alongside the stigma associated with cleaning work and the low caste people who perform them. As a result, recruitment companies often have scouts placed in poor rural areas from where they recruit people offering them jobs and in some cases housing in the city. One company, for example, notes that they specifically target areas where rural poverty is high and then provide workers with incentives to migrate to cities like provision of food and dormitories.

There are interesting contradictions in this trend given the history of caste politics in India. As mentioned earlier, lower caste people have traditionally considered suitable for cleaning jobs, which are less desired by the higher caste and class workers. The nature of the “dirty” work allocated, performed and embodied by these marginalized groups historically worked to stigmatize them and perpetuate hierarchies that maintained the hegemony of higher castes in India. However, now given the demands of the new hi-tech economy these lower caste workers are being actively recruited from both urban and rural areas. This raises several questions - Does working in this new “modern” hi-tech sector strip these workers off old stigmas based on caste? Communities and peoples considered “dirty”, “unclean”, “untouchable” are now finding employment in IT firms, symbolized by high standards of cleanliness and hygiene. Is this pattern of recruitment altering caste structure in India or is it reproducing it? Similarly are these firms reproducing gendered practices of labour recruitment or are they contributing to the alteration of these?

Our interviews have revealed that although large housekeeping firms are recruiting lower caste, and rural workers, they believe they have to be “made appropriate” for work at urban, transnational corporations. Companies provide training, which consists of making workers, as one recruiter said, “feel positively” both about the job they do as well as themselves as “professional” workers in the hi-tech workplace. Not only do the firms have new standards for
cleanliness of the office space but the workers themselves have to embody these standards in the manner in which they are dressed and groomed. This involves being clean shaven, wearing a cap, having a clean uniform, making sure nails are short, teeth are clean (not stained by betel leaf/tobacco, as one recruiter emphasized) and posture is correct, general stance is ‘pleasing’ and submissive. Workers are expected to move beyond their own caste-based stigmas that have been historically associated with cleaning jobs. Workers also have training on the “angle” at which a mop should be held for maximizing cleaning, dilution ratios for chemicals, and so on. Standardization and performance measurement pervades this industry. Does this reflect a certain specific kind of “disciplining” of the workforce?

Recruiters promise regular salaries at the legislated minimum wage. Another factor luring the poor to join this sector is the supposed promise of rightful access to Provident Fund (pension) and subsidized medical services. Despite these promises, many of the workers we interviewed did not have access to these legally sanctioned benefits. Many transnational firms believe that workers are paid wages and benefits according to labour law, many workers do not read and write, hold pension or bank accounts. Many subcontractors construct their workers as independent operators rather than employees. Due to casualisation and subcontracting, these housekeepers do not fit the legal definitions of ‘workers’ and hence are deprived of all possible legal protection. To reduce attrition rates and control demands for pay hikes, employers treat pension (P.F.) cards as benefits provided to loyal and hardworking workers only. In other words there is a double standard in the proliferation of transnational business norms - the ‘international standards’ apply at the level of disciplining the workers, but do not help ensure social security benefits.

Nevertheless, the clean pristine work environment of prestigious IT firms, wearing of uniforms, acquiring new “western” cleaning skills, working with modern electronic cleaning gadgets and supplies has also brought with it a new sense of pride and sense of achievement to the housekeepers. “Who doesn’t want to work in a nice office?” remarked one of the recruiters. Most of the housekeepers interviewed so far have few other employment options. Most of the housekeepers are young, belong to dalit or other backward castes, and come from rural area.

The professionalization of housekeeping services therefore brings several tangible advantages for workers. No longer constructed as “outcast” jobs, cleaning has been discursively resituated as a key organizational function, which demands efficient and standardized management styles. Transnational corporations with financial means and an interest in maintaining the formality of their employment arrangements implement “contracts” which are written to meet the requirements of labour law. Cleaning staff sometimes use the same washrooms as office staff, and eat in the same canteens which, is not common for workers historically employed in cleaning and domestic service work in India (Ray and Qayum, 2009). In fact, this particular aspect, that is who one eats with in a communal space have historically been a key marker of caste hierarchy in India. While challenging social hierarchies, some workers noted that eating alongside company employees sometimes translated into considerably higher food costs for them.

Despite rigid management processes, a degree of work informality pervades the sector, and in fact, is further masked behind the veneer of professional work. Workers feel as though they are benefactors of and dependent on subcontractor goodwill rather than treated as “formal” wage
Informal hierarchies of work structured by caste and gender stereotypes continue to pervade the work. Workers receive training on “tools” and “machines” which do not recognize long standing patriarchal norms that have historically feminized these jobs due to women’s gendered and racialized responsibilities for household and childcare work. Often men are preferred over women for night shifts (given that companies operate round the clock and they do not want to compromise women’s perceived domestic responsibilities and safety). There is also evidence that women are paid less than men. It is impossible for workers to receive a clear breakdown of deductions. At the same time, women such as Sonia earn approximately the same amount as their husbands and they as a result exert some influence over household decisions and childrens’ futures. Workers individually manage the “shame” associated with cleaning work, and hide, rather than express pride in the nature of their work. In these ways, workers experience the growing professionalization of cleaning work as posing new opportunities as well as new challenges. In case of men many stated that they would work as housekeepers only till they get married and then choose to work as ‘security guards’. Certain notions of masculinity and caste pride thus play an important role in shaping decisions related to occupational choices and generally affect attrition rates and so on.

Conclusions
Overall, this paper presents some of our initial findings from a project which serves to document the learning and training which service workers employed in poorly paid, routinized jobs undergo with the growing professionalization and formalization of their work. Based on an analysis of ILO data, Poster summarizes that "most new jobs within the formal sector around the world are in services... these jobs involve doing something for people rather than making things" (2007:63). Despite this overall growth in the services sector, there is a significant difference between well paid knowledge/information jobs and jobs which Ritzer describes as defined by "nothingness" (that is, poorly paid, highly routinized and allowing little worker discretion) (Ritzer and Lair, 2008). Moreover it also appears from our initial findings that this sector while characterized by new kind of “professionalization” continues to maintain gender, class, and caste based hierarchies historically tied to the informal sector. Additionally as the contributions from the informalised, casualised workforce are unacknowledged they are most of the times not taken as ‘workers’ at all, taking away the pride of meaningful work and the identity as a worker disenfranchising them from claiming labour rights under the existing legal regime affecting their personal and social life. This paper provides fresh insight into debates around neoliberalism and the changing nature of service work. As Sassen argues, "insufficient attention has been paid to the actual array of jobs, from high paying to low paying... services need to be produced, and the buildings that hold the workers need to be built and cleaned” (2002:5-6). The celebratory narratives of India’s high tech boom and economic growth in recent years has foregrounded the highly skilled, highly paid, mobile middleclass IT professionals. The auxiliary workers on whom these IT professionals depend, like housekeepers, are hardly visible and their labor continues to be devalued and poorly paid. Fernandez (2004) terms this omission a "politics of forgetting" whereby the middle class is considered the sanitized, purified visual embodiment of globalization and the impact of economic restructuring on marginalized groups is masked.
References


Learning and Identity (de)construction: the case of refugees

Linda Morrice
University of Sussex, UK

Introduction
This paper considers the learning and identity processes involved as refugees make the transition to life in the UK. It draws on empirical research conducted between 2005 and 2010 at the University of Sussex on the South coast of England. The research combined a longitudinal study with a life history approach to explore refugee narratives both before and after migration. In total fourteen refugees of mixed nationality were interviewed over a four year period. Participants were recruited from a University of Sussex course which was designed specifically to support refugees who wished to access higher education (Morrice 2009). Initial interviews usually took place within a year of arrival in the UK and were conducted every six to nine months thereafter. Interviews were transcribed and analysed thematically in line with the conventions of life history research (Plummer 2001; Yow 2005). The broad aim of the research was to explore the learning and identity processes which accompany transition, and secondly to understand how individual biography shapes and informs the strategies adopted by refugees in the UK (Morrice 2011).

Learning and migration
For refugees the movement across social spaces are moments of intense learning as they have to modify the structure and the meaning of their lives as adults and adapt to the new social world. Uprooted from former communities, culture, work and language they are stripped of aspects of their previous identity. The process of migration disrupts the inherited frames of reference and the accumulated biographical repertoire of knowledge and understanding as they are forced to learn new behaviours, understand new rules and to adapt to new values and another type of social organisation. Becoming a refugee is therefore a source of deep learning as they confront unexpected changes in their life plans and the need to reshape their lives and reconstruct their identities.

Taylor (1994) points to the lack of research which brings a learning perspective to bear on the adaptive processes which immigrants undergo as they make the transition to living in a new cultural context. He suggests that Mezirow’s theory of transformative learning provides a useful model for understanding the development of intercultural competence and identifies three dimensions which link the two sets of literature. Mezirow defines transformative learning as:

…the process by which we transform our taken-for-granted frames of reference (meaning perspectives, habits of mind, mind-sets) to make them more inclusive, discriminating, open, emotionally capable of change, and reflective so that they may generate beliefs and opinions that will prove more true or justified to guide action…(Mezirow 2000: 8).

A central proposition is that when an individual’s ‘frame of reference’ or ‘meaning perspective’ is discordant with their experience, a ‘disorientating dilemma occurs’, individuals begin to critically reflect on and question the validity of their inherited meaning perspective, and transformation of perspective can occur. Taylor (1994) describes this as the precondition to
change dimension and links it to the notion of ‘culture shock’ in the intercultural competency literature. He suggests that Mezirow’s (1994) ten stages of perspective transformation are analogous to the movement from lower to higher levels of cultural competency. Finally Taylor highlights the similarities in outcomes with the intercultural competency literature emphasising higher levels of integration and adaptation and transformative learning theory’s emphasis on the emergence of a ‘superior perspective’ (Mezirow 1990: 14). This notion of individual development is encapsulated in Mezirow’s final two phases of learning which are ‘build competence and self-confidence in new roles and relationships… [and] a reintegration into one’s life on the basis of conditions dictated by one’s new perspective’ (Mezirow 1994: 224). A key supposition about the learning that occurs as immigrants make the transition to life in a new cultural context is that there will be positive change as they become better adapted to the environment. Mezirow’s work has been used in other studies with immigrants. For example, Magro (2007) draws on his work to explore the experiences of adult learners from war affected countries now living in Canada. King (1999) describes transformations in learner’s understanding of culture and self in her study with ethnically and culturally mixed groups of English as Second Language (ESL) students in North America.

In a recent article Newman (2012) has questioned whether transformative learning is indeed fundamentally different in kind from other learning, or whether it is merely an aspect of adult learning. Concluding that ‘any learning effectively done involves reassessment and growth’ (2012: 40), he argues that we should abandon the term transformative learning and replace it with the term ‘good learning’. My concern here is not whether transformative learning differs in degree or kind from other forms of learning, it is to highlight the assumption underpinning transformative learning, and shared more broadly in conceptualisations of learning, that learning invariably has positive outcomes. Implicit in all of these understandings of learning is the sense that learning is about change for the better, and that somehow it is always a good thing.

The need to recognize that transformative learning may not always have positive outcomes for the individual was highlighted by Taylor (2007) in his review of the empirical literature on transformative learning. He pointed to the need to broaden the definitional outcomes of perspective transformation to include the potential for a more negative impact on identity and conceptions of self. His review also drew attention to the lack of research into the socio-cultural factors which shape the transformative experience. Instead much of the empirical research has focused on the individual, while tending to ignore contextual factors such as previous life experiences and the social space in which individuals are living and learning. Related to this is the paucity of studies which have explored perspective transformation from informal learning and non-formal educational settings; most studies have been located in formal education settings (Taylor 2007).
Policy and public discourses: an underbelly of learning

Policy over the last ten years has imposed increasingly severe restrictions on those who come to the UK seeking asylum. Asylum seekers are not eligible for welfare services and are excluded from the labour market (Home Office 1999; Home Office 2000). Those who do not have independent means, or family and friends who can support them, are dispersed to hostels around the country while their claim is processed (Home Office 2009). Asylum seekers are excluded from English for Speakers of Other Languages (ESOL) classes and other publicly funded education programmes (LSC 2006). The net result of these policies is to promote the perception of those seeking asylum as a burden on an overly generous welfare system, rather than as an asset or potential resource.

Excluded from economic, educational and other positive identity resources many asylum seekers learn how to break the law to enter informal and semi-legal employment while waiting for their claim to be settled (Morrice 2011). Patricia, a teacher from Zimbabwe arrived in the UK on her own and with very little money. Rather than be dispersed she became what I have called a circumstantial law breaker, working illegally to support herself and to send regular economic remittances back to her family.

Yes it was illegal…I'm not sure whether they didn't know that this was illegal because obviously they didn't even see my passport, but they still gave me a job… I didn't even have a bank account, I was using this lady, who I used to live with, I was using her bank account. She gave me her card, so I was using her card at the ATM… Not even anybody back home can ever imagine me or anyone doing that… There's no way you can actually make anyone understand what you went through. There's no way. The lies that you tell, the anxiety…

For asylum seekers either being dispersed to a hostel and being dependent on state benefits, or working illegally, make it virtually impossible to maintain a sense of dignity and self respect.

Once asylum seekers receive a positive decision on their application from the UK Border Agency and gain refugee status, they can work legally and the process of integration can begin. However, unemployment rates for refugees are estimated at 36% (Bloch 2002). It is even more difficult for refugees to find employment commensurate with the skills and qualifications that they bring with them (Houghton and Morrice 2008). Among participants in the study were teachers, engineers, a human rights worker, a judge, a university lecturer, nutritionalist and business man. They arrived with expectations of re-establishing professional identities and securing employment in the same or similar professions. The sense of loss of social status and financial independence was acute as each of the participants was obliged to find work in the low skilled and often casual labour market. This included working in care homes, as maintenance workers, delivering fast food, working in catering and cleaning, as security guards and traffic wardens.

Accustomed to earning a living to support themselves and family members, being unemployed and dependent on state benefits was a source of shame for participants in the research. Abel had worked as a judge in Ethiopia and had been applying unsuccessfully for what he described as
‘simple jobs’ – stacking shelves in supermarkets, labouring etc. He described his frustration at the loss of respect he felt at not being able to secure a job

You know in our culture you lose your self-respect, even within your family, once you end up just getting benefits. It is a big difference here. There I just lived in my own home and I just live on my own earnings, here I am just living as a beggar. That’s what I’m learning here.

After almost two years Abel did eventually get a job as a traffic warden and achieve the financial independence he sought. It was a far cry from his previous job in Ethiopia and the respect and social status which had accompanied that role.

I didn’t want to stay on the benefits, that’s the best thing about the job. That’s why I’m doing it. Someone has to do it, although I resent it, having to do it. The public resent it, but still it is a job to do...

Accepting lower status employment often involved retraining in a new career. Zainab came to the UK with a PhD in chemical engineering from the University of Baghdad in Iraq, where she had been a lecturer and researcher. Like many refugees she had accepted that her human capital was not recognised and that she would have to find alternative career opportunities in the UK.

You know, it’s a big change for us...I have an experience for more than 20 years from design and chemical engineer, also my husband, but now we are looking for jobs and we, what we say, we suffered a lot to find jobs equivalent to what we have in the past...I’m doing teacher training now. I will teach maths in schools. I have no choice; it’s the only job I can do. My experience is in research; research and design, that’s my dream... It’s a big, big loss. But I say the good thing is my husband and my son is safe now...

Alongside these policy discourses are powerful public and social discourses, fuelled by an often hostile media. Research into public attitudes around asylum conducted by the Independent Asylum Commission (Hobson et al. 2008) found that only 18% of people in their survey viewed the term ‘asylum’ positively. Their research found that the majority of respondents held negative views about those who come to the UK seeking asylum, including that they were here to: ‘steal jobs and scrounge on welfare’, that they received ‘preferential treatment in the allocation of housing and public services’ and were ‘a threat to British culture’ (Hobson et al. 2008: 14). These views support Zetter’s contention that the asylum seeker label transforms an identity into a politicised image; it is not a neutral way of describing the world, but has the covert intention to ‘... convey an image of marginality, dishonesty, a threat, unwelcomed...’ (2007: 184).

The identity of asylum seeker / refugee, and the associated pejorative meanings is all powerful; it decentres other identities, defining a person above and beyond other forms of identity. These negative stereotypes and meanings are assimilated and learned informally from the media, from encounters with others and their expectations and assumptions. For the majority of participants in the research the identity of both asylum seeker and refugee was an identity associated with...
vulnerability and shame. When asked if there was anything which had surprised him about life in the UK Yoseph from Ethiopia replied:

Yeah; the asylum process…people don’t like asylum seekers. They don’t like you if they know you’re an asylum seeker. People generally think that asylum seekers should be poor, dirty and illiterate.

The difference in entitlements and security makes the status of refugee greatly preferable. Yet being a refugee was still an identity to be kept hidden. Savalan’s response to being asked about the identity of refugee was typical:

I think it was a big worry if people asked me ‘what are you doing here?’ What can I say because, like I am a refugee but I have got respect for myself, I don’t want to be down in front of people… So I prefer not telling them why I am here and what for… They never say this refugee did something good. Everything they say about refugees is bad.

Conclusions
The research highlights how for refugees there is a deep underbelly of learning which is around ongoing processes of identity formation which cannot be understood in terms of positive transformative outcomes. Through social activity and interaction, refugees constructed meaning and learned the social identity of refugee. Learning involved epistemological processes – changing how the world was perceived and how they made sense of the world. It also raised fundamental ontological issues about who and what they could be in the world. Participants became painfully aware that to be an asylum seeker or a refugee was morally problematic and a source of stigma. They were concerned about refugee identity in terms of what it said about their worth and value and struggled to be seen as respectable and to generate distance from representations of themselves as pathological.

The learning outlined here does not lead to positive outcomes, rather it is concerned with having to unlearn and let go of much of who and what they were. It involved learning to live with loss of professional identity, and the social status and respect which accompanied their pre-migration identity. This process is more about identity deconstruction and involves learning who and what they are not. In conclusion, the research suggests the need for an enlarged concept of learning which acknowledges that perspective transformation can involve profound ontological and epistemological processes and can have negative outcomes. The case study of refugees highlights the significance of the socio-cultural context in which learning occurs and the need for learning theories to recognize the potential dis-benefits and negative outcomes of learning on identity and conceptions of self.

References
Entanglement in Things: Lifelong Learning in the Paleolithic and Neolithic

Donovan Plumb
Mount Saint Vincent University

Abstract: This paper argues that it is helpful to conceptualize learning as part of a broader entanglement of humans in the materiality of things. Using archeological examples from the Paleolithic and Neolithic, the paper contends that the capacity of humans to learn collaboratively in communities of practice is more understandable if more careful attention is paid to the ways humans and their surrounding material environment are entwined. The paper explores the ways a primordial cave and ancient city once shaped the lifelong learning of their inhabitants.

Anthropologists, including archeologists, have much to contribute to the theoretical foundations of adult education, especially our understanding of the nature of human learning. In their attempts to account for the emergence, production, and reproduction of societies and cultures, archeologists regularly explore the ways ancient people were connected to their natural environments. Anthropologist Tim Ingold (2000, 2011) and archeologist Ian Hodder (2011a, 2011b), for example, offer sophisticated accounts of the complex interactions of people and their material surroundings. Both are critical of the one-sided, dichotomizing approaches we often take when we think about the connections between humans and the world, either overemphasizing the power of human agency to change the world or exaggerating the power of the surrounding social/environmental context to determine human action. Ingold and Hodder, in different but complimentary ways, advocate a much messier notion of ancient people and the materials of their world. Hodder expresses this notion nicely with his term, “entanglement” (2011, p. 63). According to Hodder, cultural development entails an intensifying entanglement of humans (complex and emergent material structures in their own right) and the various material things of their world. At the same time as humans become ensnared by and dependent upon things, things too become ensnarled with and dependent on humans. For researchers like Ingold and Hodder, understanding the human condition means attending to the unfolding nature of the entanglement of humans and things. It is my contention that it is very helpful to think of learning as part of this process of entanglement.

Humans as Materials

A good starting place for understanding Ingold’s and Hodder’s thoughts on the entanglement of humans and things is to come to terms with the specific brand of materialism that underlies their view. Like most materialists, Ingold and Hodder believe that all phenomena, including human beings, can be understood as part of the material universe. Humans do not somehow transcend the stuff of the world. We do not have special attributes that separate us from the rest of existence. Rather, our powers and potentials express an array of capacities possessed by the materiality of the universe (Ingold, 2011).

Unlike the materialism of classical physics that endeavored to explain all phenomena as a mechanical elaboration of basic physical principles, theorists like Ingold and Hodder hold a
much more elaborate “emergent” materialist view. Rather than thinking of the universe as an already existing, vast and intricate machine that can be understood with the application of positivist science, emergent materialists characterize the universe as unfinished and always growing, evolving, developing and expressing new and often unpredictable powers and potentials. As Bhaskar (2008) relates, science can endeavor to understand the historical emergence and development of materials, but because emergence often produces surprising new material powers and properties, it cannot predict the emergence of these forms. In this view, human beings are but a particular (albeit, from our perspective, especially important) emergent material phenomenon.

Primate researcher and cultural psychologist, Michael Tomasello (1999), argues that emergence played an important role in the recent evolution of human beings. Tomasello contends that, based on sophisticated powers for social interaction that we share with our closest primate relatives, new capacities for cultural cognition and learning emerged in humans sometime around 100,000 years ago. These capacities entailed humans joining in shared learning contexts to communicate prior knowledge, to enhance social practices, to build bonds of solidarity, and to forge identities. Cultural learning did not supplant the powerful suite of individualized learning capacities that came to us through evolution first as animals, then as mammals and even more uniquely as primates. The emergence of the capacity for cultural learning added another learning power and potential that enabled humans to transmit and improve upon cultural innovations in a process that Tomasello characterizes as “the ratchet effect of culture” (p. 5).

It is important to note that our capacity for collaborative cultural learning (shared cognition) does not, to use Daniel Dennett’s (1996, p. 24) term, require any kind of transcendental “sky hook” explanation. As Tomasello takes pains to point out, cultural learning is a power and potential that emerges out of but does not in any way escape our biological materiality. According to evolutionary psychologist, Merlin Donald (2001), humans acquired a capacity for cultural learning when we became capable of linking together our solitary cognitive systems into complex aggregates of shared cognition. We add to our solitary strategies of thinking and learning when we join with others in emergent communities of practice.

Tomasello’s emergent materialist account of human powers and potentials are built upon in interesting ways by anthropologist Jean Lave and her collaborator Etienne Wenger (Lave & Wenger, 1991; Wenger, 1999). While they do not offer an account of the evolutionary emergence of our capacities for collaborative learning, Lave and Wenger offer detailed analyses of the ways communities of practice currently support human learning. Wenger (1999), for instance, highlights how communities of practice join people together in a process of negotiating meaning. As they participate together, members of a community of practice build a shared history of learning that provides an ever-expanding base of meanings that they can use to negotiate new understandings. For example, when an ancient group of ancient Britons tacitly agreed that the voiced word, “dog,” represents the furry, four-footed creatures that were lazing by their hearths, they could use this word to more easily reach subsequent understandings or agreements about dealing with the dogs around them. Lave and Wenger help us understand more

about the functioning of Tomasello’s cultural ratchet. It is through negotiating meaning in communities of practice that humans learn and then teach significant aspects of culture.

Lave and Wenger argue that, rather than viewing learning as a process of knowledge transmission and reception, that it is much better to conceive it as a process in which learners come up to speed with and enwrap themselves in an ongoing (and ever emerging) flow of social practices. The strength of this vision of learning is that it recognizes the dialectical interplay of humans and their social contexts (people make society and society makes people).

Following Ingold, Hodder, and others, it is possible to see how, despite its many strengths, the theory of situated learning in communities of practice accords far to little attention to our entwinement in materiality. In Lave and Wenger’s theorizing, people entwine their cognitive minds in processes of negotiating meaning, but their simultaneous entwinement with other materials of their existence is only lightly considered, at best. While Lave and Wenger make progress in dispelling the idea of humans as solitary, imperial learning agents by insisting on the collaborative and social nature of human learning, they do not, in the end, overcome the idea that human beings stand over and against their world. In failing to acknowledge and investigate the entwinement of humans in materiality, Lave and Wenger remain incapable of illuminating the ways things and their properties have shaped and continue to shape human learning processes.

To help illustrate the ways our entanglement in materiality has served to shape human learning, including our powers for collaborative learning, I will describe two archeological sites I recently visited in Turkey in which ancient humans and things survived and flourished together in an unfolding process of entanglement. In the first instance, I observe how the entwinement of humans into the resistant and timeless materials of an ancient cave may have supported the growth of capacities for collaborative learning during the Paleolithic Era. In the second instance, following Ian Hodder, I argue that the entanglement of humans in the ever changing clay walls and objects of an ancient city may have provoked an intensification of social connections that enhanced social learning processes in the Neolithic Era. In both cases, understanding our entwinement in materiality (the entanglement of the materiality of humans in the materiality of the world) provides a basis for deepening our understanding of the unfolding growth and development of human learning processes.

Karain Cave: Enwrapped in Stone

The lush Pamphilia plain stretches for 100 kilometers along the south coast of Turkey. Jagged mountains bound it on all sides. At its western edge, jut the rugged cliffs of the Tarsus mountains, and in one of these rocky promontories, well-hidden in the folds of rock, is Karain Cave, an ancient dwelling that archeologists have established has been inhabited by human species for over 200,000 years (Otte et al., 1995).

I was especially interested in visiting this archeological site for several reasons. First, from the perspective of my interest in human evolution, I wanted to visit the site because it is known to
have been inhabited by both Neanderthals and, after about 35,000 years ago, modern humans. This was my chance to experience a remarkably ancient human context, extending into the depths of our evolutionary history. Second, for a long time I have been interested in the ways geography (including small contexts like dwellings) has been shaped by and has shaped our bodies and minds, including our learning processes. In this case, I wanted to get the feel of a kind of habitation that played an important role in the emergence and development of human powers and potentials.

While caves were certainly not the only form of dwelling inhabited by ancient peoples (as is popularly conveyed by the notion of the “caveman”), anthropologists recognize that caves have long played an important role in human history (Galanidou, 2000). Following the lead of Tim Ingold (Ingold, 2000), archeologist Dimitrij Mlekuž (2012; 2011) suggests the notion of “affordances” to help understand the entwinement of humans and the materiality of caves. Rather than the environment existing separately from humans and constituting a pool of resources that await their exploitation, the environment and its powers and properties (including the affordances it offers humans) are only realized as humans engage in the practices that sustain them. Thus, as they wended their way through the environment, ancient humans came into interaction with the material phenomena of caves. As they engaged with the properties of the cave, humans gradually discovered its many affordances. Interestingly, in Mlekuž’s view, shelter from the elements and protection from predators were probably not the most important affordances of caves for ancient humans. Instead, for him, it was the ways caves support specific forms of interpersonal interaction that might have made them especially important for humans.

To gain some sense of how this might have been possible, let us think for a moment about the process of collaborative learning in communities of practice, not abstractly, but as a material phenomenon in which the bodies of people interact with one another in the world to negotiate meaning. According to Tomasello (1999), when people engage in these interactions they, in effect, orient their bodies and perceptions to generate a “joint attentional scene” in which they collectively focus their attention on some aspect of shared concern (p. 96). Even for solitary humans, focusing attention is demanding as it entails attuning our perceptions to isolate aspects of the world from complex flows. Sharing attention with other people is even more demanding. People have to orient their bodies physically to hear each other clearly, witness each other’s emotional expressions, and perceive each other’s intentional handling of the shared objects of attention.

Some material surroundings support these kinds of interactions better than others. Sharing attention is more difficult, for example, when participants are outside in harsh weather where it is uncomfortable, noisy, or distracting. It is also more difficult for them when doing busy activities like walking through bushes or fleeing from a predator. Sharing attention is easier, however, in conditions like those provided by the interior of a cave. As soon as one enters Karain Cave, for instance, one becomes aware of how cool, quiet, comfortable place it is, protected from the elements and isolated from the distractions of the outside world. Supplemented with a hearth, this place would have been an ideal context for collective repose. It would have been safe and

---

18 Neanderthals were an ancient human species that inhabited most of Eurasia for hundreds of thousands of years. Neanderthals gradually disappeared from Asia and then Europe following the migration of modern humans out of Africa about 60,000 years ago.
calm, big enough to allow many dozens of people to gather, but still bounded tightly enough to encourage productive interactions. In the ancient world, few contexts would have afforded the kinds of stability provided by a cave like this. Together, people and Karain Cave would have comprised a web of material substances—a learning assemblage—capable of expressing properties that may not otherwise have emerged so powerfully.

In this case, the entanglement of humans with a slowly transforming thing (the materiality of the cave) provided a lattice in which specific learning (like building stone tools and engaging in increasingly sophisticated forms of artistic and religious expression) could take place. The materiality of the cave was stable enough to provide reliable and long-lasting support for social and cultural reproduction throughout the Paleolithic era. As evinced by many stone artifacts unearthed in the cave by archaeologists, however, cultural development and transformation of the inhabitants of Karain Cave occurred extremely slowly. For example, stone tools made by Neanderthals and early modern humans in the cave showed only slow development over many thousands of years. While the resilient materiality of the cave may have supported the development of people’s capacities for forms of learning that could reliably reproduce culture, it did not, in the end, provide especially rich support for the kinds of learning that might produce new and vibrant cultural forms.

Çatalhöyük: Entangled in Clay

Rising thirty meters out of a flat field on the Anatolian plateau is a large mound of earth that hides the buried remnants of one of the oldest cities on earth. Around 9000 years ago, for about 1400 years, thousands of people lived in the ancient city of Çatalhöyük in curious dwellings that were interconnected wall-to-wall and accessible only through their roofs. Since 1993, Ian Hodder has led a careful exploration of this important archaeological site. In the style of the best contemporary archaeologists, Hodder’s intent has been to understand the rich details of the lives of the Neolithic inhabitants of this city. He contends that we can achieve deep insight into large and important shifts in human history, like the appearance of agriculture, the development of deepened religious sensibilities, and the heightening of a sense of self that took place during the time of Çatalhöyük by attending to the many remnants of everyday life in the site. “Major change,” he argues, is often “embedded within small shifts in daily practice” (2011, p. 237). Attending to the small ways people are entangled in the materiality of their contexts provides fresh insight into the appearance of major cultural events.

In the previous example of Karain Cave, we considered how the durable materiality of the cave may have supported the development of collaborative learning practices that enabled people to effectively reproduce culture over thousands of years. As Hodder makes clear, the materials of Çatalhöyük had very different properties. The people of Çatalhöyük lived in an oozing, pliable, ever shifting, always crumbling world of mud! While stone tools are still present, the primary technological innovation of this Neolithic city was the use of clay. People used clay to build the walls of their houses, they molded clay into benches and shelves, they stored food and other things in clay containers, they decorated their bodies with clay paint, they cooked in clay hearths, and boiled food with the use of heated clay balls. Clay was so ubiquitous in the lives of these people that it was even deposited in their very bones. In Çatalhöyük, people were deeply entangled in clay.
For Hodder, the entwinement of the people of Çatalhöyük with the clay objects of their lives forced a shift in their practices. Unlike stone, clay is easy to fashion into objects. An entanglement with the powers and properties of clay results in an increase in the production of objects. The plasticity of clay encourages creativity. It can be used to build big structures (like the walls of houses) or small (like pipes, salt shakers, or figurines). But, while stone tends to be durable, clay is friable. Hodder argues that, the more the people of Çatalhöyük became entangled in clay, the more their practices became caught in the ongoing need to maintain, patch up, and rebuild the structures of everyday life.

Let us ponder, for a moment, the implications of clay for the collaborative learning practices of the people of Çatalhöyük. According to Hodder, the entanglement of humans with clay resulted in the vast intensification of social relations just to maintain the city. In this case, instead of stabilizing a learning context, the entwinement with clay enhanced the extent to which humans were pressed to continue to learn, simply to keep things standing! Whereas in the Paleolithic cave, people could survive with only minimal engagement in communities of practice simply to reproduce longstanding cultural practices, in Çatalhöyük people were pressed by their complex entanglement in clay to engage much more fully with others in social actions needed to maintain their lives. Learning in this context was increasingly multidimensional. At the same time as people learned new ways of coordinating action to manage the complexity of their material entanglements, they learned and then became entangled in new forms of communication (linguistic, symbolic, musical) for sharing their experiences. As well, “increasing investment in materials also increases social commitments” (p. 238). For example, Hodder argues that the increasing entwinement of people with things enabled people to learn to extend their social connections through the exchange of gifts. “By providing ‘enchanting objects’ for each other, humans became tied more completely – to things and to each other” (p. 239). Finally, the intensifying engagement with durable materials witnessed at Çatalhöyük changed people’s identities, their “approaches to agency, … sense of history, … [and] self image” (p. 242). Perhaps for the first time, people became conscious of themselves as individuals and as learners!

**Conclusion**

Hodder argues that human history is strongly marked by our entanglement in things. Perhaps because of their uniqueness, Karain Cave and Çatalhöyük provide a basis for seeing more clearly how collaborative learning is shaped by the nature of the things we are entwined with and that intertwine with us. All too often, we think of learning in strictly cognitivist terms, as a process that transpires in our solitary minds. While Tomasello and Lave and Wenger enable us to see how important aspects of human learning transpires in communities of practice, theorists like Ingold and Hodder help us appreciate how important it is to keep things in mind in our account of learning processes. In our busy thing filled lives, it is easy to forget the profound ways our powers and potentials are shaped by the material environment in which we dwell. Understanding lifelong learning requires us always to remember the complex ways learning is part of our entanglement in things.
References


Relationships over brochures: the role of communities for promoting adult health education among immigrant groups

Adnan Qayyum
University of Ottawa

Abstract: This qualitative research study found that adult immigrants with a high risk for diabetes preferred learning about health education from community leaders within their own community. This was an important first step for these immigrants towards learning about and accessing health information and resources after arriving in Canada.

Background
Newcomers, especially immigrants and refugees, are among populations most vulnerable to poor health literacy and knowledge about health (Canadian Council on Learning, 2008; Quigley et al 2009). Poor health literacy has a strong link with poor health status. Health literacy affects health status in three sets of ways. First, health literacy affects a person’s self-care, including their knowledge of health topics, motivation for self-care, problem-solving skills, and self-efficacy. Second, health literacy affects access and use of health care, including system navigation skills, self-efficacy, perceptions of barriers. Finally, health literacy is important when a person is a patient using the health care system. Health literacy affects patient-provider interaction including a patient’s health knowledge, beliefs and participation in making health decisions (Paasche-Orlow and Wolf, 2007).

Health education is especially important as a way of addressing what is called the “healthy immigrant effect”. Research indicates that immigrants’ health status upon arrival is generally better than that of Canadian born people. However, immigrants’ health status deteriorates soon after arrival (McDonald & Kennedy, 2004). Immigrants face many transitions upon arriving and settling in Canada. Understanding and using health information and services is an important one. Immigrants face several challenges to learning about and accessing health resources including language barriers and lack of culturally appropriate resources (Dunn & Dyck, 2000).

In Ontario, several Local Immigration Partnerships identified health literacy as a high priority by both immigrant groups and service provider organizations as a way to increase access to primary care, disease prevention, health protection (e.g. vaccination and immunization) and promotion (e.g. exercise, healthy food), and navigation of the health care system (Ottawa Local Immigration Partnership, 2011). To identify possible approaches for health education among immigrants, this study focused on one specific health topic, diabetes. Diabetes was useful to investigate as immigrants from sub-Saharan Africa, Latin America and South Asia have a 2.7 to 4.1 times greater risk of developing type 2 diabetes than other Canadians. They also have poorer disease outcomes. This results in poorer health for these immigrants and more cost for the health care system. Research has also shown that poor health literacy has a strong link with diabetes in particular: as health literacy increases diabetes prevalence decreases (Rudd, 2004; Canadian Council on Learning, 2008).

Purpose of Study
The goal of this study was to understand how to improve health education and care among adult immigrants with a high risk for diabetes. In particular, we explored the knowledge needs and preferred approaches for health learning, as identified by these immigrants.

The main research questions were:
- What are the knowledge needs of adult immigrants with high risk for diabetes?
- How can diabetes health literacy be increased for adult immigrants with a high risk for diabetes?

**Research design**

This was an exploratory study about health education, so a qualitative approach was selected. The study was conducted in Ottawa and focused on immigrant groups with the highest risk for diabetes. The study included a literature review on diabetes education for immigrants and an environmental scan of diabetes education programs running in Ottawa. The scan indicated that several organizations in Ottawa provide community diabetes education programs. However, these were highly under-used. These organizations had difficulty attracting immigrants and other newcomers to their services.

Next, data was collected in two stages from immigrant groups with a high risk for diabetes. In the first stage, information gathering workshops were held among the Punjabi, Nepali, Latin American and Somali communities of Ottawa. These workshops were open to all members of these communities (N=67 for the Punjabi community, N=32 for the Nepali community, N=15 for the Latin American community, and N=17 for the Somali community). Community liaisons from each community assisted in promoting these workshops and encouraging participation. People were asked to identify their knowledge of diabetes, how they currently try to access diabetes education and care, and to make suggestions on how to learn about health issues.

Based on the findings of the first stage, focus groups were held among community leaders from each group. Again, community liaisons were important in recruiting and coordinating participants. These discussions were purposefully kept smaller to allow for more in-depth conversation about health education related to diabetes (N=9 for the Punjabi community, N=8 for the Nepali community, N=9 for the Latin American community, and N=8 for the Somali community). These focus groups were used to confirm and explore in-depth the general findings from the information gathering workshops. Community leaders provided insights about what has and can work for health education and care for their respective communities.

Given the iterative process of data collection and analysis, data was analyzed using grounded theory, particularly Glaser’s (1992) emerging design approach.

**Findings and Conclusions**

Results indicated that two phenomena about adult health learning emerged as central for immigrants with a high risk for diabetes: access and trust. Several groups mentioned they were unsure where to turn for diabetes education. Some general comments were made about using Google to search about diabetes, but there was very little knowledge of local resources and educational programs. This sentiment was captured by one participant who said, “where do I get
the care for diabetes? We don’t know where to get the care from.” The default approach was to turn to their general physician. But most respondents had little knowledge about health education programs from public health groups or service provider organizations. The exception was the Latin American community because of the high profile of community leaders who acted as community knowledge brokers, creating community outreach and education about diabetes.

The issue of trust was important in all groups. All groups stated they would prefer to learn about health by starting with someone from their community; a person they could communicate with, who understood them culturally, and in many cases, could overcome language concerns. But they also saw this person as a stepping-stone to increase their health education so they could engage with existing health education options and health care resources in the Canadian system.

These trust issues also manifested in what the respondents didn’t initially find useful: the Canada Food Guide, Diabetes Food Guide, and brochures about diabetes. Many were unaware of these and when they became aware these resources were seen to be only partly unhelpful even if they were translated into, say Punjabi or Spanish. What mattered was having community members with whom they had a trusting relationship to connect them to other people. In other words, they preferred relationships over brochures for learning about health information and resources.

In these workshops we learned there is a strong demand for cultural tailoring of health information and services for these communities. Immigrants were more likely to access and use resources if the people they encounter understand their background and culture. For example, in the focus groups we provided a scenario for respondents about who they would contact for help regarding diabetes. The options were:

a. a community leader who was not a health specialist but knew some basics about diabetes and the health system
b. a retired health professional from within the community
c. a health professional in the mainstream Canadian health system

All immigrant groups identified advantages of each option but in the course of the discussions, each group moved from option a to c. Community leaders were seen to be important, trusted conduits. Eventually respondents wanted to connect with the mainstream health system. However, community leaders were seen to play an important linking role as knowledge brokers who could help build trust, connect immigrants to the health system and promote health literacy.

These findings are consistent with a major systematic review from Britain that showed the effectiveness of culturally appropriate education for diabetes. Culturally appropriate health education was more effective than ‘usual’ health education in improving hemoglobin levels (used to measure plasma glucose concentration -HbA(1c)) and knowledge in the short to medium term (Hawthorne et al, 2010).

Community health knowledge brokers seem to be the key to linking newcomers to health information and the health care. They understand health educational resources and services. They also understand the language and culture of their community members and can act as health advocates on their behalf.

Implications for adult education theory and practice
Community leaders were seen to be important because of the trust they generally had among others in the community. This suggests resources should be directed towards using these relationships rather than creating more educational materials.

This study helps further the recent work of Schecter & Lynch (2011) about how to teach health topics to adult learners. They advocated of using Wenger’s community of practice model (1998) for health learning. Adult educators working to promote health literacy among immigrants need to consider the value of community members who can serve as a bridge to the larger community. In immigrant communities, these community members can play a role as knowledge brokers. Indeed, they can play an important cultural tailoring role that is an important step in helping to increase health literacy in the larger immigrant community.

Finally, the findings also suggest that social network analysis can be useful for understanding how to create health education models that may resonate for adult learners. Christakis & Fowler (2009) advocate using social network analysis to understand how personal relationships and influence can help change health behaviour. This study found that personal relationships were valued by adult learners. However, further research is needed to understand the details and dynamics of these personal relationships within immigrant groups.

References


Paquataskamik: Learning From Place in Fort Albany First Nation

Jean-Paul Restoule, Sheila Gruner and Edmund Metatawabin
Department of Adult Education and Counselling Psychology, OISE/University of Toronto

Abstract: This paper details a research project dedicated to honouring Mushkegowuk Cree concepts of land, environment and life in Fort Albany, Ontario. This project examined how the James Bay Cree perceive the land/environment and how changes to the land brought on by resource extraction affected these understandings. A key part of this project featured a 10-day river trip with youth, adult and elder participants. Bringing generations of community members together on the land led to reclamation of culture and indigenous knowledge and in the process of these community building activities, greater resistance to external forms of economic exploitation, accumulation and development.

Paquataskamik: Learning From Place in Fort Albany First Nation

This paper will detail a research project dedicated to honouring Mushkegowuk Cree concepts of land, environment and life in Fort Albany, Ontario. This project examined how the James Bay Cree perceive the land/environment and how changes to the land brought on by resource extraction affected these understandings. To ensure relevance to the community and ongoing involvement, a local advisory group was formed with the involvement of the band council and greater community so that the Cree could track environmental and social changes on their own terms for their own purposes.

A key part of this project featured a 10-day river trip with youth, adult and elder participants. As they travelled together on their traditional waters and lands, youth, elders and the generation between shared their learning about the relations of the people to the lands and the resulting issues of governance and land management. Bringing generations of community members together on the land led to reclamation of indigenous knowledge and culture and in the process of these community building activities, greater resistance to external forms of economic exploitation, accumulation and development.

Setting the Stage for Research

Fort Albany First Nation is a small Mushkegowuk Cree community located on the west coast of James Bay, about 130 air kilometres northwest of Moosonee, Ontario. The community is situated on Sinclair and Anderson's Islands on the Albany River, and on the mainland. Alongside local researchers and partners, we set out to ask how the Mushkegowuk Cree community along the James Bay coast perceives land, the environment, and traditional cultural and economic practices in relation to social and economic well-being.

Before developing a formal research strategy, researchers and community members discussed issues that would support the development of a framework reflective of local aspirations. These included discussions of:

- language, history, and territoriality;
- deeply rooted relationships among people and between people and nature (such as the concept of paquataskamik, explained below);
- ways of seeing and being in the world (including social and economic relationality) that lay outside of a western perspective;
- efforts of local people who struggle for self-determination in a specific place (i.e. Treaty 9 area).

We then developed a set of objectives that were achievable within the project’s two-year timeframe and that could respond to the different perspectives of the specific people involved in project discussions, including university researchers, community colleagues and partners including youth, adults, elders, and other local participants.

The Economic Development Officer from Fort Albany First Nation encouraged the lead researcher to draw on various institutional affiliations which lead to the involvement of NORDIK Institute, a community-based research centre based at Algoma University that supported the development of a broader project platform, and a group called Rural Women Making Change from the University of Guelph, which became involved in supporting the efforts of local girls to creatively express their experiences through the creation of a ‘zine, or informal magazine. Diverse community members helped develop collaborative proposals that could further community goals beyond the scope of the original project discussed here.

The initial research phase involved local participants in defining research directions. An advisory group was formed with representative members of local organizations from the community so that ethical issues and choices would be informed and tracked by local people themselves and the project would develop with continued community involvement. Diverse community members became involved to help develop collaborative proposals that could further the goals of the community beyond the scope of the original project discussed here. An intergenerational community advisory group was established with membership from the key community institutions including the band office, health centre, schools, youth, elders and others. Research protocols were developed with the advisory group. It was important to the researchers to build reciprocity into the research process and to privilege Mushkegowuk social relationality.

In the early research design stages, it was evident that a community priority was bringing together Elders and youth so they could learn from one another about the role and meaning of the land to social well-being. Since that time, the project has been about fostering development of meaningful space for inter-generational dialogue and community research on social and economic relationships rooted in Mushkegowuk conceptions of life and traditional territory.

Throughout the research, we were primarily asking: what is the role of land/territory, and what strategies are people developing to maintain the Mushkegowuk ‘way of life,’ particularly in face of pressures to enter into the world of large-scale extractive capitalism? These are large questions for a small project to grapple with.

**First Relationships to Land**

We developed a process with the participating community groups to promote youth, adult, and elder involvement with an audio documentary project about the social and economic meaning and ‘value’ of the Kistachowan (Albany) River. The community chose the river as a theme because of its cultural, social, and economic importance. As part of the project, youth and elders
travelled together on the traditional waters and lands, exploring history, language, issues of governance, and land management. To support local Cree youth, the advisory group organized skill-building workshops in which youth participants made their own audio documentaries based on the interviews they carried out with community members. They received training in research and communication skills, and recorded their intergenerational learning through radio documentaries and ‘zines.

Youth conducted interviews with peers, adults, and elders on key issues related to the role of land, the river, and the people for community social and economic well-being. Fifteen interviews were collected and formed the basis for a short audio documentary, titled *The Kistachowan River Knows My Name*, which aired in the local community and on Wawatay radio in northern Ontario. The key objective of this process was to bring generations together to learn about relationships to land, the river, and the community. The resulting traditional knowledge and teachings, and commitments by youth to learn more, was particularly powerful because they could be shared with the community via radio.

Gruenewald (2003), paraphrasing Bowers (2001), says decolonization as an act of resistance must not be limited to rejecting and transforming dominant ideas; it also depends on recovering and renewing traditional, non-commodified cultural patterns such as mentoring and intergenerational relationships. A critical pedagogy of place aims to (a) identify, recover, and create material spaces and places that teach us how to live well in our total environments (reinhabitation); and (b) identify and change ways of thinking that injure and exploit other people and places (decolonization). (p. 9) In other words, reinhabitation and decolonization depend on each other.

In the development of the radio documentary, the significance of the river and knowledge of the social, cultural, economic, and spiritual meanings of the river among community members became heightened. The excursion into traditional territory itself offered a wealth of insight into the importance of land for social and economic well-being among people in the remote First Nation. The group documented sites of significance to the community, experienced routes that hold great historical significance, and brought people together in the sharing of knowledge. Audio visual (radio, photo and film) and written materials were produced that were gathered as part of a growing body of work valuing traditional territory, including the importance of history and current usage of the territory by Fort Albany First Nation, and for visioning for the future. The excursion brought out how important water is to Mushkegowuk culture. As one participant explained,

> When we hear frogs singing we know the water quality is safe for our consumption. We listen to the song of the birds to know what kind of weather is approaching. The moose will know when we need food and allow themselves to be taken. Such is the contract we have with the animal world. (Elder and community member, Fort Albany)

**Renaming and Reclaiming: community mapping**

This community-based research project contributed to a community mapping of key cultural and historical sites akin to Linda Smith’s (1999) decolonizing projects of renaming and reclaiming.
Names for places in the Inninowuk language were marked as an effort to bring the original names and Cree concepts to more common use among the youth. During the river excursion the Cree-language terminology was expanded for those participating. The words *paquataskamik* and *Kistachowan Sipi* (Albany River’s original name) were written along the fifty-foot long sides of the raft. There were Mushkegowuk words that were accompanied by stories for many sites along the route which were documented during the trip. Many more place names existed than the English ones that appeared on printed maps. This supported the elders’ suggestion that ‘every curve in the river has a name.’

The ongoing drive to orient the project to Mushkegowuk ways of knowing resulted in exploring Cree words and concepts and inserting them into key project activities and documents. The main word that arose as discussions evolved about land, the river, and life in their territory was *paquataskamik*, ‘an Inninowuk (Cree) word that describes the ‘natural environment’ and draws attention to the whole of traditional territory.’ (Gruner & Metatawabin, 2009) As adults involved in the project described, *paquataskamik* is significant partly because it references a historical relationship to land which encompassed a much larger area than the reserve or family camps. This territory has been regulated, divided, and parcelled by non-Inninowuk into Crown land, treaty, and reserve spaces, which has resulted in fractures and alterations to that relationship. The resulting effects of this for social networks, economic development, and survival are felt daily. When youth lose a sense of what *paquataskamik* is, they may begin to lose the connections that form the complex set of relations that bind them together in a historically and geographically informed identity. The focus on the word is an explicit attempt to retain a relationship to the rivers, the lands, and the communities joined together by them.

**Paquataskamik: language, land and identity**

According to one Mushkegowuk interviewee, *paquataskamik* is the Cree word used for traditional territory, all of the environment, nature, and everything it contains. *Noscheemik* is the word for ‘camp,’ the bush, or a more specific area within *paquataskamik*. For project participants, it was important to remember words like *paquataskamik* because they spoke to the broader project of territoriality and self-determination within Mushkegowuk lands, the ability of the Mushkegowuk people to define development on their own terms, and to continue to build on a historical identity in a vast area that was never ‘given up’ to European settlers. Historically and currently, people have derived sustenance from the land, are guided by seasons and traditional hunting routes, and consider the land as crucial to healing the Mushkegowuk people from the impacts of colonialism.

The elders and other community members were concerned that the word *paquataskamik* was falling into disuse among the younger generations, who tend to use *noscheemik* instead, which pointed to a loss of important linguistic distinctions related to concepts of territoriality. One interviewee said:

> So you use *paquataskamik* if you are fluent (in Cree) and if you are a young kid you use *noscheemik* ... they confuse, they’re not saying it properly. That’s too high a word for them so they just use the simple word, *noscheemik*. (Community member, Fort Albany First Nation)
This change in word usage is partly because of intergenerational language loss. Residential schooling and its impact on indigenous language use drastically reduced the number of fluent speakers. Some community members worry that the decreasing use of words like *paquataskamik* means that the ability to form a linguistic connection to traditional territory could be at risk within a short period of time. The implications for governance, land use, economic development, and social relationships are vast.

*Paquataskamik* speaks to a way of relating to land based on laws and governance arrangements that were in place long before European settlers arrived. According to Inninowuk, the organization of travel routes, negotiation of temporary settlements and gathering places, and planning based on availability of food sources and seasonal changes were all rooted in land-based knowledge that shaped governing practices and laws. While these laws still exist, they have been made less visible since the onset of colonialism and capitalism. Large-scale extractive capitalism, in particular, has presented new problems and perceived threats to the environment. In order to protect land and the relationships to land that are integral to Inninowuk identity, territorial self-governance is a necessity. *Paquataskamik* fosters a connection to land and community beyond the reserve boundaries, encouraging Inninowuk ways of relating to land that are put ahead of an accumulative or extractive economy.

The Kistachowan River is included in the traditional territory that *paquataskamik* refers to. According to one member of Fort Albany First Nation (FAFN) interviewed by a community youth, the river is particularly important in the concept of *paquataskamik*:

> It’s very important to me as well, because I use the river for fishing, hunting, camping, being raised on it from a very early age ... it’s also very beautiful, it’s pristine, and of course, it being a river, it also carries water that’s important for human life; it carries water, and it’s clean ... At the same time it’s a very powerful river. Every spring, when you have the spring breakup, it’s quite a mighty river; I have quite a lot of respect for it. Basically, I just love the river myself. I’m on it a lot, almost every day. And just to even look at it is satisfying. (Male FAFN member interviewed by a community youth)

For the Mushkegowuk, the river is a way of life: one that has existed for thousands of years. As such, the river has many significant uses and meanings, physically, emotionally, and spiritually. The quotation below describes how points along the river where family are buried demonstrate the profound connection of ancestors, land, river, and *paquataskamik*:

> And my sister’s there. My young sister is there; the third born in the family. She died when she was an infant. For him (father), the memory was so fresh, that every time he goes close to the cemetery, cleaning up the grass or fixing the fence, just doing anything to improve, then he’d finish all that and then he’d say a little prayer and cry. That was just how fresh it is. And I saw him do that until way afterwards; the last time we took him out there, and it was the very same thing. So for him the river is his daughter, lying a hundred miles up; his brother who is buried twenty miles downstream from that; his mother who’s buried,
probably 120 further than that ... And his grandfather is buried about 135 miles from the north side of the river ... along the river. So, it’s family, it’s a family cemetery, it’s a highway... there are markers along the highway to indicate significant events, significant moments; people that have passed away that are close to you and they are lying along the river. So it’s a river of life; it’s growth. (FAFN adult, interviewed by FAFN youth)

In this case, the part of paquataskamik that relates to the river demonstrates the profound set of personal historical relationships with the river that connects the community to the land and to each other.

The Kistachowan River was a site for discussing how Mushkegowuk self-organized in the territory, binding diverse communities through sites of social, cultural and economic activity. Through the project, participants learned that prior to contact there was a community along each tributary. There was a pathway connecting each community to the next one. One important purpose of this pathway was for the use of runners who brought news to a neighboring community. News could travel instantly with runners taking news to the next as soon as they received it. It was the river that bound people and communities together. One such name is Nameo Sipi (Ghost River), which now is a cultural camp for Kashechewan and Fort Albany. It is an old trading post, a place where sturgeon are to be found and an old village site. Old trails still intersect at that site.

The river trip helped members of the community share linguistic, cultural, historical, and geographical knowledge. It re-established respect for the meaning of paquataskamik and demonstrated how irreconcilable that meaning is with western notions of boundaries as imposed by federal and provincial reserve policy and other planning models. This points to the broad political efforts for the recognition of land and water rights that are currently underway. For the people of the community, these lands are a part of the cultural inheritance of the Mushkegowuk, one that they feel their children and grandchildren should be able to experience. The project helped to stoke dialogues and partnerships, some pre-existing, and some catalysed by the research project itself, about the place of the river, the land, the language, and self-determination in relation to both the community of Fort Albany and to the Mushkegowuk.

Also significant to this project was the process of deepening the relationships among community members and to the land (Cajete, 1994). These activities, organized as they were through partnerships of small enterprises, government agencies, social economic organizations, and university bodies, still relied ultimately on the activation of friendship, kinship relations and Indigenous knowledge, originating from connection to land.

**Conclusion**

Bringing generations together to talk about the issues of land and water rights provided many learning opportunities for the community. On the subject of learning and intergenerational relationships, one interviewee said:

> And I like this one (audio project), because at least you get to sit for one time in your lives, and somebody’s going to show an interest in their stories, in their
lives. They were just waiting for you to visit. Just waiting for young people to visit, because they have stories, they will remember good times, bad times, and dangerous times. (Community member interviewed by FAFN youth)

The community worked with the NORDIK Institute to develop an historical timeline, an inventory of strengths, and an ethnographic snapshot of key land issues, all growing out of the interviews and audio documentary. These smaller projects became part of a broader effort to engage the community in a discussion about what activities should take place on traditional territory and how decisions about those activities should be made. In such discussions, the framing of decision-making about territory and development is at stake. Dominant western frames that centre on an accumulation-oriented model of development are at odds with Aboriginal ways of existence in cultural and geographic regions where land informs social and economic practices.

Learning from place has concrete and meaningful community-building consequences, as Gruner (2012) articulates:

“…youth who interview peers and elders such that new stories are told and recorded, later to be transcribed, and otherwise unexpressed enthusiasm for the beauty of the land is uttered out loud; English language topographical maps are scribbled over in Cree syllabics, and people gather in community halls to celebrate the sending off or coming home of people from camps and field excursions. It is this learning that was taking place out in the territory, the learning and teaching of history by community members, the assertion of legitimate presence in the area.” (p. 251)

By supporting and creating a space for dialogue and learning between Cree youth and elders, this project helped strengthen the bond the Mushkegowuk people have with the river, the land and themselves. In the words of one project advisory member “I want my kids and grandchildren to know the rivers as they, so they know who they are and are proud of who they are, and where they come from” (Interview with female adult from Fort Albany First Nation, 2008). (Gruner, 2012, p. 224)

References


How Transformative is a Film Festival?  
Exploring the Contributions and Limits of a Documentary Film Festival

Carole Roy  
St. Francis Xavier University

Abstract: Canadian adult educators have historically worked effectively with radio programming and community film councils. Recently, limited attention has been paid to the media in the adult education literature. However, citizens have initiated documentary film festivals to inform themselves, provide an alternative source of information, encourage community building, and foster solidarity for social justice, locally and globally. This paper examines the learning reported by attendees and organizers of one film festival in light of transformative learning, especially Freire’s pedagogy of indignation.

Background
Adult education has a long tradition of researching and promoting social justice. Lindeman (1926), Kidd (1950), Welton (1998), Butterwick, Fenwick, and Mojab (2003) have called for adult educators to adopt a social justice agenda and have proposed different venues to facilitate this agenda. From 1940 to 1965, adult educators and the CBC created the Farm Radio and Citizen Forum programs to advance a participatory and grassroots approach to social change. Another effort was the National Film Board (NFB), founded in 1939, which established 250 community film councils within its first decade and allowed Canadians to regularly watch films in non-commercial venues (Selman et al., 1998). They understood that films are catalysts for bringing people together (Chatwin, 1950). The NFB’s ground-breaking 1970s Challenge for Change program, including the well-known Fogo Island project, used films and filmmaking for community development.

One of Canada’s primary sites for social change has been and continues to be the media, which is too often oriented to conservative approaches and to homogenous voices. Media critics have warned of the privatization and deregulation of the media which could narrow media perspectives (McChesney, 1996). Berry (2006) commented on the “degradation of the communication networks” with pseudo-information (p. 11). As mass media homogeneity increased, some citizens recognized the strategic educational and community-building importance of documentary films. The grassroots’ interest in using film to educate citizens and build advocacy for social justice is not, however, reflected in the adult education literature, despite our field’s strong social justice orientation. For instance, Winton and Garrison (2010), from media studies and who do research on the NFB, describe how commercial film distribution structures shape what we see, and do not see, and often ignore under-represented narratives. They point to the importance of “alternative modes of grassroots/community documentary distribution and exhibition … that animate discussion and facilitate action in community-based venues” (p. 404).

Documentary film festivals contribute to a democratic epistemology developing outside educational institutions. Documentary film festivals can present stories that do not make the evening news and highlight and challenge the limited representation offered by mainstream
media. These festivals embody Freire’s (2004) pedagogy of indignation by denouncing problems while also announcing possibilities for change, a contribution to the social-emancipatory perspective of transformative learning, which Taylor (2008) names as following in the tradition of Freire, a tradition that is participatory, social justice oriented and moving beyond the literature on personal transformative learning. These festivals also act as a creative response to the 2009 International Council of Adult Education’s call for renewal of adult learning for social and political transformation.

Case, Purpose and Methodology of the Study
This is a qualitative case study of the World Community Film Festival (WCFF) in Courtenay, British Columbia, a city of 24,000 people. The region is rich in natural resources and has active resource industries and labour activism. In the 1960s, it attracted Americans opposing the Vietnam War and others seeking an alternative way of life. Now, its mild climate and natural beauty attract retirees. While it is called a film festival, it only presents documentaries by independent filmmakers. Film and documentary are different genres but here they are used interchangeably according to popular usage. This festival was chosen as one example of the impact of an alternative film distribution and exhibition that educates on social justice and fosters solidarity. The annual WCFF was initiated by citizens in February 1991. Documentaries are shown concurrently in 4 venues. There is a bazaar where organizations display information on local or global environmental and social justice issues, and offers food and a place to meet friends and network with others. The festival typically attracts 4,000 people every year.

This study investigated the impact of the WCFF on the people who attend it. I examine the transcripts of interviews with organizers and attendees in light of transformative learning theory to discern the learning that took place and the limits of this event. The data analyzed for this paper were collected between 2008 and 2011 at: exit interviews with 48 attendees, 1 group interview with 11 attendees, and semi-structured interviews with 10 attendees, 3 sponsors, 5 organizers and 2 founding members. Interviews were audio-taped and some were also videotaped. Attendees’ comments are anonymous and pseudonyms are used for organizers and founders.

Findings
An analysis of transcripts of interviews with organizers identifies the objectives they had, and have, for the festival. Interviews with attendees suggest that the WCFF offers possibilities for meaningful learning and reveal aspects of a transformative learning process: connection of films to personal lives, disorientation, critical assessment of beliefs, and recognition that solidarity is needed for effective social change.

Brief History of the World Community Film Festival
The goals of the WCFF are: (a) to provide an alternative source of information, (b) to encourage networking and community building, and (c) to foster solidarity for social justice, locally and globally. A founding member used a democratic framework to explain the festival, saying: “We just don’t have a media with a really critical cutting edge in this country. …Where else do you get the other side of the coin using a media that people can so easily relate to?” He suggested that with its content the festival is “utterly unique,” “plays an important ‘role in countering the lies, the deception, the falsehoods,’” and “in keeping a significant number of people sharp and
thinking critically” (Peter, personal communication, February 7, 2010). An attendee commented that “the film festival has really fed and nurtured” activism over the years.

The diversity of films shown at the festival reflects the organizers’ desires to reach a wide range of people. The films tell stories of injustices or ecological destruction, but also of successful struggles, creativity, and courage. There has always been an effort to take a critical look at issues, which can seem negative; due to feedback from attendees, they had to balance films that denounce problems with films that announce possibilities. A founding member recognized that he had not initially considered that important aspect given the challenge of reaching new people. He appreciated how attending the festival can be both safe and challenging for community members. While no performance is required of attendees, and watching a film calls for passive engagement, he noted that the nature of the films and the community venue prohibits disengagement: “I’m dealing with the art of it … the content … the sound … the person sitting next to me … there’s nothing left out. … It demands that kind of recognition and interaction … even if very passive” (Peter, personal communication, February 7, 2010). He argued that film festivals are needed because our “education system has been increasingly oriented toward training people to participate effectively and efficiently in the status quo … [but] the status quo has gotten us into… very big trouble. … Education systems have lost their critical edge” and while he “had some inkling of this [in 1990]” he has learned that the festival is far more important than he realized then. A former professor of film studies commented on the growing popularity of documentaries: “People have become more and more interested in what’s real. The same thing happened in publishing. Non-fiction became more important” (Joan, personal communication, February 17, 2010).

Connections between stories told and personal experience
The films selected cover a wide range of issues that often connect directly to people’s lives. Someone with a 36 year old relative with Lymphoma saw a film about chemicals and health, and felt that “it had a very personal message.” Music by Prudence, about a disabled Zimbabwe woman with an amazing voice, reminded a mother of her courageous daughter who struggles with mental illness and who, like Prudence, shares her gifts and refuses to be marginalized. A self-identified Native man watched a film because homelessness was an important issue for him and found that what people are doing to solve the problem affirmed that “People are people and there are ways to deal with our social problems.” An attendee revealed that an open mind is, at times, an open-heart as he cried at some painful films; still he was glad to see the films, even those that seemed lame initially, and found “a tremendously rewarding feeling” from stories of successful struggles. One noted that these powerful films were not on television or in video stores so she valued that the film festival provided opportunities for her to see them.

Disorienting dilemma: Audience expectations and opinion shifts
Some festival goers openly court disorientation, expecting, even demanding that the films “give me something new, give me something interesting.” Others are unprepared for the change in perspective that can occur after viewing a documentary. College students required to attend the festival as part of a course were an interesting test of the effectiveness of the festival. In a group interview they revealed their low expectations and their surprise that documentaries connected to their lives. One student was angry: “I wasn’t sure what it was going to be … I thought it was going to be quite depressing. I wasn’t very happy that I had to pay for an event that I had to go to
on my personal time.” However, after seeing four films (culture of cotton in India; water; drugs; and homelessness), she felt differently: “I take all of that back now after going to the films. I am so glad that they made me [go].” In response to *Cats of Mirikitani*, a film on the transformation of an elderly, homeless Japanese artist in New York, this student “left with hope” and after other films went home, “telling people about them.” She offered an example of her new awareness: “Now I know that when I make purchases, I want to look harder, I don’t want to have blinders on.” Clearly these documentaries resulted in a changed perspective and new actions for this young woman. A founding member of WCFF surmised that changes in viewers’ worldview are gradual, seeping in over time, until we think differently about what we do or are willing to do.

**Critical assessment of assumptions**

Interviews with attendees revealed that the WCFF is effective in challenging assumptions and raising awareness of the partiality of mainstream media. A man whose uncle and cousin were involved in the construction of a hydroelectric project wanted to see a film about similar projects on BC rivers: “I heard their stories about it and … about recruiting jobs from them. So I wanted to see the other side of it.” Others had their critical views validated. A retired educational consultant for the UN reacted strongly to a film that showed how schooling distanced Ladakhi students from the knowledge and work of their agrarian communities:

>*[Schooling the World]* really resonated with me because I have been asking those same questions: What am I doing here? Why am I promoting the kind of education that makes … no sense to this small country … in the South Pacific? The Chief said to me, “why do I want to send my children to school? If they go to school they become dissatisfied with what’s going on in their community and they won’t listen to what we as the Chiefs have to say.” … It really resonated with my own philosophy of education. … Why is the schooling system around the world so similar? … So from that film came … [the idea of] the power of the schooling system. … Schooling is a process of … developing a child within a certain structure, [but] education has a component of freedom of choice in it. … We call it an education system but really it is a schooling system. What is interesting to me is “why did I stay in that field when I really don’t believe in it?”

In addition to providing information, the film festival fostered media literacy. Many respondents reported becoming aware of how much was missing from mainstream media accounts. A student who saw *Raised to be Heroes* was surprised to learn that some Israel military officers refused to serve in the Occupied Territories and were imprisoned for their refusal. In another instance, seeing *Sir, No Sir* made one person think about human rights violations close to home, “I never knew the American soldiers played such a big part in protesting Vietnam [war]... It makes you think. Before … that movie I was like, screw the military… When you see a film like that … [you realize that] just because you are in the military doesn’t necessarily mean you support what you are doing.”

**Building solidarity for social transformation**

The festival has become a ritual for many residents including one woman who delayed a trip in order to be at the festival, her 10th WCFF. According to interviewees, the most important aspect of the WCFF “is the social dimension, the reminder of how many people are concerned about these issues.” Newcomers saw the festival as a way of learning about local groups and “fitting
into the community.” Providing an event that attracted a diversity of people helped building a sense of community. Film is a collective medium, as one interviewee pointed out: “Almost from the beginning film was conceived as a public experience. You … sit in the dark with a lot of people and you see the same images.” She added, a “sense of everyone breathing, and the expectations and the responses … Drawing in their breath … something about the response, it’s contagious” (Joan, personal communication, February 17, 2010). Awareness of being together in solidarity is important given that making changes “can be a lonely, difficult and even … a dangerous job.” More specifically, residents of a shelter for women had quite a conversation after seeing a film and a woman who worked with them noted the importance for these women and those working with them “to see ourselves as part of a worldwide movement.” Finally, someone spoke about being more involved. There are few protests in Courtenay yet one man said, “I am there for more of them then I ever was in a much larger community … I suit up and I show up a little more often. … Presenting my physical person is much more important than blabbing and writing.”

Others called the festival “a conversation starter,” a spark for networking. In one encounter, a member of the local Labour Council met a member of an environmental group concerned with water pollution and invited her to speak to a meeting of regional Labour Councils about fish farming. This activist also spoke of wanting to take action after seeing Black Wave, which examines the Exxon Valdez disaster and the fact that 20 years later local residents were still waiting for compensation for their destroyed fishing grounds. This was followed by Oil in Eden about the proposed pipeline from the Alberta tar sands to Kitimat, B.C. and onto tankers to Prince Rupert, after which the same activist said: “Such an impact. … Hard to watch … [but] it certainly stiffened my backbone as far as that whole issue of tankers on the West Coast.” When she met someone organizing to stop the pipeline, she invited him to the next Labour Council meeting. Knowledge of the Exxon Valdez legacy strengthened this labour activist resolve on a current issue and the festival provided opportunities to make strategic connections with environmentalists. After talking with an organizer of caravans to Cuba, a man wanted to join a caravan and said, “other than the films, just talking to people, you learn a lot about world issues that you wouldn’t otherwise.”

While many attendees expressed a desire to discuss the films, a founder recalled an early experiment with organized discussions, which did not work. He explained that “there has to be a time lag from when you see something and digest it in order … relate to it, talk to it … in a way that makes some sense” (Peter, personal communication, February 7, 2010). On the other hand, question and answer sessions with filmmakers worked well; people reported talking about the films with people at the festival or with friends and family. Film viewing can sometimes spark immediate action. After seeing films on the privatization of water, one viewer reported: “I used to buy bottles of water sometimes, I don’t ever now. I carry around a refillable container.” A woman got a new perspective on using humour in her activism and was already working on this new approach. Some said the festival preached to the choir but others saw it as a support for activists. A festival-goer who just returned from a four-week labour education program said that solidarity was important for sustaining commitment: “I came away feeling very strong. … [the film festival] reminds me that I’m part of something much bigger and that keeps me going.” He and another attendee stressed how the festival helps curb burnout as it provides an opportunity for the activists to “get a bit of reassurance that they are not alone.” After seeing a film on gay
and lesbian issues, the mother of a lesbian started a chapter of Parents, Families, and Friends of Lesbians and Gays in Courtenay. Many attendees involved in social change come to the festival for inspiration and “to recharge their batteries,” reassured that they are “part of a collective.” One attendee appreciated that the festival addressed a broad range of issues and showed connections between them.

**Implications for Adult Education**

As the data show, a documentary film festival is a catalyst that can effectively raise awareness and create a public space for dialogue by providing information rarely presented by mainstream media. When they learn about these unpublicized stories, individuals are ‘disoriented’ which allows them to examine their views, look for new perspectives, and take action, individually or collectively, to contribute to social movements. The friendly, celebratory atmosphere of the festival fosters a sense of belonging, which is important to community building in a diverse society where engaging differences is needed. Yet the question remains: How can a film festival be more effective at encouraging collective transformative action? As a founding member said “we’re swimming upstream, and … we’ve got to keep swimming upstream,” suggesting an urgent need for deep changes in our society. The changes that Freire envisaged are not here yet.

**References**


Black, C. (Director). (2010). *Schooling the World: The white man’s last burden* [DVD]. USA.


Winton, E., & Garrison, J. (2010). ‘If a revolution is screened and no one is there to see it, does it make a sound?’ The politics of distribution and counterpublics. In T. Waugh, M. B. Baker, & E. Winton (Eds.), *Challenge for Change: Activist documentary at the National Film Board of Canada* (pp.404-424). Montreal: McGill-Queen’s University Press.

White Masculinity and Ableism in the Formation of an Oppressive Consciousness

Thomas Saczkowski
Ontario Institute for Studies in Education at the University of Toronto

Abstract: The following paper seeks to bring into discussion the ways social structures shape or represent social dynamics of white masculinity and ableism. Employing a dialectical historical materialist method, I understand masculinity and ableism as social relations that are constantly changing. In order to outline the processes in which an oppressive consciousness is formed, I will use examples of how white masculinity and ableism are represented in daily life. Ultimately, the paper strives to show how dominant notions of white masculinity form and perpetuate oppressive social relations.

Introduction
To this day, I have dreams about being a saviour using unparalleled strength and courage. I dream that I am running across open fields saving my partner from a myriad of dangers—maybe trigger-happy police officers or misogynist rapists. Or, perhaps, I put myself in harms way so I can defend my friends and family from blood-sucking zombies or American soldiers. These imaginations are not simply the stories of a small boy, or a movie, or the manifestation of male genetics. These imaginations are a product of an ideology that tells me what it means to be a man. I challenge these imaginations when I am in a critical, conscious state, where I analyze these dreams as a product of my socialization. It is within these dreams I am the ideal masculine man—I am able bodied, and unimpaired in my appearance, mind, and emotions. The dreams that I have described occur when I am sleeping and awake. I am not critical of these images and scenarios at the time, rather they give me pleasure. These imaginings are particular to my experiences, my period of history, and the location that I find myself in. Dreams reflect power and how I exercise that power against others. Imbedded in these power relations are various layers of socialization, including the importance of the able-body to masculinity. In saving my partner from danger, I act as a hero, a person with no fear who is always in control. In this state, I save the “damsel in distress”, in which I attribute to my partner, who is depicted as lacking her own strength and resolve. Although this sounds very much like a case of ableism and sexism, I will discuss how structural and interpersonal elements lead to a white masculine standard that many boys strive to meet. To meet this masculine standard you must be ableist—you must reject and detest anything that is disabled both within yourself and others.

Dialectics
The most appropriate method for my endeavour in analyzing the social relations of race, gender, and ability is by using a dialectical analysis. A dialectical historical materialist method examines social relations, contradictions, and the complexity of material relations that are dependent on one another (Gorman, 2005). Social relations are an essential term in dialectical writing because it refers to thinking about relations dynamically, and how such relations have a relationship with one another. Social relations of masculinity and ableism inculcate a set of norms, values, and behaviours within particular social structures and social actors. As I have mentioned previously, the characteristics and descriptions of these social relations vary depending on the context.
Social relations are constantly changing, and adopting new characteristics to maintain dominance (Bannerji, 2011). I will use Gramsci’s (1972) theory of hegemony along with a Marxist-feminist analysis of consciousness to argue that both ableism and masculinity are hegemonic relations that operate on personal and structural levels. In describing masculinity, I will argue that the common and popular socialization of the masculine gender is connected with patriarchy and that it operates to benefit and supplement patriarchal dominance (Hearn, 2004; hooks, 2004). Using a dialectical form of thinking allows me to identify the particular masculinity I have experienced, namely, a white masculinity in middle-class rural Southern Ontario. There are many values, relations, oppressions, and characteristics that form different types of masculinity. Therefore, I will be describing potential characteristics of masculinity that have been located within my own experiences and acts of witnessing. As I describe these experiences, I will articulate how ableism plays out to define a white masculinity, which is used to uphold exploitative social structures in Canadian society. Consequently because my analysis focuses on consciousness rather than dominant social structures, the references made within this piece centre on interpersonal relations that are informed and influenced by structural elements.

Ableism
Ableism is a social relation that demands a state of normalcy, which is maintained by able-bodied individuals who deem people with disabilities as inferior. The social model of disability identifies ableism as an ideology that oppresses and excludes people with disabilities. This model focuses on social oppressions and cultural discourses by assessing various disabling barriers (social, economic, political, and cultural) (Pothier & Devlin, 2006). There are diverse corporeal manifestations for people with disabilities, which are impacted by political policies and social organizations of disability. Canada has been organized to limit the movement and inclusion of people with disabilities by excluding them, through violence, oppression, and a denial of accommodation, from participation within society (Crow, 1996). The social model of disability identifies some social relations as disabling forces, such as ableism and patriarchy.

Masculinity
In identifying myself as a white, middle-class able-bodied man, I fall into the description of what many scholars have identified as the hegemonic masculine man. R.W. Connell’s (2002) description of hegemonic masculinity has become one of the most prevalent theorizations of masculinity. bell hooks (2004) contributed to this area of study by arguing that the structures of power prominent in masculinity are consistent with patriarchal values of misogyny, heterosexism, white supremacy, and classism. hooks recognizes that social relations are not enacted through a singular fashion, but consists of distinct logics that are interrelated. Connell argues that when we speak of hegemonic masculinity in Western society, we speak of a middle or upper-class, white heterosexual male who is assertive, intellectual, courageous, strong, heteronormative, able-bodied, daring, sexual, and insensitive (Kimmell, 2007). When a man acts violently towards another person, he is not only performing individual violence, he is also performing the violence that reflects the values of our society—a society that is characterized by hierarchy, authoritarianism, classism, sexism, militarism and racism. Much of Connell and hooks’ analysis is accurate for the purposes of the type of masculinity I am describing. That said, not all of the characteristics that were mentioned apply to my experiences and the constructions of masculinity in my context. I have come to understand masculinity dialectically, which is in accordance with how Gramsci describes the operation of hegemony and social relations.
Hegemony

Gramsci (1971) used the concept of hegemony to argue that people organize themselves in relation to dominant ideologies. Hegemonic social relations retain their prevalence in society by people enacting those relations on a daily basis. Social relations are diffused, frequently coinciding with and benefiting the views of the ruling class (Bates, 1975). Public opinion and cooperation is integral to the hegemony of social relations, whether it is ableism or masculinity. Social relations change and are reorganized as different people engage with them and reproduce them (Gorman, 2005). This dialectical process of hegemonic social relations is how I have come to understand masculinity differently than described by Connell (2002). Demetriou (2001) argues that Gramsci understood hegemony to operate both internally and externally on people. The dreams that I previously described are my reflections of how I have ideologically come to understand masculinity and ableism and how it has come to affect my behaviours. The external power ranges from all mechanisms of society that operate as socializing tools for gender role construction. Demetriou (2001) responds to Connell’s concept by arguing that hegemonic masculinity is not exclusively linked to white supremacy and the ruling class. Rather, Demetriou argues that characteristics of subordinate and marginalized masculinities can become aspects of a hegemonic ideology and in doing so, perpetuate patriarchy. Thus, a hegemonic form of masculinity is constantly in flux, where it unites different characteristics from various masculinities and moves beyond the duality of hegemonic masculinity.

The Relationship Between Masculinity and Ableism

Using Foucault’s ideas of power and Gramsci’s theory of hegemony, I have begun to understand how the relationship between white masculinity and ableism forms an oppressive consciousness. Using structural and post-structuralist traditions will result in a conflict of explanation in navigating how social relations foster an oppressive consciousness. On the other hand, I have found it useful to describe interpersonal relationships and social structures using many different theoretical paradigms. For instance, Foucault (2003) details how power relations exist in all social processes and interact with all relations. Power is not random and people are not unaware of its existence—it is intentionally used against certain social groups. Gramsci’s description of hegemony suggests that power is concentrated in different social relations and social structures. Ableism and masculinity share a similar connection in both their establishment of power and social control. Both social relations are used to serve the interests and maintain the power of those that benefit from it—in this case, the able-bodied male. The ruling group uses various modes of violence and structures to subordinate certain groups, which ultimately secures their social position. In examining white masculinity and ableism with different theoretical conceptions of power, we can begin to have a complex understanding of how power creates hegemonic social relations and conditions of oppression and exploitation.

The body of the patriarchal male is one that must be able-bodied, and hold characteristics that are not impeded by physical, mental, or emotional impairments (Ostrander, 2010). The patriarchal male is thought to be strong and exhibit little emotion, including any manifestations of pain. Impairment and the corporeality of pain for people with disabilities is an important element in understanding how disability is experienced (Crow, 1996). Thus, in order for the patriarchal male identity to exist, it must include the ideology of ableism that rejects all bodies with impairment. Oppressive masculinities can be used to justify the rejection of the disabled body by drawing from the dominant forms of productivity and to justify which body is best suited for the well-
being of society. The social relations of ableism and masculinity contribute to social hierarchies of communities and bodies (Smith, 2006). Within these hierarchies, bodies with disabilities must disappear and should always be disappearing (Ostrander, 2010).

Ableism has been constructed in such ways to become part of masculinity and create new power relationships. The masculinity that I have been socialized with has always included a rejection of disability via ableism. Ableism has also been negotiated in terms of forming an ableist gaze, which views people with disabilities as objects of pity rather than respect. This has and continues to segregate and oppress people with disabilities, while maintaining the hegemony of an able-bodied masculinity. I will now seek to understand new forms of power relationships and how they are presented through the relationship of masculinity and ableism.

**Oppressive Consciousness and Action**

This paper has focused on describing how social relations come to dominate and influence people’s consciousness. Using a Marxist-feminist understanding of consciousness, we see that consciousness is formed through our actions and experiences in the world. A person’s consciousness consists of their ideas and perceptions of social complexities and their own material reality (Mojab & Carpenter, 2011). The following examples will show how the social relations of white masculinity and ableism create an oppressive or uncritical consciousness.

**Sexuality and Power**

The following section clarifies the relationship between masculinity and ableism by exploring language, sexuality, and internalization. Ableism is grounded in structures of domination and control, and similar to masculinity, ableism is embodied in the personal subject and is dispersed through economics, politics, and social environments (Kaufman, 1995). A way in which an oppressive masculine identity can be threatened is through the connotation that a man is feminine. A man is called a “pussy” or a “bitch” if he shows emotion, compassion, and sensitivity (Ostrander, 2010). These attitudes are contrary to the tough, powerful, assertive, and insensitive male. Similarly, when a man does not show strength, assertiveness, and the capabilities of a fully able body, then he operates outside of the dominant norms of masculinity. Here, one can see the similarity of the masculine identity in relation to ableism. The oppressive male is “disabling” these bodies by calling them “lame” or a “retard.” This language operates to universally exclude people with disabilities from the dominant conception of normalcy. Disabling language is used as a response to a potential threat of masculinity.

In the context of the masculinity, I have been socialized with the notion that a man must be sexually-driven and sexually-capable. The disabled body, however, is seen to be asexual (Ostrander, 2010). A man who has an impairment that is perceived to affect his sexuality or sexual ability is deemed to be inferior to the white masculine standard. The masculine body must be attractive and sexually appealing within the standards of normalcy and a body with impairment does not fit into this criterion and is thus, excluded (Begum, 1992). The oppressive male’s ability to have sex and be sexually appealing is represented in the disabled body’s “lack of.” Male identities are empowered and maintained because of their “normal” ability to have sex and to be sexually appealing. Because of the perceived notions of the disabled body’s (in)ability to be sexually active or sexually appealing, the able-bodied male, particularly in heteronormative understanding, is deemed to be “more of a man.” The disabled male body will consequently
never fit notions of a man. Thus, a hierarchy is formed with the able-bodied man over the disabled man.

When violence is used on peoples’ bodies, sometimes, it is in response to a perceived threat to their masculinity. Violence can also be used to maintain the power of the able-bodied male. When a male feels like their masculinity is threatened, they may react with violence to alleviate any feelings of powerlessness and to prove himself as a true man (Connell & Messerschmidt, 2005). When a man feels as if his masculinity is threatened, he may turn to sexual violence against an individual because he may feel like he can restore his power and thus his conceptions of being the oppressive male quickly (Kimmell, 2007). As Begum (1992) argues, the ableist male can be attracted to a woman with disabilities and targets her with sexual violence because she is seen to be more passive and vulnerable. Often, the man feels free to assert his power over her. Because disabled women are seen to be more passive, the man’s power is reinforced and amplified. The targeting of people with disabilities and asserting sexual violence upon them then reinforces male dominance by exhibiting and highlighting his characteristics of strength, misogyny, and sexual veracity (Connell, 2002; Tollestrup, 2009). This description of sexuality and power reveals the dynamics of how masculinity-ableism is entangled with daily life experiences.

Symbolic Violence and Internalization
To protect the dominance of the able-bodied male, there are specific structures and social relations prevalent in Canadian society that maintains this identity. One way that this is accomplished is through symbolic violence (Bourdieu, 2004). Symbolic violence is a form of self-regulation that controls the population’s behaviours and identities, without their knowledge of this ongoing process. Dominant values of society are instituted through self-regulation and controlling one’s actions, which forces people to represent a masculine identity. If a man acts outside of this dominant identity—by acting feminine, for example—that man will experience shame, guilt, internal conflict, and embarrassment (Bourdieu, 2004). These are seen as negative emotions and qualities that are reflective of deviant behaviour. Thus, a man is attacking himself internally is also simultaneously attacked by society. In maintaining a masculine identity, a man rejects and hides any attribute that is perceived to be feminine or disabled. Accordingly, he then strives to avoid and reject any future displays or expressions of femininity or disability that would further inhibit his masculinity. This rejection of self originates from an oppressive consciousness of masculinity and ableism. As Smith (2006) reminds us, people adopt oppressive behaviour so they are not placed at the lower end of the social hierarchy. This normalizes oppressive behaviour and thus solidifies the oppressive power structure of ableist masculinity (hooks, 2004). Societal organization perpetuates social relations of masculinity and ableism, thus individual acts outside of the confines of oppressive behaviour is insufficient in revolutionizing oppressive social relations.

Conclusion
Dialectical reasoning reveals that dominant gender and ability social relations are connected. The focus on power and symbolic violence displays how an oppressive consciousness is formed through the operation of social relations in daily life. The operation of white masculinity and ableism is always in constant flux to maintain its dominance as social relations. The focus on sexuality clarifies the role gender and patriarchy plays in erasing the experiences and differences
of people with disabilities. Furthermore, sexuality and symbolic violence describes how characteristics of oppressive masculinities are internalized. The oppressive masculinity I have experienced is described as aggressive, productive, and valuable, while the disabled body is marked as deficient, exploitable, and inferior. Consequently, the disabled body threatens the values and existence of masculinity. It is important to remember that masculinity is not a static description, but rather changes and evolves depending on the place and history, and this description and relation has come from my time and my history. Presently, I see an internalized ableism as necessary for an oppressive masculinity to perpetuate its patriarchal foundation. A hegemonic social relation must be supported by the internalization of the ideology and also by outside structures to maintain dominance.

Works Cited


Beyond ‘Educational Tourism’: Informal and Incidental Learning Outcomes as an Example of Critical Pedagogy in Short Term Travel Study

Lisa Stowe
University of Calgary

Abstract: This paper utilizes a framework developed by Marsick and Watkins (1990) to explore the significant learning outcomes in the informal and incidental learning situations provided by short term travel study programs. Analysis of the reflective essays and excerpts from preliminary interviews of participants of the short term travel study program, Food Culture in Spain 2011, suggest that students see themselves differently as food consumers and learners after only three weeks abroad, reinforcing the critical pedagogical objectives of this program.

Introduction
As an Instructor at the University of Calgary, I have organized and taught three short term travel study programs called “Food Culture in Spain.” I see each and every time the powerful effects such a program can have on undergraduate students. Such effects include a more collaborative and informal peer learning environment and an appreciation for how field trips and nontraditional classroom settings can give them multiple perspectives, on not just the content studied, but also on their own perspective as learners. As a result of these and other learning attributes, my short term programs foster some of the most engaged undergraduates I have ever worked with. Yet on the part of many education scholars, there is still resistance to the pedagogical value of such programs. The bias in the literature favors longer term study abroad, suggesting that students need extended time in the field to absorb the culture, to acquire intercultural skills necessary to develop as global citizens and to realize significant learning outcomes (Canadian Bureau of International Education Report 2009). If longer time is not an option then the literature suggests that short term program curriculum often needs anchoring in substantial on-campus or service learning components to have rigor (Lewis and Neisenbaum 2007; McLaughlin and Johnson 2006). As Woolf (2007) points out, some see short term programs as nothing more than educational tourism. Tourism implies an less active role in experiencing another country where participants are more observers than actors.

I posit that, instead of measuring these short term programs against the lengthier semester or year-long study abroad, it is necessary to examine short term programs from theoretical perspectives that highlight the informal and incidental learning situations of this unique learning environment. In the Spain 2011 program, students formed a community of learners that were together 24 hours a day for three weeks. They ate, slept, studied, socialized, read, wrote, prepared and presented together. The lines between the academic and the social intersected by virtue of the academic workload, social experiences, and the short time that students spent in the program. In this program students participated in creating and distilling knowledge in a variety of informal and incidental learning situations that critically challenged the way they saw themselves as food consumers and as learners.
Literature Review
While the body of literature is small, there has been some research done in the area of short term travel study programs. Sachau, Brasher and Fee (2010) highlight, through an extensive literature review of the current research on short term travel study, many of the benefits of such programs, including global citizenship awareness and increased cultural sensitivity. Chieffo and Griffiths (2003; 2009) have published extensively on survey design and implementation to help educators measure learning. McLaughlin and Johnson (2006) explore how curricular design and assessment tools can help enrich the shorter term programs. Ritz (2011) emphasizes a combination of short term travel and on-campus programming as an example of holistic pedagogy. These studies are good starts to promoting the benefits of short term travel study, but the focus on skill acquisition and cross cultural outcomes does not address how students learn in short term travel study programs. There is a gap in understanding the type of learning that takes place, and a lack of attention to how students perceive their own learning in these programs.

Theoretical Perspective
The key to understanding how students learn in a short term travel study is to see and hear from students themselves how the continuous three week program is a site of informal and incidental learning. The curriculum is designed by the instructors to purposefully help students construct their own knowledge in the field. This fits into the instructors’ critical pedagogical perspective that students, when given the tools to critically analyze complex issues, can co-create knowledge and become critical learners. Central to this perspective is the concept that learning can happen anywhere, and that often, there is an intersection between formal and informal learning that can not be so neatly demarcated (Billett 2002; Coffield 2006; Malcolm, Hodkinson, & Colley, 2003). Like other adult educators, Marsick and Watkins (1990) see the divisions between informal and formal learning as institutionally determined, suggesting that learning “…take[s] place whenever people have the need, motivation, and opportunity for learning” (p. 28). They claim that learning is “not linear” (p. 29) but rather “more an ebb and flow as people begin to make sense of a situation” (p. 29). Learning grows from everyday encounters that happen within a specific context (p. 29). For Marsick and Watkins, informal and incidental learning is characterized as “integrating with daily routines, triggered by an internal or external jolt” (p. 29), and includes ‘an inductive process of reflection and action’ and is “linked to the learning of others” (p. 29). Informal and incidental learning situations are key to highlighting the learning outcomes of students in short term travel study as students engage with formal curriculum but in a very informal social situation, often weaving their way through experiences, not as some linear traveller with a set itinerary, but rather moving back and forth between ideas and concepts studied throughout the three weeks. This “ebb and flow” can be seen as they integrate those academic ideas into daily routines and as they learn from each other.

Methodology and Methods
This paper is part of a larger qualitative explanatory case study based on my 2011 short-term travel study program, a three week program that offered students experiential and reflective learning aimed at understanding food culture in Spain. The program was comprised of 27 undergraduate students, two instructors and a program assistant. In accordance with ethics protocol, all students in the program were given the choice of whether to participate in the study. 13 students agreed to participate in this study, representing different years of program in departments and faculties as diverse as Business, Communication and Culture and Fine Arts. I
remained unaware of who had agreed or declined to participate in the study until all grades were submitted to eliminate any bias while in the field. While in the program, students completed three courses; one was completed within the three week program, while two others were completed by way of final essay submission upon return to Canada. Prior to the three week program in Spain, students attended three pre-departure classes where main academic concepts and themes were defined. For the one course completed in the three weeks, students wrote five reflective essays, presented in groups on an article connected to a field trip, and wrote a final exam on the last day of the program. This paper will primarily focus on the reflective final exams and short reflective essays produced in the field, offering a picture of how the students synthesized and interpreted their situations and environments as the three weeks unfolded. Supplementing this textual analysis are excerpts from 6 preliminary interviews done with students eight months after the end of the program. Sections of these interviews highlight the effect time and group work had on learning during the three week period illustrating, once again, how incidental and informal learning situations within a three week program help students understand themselves differently as learners and food consumers.

Analysis
A communications studies course titled, The Popular Culture of Food in Spain, emphasized a synthesis between experience and theory by anchoring the students with regularly submitted reflective essays. The topics for these essays were selected as the program progressed to take advantage of the ideas or concepts that came up in the field from group discussions or from student comments. Often a passing word from a student, or an observation about how students reacted to particular field trips, led to the reflective prompt. Students participated in constructing triggers that then allowed them to reflectively assess their learning situations, exemplifying the very non-linear model that Marsick and Watkins present. This type of formal assignment was situationally based and required students to link their experiences back to both the concepts or readings completed earlier in the program, and previous field trips or outings. The final exam reflection essay formally prompted students to consider how their food consciousness and relationship to food was affected by their experience in Spain. They were required to incorporate and synthesize three scholarly articles but were unlimited in the number of experiences they could draw upon. Again, the prompt was a formal request made by an instructor, but the student was given the choice to incorporate the more informal experiences to help articulate what they learned in the program and how they now see themselves as food consumers.

Learning integrated with daily routines
It was apparent, while in the field, that students adapted to living in Spain very quickly, even though they knew it was for only a short period of time. They took advantage of many typically Spanish food customs including frequenting tapas and pintxos bars, integral parts of daily routines for Spanish culture. During the three weeks the students made that routine part of their daily socializing and the rhythm of daily life in Spain became a powerful means of seeing their relationship to food in a new way. Such experiences became vivid examples of food consciousness that many students linked to required readings and incorporated into their final reflective exam. One student describes a tapas outing where the physical work of the tapas routine challenges many notions of what it means to feed herself:
The tapas culture requires that you work for your food, but rewards you with unending tidbits of delicious (yet unexpected) combinations. This feeling of having my comfort zone challenged was essential to shifting my perspective on consumer consciousness and the pleasures of eating. Being so involved in the process, fighting to get up to the bar, shouting to order, without knowing what you are getting, even keeping track of your own bill, puts an onus and responsibility on the diner and sharpened my perspective and made me appreciate my food, and the pleasure of eating, all the more.

For this student, being involved in the tapas process gave her a heightened sense of appreciation for the food and also shifted her perspective as an eater. The reward became not just a ‘tidbit’ to satiate hunger but a new sense of what it means to literally interact in a food custom that is a regular occurrence for the locals.

Eating in pintxos bars became a form of fast food for the students as it became routine for them to frequent the pintxos bars after class or before another more formal outing. Such visits meant the students often saw a strong connection between the producer or owner of the tapas bars. According to one student:

There definitely is more of a connection to the producer as we saw in the pintxos bars of Vitoria and San Sebastian. Each place offered a selection of pintxos greater than the next. The innovative new varieties and the twists on the classics kept my mouth watering and kept me wanting more. The pride and care taken by the people serving the food was evident. There was no happy meal - just happy.

The play on ‘happy meal’ suggest a comparison to that other student-favourite fast food establishment, McDonalds, but students became increasingly aware of the differences between North American and Spanish notions of what constituted fast food.

The way students lived during the program was also an opportunity for them to learn about their food choices. In Calgary, most of them live on strict budgets. They have to balance their school and their leisure and, while a very small number of them can treat three weeks in Spain as a vacation, for the larger majority of them three weeks is a long enough time they have to implement their at-home budgeting skills in their travel environment. For one student, an informal picnic in the middle of the program taught her the benefits of socializing while eating, as well as budgetary considerations while traveling. She writes, “My picnic experiences have taught me that not only does eating in or buying from markets instead of a restaurant make me more in control and allow for stronger social connections, it actually costs less.” Budgetary shopping also took the form of frequenting markets as opposed to grocery stores -- a normal routine for most Spaniards, but an unfamiliar one for most students. In Calgary most of them shop for food in multinational grocery stores where there is little connection to food producer. One student, in her final exam, compares food shopping in Spain and at home:

When I think back to the meat market the thing that jumps out at me as the cause of this realization was the knowledge that the butchers had about their products and their willingness to share that information with us freely. As we listen to them talk about their products, I imagined trying to have the same conversation with someone in the meat
department at Superstore and I decided that the experience just wouldn’t be quite the same.

From such routine shopping trips, students gained a new awareness of food producers and food knowledge, not through an academic journal or assignment, but directly from the producer. Students began to participate in a re-visioning of buying food at home, acknowledging the labour going into food production. As one student wrote, “Having witnessed first hand the connection to food that Spaniards have has forced me to examine my own relationship with food. I find myself questioning if it is not the best I can get, why am I putting it in my mouth?” The routine during the three weeks of shopping daily in small markets made them realize the differences between food relationships in Canada and food relationships in Spain, challenging their understanding of the producer-consumer relationship.

Learning linked to others
Spending so much time together meant for some students that there was an opportunity to learn from each other. Many students, in the interviews, described what can be best described as Peer Assisted Learning, even though there was no formal structure in place for such learning to take place. Most students saw the physical space of classes in the field as activating peer assisted learning. One student commented that the hotel salon where we held our first class allowed her to see her peers’ body language and facial expressions, eliminating the intimidation that she often felt in the traditional classrooms, saying “There was something about being there that didn’t make me feel as vulnerable.” For this student, the non-judgmental atmosphere created in this first class allowed her to approach her peers outside of formal classroom time when she was having trouble with a reflective assignment: “Walking in I had no idea what a reflection really was. Most other kids on the trip had written reflections before so knew exactly what they were doing so I was going to them for help...” Asking for help became easier when students were comfortable with their peers. Some students described the group as ‘more family’ than school and the ability to walk through a hotel and find groups meeting and working meant it was easier to attach to a group and do schoolwork than on campus where there can be a sense of disconnection from peers. Related to this comfort level amongst students is how communication between peers differed from on campus communication. Once student credits living together for three weeks as contributing to the familiarity amongst peers which in turn creates opportunities for peer learning:

Student: When you are all together all the time there’s always easy ways to say ‘okay maybe you should get started on this because you got to get this done’ because of this and you feel more comfortable saying ‘okay you really have to step it up. This is terrible.’

Interviewer: So you really do feel more comfortable talking to your peers in a language that maybe you wouldn’t use on campus?

Student: Oh for sure. Because you live with these people and you are moving around and you all are doing the same things so two weeks in you are more comfortable saying ‘Okay I’m really lost with what is going on, do you mind helping me with this, can you help me with this can you work with me through this’ versus on campus I would never do that.
The comfort level of traveling and living together allowed students to formally ask peers for help but peer assisted learning also happened incidentally. Dinner became a regular site for sharing and brainstorming ideas. One student describes, what for her was a typical nightly event:

...when we all went for dinner together we were discussing the food and we were discussing the assignments which is something you don’t really do at home when you go out for dinner as friends together. You don’t really talk about, ‘Oh this is what I am going to write for this paper.’ Or I don’t at least. Cause you are trying to get away from that school setting. But with us we would talk about, ‘Oh what are you going to write for that reflection?’ or everyone wanted to hear what everyone’s independent paper was about. So we would discuss that and then everyone was like, ‘oh I found out this that might help you or you should go talk to this person’ and I found that everyone helped each other with that.

Getting away from the school setting isn’t so easy on a short term program but it is apparent that the students didn’t seem to mind using social events as collaborative opportunities. Such dinner conversations also allowed students to share information about research possibilities and encouraged them to stay focused.

**Conclusion**

Despite scholarly suggestions to the contrary, it is apparent that the length of time in a three week program does offer some very significant learning outcomes. For many of these students the learning never turns off. It happens as daily routines are played out in tapas bars and food markets. Interestingly, such a compressed period of time also means students see their peers in a different way than they see each other on campus. The feelings of familiarity, comfort and shared experience create situations where peer assisted learning happens almost organically. These informal and incidental episodes, taken together with the more formal curriculum, highlight how such intense short term travel study programs can help students see themselves differently, not only as food consumers but also as learners and creators of their own knowledge. Such change of assumptions amongst this group of students show how short term travel study programs can be sites of critical pedagogy that is rigorous and academically sound.

**References**


Abstract: While literacy is central to the field of adult education, food literacy is just emerging as a crucial concept. Backed by the recognition that we all eat, food literacy has gained traction in an era of rising crises associated with food, from increasing world hunger to the so-called obesity epidemic. But current understandings of food literacy are inadequate for dealing with the crises we must learn our way out of – most definitions are apolitical, blame the victim and do not consider the larger context, thus constraining the ‘politics of the possible’. Reframing our understanding of food literacy within Habermas’ three knowledge domains and keeping in mind Freire’s insight that all education is political, a new definition of food literacy is put forward. This definition is placed within the three main and enduring traditions of adult education, allowing it to analyze current foodscapes and model sustainable alternatives.

Introduction

Literacy has always been central to the field of adult education – from its beginnings in organizations like the Mechanics’ Institutes and Frontier College to its current engagement with street youth, immigrants and high-school dropouts. Within the field, literacy has taken many forms, such as functional literacy, computer literacy and ecological literacy.

But these forms of literacy do not address a growing, and interconnected, set of issues that focus on food, including the power of transnational food corporations, the rise of various food movements and the recurrence of global food crises, along with the shocking revelation that there are now as many obese people in the world as there are starving ones. We need a new form of literacy to help us analyze and address these issues – food literacy. While other disciplines have adopted this term (e.g., nutrition, marketing and teacher education), adult education is just beginning to open up to questions of food and food literacy (see, for example, Liu, 2008, 2010; Sumner, 2008; Waterman, 2008). As a field that is deeply concerned with social movements and social change, adult education can infuse its expertise in literacy with the aspect of food – a critical combination because, in the end, we all eat.

This paper will explore a new and vital form of literacy – food literacy. It will open with a brief outline of literacy, and move to a discussion of the larger political-economic context of the global corporate food system before examining the question of food literacy. It will conclude with some observations of the importance of food literacy for the field of adult education.

Literacy

Over time, the understanding of literacy has shifted from humanistic and citizenship frames to an economic one (Taylor & Blunt, 2006), reflecting the neoliberal values that have come to dominate public policy and programs. For example, in 2000, the International Adult Literacy
Survey (IALS) defined literacy as “the ability to understand and employ printed information in daily activities, at home, at work and in the community – to achieve one’s goals, and to develop one’s knowledge and potential” (in Quigley, 2005, p. 384). A few years later, Human Resources and Skills Development Canada (in Taylor & Blunt, 2006, p. 326) narrowed the understanding by conceptualizing literacy as “the capacities required by persons to function effectively in the social spheres of work, community, culture, and recreation, including reading, writing, numeracy, and the essential skills required for employment, such as computer use, document use, and working with others.”

These differences in understanding point to tensions inherent in the study of literacy. According to Quigley (2005, p. 381),

"Few areas of research or practice have engendered more public debate; few have become more contested or politicized in the entire field of adult education. In effect, it has held a mirror to society reflecting its most fundamental knowledge requirements, its loftiest aspirations, and many of its primordial fears for well over 2 centuries."

These days, when literacy holds a mirror to society, it doesn’t like what it sees. It reflects a flabby population, the dominance of giant food corporations and rising hunger around the world. Clearly, a new form of literacy is needed to address these problems – food literacy – and the larger political-economic context guarantees that it will be just as contested as other forms of literacy.

The Political-Economic Context of Food Literacy

While literacy is undoubtedly an integral aspect of adult education, why is food literacy important? The larger political-economic context of an increasingly powerful global corporate food system provides the answer. Over the last fifty years, the introduction of processed foods, the vertical and horizontal integration of food corporations and the power of advertising have combined to produce a situation where, for example, 95% of American food is a corporate product (McMichael, 2000). Many of these products have been described by Michael Pollan (2008, p. 1) not as food, but as “edible foodlike substances.” Each year, Pollan points out, 17,000 new forms of such industrialized food are put on the market, backed by a $32 billion marketing machine to persuade people to buy into what has been called the Western diet, which has “lots of processed foods and meat, lots of added fat and sugar – lots of everything, except vegetables, fruits and whole grains” (p. 10). Wherever the Western diet has been adopted, he maintains, Western diseases predictably follow – obesity, diabetes, cardiovascular diseases and cancer. These so-called ‘lifestyle diseases’ wreak havoc on human health in both developed and developing countries. For example, Lawrence (2011) reports that a recent UN summit in New York confirmed that nearly two-thirds of all deaths worldwide in 2008 were attributable to lifestyle diseases. And the drive for ever-increasing corporate profits contributes to globalizing this Western diet:

As affluent western markets reach saturation point, global food and drink firms have been opening up new frontiers among people living on $2 a day in low- and middle-income countries. The world’s poor have become their vehicle for growth (Lawrence 2011, p. 8).
Little wonder that food literacy is an important – and contested – topic.

**Food Literacy**

The concept of food literacy has emerged with the rise of food movements and the growth of interest in food issues. A new term, its current meanings hint at a concept under construction. For example, the Food Literacy Project (2011) defines food literacy as the ability to organise one’s everyday nutrition in a self-determined, responsible and enjoyable way. Wiser Earth (2007), a social network for sustainability, puts forward a more encompassing definition:

Food literacy refers to the degree to which people are able to obtain, process, and understand basic information about food in order to make appropriate health decisions. Food literacy encompasses understanding labeling on food and knowledge of nutrition.

As part of their larger concept of food well-being – defined as a positive psychological, physical, emotional and social relationship with food at both the individual and societal levels – Block et al (2011) provide a nuanced engagement with food literacy. For these authors, food literacy is more than knowledge – it also involves the motivation to apply nutrition information to food choices.

Whereas food knowledge is the possession of food-related information, food literacy entails both understanding nutrition information and acting on that knowledge in ways consistent with promoting nutrition goals and FWB [food well-being] (p. 7).

Block et al (2011) put forward three main components of food literacy:

1. **Conceptual or declarative knowledge** – reading and acquiring knowledge about food, food sources, nutrition facts and other knowledge acquisition and apprehension activities involving food and nutrition.
2. **Procedural knowledge** – applying such knowledge to food decision making, including food shopping and preparation skills. Procedural knowledge requires the development of food scripts – food-related sequences of events, actions, or routines that occur in a particular context (e.g., how to shop for, prepare and sauté fresh broccoli). These food and nutrition scripts and procedural knowledge support a person’s food goals and food well-being.
3. **The ability, opportunity and motivation to apply or use that knowledge** – having the ability, opportunity and motivation to identify, understand, interpret, communicate and use information about food in various contexts.

Block et al (2011) make it clear that all three components are necessary for achieving food literacy – if one or more components is missing, the goal of food literacy is not met. And following their understanding of food literacy, Block et al (2011) define food illiteracy as a deficiency in food knowledge and inadequate ability, motivation and opportunity to acquire and apply that knowledge.
But just as literacy is a highly contested term, the new concept of food literacy is also being challenged.

A Critique of Food Literacy

In her article on food education as food literacy, Kimura (2011) argues that the food literacy approach is highly individualistic and apolitical. While acknowledging that there is a wide consensus that citizens do not know enough about food and they should become more informed, she refers to Guthman (2008) who points out that

food knowledge in contemporary agrofood politics tends to emphasize consumer choice, entrepreneurship, and self-improvement – elements that exacerbate neoliberal subjectivity and limit ‘the practice of the possible’ (in Kimura, 2011, p. 466).

For Kimura (2011), food literacy involves an individualized understanding of food choice, dietary behaviour and culinary practices.

In other words, it is because individuals do not have nutritional knowledge, cooking skills, or understanding of health impacts that these inappropriate behaviours and practices are prevalent. The remedy (e.g., food education) therefore is to supply sufficient knowledge and skills (p. 479).

Comparing food literacy to health literacy, Kimura (2011) maintains that an individualized approach not only entails a relatively simplistic understanding of the relationship between communication and behaviour change, but also fails to take into account social, cultural, economic and environmental factors. She contrasts an individualized food literacy framework

with a more structural understanding of food-related behaviors and practices as functions of cultural and social influence, one’s class position, gender stereotypes, social infrastructure, and the macrostructure of food and agricultural systems (p. 480).

In essence, Kimura (2011) concludes, food literacy “effectively depoliticizes food education” (p. 480), which becomes

a project of individual training and provision of information for people to “make a right choice,” without critically examining how individuals’ choices might be constrained or shaped by a wide range of factors. By equating the improvement of personal knowledge and skills to the solution, the food literacy concept implicitly blames individuals for food problems and crises (p. 480).

Kimura (2011, p. 480) proposes a broader kind of food education, aiming at a wider range of issues such as “changes in public policy, societal resource allocation, institutional practices, and economic and social conditions that shape individuals’ and communities’ control over food.” And while she dismisses the concept of food literacy altogether, can it be rehabilitated to engage with these issues and unleash the practice of the possible?
Reframing Food Literacy

To effect positive change in a globalizing world, food literacy must move beyond individualized prescriptions and notions of blame to become a concept that can analyze current foodscape and model sustainable alternatives.

As a knowledge-based understanding, food literacy holds great promise. But Block et al.’s (2011) three components of food literacy – conceptual or declarative knowledge, procedural knowledge and the ability, opportunity and motivation to apply or use that knowledge – spring from an individualized approach. We need a broader knowledge framework that can address Kimura’s (2011) critiques and rehabilitate the term – Habermas’ three knowledge domains.

In his study of knowledge and human interests, Jürgen Habermas (1978) challenged the dominance of instrumental forms of knowledge by presenting a framework that involved three knowledge domains. The first knowledge domain he called empirical/analytic knowledge, which Morrow and Torres (1995, p. 24) describe as being “based upon a desire potentially to control through the analysis of objective determinants.” Instrumental knowledge would fit into this category. In terms of food literacy, Block et al’s (2011) forms of knowledge would belong in this domain: nutrition facts, food sources and food shopping and preparation skills.

The second knowledge domain Habermas called historical-hermeneutic knowledge. This is knowledge that Morrow and Torres (1995, p. 24) describe as “based upon a desire potentially to understand through the interpretation of meanings.” Discourse analysis, narratives and “women’s ways of knowing” (Belenky et al, 1986) are all forms of historical-hermeneutic knowledge. In terms of food literacy, advertising and branding analysis, culinary histories, the emotional appeal of ‘comfort foods’ and the ambivalent relationship many women have with food (e.g., bulimia, anorexia and body image issues) would all belong in this domain.

The third knowledge domain Habermas called critical-emancipatory knowledge. This is knowledge “based upon a desire potentially to transform reality through the demystification of falsifying forms of consciousness” (Morrow & Torres, 1995, p. 24). Transformative learning, critical reflection and liberatory praxis are all part of critical-emancipatory knowledge. In terms of food literacy, the knowledge mobilization associated with food justice movements, the demands of food sovereignty and a critical understanding of issues like food deserts would all be forms of critical-emancipatory knowledge.

Instead of prioritizing one domain of knowledge, Habermas (1978) argued that humans need all three kinds of knowledge. Such a tripartite epistemology is more encompassing than Block et al’s (2011) narrow focus on individualistic, instrumental forms of knowledge as the basis of food literacy. Without including historical-hermeneutic knowledge and critical-emancipatory forms of knowledge, food literacy is doomed to remain a shallow, apolitical, individualistic conceptualization that will contribute little, if anything, to social change.

Paulo Freire (1976) has reminded us that all education is political, including literacy. In other words, to ignore the larger context and remain within one narrow domain of knowledge is just as political as serving food to the poor on the sidewalks in front of prosperous businesses (as Food
Not Bombs does) or driving a tractor into a McDonalds franchise (as French farmer Jose Bovée did to protest the damage to local food cultures by the fast-food giant). Freire maintains that he never reduced literacy to a set of techniques and methods. In his approach to literacy,

knowledge does not come as a formula or a ‘slogan.’ Rather, it is a fundamental way of being for individuals who work to re-create the world which they inherited and, in this process of construction and reconstruction, remake themselves… When the separation between thought and language and reality no longer exists, then being able to read a text requires a ‘reading’ of the social context from which it came (p. 71).

In her study of school gardens, Yamashita (2008) touched on some of the components necessary for a reframed understanding of food literacy that can ‘read the world’. She defined it as:

The ability to understand where food comes from and how it is produced, appreciate the cultural significance of food, make healthy decisions and recognize the implications – social, environmental, political, cultural and economic of the food we eat (p. 5).

The strengths of this definition include the appreciation of the cultural significance of food, the recognition of the broad spectrum of impacts of our food purchases and the embrace of the social, highlighted by the use of “we.”

Using Yamashita (2008) as a basis, combined with Habermas’ tripartite epistemology and Freire’s educational politics, a reframed understanding of food literacy would be as follows:

Food literacy is the ability to ‘read the world’ in terms of food, thereby recreating it and remaking ourselves. It involves a full-cycle understanding of food – where it is grown, how it is produced, who benefits and who loses when it is purchased, who can access it (and who can’t) and where it goes when we are finished with it. It includes an appreciation of the cultural significance of food, the capacity to prepare healthy meals and make healthy decisions, and the recognition of the environmental, social, economic, cultural and political implications of those decisions.

Food Literacy and Adult Education

In the introduction to the edited collection, Contexts of Adult Education: Canadian Perspectives, Nesbit (2006, p. 17) outlines the three main and enduring traditions of Canadian adult education:

- A set of unyielding social purposes, informed by passion and outrage, and rooted in a concern for the less privileged
- A systematic and sustained philosophical and critical analysis that develops the abilities to connect immediate, individual experiences with underlying societal structures
- A keen attention to the specific sites, locations, and practices where such purposes and analyses are made real in the lives of Canadians

These traditions provide a critical benchmark for assessing the adequacy of any understanding of food literacy. Learning nutrition information and practising shopping and cooking skills will not
meet the inherent demands these traditions place on adult educators. For food literacy to be relevant to adult educators in a globalized world, it must move beyond the individual atomised consumer to the social plane, with a bias toward the less privileged. It must also have the analytical capacity to ‘read the world’ and link that reading back to individual foodways. And it must be attentive to the spaces and places where these two obligations play out in the lives of adult learners.

Conclusion

The fact that we all eat confirms the need for developing the concept of food literacy within the field of adult education, and using it to address questions we face every day: how to interpret food labels; why is food full of empty calories cheaper than nutritious food; is it better to eat organic or local food; why is hunger growing in a world that is becoming richer; why should we care if farmland is sold for housing developments?

Levine (1982, p. 54 in Quigley, 2005, p. 383) remarked that “the social and political significance of literacy is very largely derived from its role in creating and reproducing – or failing to reproduce – the social distribution of knowledge.” The same can be said of food literacy. Following Freire, food literacy should help people read the world through the social construction and sharing of all three domains of knowledge in the realm of food. Without this ability, we remain vulnerable organisms in a hostile food environment.

References


Generals, Colonels, and Captains: Discourses of Militarism, Education, and Learning in the Canadian University Context

Nancy Taber
Brock University

Abstract: This paper discusses a feminist discourse analysis that explores the ways in which discourses of learning interact with discourses of militarism at four Canadian civilian universities named for military leaders. I discuss how this particular research topic became apparent to me and examine literature that connects education with militarism, taking a feminist anti-militarist adult education approach. Then, I explain my methodology and detail my findings, concluding that adult educators should contest gendered militarism in the various contexts in which they work.

Introduction
As a faculty member at a university named for a military leader (Brock University), I am continually confronted with the ways in which its military history is privileged and integrated into daily life on campus. In August of 2011, I happened upon a photograph on the university's home webpage, prominently displaying how orientation week was organized, by the Students' Union, around an army theme. Students were pictured wearing red t-shirts, with a cartoonish profile of General Brock above the words, "Isaac's Army," and felt hats made to look like military helmets (The Brock News, 2011). This example connects to other military representations at Brock, such as two larger than life paintings of General Brock and Chief Tecumseh at the entrance to the largest dining hall on campus. One wall of the cafeteria is covered by a 60 foot mural depicting the Battle of 1812, titled Reverberations (The Brock News, 2010). Although these portrayals may be understandable given the fact that the university is named after a military leader, is located at the site of major battles in the War of 1812 (St. Catharines), and is involved in the war's 200th anniversary celebrations, the valuing of the university's military history and connections is problematic.

What are the implications of viewing civilian university students as soldiers in an army, with attendant military representations? This question precipitated my interest in specifically exploring the ways in which militaristic ideas may be promoted in the Canadian post-secondary context. In particular, I wondered if other universities named for military leaders were experiencing similar dynamics. This paper therefore discusses a feminist discourse analysis (Lazar, 2005) that explores the complex ways in which discourses of learning interact with discourses of militarism at four Canadian civilian universities named for military leaders. First, I examine literature that connects education with militarism, taking a feminist anti-militarist (Enloe, 2000, 2007; Feinman, 2000) adult education approach (Taber, 2009). Next, I explain my use of the methodology of feminist discourse analysis. I then detail my findings that demonstrate the varying ways in which each of the universities' representations interact with discourses of militarism. Finally, I conclude that adult educators should continue to contest gendered militarism in the context of not only higher education, but the various contexts in which they work.
Theoretical Framework
In addressing this research, my feminist antimilitarist approach explores the ways in which the connected processes of militarization, masculinization, feminization, and globalization work together to privilege hegemonically masculine capitalist violence in ways that marginalize those deemed in need of protection and assistance (Enloe, 2007). I argue for a need to "critiqu[e] militarism and war from a learning lens" (Taber, 2009, p. 192) in order to explore not only how gendered militarism pervades daily life, but how it interacts with education systems.

There is a "merging phenomena of militarization and corporatization ...[which] are shaping not only the terrain of school but the broader society" (Saltman, 2011, p. 2) which extends to higher education (Giroux, 2011). Unfortunately, "the goals of universal public provision of schooling is replaced with the metaphors of 'competition' and 'choice'" (Saltman & Gabbard, 2011, p. 21) wherein those who succeed are considered as more deserving than those who do not, with little or no attention paid to the ways in which society and education typically work to marginalize specific groups of people. It can be difficult to critique issues of militarism (Apple, 2002, 2006) and gender (Webber, 2005, 2008) in masculine educational institutions that are becoming increasingly corporatized and conservative. Combining the two into a critique of gendered militarism can be particularly challenging (Taber, 2011). In universities which promote their military heritage, a feminist antimilitarist critique may conceivably question certain aspects of its very foundations.

Research Design
This research focuses on Canadian civilian universities named after military leaders, of which I found four: Brock University, named after Sir General Isaac Brock; Dalhousie University, General George Ramsay, 9th Earl of Dalhousie; McGill University, Colonel James McGill; and, Simon Fraser University, Captain Simon Fraser. The research addresses the following questions:
To what extent is the military background of the namesake emphasized by university stakeholders? Are discourses of militarism present? How might these discourses interact with the oft-stated higher education ideal of critical inquiry? In what complex ways might discourses of learning interact with discourses of militarism? And, finally, what are the implications of these interactions for adult education?

As Lazar (2005) explains, "For feminist CDA, the focus is on how gender ideology and gendered representations of power are (re)produced, negotiated and contested in representations of social practices... [and] in text and talk" (p. 11). For the purposes of this research, I focus on the representations on the university websites as relates to discourses of militarism and learning. In particular, I explore how each namesake is represented, how his history is told, and how/if these aspects are integrated into other aspects of university life. I examine how these discourses interact with each university's most recent reports. With the exception of Brock University, my focus is solely on the discourses and representations found on the universities' websites.

Findings
Findings indicate that each university website differentially draws on and represents its military connections. For instance, Dalhousie discusses the "spoils of war" on its "History & tradition" page (Dalhousie University, n.d. para. 3) but does not mention Lord Dalhousie's personal military history; it is noted that Sir Isaac Brock "died defending Niagara" (Brock University,
2010, para. 1) "while leading his soldiers in a charge" (para. 7) with his believed last words, "Surgite! Push on" (para. 3) as the university's motto; and, McGill briefly mentions its founder's military history in the description of his life. Simon Fraser University is the only university website wherein I could not find any mention of its namesake, Captain Fraser, let alone any discussion of his military past. Each of these men, with the exception of General Brock, were arguably known more for other accomplishments in the areas of trading, exploring, and politics than for their military ones. Nonetheless, each university, other than Simon Fraser, does promote masculinist militarism in various ways, interconnecting with its namesake's history and the university's current textual representations and context.

Taken alone, the phrases mentioned above may be viewed as benign; however, when analyzed for militaristic discourses that reach beyond the webpages, particularly as relates to official annual reports, it becomes clear that they have further implications. As an example, on the same webpage, one paragraph celebrates how "The spoils of war helped fulfill his [the Earl of Dalhousie's] dream" (Dalhousie University, n.d., para. 3) to the found the university. Yet, another paragraph describes how he "wanted to establish a Halifax college open to all, regardless of class or creed" (para. 2). As war works to dehumanize the enemy (Butler, 2003; Enloe, 2007), it begs the question of who the student population was intended to be, particularly when the wording of "spoils of war" glorifies violence and othering. The discourse of militarism is at odds with the discourse of acceptance. This does not mean that those in the university do not necessarily engage in accepting practices, but that competing discourses are present in its public communications.

In another example, Brock University has been increasing its focus on the military history of its namesake. Although the official image in the university logo has recently been changed from a profile of General Brock to a fingerprint, the profile has reappeared on the front cover of the Fall 2011 Convocation program. Brock's last words are mentioned inside (Brock University, 2011, p. 6). Additionally, his image is now on student identity cards, creating a juxtaposition of students' own images with that of a white military man. Concurrently, the 2010-2011 Annual Report highlights that we live "in a relentlessly competitive world" (Brock University, 2011/2012, p. 2) where only some will "prevail" (p. 2). The focus on competition, much like McGill's "world-beating" alumni (McGill University, 2011a), highlights a fight (or war) for scarce resources where only the best rise to the top; how then, is it possible that "everyone wins" (Brock University, 2011/2012, p. 2), as the report claims? The question arises, who is "everyone"? From the accompanying photo (p. 3), it appears that "everyone" is young white men and women graduates, perhaps those who best emulate the qualities of General Brock (white, male and masculine (or its equivalent, female and feminine), "heroic," and of British heritage) as pictured on their student cards. These discourses of competition and militarism highlight a tension between the aim of "help[ing] students become better thinkers, better citizens" (p. 4) and the aim of competing in zero-sum game where some must prevail over others.

Colonel McGill is presented in ways similar to General Ramsay and General Brock, as a caring yet masculine man whose aim was to better society. McGill was involved in "the rough-and-tumble world of the fur trade" (McGill University, 2011b, para. 3) keeping him "in almost constant danger" (para. 3). He was involved in the war of 1812, as he "led the defence of Montreal" (para. 5). In the Principal's Report (McGill University, 2010/2011), McGill is credited
with bringing "together two worlds that, on first blush, seem unlikely bedfellows: the intellectual milieu of the Scottish Enlightenment and the rough Canadian frontier" (p. 1). There is very much a discourse of winners and losers, us and them, where winners (us) are deserving and losers (them) did not try hard enough, in the Principal's Report. For instance, James McGill "flourished where others floundered" (p. 3), growing "his fortune by hard work" (p. 4). McGill University "appl[ies] today the same gutsy ingenuity that James McGill possessed in order to achieve our goals and compete with the best" (p. 4). McGill "people are cut from a special cloth" (p. 5); "where others see obstacles and stumble, we create opportunity and seize it" (p. 5). How does this fit into the "betterment of the world" (p. 1) where it seems that only the deserving survive? While Colonel McGill's military history seems to be less prominent than General Brock's, there is certainly a comparable discourse of militaristic competition and victory in the websites and reports.

The Dalhousie University Annual Report (Dalhousie University, 2009-2010) discusses funding, research grants, and student recruitment. Approximately half of the three page "Message from the President and Vice-Chancellor" focuses on "pension problems" and "labour contract negotiations" (p. 3) as "challenges" (p. 4), setting a tone of the university administration against the unions in the very first pages of the report. Additionally, it highlights "an increasingly-competitive environment for students and research funding" with a need for "aggressive strategies" (p. 4) in order to succeed as a university. Again, a fight for scarce resources (funding and students) is highlighted. Furthermore, a gendered classed perspective is taken in the use of such words as "mankind" (p. 26), eclipsing the lives of women, and "needy and deserving students" (p. 31), raising the question of whether some students are perceived as perhaps needy but undeserving. These are just a few examples in a report that also discusses such positives as student support, community connections, and efforts to decrease harassment and increase inclusion; yet, the use of certain words and phrases throughout point to very specific discourses that operate as a hidden curriculum in the document itself and perhaps in the university as well.

Unlike the other universities, Simon Fraser does not appear to utilize the same discourses of aggressive competition. While still acknowledging the need for funding and student recruitment in a "challenging time" (Report to Donors section, para. 1), the Simon Fraser University 2010/2011 Report to the Community (Simon Fraser University, 2010/2011) uses phrases such as "attract the best students, teachers and researchers" (Student-centred section, para. 2) as opposed to words such as "compete." Each section of the report discusses community connections and importance of making a societal difference; they are not isolated in one place. In short, the document reads differently from those of the other universities discussed here. Although the report's focus differs (it is not an annual report but a community one), the discourses it draws on are quite dissimilar than the other universities named for military leaders, leading to the supposition that perhaps universities which do highlight their military heritage are indeed more militaristic than those that do not. The research undertaken here is not a comparative analysis of all universities with military heritages in comparison to all those without, so I am not arguing for a definitive conclusion, but the results are thought-provoking. In these cases, overt military connections do appear to permeate certain aspects of the university websites and reports. At Brock University, it also appears to permeate university life. A newspaper article about a donor's $1,000,000 donation for a campus monument to General Brock reported that "Lightstone [the university president] said in recent years the university community has developed a deepening
sense 'there is a legacy that comes to us as a result of being named for Sir Isaac Brock'" (Herod, 2011, p. A4). But Brock University, like the other universities discussed here, is a civilian university, not a military one. Legacy or not, the aim of universities is not to support or valorize the military. As in Ben-Porath's (2006) discussion of public education systems, schooling "should never be made responsible for creating soldiers. Creating citizens is the first and foremost responsibility of a public education system in a democratic country" (p. 55).

**Implications**

This research focused on a discourse analysis of a very select group of documents and website representations. It is not intended to extend to all university documents nor to extend findings to the actual beliefs and actions of university members, which are themselves extremely diverse. Furthermore, the analysis of Brock University was more extensive due to my physical presence on campus and ability to view artifacts such as paintings, identification cards, convocation programs, and local news articles. It is conceivable that I may have found similar representations at the other universities explored here. However, it does appear that, although the reports and websites of Dalhousie and McGill University do emphasize certain military connections and militaristic discourses, Sir General Isaac Brock, as a university namesake, is promoted in much more ubiquitous ways than the military namesakes at the other universities.

I began this research as a way to broaden my focus, but have found it to return to Brock. The increased embeddedness of its masculine militaristic discourses is disconcerting. As evidenced by Simon Fraser University, a military namesake does not demand a militarist stance. Higher education should "oppose the death-dealing ideology of militarization and its effects on the world" (Giroux, 2011, para. 22), not embrace it. When militaristic neoliberal ideals are promoted, critical inquiry and democratic citizenship suffers. "Citizenship becomes defined by an anti-critical following of authority; knowledge becomes mistakenly presented as value-free units to be mechanically deposited; schooling models the new social logic that emphasizes economic social mobility rather than social transformation" (Saltman, 2011, p. 5). Ironically, "while the United States [and Canada] offers no public universal higher education program in civil society, it does so through the military" (Saltman, 2011, p. 8), lending to the competition for funding that each of the universities discussed here face. Additionally, the Canadian military recruits on many university campuses (Patterson, 2007), begging the questions, might any explicit military connections make students more amenable to recruitment? Might they be viewing the military with an uncritical eye wherein "war becomes a source of pride rather than alarm, while organized violence is elevated to a place of national honor" (Giroux, 2011, para. 15)?

Universities contribute to society in many positive ways, but the militaristic trends discussed here are cause for concern. Many educators are speaking out about these dynamics, critiquing Canadian universities' "masculine marketplace framework" (Gouthro, 2002, p. 8), education's increasing focus (in the United States and Israel) on a belligerent citizenship that requires "an overpowering form of patriotic unity" (Ben-Porath, 2006, p. 13) wherein "deliberation and disagreement are widely regarded as threats to the security effort" (p. 15), and on increased militarism in American education (Apple, 2002, 2006; Giroux, 2011; Saltman, 2011). This research adds to this literature by exploring how discourses of neoliberal masculine militarism are invading Canadian higher education.
Militarism interacts with Canadian higher education through discourses present in university websites and annual reports, pointing to the importance of continuing to explore and challenge how war, capitalism, and masculinity are intermeshed with formal education and learning in everyday life. "The movement against militarism in education must go beyond challenging militarized schooling so as to challenge the many ways that militarism as a cultural logic enforces the expansion of corporate power and decimates public democratic power" (Saltman, 2011, p. 16). To do so "requires a conscious effort to oppose the emergence of a culture of war, which is inimical both to democracy and to maintaining a vision of peace" (Ben-Porath, 2006, p. 119). Adult educators, therefore, should engage in this "conscious effort" in our various positions as professors, community workers, workplace trainers, and activists, to name a few. This engagement is not without its challenges and risks but, in doing so, educators can work to contest gendered militarism in its many forms and locations.

References


But what about the girls? Youth apprenticeship and social mobility

Alison Taylor
University of Alberta
Milosh Raykov
University of Alberta

Abstract: This paper compares Canadian data on adult and high school apprenticeship training programs with a focus on gender equity. Policy-makers are well aware of the multi-faceted challenges involved in attracting and retaining women in non-traditional trades. Youth apprenticeship programs have been promoted as both a way of meeting labour shortages and a means for non-college bound youth to be socially mobile. However, our findings suggest that such programs are disturbingly similar to adult programs in their failure to address gender equity.

Introduction
Youth transitions from secondary education to working life have become a policy focus in most OECD countries in recent decades. In Canada, most provinces support a range of secondary school initiatives intended to facilitate youth transitions particularly for non-university bound youth, the “forgotten half” according to a 1988 US report by the William T. Grant Foundation. Provincial education departments have encouraged school districts to more clearly articulate different career pathways for youth. One way to do this is through vocational education and training opportunities, including cooperative education, work experience programs, internships, and high school apprenticeship programs (Taylor, 2007).

This paper focuses on high school apprenticeship programs that allow students to work towards their high school diploma and apprenticeship certification at the same time. It is hoped that attracting younger apprentices will improve apprenticeship completion rates (Sharpe, 2003) while also raising high school completion rates. The policy literature also portrays high school apprenticeship training as an avenue for upward social mobility for youth who are unlikely to pursue university education (e.g., Government of Ontario, 2003). However, we know from national and provincial statistics that trades are gender segregated. Given that youth apprenticeship programs encourage youth to make occupational choices earlier (cf. Fitzenberge & Kunze 2005), this article considers whether such programs yield similar benefits for young males and females. We focus on the two provinces of Ontario and Alberta because, according to Statistics Canada (2012a, 2012b) they were ranked first and second in terms of the number of apprenticeship enrolments in 2009 (146,859 and 88,224 respectively). Further, the oil and gas sector boom in Alberta has spurred a significant increase in trades employment, from 9% in 1987 to 15% in 2007—nearly a quarter of plumbers, pipefitters, and gas fitters worked in Alberta in 2007 (Pyper, 2008).

The rest of this paper provides a review of the literature on apprenticeship and gender, followed by a gender analysis of national data related to apprenticeship systems in Canada, and analysis of a small dataset from our survey of youth apprentices in two provinces. Our purpose in this paper
is to compare our findings for youth with those focused on adult apprenticeship to see if high school programs are doing a better job of addressing gender equity issues.

**Literature related to gender and apprenticeship**

There are approximately 150 apprentice trades in Canada, most in manufacturing and construction, and approximately 2% of the labour force aged 15-40 are registered as an apprentice (Gunderson, 2009). Apprenticeship training is under provincial jurisdiction in Canada and therefore systems vary. However, statistics suggest that, across the country, women are underrepresented in trades, gender segregation is common, women are clustered in the lower-paying trades, and women tend to perform more menial tasks (Ménard, Chan, & Walker, 2007; Pyper, 2008; Scullen, 2008; Vojkovic, 2008). On a more positive note, female registered apprentices appear to be completing training at similar rates to men (Ménard, Chan, & Walker, 2007).

McMullen, Gilmore and Le Petit (2010) note that women made up only 11% of individuals who completed an apprenticeship program in 2007 and most of these ‘completers’ were in the ‘food and services’ trade group. In other trade groups, women made up only 1 or 2% of completions (Skof, 2010). More generally, the degree of gender segregation in ‘trade-vocational education programs’ (including in-class apprenticeship training) was higher than for community college programs overall in 1990, and earnings differences between women and men between 1992 and 1995 were largest for trade-vocational graduates and smallest for university graduates, according to data from the National Graduate Survey (Boothby, 2000).

Women tend to be overrepresented in trades like hairstyling and cook and are underrepresented in other trades (Vojkovic, 2008). Citing 2006 data, a paper about trades in British Columbia suggests that women were more concentrated among “trades helpers, construction and transport labourers and related occupations” compared to more lucrative positions in trades (ibid, p. 7). Findings from Saskatchewan also confirm a wage gap between male- and female dominated trades—in 2004/05, the median income for a certified female tradesperson across trades in the province was $29,371 as opposed to $52,305 for males (Scullen, 2008, p. 14). Findings also suggest gendered wage gaps within the same field (e.g. construction).

Authors address barriers to entry and retention in trades for women, including what Harris and Simons (2005) refer to as *antecedent* factors (personal agency, prior education and work experiences), *context* factors (e.g., support networks, labour market conditions) and *process* factors (workplace conditions and climate, quality of training on and off the job, etc.). Antecedent factors for women include gender stereotyping in social institutions, lack of awareness of skilled trades training and careers, and lack of hands-on skills (Vojkovic, 2008). Context factors include recruitment practices and internal labour markets that privilege males, and women’s lack of social networks (Mastracci, 2005), and process factors include sexist attitudes, unwillingness to properly support and train women, and long and inflexible working hours that exclude workers with family responsibilities (Clarke & Gribling, 2008). In addition, certain groups of women (e.g. Aboriginal and immigrant women) face additional barriers (Canadian Apprenticeship Forum, 2003; Vojkovic, 2008). Some authors also describe projects that have effectively addressed some of these barriers (e.g., Mastracci, 2005, in the US) or suggest ways obstacles could be addressed (e.g., Vojkovic, 2008 in Canada; Clarke & Gribling, 2008, in the UK). Writers tend to agree that problems are complex, and partners, including
different levels of government, need to prioritize equity goals and work together to address them.

Less research has been done in Canada on youth apprenticeship. However, studies suggest that young women in non-traditional trade occupations face particular challenges (Stone, 2005; Taylor, 2008). In international studies of youth apprenticeship, writers also observe gender segregation and its consequences (In Germany, Fitzenberge & Kunze, 2005, and in the UK, Beck, Fuller & Unwin, 2006; Miller, 2005; and Skeggs, 1988).

**Method**

This paper draws on primary and secondary quantitative data sources. Primary data collection includes data from surveys of youth who had participated in high school apprenticeship programs in Ontario and Alberta before 2006. We recruited former Ontario Youth Apprenticeship Program (OYAP) students in Ontario with the help of Apprenticeship and Industry Training. We recruited former Registered Apprenticeship Program (RAP) students in Alberta with help from a private-public foundation called CAREERS the Next Generation. In both provinces, an invitation to complete an on-line survey was sent to former high school apprentices, with an option to be contacted for a follow-up interview. 168 respondents completed the survey (68 former OYAP and 100 former RAP). Questionnaires asked respondents about their family background, experiences in high school, and training and employment outcomes. 100 interviews were also conducted and are in the process of being analyzed.

In addition to the RAP/OYAP Survey, this study uses the most recent data from the Registered Apprenticeship Information System, a yearly census on registered apprentice training in Canadian provinces and territories presented through the Statistics Canada CANSIM statistical information system (Statistics Canada 2012a; 2012b).

**Apprenticeship Training in Canada**

*Enrolments by Gender*

Our analysis of the most recent Canadian data from the Registered Apprenticeship Information System (CANSIM) shows that in 2009, 409,038 people (357,456 males and 51,582 females) were registered in apprenticeship training programs, more than a twofold increase since 1991. In this nearly twenty-year period, female enrolment in Canada rose more than six times (from 8,241 in 1991 to 51,582 in 2009). Nonetheless, women still represent less than 15% of all Canadians enrolled in apprenticeship training and an even smaller percentage of those who complete it.

From 1991 to 2009, female apprenticeship enrolment in Ontario increased from 4.8% to 21.6%, currently exceeding the Canadian average. However, in Alberta, female apprenticeship enrolment actually declined proportionately (from 9.1% to 7.5%). And whereas, from 1991 to 2009, female enrolment in Canada increased six and in Ontario ten times, it rose less than three times in Alberta (from 2,634 in 1991 to 7,773 in 2009). According to most recent CANSIM data (1991-2009), females accounted for more than 14% of apprentices in Canada, compared to 21% in Ontario, and a minimal 9% in Alberta. There are also differences in the ages of the female apprentices enrolled in the compared provinces. Half (49.7%) of those studying in Alberta are under 25, compared to Ontario (38%) and Canada (41.7%).

*Completion Rates by Gender*
A longitudinal study of apprentices in Canada found that 11 years after registering, about half of the apprentices had completed the trade they had started, almost half dropped out, and between 5 and 12% were still continuing (Prasil, 2005). But despite the relatively small number that finishes their apprenticeship training (30,088 vs. 409,038 registered in 2009), the completion rate (number of apprentices who complete apprenticeship training) in Canada has increased since 1991 by approximately 50%. In contrast, male completions in Ontario declined during the ’90s, and only regained the 1991 level in 2009. Despite the economic slowdown that affected other provinces, male apprenticeship completions in Alberta grew consistently.

Female apprenticeship completion in Ontario demonstrates a different trend from that in Alberta. Despite the very small number of female apprentices during the early ’90s, the number who graduated in Ontario increased by more than 6 times (from 245 in 1991 to 1,560 in 2009). Although female apprenticeship completion in Alberta during the ’90s was higher than in Ontario, the number of completions remained fairly constant and female completions increased only marginally (from 666 in 1991 to 738 in 2009).

The structure of female enrolment in apprenticeship training in Alberta has also changed. Enrolment in hairstyling and food service occupations has decreased, whereas the traditionally male-dominated trades (electricians, automotive services, welding) are gaining slightly in popularity. Unfortunately, the shift towards females enrolling in non-traditional trades has not created a similar shift in their completions. Females in Alberta are still more likely to complete a trade in hairstyling and food services than other trades. For example, a very small number of females registered as electrician apprentices completed their training (3.8% or 27 out of 708) in comparison with 13% (396 out of 3,033) registered in a hairstylist program.

**High School Apprenticeship**

*Secondary Data from Alberta and Ontario*

Between 1992, when the Registered Apprenticeship Program (RAP) began in Alberta, and 2010, almost 14,000 youth enrolled in the program. Enrolments in RAP grew rapidly, but then declined by more than 40% between 2006 and 2010 (Alberta Apprenticeship and Industry Training Board, 2011, p. 16). During the past 19 years (1992-2010), 2,441 or 17.5% RAP participants completed their apprenticeship training (ibid, p.16). Further analyses of the scarce data on RAP in Alberta (Alberta Apprenticeship and Industry Training Board, 2010, 2011) show that among the male-dominated occupations the largest numbers of apprentices receive certificates as welders (22%), heavy equipment technicians (11%), automotive service technicians (10%), electricians (11%) and carpenters (5%). These five RAP trades also had the highest enrolments in 2006 (Personal communication, AIT, 2007). Hairstyling, a female-dominated trade, represents only 14% of the RAP participants who are now certified tradespeople. Hairstyling was also the only female-dominated trade in the ‘top six’ in Alberta in 2006 (in sixth spot). A rough estimate of the number of new completers vs. the number of currently active RAP participants shows similar completion rates to adult apprenticeship programs in Canada.

In Ontario, we have data with enrolment by gender for the top six OYAP trades (by overall enrolment) between 2001 and 2006 (Personal communication, Ministry of Training, Colleges and Universities, 2007). These trades include auto service technician, cook, electrician, carpenter, machinist and hairstylist. Since most students in OYAP are not registered as
apprentices, we looked at data only for those who did register (demonstrating stronger commitment). These data suggest that women made up between 25% and 30% of enrolments (see Table 1). However, when we take out hairstylists, their proportion falls to less than 10% (see Table 1). In addition, women were well represented in the cook trade over this period, making up between 30 and 40% of registered apprentices. If we look only at male-dominated trades, therefore, the representation of young women in OYAP is no better than for the adult system. In Alberta, since only hairstylist was in the top 6 RAP trades in 2006, we can expect the proportions to be even lower.

Table 1: Females as a proportion of registered OYAP apprentices in top 6 trades, 2001-2006

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Females as % of top 6 trades</th>
<th>Females as % of top 6 without hairstyling</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2001-2002</td>
<td>26.3</td>
<td>7.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002-2003</td>
<td>28.1</td>
<td>6.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003-2004</td>
<td>30.</td>
<td>8.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004-2005</td>
<td>27.4</td>
<td>9.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005-2006</td>
<td>26.7</td>
<td>8.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Survey results indicate that female apprentices had parents with slightly lower levels of education. 61% were from families with mothers who had high school education or less in comparison with 50% of their male counterparts (see Table 2). In addition, 26% of female apprentices said their fathers had attained less than a high school diploma in comparison with only 12% of male apprentices. Although not statistically significant, 16% of females reported living in families whose earnings were below the average in comparison with 11% of males. Finally, 38% of female apprentices reported that their fathers work in skilled trades (38%), compared to 31% of males.

Table 2: Female apprentices’ Educational Attainments and Aspirations and the Highest Level of Their Parents’ Education

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Educational Attainment</th>
<th>Educational Aspirations</th>
<th>Mother’s Education</th>
<th>Father’s Education</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Less than high school</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High school diploma</td>
<td>34*</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trade certificate/qualification</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>College diploma</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University degree</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Aspirations and attainment of apprentices.

The career and educational aspirations of male and female apprentices also differ. Compared to 47% of males, only 31% of females aspired to become business owners, and the same number expected to become journeypersons compared to 48% of male apprentices. Results also show that females’ educational goals for the next 5 years were higher than those of their male counterparts. They much more frequently planned to attend college (26% vs. 11%, Chi-square =
5.655, \( p < .01 \)). However, the results also show that a much greater number of female apprentices expected to be involved in caring for family (45\% vs. 15\%, Chi-square = 16.369, \( p < .001 \)) and that many more females were uncertain about their educational goals (17\% vs. 7\%, Chi-square = 3.316, \( p < .07 \)). Unfortunately, our analysis also shows that fewer females who began an apprenticeship in high school have continued to work in their trade since high school (55\% vs. 79\%), and that more females than males discontinued their apprenticeship training (34\% vs. 25\%). An interesting finding from our interviews was that some young women viewed apprenticing in a non-traditional trade as a ‘back up’ plan.

Motivations and support for RAP/OYAP youth.
The results show that a statistically significantly greater number of females were encouraged to enroll in apprenticeship training by school counselors (29\% vs. 15\%; Chi-square = 3.881, \( p = .051 \)). Similarly, more females than males reported that encouragement from their parents affected their decision to enter RAP training. Almost 70\% of female apprentices considered their parents’ impact as significant, compared to 48\% of males.

According to the RAP/OYAP survey, no females reported having previous contacts in trades, while 10\% of males reported having some contacts who encouraged them to enter apprenticeship training (Chi-square = 4.301, \( p = .038 \)). Also, many more female (52\%) than male (35\%) apprentices reported that taking courses to gain work experience in trades was a significant reason to enter the RAP program. For almost three-quarters of female apprentices (72\%), the ability to earn a high school diploma through RAP was very important (compared to 57\% of male apprentices).

Finally, 12\% of females (compared to 4\% of males) believed more support to complete the required training would help them to continue working (Chi-square = 3.544, \( p < 0.06 \)). In addition, 19\% of females, as opposed to 8\% of males, said that higher wages would help them to stay employed in their trade (Chi-square = 4.065, \( p < .044 \)). This finding makes sense when we consider that earnings of RAP/OYAP youth differed noticeably, with 57\% of females earning less than $30,000 compared with only 27\% of males.

Concluding comments
The analysis above highlights gender differences in apprenticeship both in adult and youth training systems in Canada. Like authors writing about the adult system, and about youth apprenticeship in international contexts, we find a high degree of gender segregation in high school apprenticeship programs in Ontario and Alberta. Our preliminary analysis of RAP/OYAP survey data also indicates disturbing similarities in terms of the proportion of females versus males leaving trades and a gender gap in earnings. Our qualitative data promise to provide a more nuanced picture of the experiences of female youth in traditional and non-traditional trades.

Acknowledgements
Funding for this study was provided by the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada standard research grant and a postdoctoral research award (#756-2010-0481) from the same agency. Authors are grateful to Dr. Wolfgang Lehmann for his involvement in the OYAP part of the survey.
References


Adult Learning and Social Capital Theory: Towards the Development of a Measure for Adults with Low Literacy

Maurice Taylor, David Trumpower, and Ivana Pavic
University of Ottawa, Faculty of Education

Abstract: The purpose of this study was to assess the current scholarship on adult learning and social outcomes and to conduct a pilot study of a new measure called the Social Capital Inventory (SCI) in an adult high school custodial training program. Cronbach alphas were computed to assess the internal consistency of the items for the total scale and for each subscale. The total scale showed good reliability with alpha = .88; the reliability of the Network Qualities, Network Structures, Network Transactions, and Network Types subscales varied with alphas of .55, .56, .78, and .64, respectively. Results of the pilot study seem to suggest that how we measure social capital may be intrinsic to the adult learning process as trainees begin to realize the social outcomes of a literacy program.

Introduction

The problem of defining adult learning and measuring its impact on key social outcomes is complex and multi layered. Over the past decades, adult and workplace learning has often been seen through a narrow policy lens of preparing for employment and as a means for increasing wages and productivity (Riddell & Sweetman, 2001; OECD, 2005; Machin, 2006). However, with the need for greater social inclusion of several Canadian sub groups such as adults and workers with low skills, it has now become important to look beyond measures of earning and move towards measures of learning (HRSDC, 2009). According to the Organization for Economic and Cultural Development (2006, p.15) “a great deal is known about how much people earn after completed an additional year’s schooling, but a lot less is known about outcomes society intends education to provide and even less about the unintended consequences of learning.” Furthermore, the Canadian Council on Learning (2008) maintains that there are considerable gaps in our knowledge of adult learning and ways for understanding and measuring the non-economic outcomes to learning. In addition, the OECD (2005) has also acknowledged the fact that human capital theory does link education to economic returns but there as of yet no widely accepted theory linking education to social outcomes. Given this gap, one aspect of this important area that may further the debate on this complex phenomenon is adult learning and social capital. The purpose of this study was to begin the process of mapping out the terrain of adult literacy learning and social capital theory. The investigation explored some of the conceptualizations of social capital that are useful in understanding adult learning and training. Two key questions guided the inquiry: (1) What current knowledge base on adult learning and social outcomes is useful to begin the development of a measure of social capital for adults? (2) What were the results of a pilot study in an adult high school custodial training program that used a tool called the Social Capital Inventory?
Focused Literature Review and Orientating Theoretical Framework

Social Capital Perspectives
A critical review of the adult learning and social capital literature reveals that this new discipline of knowledge has been influenced by three major tracks of research. As a cornerstone of the literature, social capital as a concept begins with the influential work of Bourdieu (1986), Coleman (1987). Both of these sociologists arrived at a theoretical definition of social capital as a way of understanding the effects of the social environment, the social connections and social relationships through their own applied research. For Bourdieu, social capital is not reducible to economic capital or cultural capital, nor is it independent of them. In his later writings (1986, p.251) he defines social capital as “the aggregate of the actual or potential resources which are linked to possession of a durable network of more or less institutionalized relationships of mutual acquaintance and recognition.” Coleman’s framework (1990, p.302) was based on his intuition that the social structure within which individuals act are also a resource for individuals. However, it is the work of Putman (1996) and Lin (2001) who have popularized the concept in public and political discourses. More recently, Putman’s definition of social capital focuses on the existence of networks of social connection that produce norms of reciprocity and trustworthiness among individuals (2000). Building on this research, Lin (2001) defines social capital as the “resources embedded in a social network, resources that can be accessed or mobilized through ties in the network” (p.49). These theoretical and empirical investigations were influential in the ground work of the pilot study and the conceptualization of the tool – The Social Capital Inventory.

Social Capital Outcomes and Adult Literacy
A second track of literature focuses on adult literacy and social capital outcomes. The extensive work of Tete, Hall, MacLauchlan, Thorpe, Edwards and Garside (2006, 2008, 2009, 2010) provided the foundational research for understanding the benefits of adult literacy and numeracy learning through a social capital lens. As a way of operationalizing the concept, Tete et al. (2006) have defined it as the processes between individuals that establish norms, networks and trust to facilitate mutual benefits. In a study of over 600 basic education learners and 75 tutors in 9 geographical areas of Scotland, they found that this combined effect of trust, networks norms and reciprocity created both strong communities and a sense of social efficacy. Findings also seem to suggest that there is a need for active and willing engagement of individual learners in the creation of social capital. For example, MacLachlan, Hall and Tete (2009) found that respondents in adult and numeracy courses had very high social capital as they generally liked their neighbourhoods, were well integrated in their communities, voted and looked for opportunities for more local involvement. The researchers go on to say that the increase in self confidence was linked to social capital, prior experiences of learning and correlated to the ability of learners to acquire new skills and network with peers. Related studies in Australia conducted by Balatti, Black and Falk (2006, 2007, 2009) further confirmed that the pedagogy a teacher uses is a factor that influences social capital outcomes experienced by participants in adult literacy and numeracy courses. In one particular study, Balatti et al. (2006) conducted 75-face-to-face interviews with teaching staff and 57 learners across three cities in Australia. A set of 12 indicators drawn for the Australian Bureau of Statistics (ABS) social capital framework (2004) was used to measure social capital. These indicators measure change due to participants’ interaction in new networks. Examples of such indicators were change in the level of trust and the participant’s willingness to receive or provide support to others.
Results of this empirical investigation seem to indicate that there are three types of networks that students become members of through program participation. The first network is the formal network, the clearly observable structure and operation of the class. The second network is the teacher-based network, which involves the direct participation of the teacher and student within and outside of the classroom. Finally, the third network is the informal network, which can be defined as the informal network between student and student outside of the formal in class learning environment.

Measurement of Social Capital
A final theme of literature for the twofold purpose of this study is situated in the measurement of social capital. Starting from a meta-synthesis of the social capital measurement literature in elementary and secondary education, Dika and Singh (2002) suggest that the research in this area is still in its infancy. However, some early exploration has been done in attempts to link social capital to educational attainment, educational achievement and psychosocial factors that affect educational development. From a lifelong learning viewpoint, other investigations have also been conducted. These studies can be seen from various perspectives due to definitional diversity and issues of validity of the concept. For example, Baron Field, and Schuller (2000) suggest that questions of measurement can be categorized into three main issues: the methodological challenges of measuring social capital; the problems of explanation across time and the problem of aggregation of data from individual levels to social structural levels (p.26). From a different perspective, Castiglione, Van Deth and Wolleb (2008) propose a ‘bottoms up’ approach to issues of operationalization and measurability of social capital. In a similar vein, Van Deth (2008) maintains that it is possible to view the major measures of social capital in a classification scheme. He reports that there are several broad categorizations across three dimensions. The first dimension focuses on what is meant by the characteristic. The second is the level of analysis. Here the author proposes that social capital can be conceived either as an aspect of relationships among individuals or as a collective good. The third dimension is related to data collection methods. This approach which was also used in the Australian framework and indicators for measuring social capital (2004) report informed the early conceptualization and tool development of the Social Capital Inventory employed in this pilot investigation.

Methodology

Site and participants
The site for this pilot study was an Eastern Ontario Adult High School which delivers credit and non-credit educational and training programs for adults who are returning to school and the workforce. Programs are designed to allow students to move from basic literacy instruction to grade 12 certification, and apprenticeship training or direct entry into the labour market. The custodial workplace education program was a six week course designed for adult learners seeking employment as a custodian in the local hospital and school board environments. The program funded by a provincial ministry incorporated both a classroom based curriculum and a work placement component. The course was offered several times to small groups of trainees without a grade 12 equivalency. The total sample for this pilot study was N=37.

Development of the Social Capital Inventory
The conceptual development of the tool itself was drawn from the ABS framework and
indicators for measuring social capital report (2004) and included four subscales. The first subscale was called Network Qualities (NQ) and included sub-concepts of trust levels, efficacy, diversity and inclusiveness. The second sub-scale referred to as Network Structure (NS) measured sub-concepts of network size, communication mode and power relationships while the third subscale was called Network Transactions (NT) and focused on sub-concepts of sharing support and sharing knowledge. The final sub-scale integrated sub-concepts of bonding, bridging and linking and was referred to as Network Types (NT). A panel of experts comprising of adult instructors, counsellors and researchers examined the various bank of items in the drafting of the tool against the ABS framework to determine the alignment of the items with the measurement of the sub-scales. Following several iterations, detailed feedback was provided on the content of the items, readability of the items, format of the measure and the self-scoring profile of the Social Capital Inventory. The draft tool was then administered to a small group of adult learners in a non-credit program at the adult high school to seek feedback on readability and comprehension of the individual inventory items. An important criticism of the measure was raised by this focus group of adult learners who felt that ideas behind the questionnaire and social capital were difficult to understand and confusing to someone who had never heard of the concept beforehand. As a result, a workshop on social capital and this new questionnaire were developed specifically for an adult literacy program within the adult high school and integrated into the training curriculum. The workshop included easy to follow ideas about social capital, the administration of the tool and interpretation of the self scoring profile. This workshop was given to 37 adults from small classes who were enrolled in the six week custodial training program. Both individual learner and instructor interviews were conducted following the workshop to explore the usefulness of social capital as pedagogy.

Results
The total scale was comprised of 24 items, whereas the four subscales were comprised of 6 items each. Subscale scores were determined by summing the Likert-type responses (1=Strongly disagree, 5=Strongly agree) for each item of the subscale for a potential range of 6-30. Frequency distributions of individual learner’s subscale and total scale scores were then calculated. Overall, subscale scores were roughly normally distributed with very few individuals scoring below 18 on any of the subscales, indicating moderate to strong agreement with most items on the scales. In fact, none of the 24 individual items had a mean of less than 3.60 on the 5-point Likert-type scale. The interquartile ranges (the values between which 50% of all respondents scored), means, and standard deviations of the Network Qualities, Network Structures, Network Transactions, and Network Types subscales were 22-26 (M=23.74, SD=2.86), 20-26 (M=23.22, SD=3.35), 21-27 (M=23.35, SD=3.76), and 21-26 (M=23.22, SD=3.18), respectively. The interquartile range of the total scale was 88-101 with a mean of 93.52 (SD=11.33).

Cronbach alphas were computed to assess the internal consistency of the items for the total scale and for each subscale. The total scale showed good reliability with alpha = .88; the reliability of the Network Qualities, Network Structures, Network Transactions, and Network Types subscales varied with alphas of .55, .56, .78, and .64, respectively. Inspection of individual item correlations with the subscale scores revealed that subscale alphas would not be significantly improved by deletion of any items. These initial results allow for the possibility that the tool may be measuring a unidimensional social capital construct rather than four sub-constructs. Consistent with this possibility, the subscales correlated with a range from r=.468 to
With the pilot study now completed, data collection using the tool and other instrumentation continues over the next several months across three provinces. Although the ratio of participants to items was too small to apply factor analysis to the pilot study data, for this next phase of analysis factor analyses will be conducted to determine if the proposed subscale structure is valid, or if the tool is better conceived as measuring a unidimensional social capital construct as mentioned above. As well, frequency distributions of scores on the subscales and/or total scale will be used to determine cut values for classifying individuals into low, medium, and high-level groupings. Then, profiles created to describe each of the groupings will be assessed to determine if they accurately represent individuals classified into each level.

**Implications for Adult Education Theory and Practice**

Results of the pilot study which also included the workshop as a teaching strategy seem to suggest that how we measure social capital may be intrinsic to the adult learning process as trainees begin to realize the social outcomes of a literacy program. These preliminary findings hint that the role of social capital might be seen as a means to counterbalance the hegemony of the human capital approach to education and training (Fine & Green, 2000). In this sense, it emphasizes the non-economic objectives of learning and the social norms that may motivate individual participation in education and training. Trainees with a stronger stock in social capital may be better able to navigate the uncertainties related to their employment search both while attending the program and following completion. Furthermore, a classroom process that considers social capital awareness may encourage the socioeconomic benefits of learning brought to light through identity formation/reformation and skill attainment (Balatti & Falk, 2002).

From a practitioner’s perspective, questions arise as to what forms of pedagogy and andragogy are best suited to illuminate the individual learner asset of social capital and how to best strengthen the membership networks that have already developed through the training group process. The findings seem to indicate that the intervention workshop followed by the administration of the inventory, afforded trainees with new insights into their social capital assets. This may further propel the development of deeper and wider networks due to the increased awareness of the value of these newly founded resources. It may well be that the nebulous notion of informal learning within and beyond the training program is somehow connected to the development of social capital for adults with low literacy.

**Selected References (full references are available upon request)**


http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Publications/2006/03/20102141/
An Investigation of Mature Students’ Motivation to Attend University

Tricia van Rhijn
University of Guelph

Abstract: Mature, undergraduate students (n=1549) were surveyed to explore their motivation to attend university in a mixed methods study. Quantitative analysis revealed that mature students were more self-determined in their motivation than demonstrated by previous work with traditional-aged students. Qualitative analysis revealed that the most common motivators related to abilities/education (i.e., attaining an education/degree) and occupation (i.e., attaining a valued job/career whereby education was required). Findings suggest that motivation to attend university for mature students is multi-dimensional in nature.

Adult education is not a new field. In the early 1900’s Eduard Lindeman (1926, as cited in Thompson, 2009) outlined four broad assumptions about adult learners that are still relevant today: 1) adults are motivated to learn as they experience need/interest to do so; 2) adults want to apply learning to real life situations; 3) adults have preferences for being self-directed in their learning; and 4) adult learners require flexibility in time, place, pace, and style of learning due to differentiation in development/experiences. Despite this, much of our understanding of adults in formal post-secondary education is strongly influenced by approaches that focus on the majority of learners – traditional-aged and circumstanced students (i.e., direct entry, 18-24 year old students). Attempting to understand mature students’ experiences using a framework developed for a traditional population is inadequate and a better understanding of the experiences of mature students is required to support this population.

Both goal orientation and perceived relevance of studies are found to be influential for commitment and persistence of mature students in post-secondary studies (MacFadgen, 2008). Mature students have specific goals related to their school attendance and are motivated to achieve them. As a key driver of behaviour, motivation can be defined as the psychological drive/aspiration to work towards a desired outcome/goal. Motivation provides “explanations for why we do the things we do the way we do them” (Forbes, 2011, p. 85). A focus on goals and motivation then is important in understanding behavioural choices.

The types of goals being pursued are important. In their research comparing the goal orientation and academic success of traditional and non-traditional-aged (i.e., mature) students, Hoyert and O’Dell (2009) provide evidence that the higher grades earned by mature students are related to the types of goals they endorse. Mature students were significantly more likely to endorse learning goals (i.e., intrinsically motivated/self-determined) over performance goals (i.e., extrinsically motivated/non-self-determined) than traditional students. As learning goals have been demonstrated to promote adaptive responses to challenges, Hoyert and O’Dell propose that mature students may be better predisposed to adapt to challenge than their traditional-aged counterparts. Therefore, exploring both what goals are being pursued as well as the type of motivation is important.
Purpose of This Study & Theoretical Framework

This investigation was conducted to answer the following research question: what motivates mature students to attend school? Self Determination Theory (Deci & Ryan, 1985) and Possible Selves Theory (Markus & Nurius, 1986) were used as a theoretical framework. SDT proposes that humans have an innate desire (i.e., intrinsic motivation) for stimulation and learning from birth. This theory conceptualizes motivation as a continuum reflecting the degree of self-determined behaviour, ranging from amotivation→extrinsic→intrinsic. Mature students may be attending school for fully self-determined reasons (e.g., fulfilling a lifelong dream), non-self-determined reasons (e.g., earning more money), or some combination thereof. PST proposes that an individual’s possible selves represent future ideal selves that they could become and future selves that they fear becoming. These possible selves represent motives, goals and fears and act as psychological resources that function as motivators (Cross & Markus, 1991), guiding behavioural choices to attain (or avoid) those future selves.

Combining these perspectives allows for a deeper understanding of mature students’ motivation to attend university. The current investigation utilizes a mixed methods concurrent triangulation design (Creswell, Plano Clark, Gutmann, & Hanson, 2003) whereby the data were collected at the same point in time and both qualitative and quantitative methods were used for analysis. Based on SDT, the quantitative analysis sought to establish evidence of types of motivation reported by mature students. Based on PST, the qualitative analysis allowed for a richer understanding of what specifically motivated mature students. Together, these analyses allow corroboration of findings and provide complimentary approaches to understanding mature students’ motivation.

Methods

Data Collection Procedures

Data was collected during the fall 2011 phase of a three-year study of mature students, the Mature Student Experience Survey. With assistance from Registrar’s offices at four universities in southwestern Ontario, mature students (undergraduate students aged 25+) were invited to participate. Recruitment occurred via email and data collection was done using an online survey instrument with a mix of open-/closed-ended questions.

Quantitative Measure

Vallerand, Pelletier, Blais, Brière, Senécal and Vallières’ (1992) Academic Motivation Scale (AMS) was used. Responding to the question stem, “Why are you going to university?” the 28 items are rated on a seven-point scale ranging from one (does not correspond at all) to seven (corresponds exactly). Items form seven subscales with high subscale scores indicating endorsement of that form of academic motivation. Internal reliability for each of the subscales in previous work has been acceptable with Cronbach alphas ranging from .72 to .91 (Vallerand, et al., 1992). The subscales range from the least self-determined form of motivation (amotivation) to the most self-determined (intrinsic motivation). Amotivation is no awareness of a relationship between outcomes and actions. External regulation occurs when behaviour is regulated through external means such as rewards. Introjected regulation occurs when reasons for actions begin to be internalized. Identified regulation occurs when behaviour becomes valued based on internalization of extrinsic motives. Intrinsic motivation is acting simply for the
pleasure/satisfaction derived from the act. There are three types of intrinsic motivation: to know, to accomplish, and to stimulate.

**Qualitative Measure**

Responses to three open-ended questions were analysed. The questions asked: 1) Why did you choose to attend school at this point in your life?, 2) Were there any precipitating events?, and 3) What motivated your choice? A directed content analysis (Hsieh & Shannon, 2005) was conducted whereby initial coding used Cross & Markus’ (1991) 11 PST categories: personal, physical, abilities/education, life-style, family, relationships, occupation, material, success, social responsibility, and leisure. Following the initial coding, a subsequent analysis was conducted to determine subcodes for each category based on the category’s type and breadth.

**Results**

**Sample**

The sample consisted of 1549 mature students who were primarily female (68.2%), single (53.3%), and were an average of 34.5 years old (range: 20-80) (Table 1). A majority of participants were studying full-time (57.2%), employed (70.2%) and those employed worked an average of 29.0 hours per week (range: 1-66). Table 1 also presents a breakdown of the sample characteristics by gender and tests for differences between the groups. Male and female mature students were not significantly different in terms of their age, partner status, enrollment or employment status; however, compared to females, males were significantly less likely to have dependent children.

**Table 1**

**Sample Characteristics**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Total (N = 1549)</th>
<th>Male (n = 489)</th>
<th>Female (n = 1047)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mean/ %</td>
<td>SD</td>
<td>Mean/ %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>1539 34.5</td>
<td>10.0</td>
<td>485 34.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Partner status</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single</td>
<td>789 53.3</td>
<td>10.3</td>
<td>262 55.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Partnered</td>
<td>690 46.7</td>
<td>10.3</td>
<td>209 44.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dependent children b</td>
<td>462 30.1</td>
<td>10.3</td>
<td>110 22.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enrollment status</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Full-time c</td>
<td>878 57.2</td>
<td>10.3</td>
<td>285 58.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part-time</td>
<td>658 42.8</td>
<td>10.3</td>
<td>204 41.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employment status</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employed</td>
<td>1034 70.2</td>
<td>10.3</td>
<td>314 67.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not employed</td>
<td>439 29.8</td>
<td>10.3</td>
<td>150 32.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work hours/week</td>
<td>1028 29.0</td>
<td>14.3</td>
<td>310 30.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*p < .05. **p < .01. ***p < .001.

a Independent samples t-tests used for continuous variables and Pearson chi-square difference tests used for categorical variables.

b Dependent children included those under 19 years and living at home.

c Full-time status defined according to Canada Student Loans Program requirements of 60% or greater of a full course load.
Quantitative Analyses

The means, standard deviations, Cronbach alpha reliability estimates, and intercorrelations of the AMS subscales are presented in Table 2. Cronbach alphas ranging from .79 to .88 provide evidence for the internal consistency of the measure for these data.

Table 2
Means, Standard Deviations, Cronbach alphas, and Intercorrelations of AMS Subscales

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Amotivation</td>
<td>1.61</td>
<td>1.10</td>
<td>(.84)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. External regulation</td>
<td>4.87</td>
<td>1.72</td>
<td>.11*</td>
<td>(.79)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Introjected regulation</td>
<td>4.69</td>
<td>1.79</td>
<td>.03</td>
<td>.40**</td>
<td>(.84)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Identified regulation</td>
<td>5.49</td>
<td>1.52</td>
<td>-.06*</td>
<td>.67**</td>
<td>.34**</td>
<td>(.80)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. IM to know</td>
<td>5.74</td>
<td>1.36</td>
<td>-.20**</td>
<td>.03</td>
<td>.42*</td>
<td>.17**</td>
<td>(.88)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. IM to accomplish</td>
<td>4.96</td>
<td>1.64</td>
<td>-.13**</td>
<td>.12**</td>
<td>.64**</td>
<td>.24**</td>
<td>.72**</td>
<td>(.88)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. IM to stimulate</td>
<td>4.16</td>
<td>1.72</td>
<td>-.07**</td>
<td>.11**</td>
<td>.45**</td>
<td>.21**</td>
<td>.69**</td>
<td>.67**</td>
<td>(.87)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note. N ranges between 1543 and 1549. Cronbach alphas in parentheses along diagonal.
* p < .05, ** p < .01

The types of academic motivation most strongly endorsed by mature students were as follows: intrinsic motivation to know, identified regulation, and intrinsic motivation to accomplish. There were significant correlations among most of the subscales demonstrating that academic motivation is multi-faceted.

Qualitative Analysis

The directed content analysis demonstrated that PST is a useful and relevant framework in which to categorize mature students’ motivation. All 11 categories were captured in the participants’ responses. Rank ordering of the categories from most to least common is as follows: Abilities/education, occupation, personal, family, lifestyle, material, relationships, social responsibility, leisure, physical, and success. The two most dominant categories, abilities/education and occupation, will be examined as these categories were each apparent in more than 20% of participants’ responses. Descriptions will be grounded in the data by the inclusion of verbatim quotations from the participants deemed to demonstrate the concepts being described. Prior to this, a brief description of the meaning of the other categories for mature students is presented.

Motivation in the personal category included a number of personal factors that influenced the decision such as turning a certain age and overcoming mental/physical health challenges. In the family category, motivation was either derived from family members or from a future focus on improving family life or acting as a role model to children/other family members. The lifestyle category related to having the opportunity to attend university now because the timing was right or a lifestyle change that facilitated returning to school. There were two distinct influences in the material category: those who wanted to earn a higher income in the future and those who had access to financial resources to support their school attendance (e.g., an employer paying for tuition, financial stability, access to student assistance, or not having to pay tuition due to age). The relationship category included being inspired by others to attend university. The social responsibility category captured mature students who were driven to help others and give back to
their communities. For the leisure category, studying in university was a way to fill time (e.g., during retirement), relieve boredom, or to keep one’s mind active. In the physical category, mature students were motivated to attend university following an injury/disability that required them to retrain.

Responses coded as abilities/education related to motivation where the primary focus was the attainment of an education or degree, specific skills, or for the attainment of a particular certification/designation. Subsequent analysis of this category revealed three distinct subcategories: personal fulfillment, future opportunities, and current requirements.

The personal fulfillment subcategory represents motivation to attend university based on a desire to attain a degree for a sense of personal satisfaction/growth. Many participants described having a long-term desire to attend university. As one participant wrote, “I had always wanted to attend university. I feel that I am at a point in my life where I can focus and succeed and can apply my twenty years working experience to achieve my goals” (P406, Male, 45). Other participants expressed that they had always wanted to attend; one participant was motivated “to finally hold a university degree. Didn't have the opportunity when I was younger” (P84, Female, 38). In terms of future opportunities, participants were motivated to improve their own futures. As one participant stated, “I wanted to further my education. I have a diploma but I feel that having a degree will provide me with more opportunities in the future” (P1502, Female, 30). Many participants in the final subcategory, current requirements, were required to attend school for their current jobs including the attainment of specific designations/certifications. One example is the following:

I’m a CGA (Certified General Accountant) and I’m required to obtain 40 continuing education credits per year. Since I don’t have an undergraduate degree it is logical to get continuing education points and an undergraduate degree at the same time. (P104, Male, 46)

Responses coded in the occupation category related to motivation where the primary focus was to attain a valued job/career where education was required to do so. Subsequent analysis of the occupation category revealed three distinct subcategories, mirroring the abilities/education subcategories but being specifically focused on employment: personal fulfillment through career, future career opportunities, and current employment difficulties.

The personal fulfillment through career subcategory represents participants who were motivated to attend university in order to find a more fulfilling career. This was a strong theme expressed by participants who saw the attainment of a degree as the path to a fulfilling career. Many noted that they were now at a point in their lives where they knew what they wanted. As one participant stated:

Because there is no way to survive in this world without a post-secondary education, and I want to do more than merely survive so I decided to get an education in something I care about and hope to make my life’s work something I care about, not something I have to do to survive.” (P531, Male, 27)

Participants were also motivated to have better future career opportunities, such as one participant who explained that they were motivated “to further my education in order to be more readily prepared and qualified for other job opportunities and for career advancement within my current workplace” (P1178, Female, 32). Finally, participants were motivated because of current
employment difficulties. Job layoffs/insecurity and difficulty attaining employment without a post-secondary education were all reasons that were expressed. As articulated by one participant, motivation came from experiencing “4 layoffs in 7 years in the jobs I was working. Wanted something substantial and career-oriented that I could be proud of. Wanted more stability” (P1296, Male, 40).

**Discussion & Conclusion**

**Motivation to Attend School**

Mature students were found to be very self-determined with regards to their motivation. Motivation related most strongly to intrinsic motivation to know, identified regulation, and intrinsic motivation to accomplish. These results are a departure from previous work with a population of traditional-aged university students by Vallerand and colleagues (1992) where the top three subscales were identified regulation (1), external regulation (2), and intrinsic motivation to know (3). Significant correlations between the subscales demonstrate the multifaceted nature of motivation. It is unlikely that any mature student chooses to attend university based on a single motive; rather, that there are multiple influences. The multidimensional nature of the AMS is very useful for this work and further analysis of the relationships among the different subscales is recommended for future work.

While analysis of the AMS was useful to examine types of motivation, the qualitative analysis provided a richer description of the specific experiences and processes by which mature students were motivated. PST provided a very useful and relevant framework for understanding mature students’ motivation. It is clear that mature students adopt a future focus and actively work towards the attainment of idealized future selves. They also work to avoid feared future selves. These possible selves act as motivators for the choice to return to school and all 11 categories of possible selves were apparent. The most common motivators related to abilities/education (i.e., to attain an education or degree, specific skills, or a particular certification/designation) and occupation (i.e., working towards a valued job/career that required an education).

Given the variability in age/life circumstances, it is likely that there is a great deal of heterogeneity in the mature student population. Although this investigation was limited to looking for broad patterns in the mature student population as a whole, future work is recommended that investigates subgroups in the population based on age, gender, and parental status. It is likely, for instance, that some of the categories are less relevant for specific subgroups; for example, those in the leisure category were motivated to fill time, relieve boredom, or keep their mind active. This category is likely more relevant for older mature students than for younger ones. These potential differences require further investigation in future work.

Although PST was a useful framework for understanding motivation, it was not fully adequate. Mature students were also motivated to attend university by specific institutional factors that facilitated their return to school. These factors included accessibility and proximity. Accessibility included the availability of bridging courses, ease of enrolling, part-time and online options, and being able to take courses in a flexible order. Furthermore, proximity was often a motivating factor. Living or working close to a school or having courses offered through a workplace were influential motivators. As one participant stated:
Accessibility. Being able to work away on this and maintain my commitment to my job has been key. The option to take one course at a time, and also to choose convenient times and the option of online courses – all these are motivating factors and make the very large task manageable. (P1077, Female, 47)

Findings of self-determined motivation of mature students to attend university in the quantitative analysis were supported by the qualitative analysis. In particular, both intrinsic motivation to know and to accomplish were apparent for those returning for reasons related to self-improvement and personal fulfillment. Identified regulation was also apparent and related to those who had internalized the value of attaining an education and the importance of an education to better their future career opportunities and their lives.

Hostetler, Sweet and Moen (2007) discuss how motivation can take the form of a push or pull; suggesting that economic circumstances such as job insecurity can act as incentives that push or pull men and women to return to school. These pushes/pulls were evident in this investigation but were not limited to economic resources and demands. Instead, they related both to extrinsic motives such as job insecurity or the need to make more money, and also to intrinsic motives such as self-improvement, being a role model to children, and desire to fulfill a lifelong dream.

Implications for Adult Education Theory & Practice
While mature students in post-secondary study are found to perform well academically (i.e., higher average marks than traditional students) but are more likely to drop out in subsequent semesters (Holmes, 2005). This paradox suggests that factors contributing to these reduced persistence rates are external to the post-secondary environment. Therefore, understanding mature students’ motivations and goals is an important first step to supporting their success. Although this investigation was exploratory in nature, it contributes to our limited understanding of the motivation of mature students to attend university. This understanding can assist institutions to create supports that can increase the enrollment/persistence rates of this unique population.

References


Cultural Hegemony and its Contestations: The Vancouver Canucks Hockey Riot and Occupy Vancouver as Public Pedagogy

Pierre Walter
University of British Columbia

Abstract: This paper examines two contrasting cases of public pedagogy as adult education. In the first, media discourses of professionalized hockey allow sports violence to be normalized as part of popular culture. Yet mob violence in the Vancouver hockey riots was constructed as a social aberration, its perpetrators individualized and subject to a digital media manhunt as criminals, without questioning the violence of the game itself. By contrast, Occupy Vancouver is understood as a non-violent oppositional site of public pedagogy in which digital and social media are used to question state and corporate authority, and create a democratic civil society alternative.

Introduction

The study of informal learning has a long history in Canadian adult education, focusing above all on learning, education and work (Livingstone, 2007). However, sites of informal learning also include pedagogical spaces such as community volunteering (Duguid, Mündel & Schugurensky, 2007) and learning in social movement contexts (Hall & Turay, 2006). These sites of learning, while less studied, are important in the construction of democratic civil society in the public sphere (Welton, 2001). However, it is also true that learning in the public sphere may not always be liberatory or constructive of civil society; it may in fact reinforce dominant hegemonies, repressive state ideologies, and inequitable corporate structures. The study of informal learning in popular culture and public spaces, in both dominant cultural discourses and in popular contestations of these discourses, is central to contemporary scholarship on public pedagogy (Sandlin, O’Malley & Burdick, 2011). This is an area of scholarship in curriculum studies, cultural studies and critical pedagogy which has recently been given new life in adult education.

In brief, public pedagogy refers to the ‘various forms, processes, and sites of education and learning occurring beyond the realm formal schooling…It involves learning in institutions such as museums, zoos and libraries; in informal sites such as popular culture, media, commercial spaces, and the internet; and through figures and sites of activism, including public intellectuals and grassroots social movements’ (Sandlin, O’Malley & Burdick, 2011, pp. 338-339). Notions of public pedagogy are important to adult education and transformational learning; they may help to reproduce dominant ideologies, or propose and enact oppositional discourses (Sandlin, Wright and Clark, 2011).

The purpose of this study is to examine both the oppressive and liberatory power of informal adult learning in two contrasting cases of public pedagogy in civil society. The first is rioting by Vancouver Canucks hockey fans on June 15, 2011, and subsequent media coverage, after the sports team lost in the last game of the National Hockey League championship (the Stanley Cup). The second case is the Occupy Vancouver protests beginning October 15, 2011, and its extensive digital media coverage. The two sites of informal learning and public pedagogy
represent a study in contrasts: the hockey riots are seen as a pedagogical site of popular culture which has largely been colonised by mega-sports corporations and supporting sports media, and therefore mostly reproduces dominant cultural discourses in Canadian society. The second site is understood as an oppositional site which embodies, creates and enacts ideological alternatives to hegemonic state and corporate discourses. A comparison of media and internet coverage of the two sites contributes to nascent scholarship on the role of informal learning, popular culture and public pedagogy in adult education. As Deirdre Kelly (2011, p. 186) argues in her study of corporate and alternative media, we might gainfully understand news coverage of events and social issues as an important strand of public pedagogy: ‘The texts and images represented in (and absent from) news media teach powerful lessons about what societal conditions get transformed into “problems,” how certain “problems” get framed within policy proposals, who becomes seen as a legitimate policy actor, and what range of solutions get brought forward for consideration.’

Study Sites

The two study sites were chosen not only because they have wide cultural and social resonance in contemporary Canadian society, but also because they represent continuing cultural discourses in the history of Vancouver and Canadian society since the early 1970s.

In the first instance, the June 2011 Vancouver hockey riots were presaged by similar hockey riots in Montreal and Vancouver in the early 1990s (CBC, 2011). In 1993, after the Montreal Canadiens won their 24th Stanley Cup, rampaging hockey fans broke windows, looted stores and started fires. In all, they damaged 47 police cars and totally destroyed seven; 168 people, including 49 police, were injured and 115 arrests made. The riot caused $2.5 million in damages. The next year in Vancouver in 1994, some 50,000 to 70,000 hockey fans flooded into the streets after the Vancouver Canucks lost to the New York Rangers in Game 7 of the Stanley Cup Finals. Drunken hockey fans vented their rage by breaking store windows, taunting police, climbing light posts, swearing, yelling and at times punching each other and police. By the next morning, 150 people were injured and 200 arrested in a hockey riot which cost the city over $1 million.

The second case of Occupy Vancouver and its peaceful, non-violent street protests also had precedent in a vibrant counter-culture movement in the city, which included similar protests and land occupations by the Vancouver Yippies (Youth International Party) in the 1970s. Perhaps most famous of these protests was the Gastown Smoke-in on August 7, 1971, in which some 2,000 people gathered together to protest drug laws and police drug raids (RLP, 2009). Protesters smoked marijuana, played music and wandered about the streets until attacked by mounted police and other officers in full riot gear. Two hours of fighting and beatings followed. By the end of the night, 79 people had been arrested. Mayor Tom Campbell blamed the ‘riot’ on an anarchist conspiracy to incite havoc in the streets. A second Vancouver Yippie action on May 29, 1971 involved the takeover and occupation of the proposed construction site of the Four Seasons Hotel, adjacent to Stanley Park. Renamed ‘All Seasons Park’, the vacant lot was occupied by protesters living in a tent city. Over the course of a year, hundreds of people came to the site each day to construct a people’s park and community garden, until the government finally agreed to leave the land as a park in perpetuity. Today, the occupied land is part of Vancouver’s Stanley Park.
Methodology

Data for the study was collected in an exhaustive search of websites, on-line videos and interviews, informal documentaries, internet blogs and media accounts. Analysis of this type of data in the ‘public commons’ of the internet is increasingly found in adult education research. Data collected for the present study were analysed following a ‘multiple publics’ model of critical policy analysis to interpret news media, both alternative and mainstream, as public pedagogy (Kelly, 2011).

Findings

In the June 2011 Hockey Fan Riot, some 100,000 people took to the streets of downtown Vancouver, at least 140 people were injured, including nine police; four people were stabbed, and 101 people were arrested that night. Following the example of their Vancouver and Montreal predecessors, drunken hockey fans overturned and burned 17 cars, broke numerous shops windows and looted stores like The Bay, Future Shop and London Drugs. Fist fights broke out among chanting, yelling fans who egged the violence on. The cost of the 2011 Hockey Fan Riot is estimated in excess of $3.7 million. This time, however, unlike previous fan riots, the power of social media and digital technology meant that many recorded their acts and those of others on their cell phones and cameras. In total, some 1,000,000 photos and up to 1,600 hours of video recorded by fans and others were sent in to the Vancouver Police Department (VPD). Together with seven other local police departments, the VPD then launched its ‘Integrated Riot Investigation Team’ on the web, Facebook and Twitter to digitally identify and charge individual rioters (VPD 2012).

Study findings, in the first case of the 2011 Vancouver Hockey Riot, show how corporate media, the mega-businesses of spectator sports and the state blithely packaged a largely predictable, common outcome of a violent masculine cultural phenomenon (professional corporate sports) as an unexpected anomaly of mob behaviour and rioting in a city which had recently and successfully hosted similar huge sports crowds during the 2010 Winter Olympics. Rather than examine the root causes of that night’s violent mob behaviour in the spectacle of corporate hockey itself, the city and media focused instead on identifying and hunting down ‘rioters’ (no longer called hockey fans) through a multimillion dollar police forensic search of internet digital media. To do otherwise would perhaps be to endanger not only the corporate business of sport, but also to question hockey and the accompanying ‘relevance of violence as an expression of Canadian national identity’ (Robidoux, 2002, p. 209). As Pryor (2002) tells us, hockey can be seen as a form of gender performativity, as a ‘ritualized gender performance, a celebratory, communal expression of heterosexual, heteronormative culture. An NHL game “performs” the dominant ideology of North American society, a society in which masculinity is closely intertwined with a culture of institutionalized violence’ (p. 73). In short, the public pedagogy promulgated in media and government policy normalized the dominant ideology of hockey as somewhat violent, but mostly harmless entertainment; a core component of Canadian national identity and culture.

More specifically, how are professional hockey games like those played by the Vancouver Canucks portrayed to the public eye by the media? What do they teach the public about violence? How is this connected to violent rioting by hockey fans post-game? In media portrayals, hockey heroes are constructed to have somewhat contradictory combinations of grace
and grit on ice; there is seamless team cooperation, but extreme competition; absolute loyalty to
the home team, but regularly offerings of individual player sale to the highest corporate bidder.
On the one hand, corporate and other media captures the satisfying synergy and suspense of
almost superhuman team play and translates this into transcendent joy and excitement for loyal
fans. There is a clear public message of admiration and respect for our Canadian hockey teams,
which are comprised of some of the most immensely talented athletes in the world, playing at the
peak of their ability: they are beauty and grace in motion; they are determined, talented fighters
and team players to the end.

On the other hand, in the public hockey pedagogy of the media, there is also a
normalisation, and often glorification, of professionalised male hockey violence. The message
broadcast to hockey fans here is that violence is an expected, normal part of the game. Violence
helps to make the game exciting and competitive: slam an opponent into the boards, punch hard,
slash, throw an elbow, get hit, get up, keep playing, stay tough, ‘man up’, hit back. Hard. As a
legitimate game strategy, a hockey team can in fact put in a player called the ‘The Enforcer’ (aka
a ‘goon’) – a player whose sole role is to go out on the ice and deliberately pick a fight with the
opposing team’s players, literally trying to intimidate through violence. This fearless Enforcer
and his violence can then energize his team, psyche them up to play better and more
aggressively. In short, on a number of levels, hockey fans are taught that violence and aggression
are the stuff of heroes and of our shared national Canadian identity in professional, corporate
hockey.

Now put this learned, socially acceptable hockey violence together with another favourite
Canadian male pastime – drinking beer (Molson’s Canadian, for example) and 50,000 exuberant
fans, and hockey riots might likely be the result. According to Health Canada (2012) statistics,
alcohol use among the Canadian population at large stands at about 77%; and 71.5% among
youth. However, the prevalence of heavy frequent drinking among youth 15 to 24 years old is
about three times higher than the rate for adults 25 years and older (i.e. 9.4% and 3.3%,
respectively). Is there a connection to watching Canucks’ hockey games and later rioting in
Vancouver? We can really only speculate, but it seems clear that hockey, violence and beer often
go together in Canadian popular culture, with media support and implicit official sanctioning. On
May 10, 2011, for example, just a month before the June 2011 hockey fan riots, the Vancouver
Canucks announced a multiyear partnership with Budweiser as the Canucks’ ‘official beer
sponsor’ as well as the ‘official beer’ of Rogers Arena in which the team plays (NHL, 2011).
Before, during and after the game, television and social media advertisements then continuously
reinforced this Budweiser Beer – Canucks Hockey connection for fans.

Media coverage and the public pronouncements of local government officials, however,
seem to possess an inability to connect the dots between normalised hockey violence as part of
the Canadian national identity, alcohol consumption, and the behavior of rioting hockey fans.
Instead, as was the case in previous hockey riots, the June 2011 Vancouver riots were seen as
‘unexpected’, and ‘anarchists’ and outsiders blamed for inciting riots. (It is interesting to note
that while hockey rioters were accused of being anarchists during the 2011 Canuck riots,
anarchists among Occupy Vancouver protesters have never been accused of being hockey fans,
although many might be). Following this logic, embodied in the public pedagogy and
construction of public collective memory of the event, all rioters were then individually
criminalized for retribution, as if they had committed violent acts without precedent, without
being incited by Enforcer-like hockey figures, without an officially sanctioned drug (Budweiser
Beer), and without aggressive hockey-like teamwork among the rioters. (It is very important to
note that this connection to hockey and drugs in no way excuses the virulent mob violence of rioters, only seeks to explain it.) As of the writing of this paper, following an eight-month long $300,000 digital manhunt, the Vancouver Police had recommended 350 criminal charges against 125 suspected rioters (VPD, 2012).

In the second case of Occupy Vancouver, a continuously evolving, decentralised democratic ideology and educational practice functions as public pedagogy challenging both hegemonic corporate capitalism and the state power which supports it. Inspired by Arab Spring and Occupy Wall Street, Occupy Vancouver is connected to a larger networked global movement which expressed popular discontent over the abuses of decades of corporate greed, social inequality, elitism and state complicity. The democratic, non-hierarchical material practices of Occupy Vancouver also comprise a counter-hegemonic pedagogy in action: leadership is dispersed among numerous committees, financial support is through donations of money, food and materials, and decisions are taken democratically in the General Assembly, grounded in techniques such as the ‘human microphone’ (the crowd repeats back a speaker’s statements). Participation in the occupation is wide open – all are invited to join and provided with a host of options for how they might do so. Hundreds might participate directly in protest activities, but thousands more follow them on the internet. (Ironically, mega-corporations’ Twitter, Facebook, Google Calendar, Flickr, YouTube, and other software is used as the social infrastructure for the movement). In practice, Occupy Vancouver embodies a dispersed model of democratic participation replicating the more open, democratic structures of the worldwide web and supporting digital technologies. It is reminiscent of popular culture performed in flash mobs and culture jamming, but with a more overtly political purpose:

We are a non violent movement for social, economic and political change...

Occupy Vancouver’s Official Statement of Unity: We humbly acknowledge that Occupy Vancouver is taking place on unceded Coast Salish territories. We, the Ninety-Nine Percent, come together with our diverse experiences to transform the unequal, unfair, and growing disparity in the distribution of power and wealth in our city and around the globe. We challenge corporate greed, corruption, and the collusion between corporate power and government. We oppose systemic inequality, militarization, environmental destruction, and the erosion of civil liberties and human rights. We seek economic security, genuine equality, and the protection of the environment for all. (Occupy Vancouver, 2012)

In the time since Occupy Vancouver protesters were evicted from the city’s Art Museum grounds on November 22, 2011, the movement has continued to flourish as a tightly connected virtual community using the digital commons as its organising foundation, with numerous committees and the General Assembly meeting in person in locations mostly in Vancouver’s downtown Eastside. Chat rooms, live podcasts, on-line forums, video uploads, a daily calendar of events and committee meetings today ties the community together with vibrant and creative electronic bonds (see http://occupyvancouver.com). The movement now publishes a bi-monthly alternative to the city’s daily newspaper, entitled ‘The OCCUPIED Vancouver Sun’ and an Occupy Vancouver Media Blog; it has posted a wide variety of carefully crafted educational materials on the movement, including a guide to civil disobedience in B.C., the Occupy Vancouver General Assembly and consensus process, ‘Strategic Creative Resistance’ and a statement on decision-making processes.
A listing of thirty one Occupy Vancouver committees gives an overview of the rich and varied informal education that is now being carried on in decentralised fashion. These include the Anti Oppression Committee, Anti Oppression Network, Code of Conduct Work Group, Communications, Community Inclusion, Crafts Work Group, Direct Action, Facilitation, Film Affinity Workgroup, Finance, Food Committee, General Assembly, Indigenous Solidarity Network, Info, InterCity, Labour Organizing Committee, Legal, Livestream, Media, Medical, Occupy Vancouver Newspaper Workgroup, Programming, Sound Crew, Spokes Council, Strategy Work Group, Student Action Committee, The People's Library, Translations/Interpretations Workgroup, Video and Youtube Crew, Volunteer Coordination Committee, and WebTeam Committees. Each of these committees can in turn have a rich educational and political life within its smaller orbit. The People’s Library Committee, for example, in addition to books lent out by its two ‘branches’ in the ‘People’s Lovely Library’ (complete with a book catalogue wiki), has a mobile library, digital collections of Occupy teach-ins, documentaries and interviews; regularly joins in local protests; and meets weekly to talk and plan other actions.

Conclusion

In an interesting connection between the public cultural discourses of sports spectacles and those of popular protest, Vancouver Mayor Gregor Robinson made good on his promise to clear out Occupy Vancouver protesters before the start of the Canadian Football League’s championship game (the Grey Cup) on November 27, 2011, like the Stanley Cup, hosted by the city of Vancouver. Although it was sports fans, and not protesters who had rioted violently only months before, it was now deemed necessary to clean up the city by removing peaceful Occupy Vancouver protesters in time for the football game. As this paper intimates, different sites of public pedagogy may either support hegemonic state and corporate ideologies or propose counter-hegemonic ideologies and civil society alternatives to them. In this, the public ‘curriculum’ used by media and government to frame the violence of the Vancouver hockey riots, without questioning its ties to the accepted violence of the sport spectacle itself, represents the endorsement of a well-worn cultural discourse taken as common sense Canadianism, but in fact deserving of critical inquiry. By contrast, Occupy Vancouver appears not only to challenge common sense notions of ‘acceptable’ inequality in Canadian society, but to create and enact a more egalitarian, communitarian civil society alternative; a counter-culture which in many ways also continues a long-standing and oppositional Canadian identity embracing democratic debate and decision-making, economic equality and social welfare – a public pedagogy well within the traditions of Canadian adult education.

References


**Social Networking Sites:**
**Online Spaces for Informal and Incidental Learning**

Jacqueline Warrell
University of Calgary

**Abstract:** This paper draws on different bodies of literature and explores the potential for informal and incidental learning on social networking sites. From a social constructivist perspective, the affordances and challenges of these sites to create spaces for informal learning are examined.

**Overview**
The majority of today’s university students are ‘Digital Natives’ (Preknsky, 2001); people born into the digital age who have grown up with computers, the Internet, video games, cell phones, and other digital technology. Digital Natives effortlessly integrate and use today’s many digital technologies in all aspects of their lives. One technology that has become increasingly popular over recent years, especially among university students, is social media. Studies found that between 69 to 99 percent of university students use social media (Baran, 2010; Junco & Chickering, 2010). More universities are also using it for marketing and to broadcast information.

Social media refers to a group of Internet applications that enable multiple users to collaboratively create, modify and share content (Kaplan & Haenlein, 2010). Some examples of social media are blogs, wikis, social bookmarking, and file sharing applications. Another example is social networking sites (SNS). Well-known social networking sites include Facebook, MySpace, and LinkedIn.

The primary purpose of online social networking is to establish a group of people with whom one communicates, interacts, and shares information on a regular basis (Boyd & Ellison, 2008). On SNS people connect with others and form online groups or networks. These networks are based on shared interests and can include both professional and personal contacts, such as family, friends, colleagues, acquaintances, and even strangers. People may decide to connect with each other because of a mutual hobby, similar career aspirations, a common interest on a topic, or simply to stay up-to-date on the life of a friend.

Although initially viewed as primarily a social activity (Baran, 2010; Nasr & Ariffin, 2008), these sites offer a new, unprecedented way for learners to share ideas, engage in dialogue, and negotiate new understandings (Chatti, Klamma, Jarke & Naeve, 2007). However, many people fail to recognize the unique potential of SNS to support learning, especially informal and incidental learning. As a second year PhD student and an active user of SNS, I have experienced many unexpected learning moments. Engaging with other graduate students, professors, subject matter experts, and business professionals, I have experienced these as conversational spaces for creating knowledge and reflecting on learning.

The majority of research on SNS and learning has focused on its use in formal education settings. Limited research has explored its capacity to facilitate adult learners’ informal and
incidental learning. Therefore, the purpose of this paper is to explore the potential for informal and incidental learning when adult learners engage with others through social networking sites on the Internet. Drawing from existing bodies of literature on social media, informal learning, and social constructivism, the affordances and challenges of SNS as constructivist informal learning environments are examined.

**Constructivist Online Learning Environments**
Constructivism emphasizes that knowledge is both individually and socially constructed (Jonassen, 1999). This is distinctly different from earlier theories of learning that viewed learners as passive receivers of information and knowledge. The constructivist perspective, views the learner as an active participant in knowledge construction and meaning making (Duffy & Cunningham, 1996). Social media is significant, in contrast to earlier Internet applications in its ability to facilitate two-way communication. On SNS learners do not simply find, read, and passively accept new information. Instead they can actively engage in the ongoing creation and dissemination of knowledge.

Social constructivists emphasize the importance of the social and cultural context in which the learning occurs (Duffy & Cunningham, 1996). According to social constructivism, learning is a social-dialogical process where knowledge is created through social interaction (Duffy & Cunningham, 1996; Miller, 2009). Environments that support constructivist learning provide space for dialogue and an opportunity to both question and defend beliefs (Fosnot & Perry, 2005). They create awareness of multiple points of view; encouraging learners to explore differing perspectives, and challenging them to reflect on their own perceptions (Duffy & Cunningham, 1996). Self-reflection while exploring alternative views and contradictions is key for learning (Duffy & Cunningham, 1996; Fosnot & Perry, 2005). SNS are built on social interactions. From a social constructivist perspective, they have the potential to create a space for learners to share information, explore diverse points of view, engage in meaningful interactions, and negotiate new meaning. The sites have the capacity to support collaborative knowledge building and reflection.

Constructivist learning is learner-centered and encourages the learner to take responsibility for his or her own learning. SNS are a “tool for the learner rather than a tool for the teacher” (Duffy & Cunningham, 1996, p. 174). On SNS, the learner defines and controls the learning. This self-directed and autonomous learning is especially conducive to fostering opportunities for informal and incidental learning.

**Informal and Incidental Learning**
Definitions of informal learning are usually positioned in contrast to formal learning, which can be defined as learning that takes place in formal education settings (schools, educational institutions, workplace). It is planned, intentional, and highly structured. In addition, the learning goals and objectives are defined by set curricula (Livingstone, 2001; Marsick & Watkins, 1990, 2001). According to Marsick and Watkins (1990) informal learning is “not typically classroom-based or highly structured, and control of the learning rests primarily in the hands of the learner” (p. 12). They also differentiate between informal and incidental learning. Incidental learning, as a subcategory of informal learning is “a byproduct of some other activity” and “almost always takes place although people are not always conscious of it” (1990, p. 12). Therefore, informal learning may be intentional, but incidental learning is always unintentional.
In the context of online social networking, informal learning describes the learner’s intentional engagement with others on SNS to acquire knowledge, skills, and develop new understandings. In this case, the learner is consciously aware that they are using their online network for the purpose of learning. In contrast, incidental learning refers to the unplanned or accidental learning that occurs while people interact on SNS as a part of their everyday lives.

Informal learning is a non-linear process. People move back and forth between questioning and reconciling previous understandings with alternate perspectives to arrive at a new understanding (Marsick & Watkins, 2001). Therefore, informal learning and incidental learning are supported when space is created for people to share, reflect, and make meaning of their experiences (Kawalilak, 2011). The capability of SNS to foster informal and incidental learning lies in the online space it creates where adult learners can interact and dialogue with peers, professors, colleagues, experts, and mentors.

Social Networking Sites as Spaces for Learning
Wilson and Lowry (2000) suggest that to effectively support learning online environments must: “provide access to rich sources of information; encourage meaningful interaction with content; and bring people together to challenge, support, or respond to each other” (p. 82). These principles are consistent with social constructivism and provide a good framework for examining the affordances and challenges of SNS to foster informal and incidental learning.

Rich Sources of Information
The Internet provides access to pleather of rich sources of information (Wilson & Lowry, 2000). In traditional classrooms and formal learning environments, the primary source of information is limited to the instructor or facilitator and the other learners. On SNS, learners have access to vast, large amounts of rich information and valuable resources through their established networks. As mentioned early, online networks usually include a variety of people with varying backgrounds and experience who are dispersed worldwide. Therefore, the potential for learners to access a diverse range of resources that represent multiple points of view is great. SNS give learners the opportunity to connect with content they would normally have access to in the traditional classroom.

To access information through online social networks, learners must take responsibility for their own learning. They cannot rely on an instructor to provide them with important information and resources. Therefore, SNS support self-directed learning and is a constructivist learning environment where the learner must actively seek out content. Learning how to use one’s online network to successfully find and aggregate information is a skill today’s learners must develop. Today “owning a given piece of information is less important than knowing where and how to retrieve it” (Pettenati and Cigognini, 2007, p. 52). This requires learners to have an understanding of SNS and have the technological skills to use them. A lack of these skills is a significant barrier.

Thompson (2011) found that learners can spend a significant amount of time learning to navigate the technology (Thompson, 2011) and people’s own social networks often provide them with little support in doing this (Aceto, Dondi, & Marzotto, 2010). Learners who lack the necessary technological competence tend to engage less or not at all within these online spaces (Aceto et
This barrier may be especially significant for those individuals who did not grow up in the digital age. Support is needed for these, and all learners, to become more comfortable using SNS.

**Meaningful Interaction with Content**
Good advice, feedback and guidance are also needed in the online environment to facilitate learning. This is especially true when learners attempt to understand difficult content and make it meaningful (Wilson & Lowry, 2000). Meaningful interactions are supported in a constructivist learning environment that promotes openness, exploration, and allows for errors. This “risk-taking culture is best cultivated in informal spaces that have established a sense of community and trust (Gulati, 2004; Lucas & Moriera, 2009). The social nature of SNS facilitates the establishment of a community of learners (Lucas & Moreira, 2009). Within these learning communities trust can be developed and diversity valued. Learners can break away from traditional learning roles in the classroom setting to explore different ways of knowing. The informal communities that are established on SNS encourage informal and incidental learning “through storytelling, making jokes, giving examples, linking and making available different resources, asking question, providing answers, developing empathy, and simply reading” (Aceto et al., 2010, p. 2010).

On SNS, learners rely on their established network of people to provide the support and guidance they need to successfully engage with content and construct new knowledge. In formal learning settings, the instructor or facilitator typically performs this role. In a constructivist classroom, this support is often provided through scaffolding, a technique where instructors progressively remove support to shift the responsibility of learning to the learner (Vygotsky, 1978). While it appears that advice, feedback, and support are provided on SNS, Aceto et al. (2010) found a specific lack of scaffolding in online communities. More research is needed to better understand what support and guidance is provided in online networks and what circumstances might further encourage this support between learners on SNS.

**Bring People Together**
Internet sites that foster a constructivist learning environment bring together multiple people with differing perspectives and encourage them to collaborate, discuss, question, reflect, and support each other (Wilson & Lowry, 2000). This diversity of people and perspectives is important for fostering constructivist learning spaces. On SNS, learners can build a network of diverse people. They can engage in conversations with peers, experts, and others outside of their institution and from around the world. However, not all learners take advantage of this opportunity. Some simply seek out likeminded individuals with similar viewpoints (Jokisolo & Rui, 2009; Veletsianos & Kimmons, 2011). Therefore, while SNS has the potential to bring together diverse groups of people, learners need to ensure they make a conscious effort to harness this potential.

A distinct feature of social networking sites is that everyone’s individual network is visible to others. This allows people to use other’s networks to search out and connect with additional people who share their interests. Therefore, SNS allow new connections to be made that would not otherwise be possible (Boyd & Ellison, 2008).
There is an important difference between SNS and some other social media, such as social bookmarking or file sharing applications. On these social media sites people share content such as images, audio, video, and text. Subsequently, networks form and discussions evolve based on the shared content. However, on SNS people first establish a network of people, start interacting, and then share content (Miller, 2009). This difference is significant in the capacity of SNS to foster incidental learning. Instead of intentionally searching for content on a particular topic or participating in a specific learning community, SNS create spaces that bring people together so learning can organically and spontaneously happen.

**Supporting Informal Learning on SNS**

Constructivist learning environments promote collaboration, reflection, negotiation, and consensus building (Duffy & Cunningham, 1996; Jonassen, 1999). While SNS provide a space for collaborative knowledge construction, it is the people who use these sites that actually foster it. Learning on SNS is different from learning in a classroom and few people know how to “leverage those online connections and benefit from the deep learning that can ensue” (Richardson, 2009, p. 26). Therefore, learners must develop the necessary skills, competencies, and digital literacies to realize the potential for learning on SNS. It is a common misconception that digital natives already possess these skills because they have the technological know-how (Aceto et al., 2010; Richardson, 2009). However, learners not only require technological knowledge of SNS, they need to learn how to learn in this informal setting. Aceto et al. (2010) suggests this includes learning how to find, sort, filter, and change knowledge and information; to effectively communicate online; to use critical thinking and investigative skills; to value diversity; and to develop a sense of belonging. Learners must be autonomous and take responsibility for their learning (Kop, 2011). They must be comfortable with not only being a consumer of information, but a creator and disseminator of knowledge (Richardson, 2009). Learn how to be reflective learners, and become more mindful of often taken-for-granted informal learning is essential.

Adult educators have a role to play in supporting learners to develop these skills, so they can effectively engage in learning outside the classroom (Aceto et al., 2010). Richardson (2009) encourages educators to ask “How can we best deliver these literacies in our classroom?” (p. 31). He suggests that teaching these digital literacies should be embedded in regular classroom activities. Social networking sites can be “natural extensions of the classroom” (Carbo & Antoli, 2011). Adult educators can encourage learners to use SNS to expand on their learning and further investigate areas of interest (Kop, 2011). Learners can turn to their online networks to get information, support and seek assistance for problems they are struggling with. SNS are a valuable tool for educators and learners to connect learning inside and outside of the classroom.

**Summary**

The Internet has become an intertwined part of our everyday lives. Much informal and incidental learning today happens on the World Wide Web. Social networking sites create spaces for learners to connect with peers, colleagues, experts, and other people worldwide who have a different point of view. Within these online spaces, learners can share, dialogue, question, reflect and collaborative explore these multiple points of view. From a constructivist perspective, SNS support self-directed learning and encourage learners to be active participants and collaborators in the construction of knowledge. To foster informal and incidental learning
Through SNS learners need to acquire necessary digital literacies. Adult educators play a role in not only educating learners about how they can harness the potential of online social networking to support their personal and professional development, but in helping them to build the skills and competencies they need.

Most of the literature on learning and SNS is anecdotal. There is a lack of empirical research that explores how adult learners can use SNS as a powerful learning tool. More research is needed to investigate the affordances and challenges of these online spaces to foster informal and incidental learning. Additionally, more research is required to explore how adult educators can strengthen the connection between informal learning on SNS with formal instruction. The current literature suggests that a sense a community develops between people connected on SNS. Future research should investigate whether SNS provide opportunities for online communities of practice to develop based on Wenger and Lave’s (1991) framework. Informal and incidental learning is not new, but the ways in which people learn informally have changed. Gaining a better understanding of how today’s online technologies, like social networking sites, support adult learning is essential.

References


Kop, R. (2011). The challenges to connectivist learning on open online networks: Learning experiences during a massive open online course. *International Review of Research in Open and Distance Learning, 12*(3), 19-37.


Abstract: As an adult education institution borne of the Antigonish Movement, the Coady International Institute strives to provide leadership and community development education that promotes community-engaged social action. To do so, we nurture a collaborative and engaging learning environment for our participants, grassroots activists and community mobilizers, that promotes individual and group reflections on our local and global realities. Building on our shared understanding, we facilitate discussions on strategies and skills for social change. In examining two of our course offerings, Foundations in Development Leadership and Skills for Social Change, in this roundtable, we intend to analyse the strategies we employ to cultivate learning for social change and identify the challenges inherent in creating a transformative learning environment.

Coady International Institute
The facilitators of this roundtable work at the Coady International Institute, an adult education institution rooted in the Antigonish Movement and a long history of community leadership and community development education in an international context. The Antigonish Movement was a social movement of the early 20th century in Eastern Canada, which incorporated adult education principles into models of economic co-operation and development. Community organizing “beginning with mass meetings and study clubs through to various forms of co-operative organizing led people to identify the obstacles they faced, the resources they could build upon, and the strategies they could employ to confront injustice” (Foroughi, Irving, Savage, 2011; p. 209).

Today, our work also integrates issues tied to globalization, sustainability, democratic citizenship and social accountability. Coady has worked to respond to international social and economic changes, while at the same time preserving our mission of working with grassroots organizations in the global south. For this roundtable, we intend to briefly review our approaches to fostering learning in two of our courses: a) Five-week Foundations in Development Leadership course aimed at individuals representing community groups, civil society organizations, and social movements from the global south; and b) Three-week Skills for Social Change course primarily targeted at Canadian youth.

Last year, in the CASAE’s pre-conference roundtable series, we brought forward a discussion on what can be meant by community leadership in the context of international development and collaboration that engages meaningfully with community activism and how institutions, such as the Coady Institute, providing community leadership education can promote programs of learning in a climate of competitive project-funding, results-based indicators and financial accountability. The intent of this roundtable is to invite discussions on adult education strategies to facilitate learning for development leadership. This is a timely discussion for we recognize the emerging challenges faced by working in an increasingly complex socio-political environment, where communities face confusing structures and relations of power.
Foundations in Development Leadership

Our 19-week Diploma in Development Leadership begins with an intensive 5-week Foundations course to explore concepts of leadership, adult education and community development integrating individual and collective reflection on their own path of learning and leadership. This is followed by fifteen weeks of elective courses that encompass a range of community development related topics. The range of experience among participants contributes to a program that is designed to facilitate analysis through that experience and find commonalities upon which to develop applicable responses (Foroughi et al.; p. 110).

Skills for Social Change

The Skills for Social Change certificate is an opportunity for young community practitioners, activists, volunteers and allies to share with one another their experiences of community engagement, explore the complexities of said engagement and develop new skills in order to better contribute to the communities of which they are a part. The intention is to create a learning community in which the innate leadership qualities of participants are given the space to be self-cultivated and cross-pollination by peers. This interactive process of gaining new awareness of personal, local and global realities will be a manifestation of the collective knowledge born of the lived experience of the participants in the course.

Discussion

The strategies and approaches employed in both the Foundations and Skills for Social Change courses are intended to nurture a transformative learning environment as a catalyst for personal growth and subsequent community action, empowerment and change. These courses are taught by gender-balanced teams in order to ensure gender-representation in their facilitation. The variety of strategies we apply, which require the engagement and collaboration of participants, are primarily rooted in self-reflection and lead to the changing of beliefs, values and attitudes in addition to skill development correspondent to this change. These strategies include reflection on the river of life and the peak moments; Collective analysis of our past stories; behavioural reflection; reflection on multiple lenses and perspectives; reliving past experiences through role plays and socio-drama; learning journals; and cooperative inquiries. The intentional sequencing and recurrence of these various exercises are two additional strategies used to deepen learning while collectively making meaning of the daily exercises in relation to each other.

This theoretical approach to leadership education raises some critical questions. Is the personal development of learners dependent on the extent to which they feel they have been able to critically reflect, share their expertise and internalize new skills, knowledge and attitudes which they believe are critical to promoting social change? Is their leadership development only as relevant as the sense of self reflected in the course content? As facilitators how can we ensure that as a learning community we collectively share power and create the space for every voice to be heard and valued? Is the reciprocal role of facilitators and learners as co-facilitators and co-learners of such an environment dependent upon the ability to authentically submit “power over” to foster “power within” and actualize collective “power with”? Perhaps the challenge rests in the sincerity of this intent and the delicate ability to nurture it to fruition. As adult educators, we strive to find new approaches in order to seek clarity to these questions and to promote sound leadership learning for community action and social justice.
References


“Global to Local: International Service-Learning in Canada”
Mali Bain
University of British Columbia

Abstract: This paper outlines the beginnings of a research project into student, faculty, and community experiences of service-learning in an indigenous community in British Columbia. By examining this as an 'inter-national' relationship between a settler colonial presence and a sovereign nation on this land, I consider this work to be a part of the international service-learning literature. In this paper I share some of my preliminary research into the themes of reciprocity, gaze, and justice-oriented citizenship. In the roundtable I will explore the connections I have made between those ideas, share how I plan to use photo-methodologies, and invite thoughts and feedback on my proposed research.

Background
International service-learning is a combination of organised international service activities that address community needs, direct engagement and cross-cultural interaction, and structured reflection, offered as a credit-bearing educational experience. (Jones, Bringle, & Hatcher, 2011). My research connects the literature of international service learning with the practice of service-learning as it takes place between a mainstream university and an indigenous community. By examining the 'inter-national' relation between Canada, a colonial settler state, and a sovereign nation on this land, I challenge our conception of national boundaries and examine the ways in which privilege and power work in situations which are at once familiar and 'foreign'.

I am a white middle-class female, raised in a resource-based town on traditional Kwakwaka'wakw territory, northern Vancouver Island. My ISL research is grounded in experiences leading international service trips to co-facilitate professional development in Kenya and setting up service-learning partnerships in in East Vancouver and Port McNeill. As I explore a case-study of service-learning in an indigenous community, I am particularly aware of themes of reciprocity, social justice, and gaze.

Themes
Reciprocity
Service learning practitioners aim to create programs which benefit students and also benefit communities through a 'reciprocal' relationship (d’Arlach, 2010); however, they often do not succeed (Stoecker, Tryon, & Hilgendorf, 2009). Some choose to recognize that ISL can never be completely reciprocal, given the significant power disparities between the developed and developing worlds today (Grusky, 2000); other scholars strive for some kind of reciprocity while recognizing that reciprocity is asymmetrical (Madsen Camacho, 2004), or while re-defining reciprocity such as in Porter's exploration of the Peruvian indigenous concept of `Ayni` (Porter, 2001). I will seek to explore ways in which the service-learning project I study constructs, enacts, and responds to the concept of reciprocity.

Social Justice
Service learning theorists and practitioners frame service-learning as part of a broader movement for social justice (Cipolle, 2010), as 'justice-doubting' (Butin, 2010), or as 'justice-oriented' (Kahne & Westheimer, 2006). However, students participants are often reported to enter service-
learning with conception of service as a 'charity' endeavour, accomplished by outside players for
the benefit of passive recipients (Butin, 2003; Cermak et al., 2011; Morton, 1995). This study
will explore how students, faculty and community members perceive service-learning, using as
an initial lens the three dimensions of citizenship developed by Kahne and Westheimer:
personally responsible, participatory, or justice-oriented citizenship (Kahne & Westheimer,
2006).

The Construction of Gaze
Finally, I will explore the concept of a 'tourist gaze' in service learning (Urry, 1992). In parallel to
a recent study exploring students conscious and unconscious use of the 'tourist gaze' in
international service learning, I will explore the ways in which students make use of a tourist
gaze and its accompanying power and authority over locals behaviour (Prins & Webster, 2010). I
will define the tourist gaze as one manifestation of Smiths' imperial gaze (Smith, 1999), and
explore Moaz’s contribution of the local or mutual gaze (Maoz, 2006).

Steps Forward
In order to explore the above concepts, I intend to use an ethnographic case study to explore the
ways that students, faculty and community members construct, enact, and respond to these
constructions of gaze, social justice, and reciprocity in inter-national service learning. I intend to
make use of modified forms of photo-voice or photo-elicitation in order to access deeper layers
of meaning-making through images and narrative (Urry, 1992).
I am interested in connecting with those who have experience or background in one or more of
the following areas: (post)-colonial theory, indigenous conceptions of service, history of service
in indigenous communities, and photo-methodologies. I am particularly looking to find
indigenous sources which explore these or related themes. I look forward to hearing your
comments and suggestions; I can be reached at malibain@gmail.com.

Works Cited
Education. Teachers College Record, 105(9), 1674–1692.
Cermak, M. J., Christiansen, J. A., Finnegan, A. C., Gleson, A. P., White, S. K., & Leach, D. K.
(2011). Displacing activism? The impact of international service trips on understandings
of social change. Education, Citizenship and Social Justice, 6(1), 5–19.
Michigan Journal of Community Service Learning, 16(1).
on service learning research (Vol. 1.).
Michigan Journal of Community Service Learning, 10(3).
Teaching English for Activism

Bahar Biazar
Ontario Institute of Secondary Education- U of Toronto

Abstract: Although radical theories of schooling and education have long had currency within the field of education, teaching English as a second language (TESL) has enjoyed a safely apolitical existence within the broader field of teaching and learning. However, TESL is a very controversial activity. This roundtable will focus on the relationship between teaching English and migration. It will also explore various avenues for doing critical work in the ESL classroom.

Canada is home to many new immigrants and refugees and many of whom have been active in social causes prior to entering Canada. One of the important hurdles in the settlement process of these newly arrived activists is acquiring the language of the new setting. Many newcomers to Canada begin their settlement process by taking part in one of the existing English as a second language (ESL) programs offered in Canada. However, many of these efforts prove fruitless and end in a feeling of failure when the newcomer still has not achieved proficiency after several years of living in Canada. This not only leads to a sense of failure for the newcomer language learner but could also possibly lead to feelings of resentment by the Canadian public whose public funds are being spent on programs that are not achieving the desired results.

As an ESL teacher, this is both disturbing and intriguing. Why is it that despite the large sums of money that the government is investing in these programs the results are so dismal? Certainly there is strong motivation on the part of the learners as it is clear that language proficiency is necessary in their new environment. Furthermore, the points system employed by Immigration Canada ensures that a certain type of immigrant be admitted. The desirable immigrants are those within a certain age range, with post-secondary education, and with some English language background. Then why is it that despite the resources and motivated learners, these programs ultimately do not achieve their goals?

According to Horsman (2000), “the nature of the educational setting, interactions, and curriculum are all crucial in making learning possible, ... a reality not often understood by funders who see this as extraneous rather than simply the bare minimum to facilitate learning...”. ESL classes, in the context of resettlement, do not only serve the purpose of learning grammar and vocabulary; they are the site in which the newcomer experiences the new environment for the first time. As such, the ESL class serves as an important site which could influence the process of resettlement for many years even after the program has ended.

Second language education can and should go beyond teaching the basic, functional skills and move towards self-actualization and social transformation. It is appropriate to call on political engagement for social change as a strong purpose for language acquisition. One of the basic tenets of critical epistemology is that new knowledge should be linked to old knowledge or experience for it to be deemed ‘meaningful’. As for those newcomers to Canada who have been active in social and political causes prior to arrival, the ESL class has great potential for being a space for transformation, for social change, cultural diversity, economic equity, and political
enfranchisement. The learners’ political knowledge, organizing and mobilizing skills can be linked to new knowledge about their new context, the Canadian political arena and Canadian social causes.

As the number of immigrants and refugees who arrive in Canada every year grows, so too does the diversity. Many of the newly arrived immigrant and refugees in Canada are experienced activists who have resisted against political and social repression in their countries of origin. Many although not directly involved in action have come with an understanding of and commitment to social justice. They arrive in Canada with a wealth of knowledge about organizing for social change. The extant knowledge that newcomer activists bring may be new knowledge for Canadian activists and vice versa. The ESL class can be a space to create alliances and relate knowledges. It would be intriguing to shift the focus of the ESL class from the learners’ deficit (language proficiency) to their strength (political consciousness). Conceptualized as such, the language classroom becomes a space for Revolutionary Social Transformation (Allman, 1999).

References


Abstract: Many health professionals are developing an interest in adult learning and its connections to the community, as well as health's connection to continuing and professional education. Professionals, from both health and adult education, are increasingly aware that education and learning are key in the struggle to promote health. In this roundtable we discuss the connections between learning and health, and raise issues for further research.

Health professionals are increasingly aware of the links between adult learning and health. Indeed, many have come to realize that responsibility and ownership of health resides in the community, and that health is affected not only by biology but also by a diversity of social and cultural factors such as education, gender, geography, and employment, the social determinants of health (Laverack, 2007). Yet, the links between health and education are not always clear either to health professionals or to adult educators engaged in health related practice.

Health professionals have considerable information on health and illness; yet, there is less information available to them on health and learning, and more specifically on how to increase the links between health and learning. This gap in knowledge and practice is also apparent to adult educators working with graduate students from the health professions as they delve into adult education theory and practice, and want to use these insights to inform their health practice. For many, the participatory and engaged aspects of adult education are a good fit with their preferred ways of practice. As a consequence, many are interested in learning more about the theory and practice of educating other professionals and the public about health. Our discussion at the roundtable session will help suggest links to an integrated adult health learning framework that has a strong theoretical basis.

In this session, we look at methods and practices such as participatory planning, storytelling, teamwork, and community mobilization, that can be used to increase health in the community and in higher education. We enunciate the links, raise questions, and give examples of practice, as well as acknowledge that there is a diversity of views represented here: some participants are located in higher education and others are deeply rooted in the community; others work in clearly identifiable adult education situations such as mentoring junior professionals, while others practice informal strategies such as storytelling and citizen mobilization. This range allows for innovative ways of increasing health through an adult learning perspective.

As a group of academics and professionals, we have edited a book, Adult Education and Health (English, 2012) that includes an emergent and critical theory of health and learning, which highlights power and resistance and advocates for a more participatory approach to learning.
about and promoting health. For that book, Coady and Cameron developed a discussion of community health impact assessment as a way to build capacity, healthy public policy, and community learning. Moseley proposed a comprehensive adult learning model for preparing public health nurses for practice. Kinsella et al. explored the role of reflective practice in the lives of allied health professionals. Hibbert et al. highlighted the importance of interprofessional learning and education for groups as diverse as police, nurses, and sports medicine practitioners. Although we come from a variety of backgrounds, the theme running through all chapters is how adult education principles, practices, and theories, can help to improve health systems and local communities.

Yet, some burning questions remain about how to broaden the audience of health and learning, to policy-makers and government leaders, to deans of education, and to professional associations, all of whom affect teaching and learning for health. This issue of policy is an important one, yet it seems to be quite illusory, perhaps because of the enormous energy and effort exerted on behalf of medical systems and expert knowledge. Until decision-makers and policy experts make the shift to a comprehensive view of healthy communities, which necessitates honouring people as knowers and indigenous knowledge as valid, many of these ideas and practices will be ineffective.

A related question remains about the willingness of the professions to acknowledge that interdisciplinary work with education can be of benefit to them and the patients in their care. While a great deal of effort is already ongoing to work in interprofessional teams and to do effective continuing education, there is still resistance to moving to a more participatory framework. Transitions are difficult, and yet essential if a transformational model of health and learning are deemed possible.

We are a diverse group of policy makers, educators, health professionals, indigenous workers, and adult educators, and will use this time to explore critical questions and ideas related to the intersection of health and learning. The roundtable provides us with an opportunity to talk about critical issues such as: What are the links between health and adult learning? What does it mean to move from knowledge about clinical practice in areas such as dietetics, occupational health, nutrition, nursing, allied health professions, medicine, and respiratory technology, to the community, higher education settings, and continuing education programs for health professionals? What are the implications for policy? What are the implications for how we think about what counts as legitimate knowledge in the professions? How do they we balance educational process with content? Where are the areas of resistance and how can they be addressed? Who are the missing voices in our book and how might we bring them into a sustained conversation? How do health professionals talk to each other about their practice and their insights?

References

Power, Politics and Possibilities: Relationships and Learning between Teachers and Mothers of Children with Autism

Erin J. Careless
Mount Saint Vincent University

Introduction
In Canada, approximately one in one hundred and ten people are diagnosed under the Autism Spectrum disorder umbrella (Lazoff et al., 2010). Diagnosis rates have increased dramatically, and Mandell et al. (2005) reports “a 373 percent increase in the number of reported cases of autism spectrum disorders from 1980 to 1994” (p.314). Children are typically diagnosed by the age of three, and parents are then faced with a great deal of learning about the disorder and diagnosis, strategies to support their children, how to navigate the complexity of their child’s education system, and how to engage in a relationship with the child’s educators. Educators face the challenge of fostering student learning in classrooms that are increasingly larger and more inclusive. The relationship between mothers and educators may be a key to supporting students diagnosed with autism.

Literature
Mothers tend to take on more responsibility for childcare, particularly when the child has been diagnosed with a disability (Florian & Findler, 2001; Pakenham et al., 2005). The participants of this study will therefore be mothers, as opposed to fathers, although this may be an idea for further research. Following a child’s diagnosis, mothers often “encounter a variety of challenges such as overcoming the disappointments attendant to the original diagnosis, learning to negotiate a system of health and educational networks, and developing strategies for guiding their child’s success” (Glidden & Natcher, 2009, p.999). There is a lack of research on the relationship between mothers and educators and how this can alleviate parental stress and support children.

Teachers in Western society are expected to provide inclusive learning opportunities for children with special needs in their classroom (Ingersoll & Dvortcsak, 2006; Loiacono & Valenti, 2010), often without adequate training and resources. Teachers, administration, and support staff are bound by a set educational curriculum. To attempt change within formal education, these experiences must also be brought forward.

Methodological Standpoint
Methodologically, I write from a critical feminist perspective (Tisdell, 1998; Kirby & McKenna, 1989) that requires women’s voices to be heard throughout the research. I am careful to name my personal standpoint as the researcher, and acknowledge that power is exercised by mothers differently depending on the intersection of other factors (race, class, language, ability, and culture). This research is informed by Dorothy Smith’s institutional ethnography, and her notion of “work” that refers to anything done with intent, purpose, and knowledge. I am therefore interested in the work of mothers whose children have been given this diagnosis, and the work of educators in the formal school setting.
Research Plan
The participants of this study will hopefully be mothers of children with autism, educators (in training and in practice), as well as representatives from administrative and support staff positions. Semi-structured interviews will leave room to discuss emergent themes (Denzin & Lincoln, 2008). I will try to attain participants from schools that represent diverse communities with differing levels of educational support.

The principles of institutional ethnography will guide my research process, hopefully establishing an idea of the work mothers do, and privileging their voices and experiences. Along with the interview data, educational policies around supporting children with developmental disabilities will add another layer of analysis to my research.

Conclusion
Simpson (1994) talks about inclusive teaching as a collaborative process: “students with autism will increasingly be served in integrated and inclusive settings… special education teachers, general education teachers, administrators, and support staff will increasingly adopt service delivery models based on consultation and collaboration” (p. 2). The group missing from this “collaborative” system, are the parents.

I hope that this research may help to bring attention to the experiences of mothers whose children have been diagnosed with autism, to support and acknowledge the work that they do, and to use their own words to help facilitate the relationship between mothers and educators. Privileging their voices is critical because “unless you support women in their role as mother, you will never get equality of opportunity” (Hornosty, 1998, p. 180).

References


Learner Awareness of Informal and Incidental Learning within Communities

Rebecca Reznick
University of Calgary

Abstract: This paper uses the Burning Man community and experience as a site of informal and incidental learning. Additional themes central to this study include meaning-making, authentic learner engagement and learning communities.

Overview
The Burning Man community is at the center of this study that is focused on learner awareness of informal and incidental community learning. This is a unique community in that the level of participant engagement is outstanding. Participants devote seasons to creating art, music, costumes, shelters, gifts and other artifacts, both tangible and intangible in nature, allowing for numerous informal and incidental learning opportunities.

According to Foley (2001), critical meaning-making flourishes in informal and incidental learning. Church, Bascia, and Shragge (2008) define informal learning as “any learning process that occurs outside of the context of school programmes or continuing education courses”. This critical learning, the result of acting and reflecting throughout the experiential process (Foley, 2001), challenge the learners’ assumptions and values of what they know and how they know it.

What is the Burning Man Festival?
Since the late 1980s, Burning Man has developed into a week-long experimental and temporary community, meeting annually in the Nevada Black Rock Desert to celebrate radical self-expression and self-reliance. This community is radical in the way that it challenges members to express and rely on themselves to a degree that is not normally encountered in one’s day-to-day life, at least in Western societies. Burning Man is most rewarding when experienced as a participant rather than a spectator. And just as fast as it came into existence, within a week the physical community disappears, without leaving a trace.

The Burning Man experience is different for everyone. It is whatever you chose it to be. For some people, it is simply a party in the desert. For other participants it is a spiritual event. This community is characterized by its own set of social norms that make up ten guiding principles. These include radical inclusion, gifting, decommodification, radical self-reliance, radical self-expression, communal effort, civic responsibility, leaving no trace, participation, and immediacy (Burning Man, 2012). These principles provide community members with a sense of security, equality, and legitimacy.

There are three distinct phases that make up the Burning Man experience. The first stage is recompression. This is the period of time where participants begin preparation for their journey to Black Rock City which includes arranging for food, shelter, and transportation as well as creating art and costumes projects individually and in groups. The second phase takes place in the desert where a free form society develops with the ultimate goal being encouraging participants to experience humanity in a new way. The final phase, referred to as decompression, offers participants a chance to catch their breath and culminate their experiences in the desert by
sharing stories, celebrating personal transformations and officially make the transition back to everyday life.

**Philosophy and Theoretical Lens**
While members of the Burning Man community may be aware of the learning that is infiltrating their experience, how does this translate into the ‘real world’? Exploring the experience of a Burner, a self-identified label, provides a window into learner awareness of the informal and incidental learning within their community.

The philosophical perspective for this research will take on a social learning approach so that I can study how people experience the phenomenon that is Burning Man. While individual participant awareness and self-reflection will account for a large part of this study, the reality is that learner’s experiences are connected and socially intertwined with the contributions and involvements of the community as a whole, a key tenant of social constructivism (Vygotsky, 1978). By theorizing that meaning and meaning making are a result of the social learning environment, I hope to discover a deeper understanding of how learner knowledge is constructed and applied throughout the participant’s experience, and most importantly, in their words.

Phenomenography is my theoretical lens and plays an important role in the Burning Man perspective. Marton (1986), a key developer of this theory, explained “Phenomenography is an empirical research tradition that was designed to answer questions about thinking and learning, especially for educational research” (p. 29). Walker (1998) described phenomenography as “ways of seeing them, knowing about them and having skills related to them. The aim is, however, not to find the singular essence, but the variation and the architecture of this variation by different aspects that define the phenomena” (p. 26).

Through qualitative analysis of participant’s understanding of their experiences, the learning perspective may provide opportunities for enhancement of transfer of learning practices in traditional learning communities such as those that exist in the workplace or in educational institutions. Creating sustainable, engaging learning communities is important in both these landscapes. The challenge then becomes figuring out the ‘key ingredients’ that allow for such a great level of authentic engagement and somehow re-creating this incredible level of motivation in traditional learning spaces. This research aims to provide clarity by identifying these key learning elements that exist in the Burning Man community

**Discussion Questions**
In this roundtable we will explore communities as a site of adult learning. What kind of informal and incidental learning happens in communities? What challenges are associated with informal and incidental community learning? How do the social context and expectations of a community impact the learning experiences of the participants?

**References**


**Health, Peace and the Environment: Educating and Integrating Relationships in Women's Peace Movements**

Dorothy Golkin Rosenberg  
Ontario Institute for Studies in Education, University of Toronto

**Abstract:** This roundtable sets groundwork for research on Health, Peace and the Environment: Educating and Integrating Relationships in Women's Peace Movements. It explores how equity, peace/justice, health and our ecosystem can be integrated into academic, community, courses and programs. It includes the United Nations Security Council Resolution 1325 stipulating that women play major roles in peacemaking and peace agreements - largely ignored by the powers that be, and often unknown in educational institutions and programs.

This roundtable helps set groundwork for research on Health, Peace and the Environment: Educating and Integrating Relationships in Women's Peace Movements. It explores how the gendered links – equity, peace/justice, health and our ecosystem can be integrated into academic, community, courses and programs.

It relates to the following:
In this era of continuing conflicts and wars, it is critical that adult educators focus on the interrelationships of militarism, sexism, health and the environment, not only because of the social justice, peace, violence, feminist, economic, refugees, etc. concerns, but now also because of cancer epidemics, other environmentally linked illnesses and the state of the planet. Never have these gendered and often racialized links to militarism been more visible in the media than in the U.S. and NATO led missile bombing wars in Iraq in 1992, Yugoslavia in 1999, Afghanistan in 2001, Iraq again in 2003 and Libya 2011.

The U.S. atomic bombs on civilians in Hiroshima and Nagasaki (made with Canadian uranium), agent orange and other defoliants destroying human and ecosystem health in Vietnam, the bombing of oil and munitions depots, chemical plants and other toxic sites as well as the use of depleted uranium (DU) in weapons, tanks, bullets and missiles and the climate change impacts of these activities, compel us to address these links in our transformative education for planetary health, peace, justice and ecosystem sustainability.

These contexts should include the United Nations Security Council Resolution 1325 stipulating that women play major roles in peacemaking and peace agreements - a resolution largely ignored by the powers that be, but is also unknown in many in educational institutions. We must ask if these concerns are often integrated in adult education research, courses, practices and programs. In my OISE/UT course "Environmental Health, Transformative Higher Education and Policy Change: Education for Social and Ecosystem Healing", we do so with readings, films, speakers and discussions hopefully leading to education for potential policy change in the future.

Aspects of research, class discussions, papers, conferences, personal and community engagement and working with social movements for equity, peace and justice include:
In my teaching I highlight links between violence against women, violence against the earth, the violence of militarism and war, the violence of poverty, debt crises, trade agreements and other structures of domination which perpetuate poverty for the many and riches for the few, race, class, culture, ageism and other relationships of power and marginalization. As Ursula Franklin taught us, “everything is connected”.

In this era of environmental crises and climate change, war and preparations for war are the largest single users and destroyers of resources and ecosystems. In addition to suffering, death, destruction and deprivation, these actions are the major users of petroleum and energy in general. The Feb.17th 2007 Energy Bulletin detailed the oil consumption just for the Pentagon’s aircraft, ships, ground vehicles, and facilities that made it the single largest oil consumer in the world. According to rankings in the 2006 CIA World fact book, only 35 countries (out of 210 in the world) consume more oil than the Pentagon. This information is not readily available because military emissions abroad are exempt from national reporting requirements under U.S. law and the U.N. Framework Convention on Climate Change. Since most of the Alberta Tar Sands oil goes to the US, Canadians might ask how much of it is going to the military? “The military accounts for a full 80% of the US federal government’s energy demand (Joanna Peace, 2009). Atomic Accomplice: How Canada Deals in Deadly Deceit (Paul McKay, 2010) explains nuclear reactor technology, from spent fuel to weapons grade plutonium, as an issue which must be understood to prevent nuclear weapons proliferation as Canada seeks to refurbish old and build new reactors, promote exports despite other countries, (especially since the Fukushima nuclear accident) renouncing these projects in favour of sustainable energy policies based on efficiency, conservation and renewables.

Students can be encouraged to ask: Who is making decisions and in whose interests? What ethics, values and ideologies are represented? Why does this situation continue? How is Canada implicated as a member of the North Atlantic Treaty Organization (NATO) and what do Canadians know about Canadian military relationships to the Tar Sands and uranium exports, fighter bombers, military submarines, war fighting rather than peacekeeping, what can be done and which groups are engaged in addressing these links? How can recommendations be implemented regarding the United Nations Security Council Resolution 1325 promoting/insuring women playing major roles in peacemaking and peace agreements? What is needed to change the misguided priorities of governments which rush to feed the culture of war while skimping on programs to build human security in a suffering and fragile world with tragic results? What are examples of some successful actions and models?

As such, this roundtable can help to:
1. Explore ideas for a larger work or a research study on this idea. 2. Explore and be creative around higher education. 3. Exchange ideas and strategies to affect procedures and policy.
4. Feed in to a larger discussion on equity, peace/justice education and health. 5. Generate debate and conversation on a relevant and important topic.

References:

The Ursula Franklin Reader: Pacificm as a Map, Introduction by Michelle Swenarchuk,
Colliding Narratives: Cinema and Viewers in Critical Dialogue

Samina Sami
University of Toronto

Abstract: This workshop will represent theorization and research that is part of my ongoing dissertation. The inquiry explores the use of cinema as a tool for critical consciousness and social justice action. The research question focuses on how critical consciousness takes place through cinematic viewing and what viewers do with this heightened awareness. Using the experience of Canadian South Asian communities, the proposal applies a critical race lens to theoretical frameworks and current research in cultural studies and adult education to gain insight into the consciousness process for racialized and immigrant communities.

Cinema as Catalyst?
It is often argued that cinema, as a form of popular culture, has great potential for critical learning because it appeals to a multitude of senses and offers a more pleasurable, democratic form of learning (hooks, 1996; Sealey, 2008). The research in this area has traditionally focused on children or youth given the assumption that popular culture appeals to this group the most. Tisdell (2007) argues that popular culture needs to be taken seriously in adult education as well. She points out that there is growing evidence that popular culture, including cinema and television, looms large in informal learning settings for adults yet we know little of how adults contest these spaces.

There is a great deal of scholarship examining cinema as an art form—its aesthetics, content and politics. The intersection of cinema and learning is less explored particularly as it relates to adult learning. The scholarship in cultural studies has focused on theorizing cinematic content versus unraveling the experiences of viewers. There is however increasing interest in visiting the ties between cultural studies and education (Casella, 1999; Gaztambide-Fernandez, 2004). There are arguments that cinema and other forms of popular culture need to be explored as serious pedagogical texts for adults, as they are accessible, engage the senses and address barriers such as literacy and class (hooks, 2009). Other researchers argue for critical media literacy skills as a means to challenge social and political constructions (Chang et al, 2009; Sealey, 2008; Stuckey et al, 2007). These various research threads assume that cinema can affect change yet the dynamics of this transformation are not well understood.

We need to better understand how cinema may inspire and move learners. Institutions such as the National Film Board, the Canadian Broadcasting Company and the burgeoning cultural industry of social justice film festivals (e.g., human rights, labour, environmental, justice, women, Diaspora etc.) work on the assumption that cinema holds great potential for awareness and education. Cinema is expected to permeate audiences, enter their lives and invert their understanding of the world, thereby leading to some form of action. If so, how does this consciousness take place and what do learners do with this heightened experience and knowledge? Ellesworth (2008) notes that there is a disconnect when it comes to films and viewers. She argues that audience reaction often misfires against the intent of directors and we need to better understand this disconnect.
My research explores this very issue by asking how cinema is received by audiences versus how filmmakers and educators position films for critical consciousness. This inquiry focuses on Canadian South Asian communities because this population comprises a significant demographic group in Canada and it has a rich engagement and historical tradition with cinema and visual culture. The experience of South Asians with social justice cinema in Canada is a largely untapped area of research. This research will help to fill this gap in scholarship and assist in better understanding how popular culture intersects with race, migration and transnational experiences within an adult education context. It will also provide insight into new arenas of informal adult learning.

References
“Learning Through Soul”: Spirituality and Transformative Adult Learning

Jasjit Sangha
Center for Women’s Studies in Education, OISE / UT

As Dirks (1997) outlines, in his study of adult learners, spirituality enters the sphere of learning when a person nurtures their inner self or soul. This can lead to changes in the life of an adult because “learning through soul aims at transformation of the heart, at character, and wisdom” (pg. 84). As Tisdell (1999) shows, this occurs as adults gather “new insight, a renewed sense of human history and connection, and a new sense of meaning” (p. 88). Often, this deeper learning occurs for an adult when they are part of a community. As I showed in my doctoral work (Sangha, 2010), while spirituality is “an expression of an individual’s quest for meaning” (English & Gillen, 2000, pg. 1), “learning is a social process” that occurs in relationship with others (Mezirow, 1997, p. 10, Dirkx, 1997). In this way, a classroom environment in which students engage in relational learning has the potential to be the site of transformative adult learning.

In this research roundtable I will delve more deeply into the relationship between spirituality and adult learning through my current research with mature students who have returned to graduate school after a long absence from a formal educational institution. Using data collected from interviews with these students, I will discuss how a classroom environment that nurtured wholeness, authenticity, trust, and a sense of community led to a more meaningful and lasting learning experience for students as it initiated transformative change in their lives such as a shift in their sense of self, their health, their work, their relationships and their engagement with society. I will also explore how this process of transformative change, while welcomed by many students can be arduous for some. As Scott (1997) explains, change can lead to grief, as an adult sheds one way of making meaning to “another state that is deeper, wiser, and more in tune with matter, the body and soul, and the material world” (pg. 45).

The goal of this research roundtable is to initiate a dialogue on this complex relationship between spirituality, adult learning and transformative change, and its implications for both adult learners and educators.

References


An Exploration of Human Capital Assumptions in a Canadian Construction of a Knowledge Economy

Judith Walker & Tara Gibb

Abstract: In this roundtable session, the authors examine Canadian Federal policies on lifelong learning through the lens of key discourses associated with the knowledge economy and human capital theory. They will engage participants at their session in a discussion on the lessons that these discourses and trends in recent Canadian employment and training policy might have for adult education theorization, policies, and practice.

Introduction
The “Occupy” movements and recent major economic crises across the developed world call our attention to the “broken promises of education, jobs, and incomes”, as the title of Brown, Lauder, and Ashton’s (2010) latest book puts it. Nonetheless, in Canada—as elsewhere—human capital theory (Becker, 1964; Schulz, 1961) and claims of a developing knowledge economy (Department for Business Innovation and Skills, 2009) continue to dominate policy discussions. This is witnessed in government assertions that upskilling and credentialization not only enhance an individual’s productivity and wages, but also help Canada to develop a knowledge economy. Despite allegedly declining innovation and productivity (Coyne, 2011)\(^{19}\), as well as major growth of the service economy and mining, oil and gas industries, ‘human capital for the knowledge economy’ remains a discursive goal of Canadian federal policy documents on employment and training.

In this roundtable, the authors will discuss how recent Federal policy initiatives conceptualize ‘human capital’ and the ‘knowledge economy’ by drawing primarily on eight current policies on employment and training. In examining these policies, we deconstruct major knowledge economy narratives as well as highlight the presence of human capital theory in federal initiatives aimed at increasing the employability of certain demographic groups. We use our empirical and conceptual research as a starting point to collectively engage in stimulating conversation on human capital theory, the knowledge economy, and implications for adult education theory and practice.

Discourses of the knowledge economy
The knowledge economy is understood most simply as the idea of an economy dependent on the input of ideas, technologies and information for the output of economically profitable ideas, products, technologies and information. Discourses on the knowledge economy have become so pervasive and influential that they have “assumed the status of truth, dominating the policy lexicon and excluding alternative economies – even denying that they exist” (Kenway et al., 2006, p. 4). In our work, we have identified four common discourses—or assertions—around the knowledge economy.

i. Economic performance is based on the production and distribution of knowledge

ii. Knowledge is increasingly codified and transmitted through technology

\(^{19}\)According to a recent Macleans article, from 1985 through 2006, Canada’s productivity growth ranked 15th out of 18 countries at comparable levels of development.
iii. *Education and learning are central to the economy: Development of human capital*

iv. *Highly-skilled labour is increasingly necessary for sustaining the knowledge economy*

In our roundtable, we will connect these discourses to suppositions of human capital theory, and will critically examine how such discourses play out in particular policy documents. We will also invite discussion on: 1. How these four discourses may be supported or challenged by current Canadian labour market trends; and 2. What implications these discourses are having—and might have—for adult education theory and practice.

**Importance of topic**

Discussions of human capital and the knowledge economy are relevant for both theoretical and practical purposes. As adult education practitioners and scholars, it is important that we understand the foundations of human capital theory upon which some adult education programs are built. From a practical standpoint, OECD nations such as Canada may have to confront the prospect of an underemployed, underpaid, well-educated workforce, suggested by Brown, Lauder, and Ashton (2010). As Reich (1992) predicted, Canada is increasingly producing jobs in the service sector (e.g., working in restaurants and tourism) or in ‘routine production’ (e.g., working in resource extraction). Contrastingly, well-paid, cognitively-complex knowledge worker positions (or what Reich calls ‘symbolic-analyst’ jobs) seem to be in short-supply. Understanding human capital theory, its assumptions, and its relation to national and global economic/labour-market trends can open spaces for discussions to generate alternative conceptions of adult education.

**Questions to be addressed**

This roundtable seeks to engage in collective conversations around questions such as:

- What do you think the knowledge economy looks like and should look like?
- How is human capital conceptualized in the institution where you work?
- Should—and if so how should—adult educators include a critique of human capital and knowledge economy discourses in their practices?
- What alternative conceptualizations of the economy and of the purposes of education can we develop as adult education scholars and practitioners?

**References**


Women Survivors of Sexual Violence and Partner Abuse: Exploring Transformative Learning through Social Action Participation

Susan H. Young
St. Francis Xavier University

Abstract: This roundtable will discuss preliminary findings of a research project designed to explore how women survivors of sexual violence and partner abuse experience transformative learning by engaging in social action on a Survivors’ Advisory Council. It will link the issue of violence against women with adult education and transformative learning. This session will interest educators who wish to discuss the impact of violence on learning.

Background
Feminists and their allies have worked for years to show that male violence against women is pervasive, but there is still a lack of acknowledgement of the research generally and in adult education. Transformative learning, now grounded in political analysis, can be used to show how women survivors experience change when engaged in social action.

Defining the Terms: Violence Against Women
Despite statistics showing epidemic proportions of violence against women (Breire & Jordan, 2004), the definition is controversial. The United Nations developed a consultative process that concluded with a broad, commonly accepted definition, used in the 1993 Declaration on the Elimination of Violence Against Women:

Any act of gender-based violence that results in, or is likely to result in, physical, sexual or mental harm or suffering to women, including threats of such acts, coercion or arbitrary deprivation of liberty, whether occurring in public or private life (Johnson, 2006, pp. 8–9).

Additionally, most experts in the field agree that a historical, systemic, and gender-based analysis frames and grounds the issue of violence against women (DeKeseredy, 2011).

The Personal is the Political: Linking Violence Against Women, Adult Education, and Transformative Learning
When Hanisch (2006) wrote the essay The Personal is Political in 1969, the phrase captured the imagination of feminists. People were beginning to link the individual’s experience with the larger political sphere. While feminists in adult education refer to violence against women (Butterwick, 2005), only Horsman (1999) explicitly links it with adult education. Horsman challenges adult educators to transform by: creating open learning environments where violence against women is named as common; implementing strategies to respond more effectively to learners who are survivors; working politically toward eradicating violence against women.

Some adult educators suggest that a synthesis of the personal and the political is necessary for genuine transformation to occur (Lange, 2009). The transformative learning movement has expanded from the original focus on rationality (Mezirow, 1978) to include the emotional, the
extra-rational, and the spiritual perspectives inside a framework of multicultural and political understanding (Taylor, 2009). If adult educators increase their knowledge of the issue, they are more likely to enhance the level of supportive education for learners who are survivors and challenge the hegemonic thinking that cloaks the subject of violence against women in invisibility (Maguire, 1987).

**Research Project: Do survivors of sexual violence and partner abuse experience transformative learning when engaged in social action?**

Transforming individual and social forces simultaneously is essential to develop a response to the global attempts to impose a conservative and capitalist philosophy that denies full participation in society to the poor and the powerless such as survivors of intimate violence.

**Methodology**

This qualitative study uses critical ethnography with feminist theory as the theoretical lens to identify the socio-political roots of violence against women. Additionally, I use Mezirowean transformative learning theory to examine the catalytic factors as participants move toward social action. I interviewed seven members and one key informant involved in two different Survivors’ Advisory Councils in Ontario. I held focus groups to present key preliminary findings to the two Councils and to an external group of self-disclosed survivors of violence.

**Survivors’ Advisory Councils**

Survivors’ Advisory Councils are typically linked to larger coordinating committees dedicated to ending violence against women. England has demonstrated some success with developing Councils (Naples, 2003), while Canada is just beginning to explore how these Councils may contribute to anti-violence work.

**Key Preliminary Findings**

The following seven key themes emerged from a preliminary analysis of the data:

1. Healing Elements from Council Participation
2. Significant Learning
3. Capacity Building Among Members
4. Personal & Political Transformation from Social Action
5. Key Systemic Barriers
6. Key Systemic Solutions
7. Lived Experience of Violence

Key preliminary finding will be elaborated on at the roundtable.

**Conclusion**

While all Council members spoke of transformation, both personal and political, they also agreed that being on the Council was only one element among the multifaceted dimensions of healing and only one element in a perspective transformation. Further data analysis leads to three strands of recommendations: Survivors’ Advisory Councils, Violence Against Women agencies, and adult educators. Presentations will be made to those interested in improving services for survivors, including adult educators keen on enhancing a learning environment to increase support for learners who are survivors.
References
What Shall We Do with the Self?

Yukyung Kim-Cho and Sheila Stewart
Ontario Institute for Studies in Education of the University of Toronto

Abstract: In this paper and the symposium, we examine the ways we use self-narrative writing and poetic inquiry as our doctoral research methodologies. As adult educators with a commitment to feminist social justice perspectives we value the reflexive, creative, evocative, and complex nature of our self-writing as a process of learning and meaning-making. This paper makes use of dialogue to explore tensions and possibilities in our research processes.

We are long-time adult educators who use the arts in our practice as educators and researchers. We met in the first year of our doctoral program in Adult Education and Community Development. Despite different research topics and personal, professional and ethnocultural differences, we came to know each other through courses on qualitative research, marginality and philosophies of emotion.

For our doctoral research, we engage in reflexive and creative narratives, poetry and visualization (illustrations and collage-making). Yukyung studies the dynamics of transnational feminist self-making by reflexive and creative self-narrative writing. She focuses on her experience of Otherness and inbetweeness as an ethnocultural minority woman striving for feminist social justice values. Sheila uses poetic inquiry to focus on the ways that shame, grief and silence can permeate learning, through exploring memories of growing up in an immigrant minister’s family and working in community-based adult literacy.

In the symposium we will discuss tensions and gains in such creative self-narrative-based research processes. We experience tensions between creative, reflexive and analytical methods of inquiry and modes of communication within our knowledge-making processes. We experience uncertainty doing “internal” examination in the context of adult education which has a focus on social justice. Based on this experience, we explore the meanings of self-reflection and the kinds of learning available through arts-informed practices are making available to us.

We examine different approaches to self-narratives as research and pedagogy as well as issues with reflexivity discussed by feminist and poststructural qualitative methodologists such as Carolyn Ellis (2004), Laurel Richardson and Elizabeth St. Pierre (2008), and Bronwyn Davies and Susan Gannon (2006). Feminisms and adult education theories have long advocated for reflexivity in research and education, but we want to investigate the ambivalence we uncover in research that is mainly driven by reflexivity.

With the belief that knowledge is relational and learning thrives on dialogue, we start a conversation about our inquiry methods. We describe the scope of our work and then enter into dialogue about the tensions, challenges, and possibilities.

Self-Narrative Writing and Poetic Inquiry: Perspectives and Contexts

Yukyung:

My relationship with words
A Woman of Colour’s relationship with words
Words that are “archive”
Words that are “repertoire” (Taylor, 2003)
And gossip

Words giving meanings to actions
Action based on words
Action named by words
Action because it was given words
Now different meanings

Words typed, printed, sent, presented
Words caught in my throat for days
And never heard
Baby words
Rising in my head and evaporating

Time to meditate

Public narratives
Hidden narratives
“Forbidden narratives” (Church, 1995)
Narratives in phrases
Narratives leaping
Narratives stemming out of everywhere

A rhizome
Images
Appearing, moving, connecting, disappearing
My head is a village cinema.

Time for yoga
I came to the PhD program feeling compelled to do an in-depth study on the complexity of practicing feminisms. Based on my experience with feminist organisations and my Master’s project (Kim-Cho, 2001, 2005), organisational development seems to somehow complicate the practice of feminisms within organisational boundaries. So do individual needs and styles. Relations with the state and donors are even trickier.

I investigate the relations between my feminist values and daily self-making experiences with Otherness, inbetweenness and need for belonging, as an international student, immigrant, expatriate, and feminist social justice activist. Methodologically, I examine how arts-informed (Knowles & Cole, 2008) self-narrative writing contributes to feminist research to shed light on ethnocultural minority women’s experiences of transnationality. I draw on the tradition of Third World/Women of Colour feminist self-writings such as those of Gloria Anzaldúa (1987/2007), and the work of critical transnational feminist scholars who employ evocative self-narratives such as Sangtin Writers and Richa Nagar (2006) and Diana Taylor (2003). Contemporary qualitative scholarship has increasingly incorporated and theorized self-narratives and autoethnography (Denzin, 2006; Gannon, 2006; Jones, 2008). In particular, “creative and analytical” (Richardson & St. Pierre, 2008) self-narrative writing, as a research method facilitates “the continual co-creation of self and social science” (p. 477).

I take my multi-genre self-narratives as my main “data” and self-narrative writing as a research process and presentation. I also employ visual images and visualizations, namely artefacts, collage-making and illustrations in my individual and collective research activities with other ethnocultural minority women who are feminist. I take a spiral process between reflexive and creative writing, and reading and conversing with others for scholarly and empirical input. In this paper and symposium, I explore the tensions with this spiral movement and in the course of navigating through the triangle between the three moving and (re)forming dots: self, other and the community. This triangle appears to produce technical, methodological, philosophical and political tensions around creativity, reflexivity and politics of knowledge production situated in adult education.

Sheila:
I came to academic work as a community-based adult literacy worker, literacy researcher, and poet. My doctoral studies grew out of two practitioner-based literacy research projects, one on the effect of violence on learning (Stewart, 2008) and the other on the place of narrative and social differences in adult literacy teaching and learning (Stewart et al, 2009). Both projects focused on practitioners’ subjectivities. I began doctoral work with the question, “How can we listen and learn across social differences?” I was also drawn to arts-informed research and its valuing of form.

Writing poetry and letting poetry guide my thesis, I have come to focus on shame, grief, and silence and their relationship to authority, both personal and institutional. “Shame,” according to feminist philosopher Sandra Bartky “is the distressed apprehension of the self as inadequate or diminished.”(Bartky, 1990) There is a kernel of grief within shame at the “diminished” self. I
come to understand more of why I was drawn to literacy work and how aspects of my background and disquiet childhood drew me to working with literacy students. The reflective time and space of PhD studies allows me to approach feelings of vulnerability and exclusion within the institutions of church, family, and school.

Poetry is my preferred form of writing, a place where I feel a stronger sense of voice. My first poetry collection *A Hat to Stop a Train* (2003) reflects on my relationship with my mother, her reluctant emigration from Ireland, her work as a United Church minister’s wife, and reveals an entanglement of our voices/selves. My second collection *The Shape of a Throat* (2012) tries to articulate some of what lies between self and other, and between self and the natural world.

Poetry enables me to write through and into memories, unraveling threads of experience with to understand more about dynamics between learning and authority. I reflect on my life as a United Church minister’s daughter, a schoolgirl and university student in love with learning but less with “education.” I was trained to use words in tactful, solicitous ways, upholding the sanctity of family and church. I examine what drew me to literacy work and poetry, finding the grief and silence of shame tied in a complex knot of knowing/unknowing.

I use poetic inquiry (Thomas, Cole, & Stewart, forthcoming 2012; Prendergast, Leggo, & Shameshima, 2009), because of poetry’s facility with ambiguity, uncertainty, and paradox. The fragmentary, imagistic nature of poetry allows me to work with material beyond the rational, such as the unconscious and the partiality of memory. I explore language and thought as continuous interpretive acts, placing my work in the tradition of phenomenology. I uncover emotional resonances and states of being which shape our ability to learn and our understanding of what learning is. I write into the entanglement of knowing and being. My work engages with tensions between lyrical, narrative, and analytical forms of inquiry.

**Dialogue on our Methodologies**

**Yukyung:**
What is special about using poetry in self-reflection? How does it differ from other forms of writing?

**Sheila:**
Poetry helps me dwell in the space of connection and disconnection between body and word. I write to inquire into the relationship between body, mind, emotions, and spirit, inviting integration and healing. Poetry draws on the visceral, emotional, and a sense of spirit, using rhythm and experimentation to take language beyond its usual limitations. Poetry’s fragmented rhythmic use of language helps me explore the dynamic between silence and authority in an embodied way.

**Yukyung:**
Can you explain more about how poetry connects you with your body and spirit?
Sheila:
I let the writing take me places I would not arrive at with a linear approach. The associative nature of poetry take me inside language so I feel pulled along by words that are more attuned to myself than when I write discursively. I use poetry as a container, finding a sense of control and release in creating a poem. I write to discover what I think and feel, rather than writing about something which I believe I already know.

I am struck by the resonance between my title *The Shape of a Throat* and the words in your poem,

Words caught in my throat for days
And never heard
These words bring forward the body and the physicality of speaking.

I write poetry to investigate my church background, schooling, and family life growing up in small-town southwestern Ontario. I watched my mother, other women, and girls, for clues as to how to move and what to say. My father was seen as the one who “knew” in our home; my mother’s silence and supportive role seeping into my bones.

Poetry’s oral and visual qualities and playfulness can provide space to subvert discursive language’s traditions and problematic binaries. Neilsen Glenn (2011) says, “The philosopher Martha Nussbaum argues that works of art are not only a primary means for an individual to express her humanity through catharsis, as Aristotle claimed, but, because of the attunement to others and to the world that creation invites, the process can sow the seeds of social justice” (p. 87). I am very interested in poetry that incorporates social commentary, shining a light on a particular aspect of how the world is.

Do you think your self-narrative writing practices relate to feminisms and social justice? If so, in what ways?

Yukyung:
Oh, yes, in many ways. From the critical reflections I had on my own and with my colleagues, and also from feminist literature on women organising, I learned a few things to do with self (Kim-Cho, 2001). Self-reflection is necessary to allow any social movement or critical project to remain critical and serve the people involved as a learning opportunity. Self should be taken into account when we evaluate achievement of any organisation or project. Self-sacrifice for the greater good of the society was demanded and taken for granted in social movement groups in South Korea in the 1980s up to the mid 1990s when I was going to university. Similarly, I learned about selflessness from my Buddhist patriarchal home, and observed women’s dedication to the family, domestic chores, modesty and silence, taken for granted. As the youngest daughter, I became part of the female crew when I was going to elementary school. Neither of these two societal and familiar contexts seemed to have enough space for self and women’s selves in particular.

I also observed the relations between language, subject positions and power. Writing, either creative or formal, seems to be a novelty available to people with a high level of institutional education, who are talented, and who are native speakers of the dominant language of the place.
The act of speaking works out similarly. For example, on the site of UN-led or UN-informed international conferences, there seems to be little space left for the lively voices of self and momentarily changing and fluid selves, especially for those from outside the Western world. These women appeared at these international conferences and officially represented their organisations and communities with funding from the West, however they could not speak a word or play the game. They stood out more by their traditional attire than what they say. There seemed to be only fixed separate positionalities allowed on these sites: victims brought from the Third World to testify, world leaders who know all the terminology and procedures, or women who represent NGOs.

During my first year in a graduate program in Toronto, I found myself silent and invisible in classroom overwhelmed to follow the coursework in my limited second language. Later, I was silent again as an immigrant at my first job in this country. I found the same mannerism in many Othered people who moved from their homelands, those who are racialised, and those who have to pick up the dominant language here. Writing for us is always a struggle and we censor our writing of any kind. We write according to the norms to meet the expectations from our colleagues, supervisors and teachers. I am often amazed by the political and philosophical gap I find at academic writing centres where I go for support. There are certain ways of writing that are valued in North American academia and professional world. I have to adopt them in order to have my writing communicable and recognized.

*Sheila:* Can you explain how a poststructural approach to self-narrative writing responds to these concerns?

Poststructural self-narrative writing that facilitates creative and reflexive processes helps the writers find their own inner self and interrogate their daily and momentary business of being and becoming, to borrow the Deleuzian term, the artful dance between their values and needs in my research context. It allows me to observe how I navigate the triangle I mentioned above between my self, other in my life - relationships, and the community – social justice. Through this writing, I look at my acts, name and question my feelings. I agree with the poststructural understanding of fluid self, unfixed subject positions, changing power relations. Discourse names phenomenon, determines meanings, shapes positions and appearances of subjects differently in different contexts (St. Pierre, 2000; Weedon, 1987/1997), which then creates norms and margins.

By giving my self a chance to write, I give my self a chance to feel, think and learn from *my* experiences, reflections and imaginations. I then later revisit those moments and my writings. I find different meanings from these revisits. I agree with how Davies and Gannon (2006) see reflexivity in self-writing. They emphasize the evocativity in this work by calling reflexivity "a technology of selves that is integral to the very kinds of selves made possible in the discourses through which selves are constituted and through which they constitute themselves" (p. 111).

We must . . . occupy an ambivalent position of competent agent and transgressive critic. (Davies and Gannon, 2006, p. 112)
I give my self a chance to be angry, mourn, grieve, content, happy, nervous and wonder. I let her give me a ride so I can sit and enjoy the adventure. She likes the time and space, the autonomy.

... Does this sound like self-indulgence? I claim my work to be critical and analytical as well as performative and evocative. What supports our self-writing to carry these qualities?

Sheila:
Self-exploration is not indulgence. I like what you say about “lively voices of self” and poststructural perspectives on the fluid self. Hearing you sift through layers and tensions in your subjectivity helps me reflect on how poetic inquiry aids my shift from a more official literacy voice. “Self-narrative writing” has the quality of self-making engaged in the “business of being and becoming, the artful dance between values and needs” as you put it.

Yukyung:
Would you say a little more about how you came to your thesis topic?

Sheila:
When we came to the week on shame in Megan Boler’s Philosophies of Affect and Emotion course three springs ago, I wrote an on-line post, a draft of this poem:

if you can’t say something nice

don’t say it
where to tell what
where/how conversation on-line face to face

in your face turning red gut
churning gotta get it right flight
word misspelled mis-pronounced not
a footnote in sight wrong place wrong time

way off cry in the washroom wash hands over
and over absolve yourself cleanse cut capitulate
compensate stay home no one knows you
shadow sucking sniping stupid

if you can’t say something nice don’t
a mouth opens critique the purpose
must be clearly stated goal measurable objectives objection over-

ruled over turned cast off
you want an apology why
Shame feels so personal, while it is socially shaped by our context, history, and cultural traditions.

Even though poetry has had a place in qualitative research for decades, I feel insecure about my poetic autoethnographic writing counting towards a thesis. Sometimes I wish I was doing a traditional scholarly thesis on something more obviously of social use. But, I believe that if I dig through layers of self and say my "truths," they will echo with some readers. I need to go within to find what is "uniquely" mine to say, as Anne Dilliard says in *The Writing Life* (1989). This emotionally, spiritually challenging work requires steadiness, slowness, and attentiveness. I have avoided this work through being busy, distracting myself with activities. I walk, do yoga, and have time alone and with colleagues to discuss my writing. The process of coming forward in my writing requires kindness to myself. It includes both fear and emotional release.

**Yukyung:**
That sounds familiar! I need a different kind of energy for my self-narrative writing, compared to that for more conventionally academic writing. Could you say more about how writing and knowing through self-writing requires steadiness, slowness and kindness? Does the kindness mean prioritizing ourselves over others, other people and other chores? Does it mean we should leave dishes and dirty floors to be kind to myself?

**Sheila:**
I enjoy activist work and community-building, and I embarked on the PhD become more comfortable exploring thoughts and feelings in an embodied, holistic way. Kindness is related to mindfulness, noticing my body, rather than ignoring it, leaving it, or punishing it. Prioritizing ourselves and our work is important. You mentioned being the youngest daughter in your family and I am the only daughter. I am unlearning some of my early gendered training.

**To Be Continued**

**Yukyung:**
It’s three days before the deadline. How should we wrap this up?

**Sheila:**
I have been more productive with this paper than the other journal article I’m working on. This paper was easier because we were in dialogue.

**Yukyung:**
It’s interesting to see how this dialogue evolved without pre-planning the content. This paper seemed to have its own life. I spent much more time on this paper than my comprehensive paper which I hoped to finish a good draft by the same day. I am far from a good draft of my comprehensive paper, but we are nearly finishing this paper together. Is it the power of relationality? Did we let our selves talk? What were the tensions we experienced in writing this piece together and separately?
Sheila:
It is interesting to see you, a woman of Colour, doing arts-informed work, when most racialized high profile scholars do highly theorized work and most arts-informed researchers at our school are White and are often older than the average student. What we are doing may be seen as “soft.” But what a complex process: self-writing revealing more of self. Which parts to reveal in academic publishing? Yesterday I sent off the proofs for my new poetry book and I am very ambivalent about releasing it into the world.

Yukyung:
It is very complicated and uneasy to work with self and write her out for our study. For me, I observed my tendency to keep going back to the scholarly literature. It is my self-doubt and habit obtained from the academia that I should perfectly and clearly know what other scholars said about my subject matter before I explore my own memory and embodied knowledge. It is liberating to acknowledge this anxiety now and discuss it with you. Self-writing is an excellent tool to examine the daily dynamics of self-making, becoming. Collaboration, in addition, offered us learning that could not have happened if we worked separately.

References


Adult Education Journals in Metric Time: Editors’ Perspectives

Tom Nesbit, Edward W. Taylor, John Holford, Patti Gouthro, Virman Man, Michael Osborne, Jim Crowther, & John Dirkx

Abstract: This symposium involves six former and current editors of international adult education journals who discuss the challenges and implications the journal metric system (impact factor, assurance measures) has for the study of adult education.

Introduction

As key vehicles for creating, communicating and legitimating knowledge, scholarly journals play a pivotal role in the life of any academic field. Much can be learned through how they disseminate theory, research, policy orientations, and reflections on practice. Academic journals not only represent the knowledge base of a given discipline, but also reflect its history, trends, research norms and social structure of communication between scholars and others with professional expertise (McGinty, 1999). One voice that is rarely heard (at least publicly) in such discussions is that of the journal editor—the human face behind the metaphorical gate—who play a crucial role in any process of legitimization and control (Wellington & Nixon, 2005). A recently held international symposium brought together several adult education journal editors (Nesbit et al., 2009) to focus on the tensions and contradictions inherent in their work, and how they viewed the nature, purposes, epistemological emphases, and academic norms of their journals in relation to the field of adult education. Although the symposium made significant headway in documenting the various editors’ perspectives, other issues emerged during the discussion. Of particular concern was the increasing demands of commercial publishers and the role of editors in ensuring an independent intellectual space in a time of increasing journal metrics, impact factors, cost/benefit analyses and quality assurance measures. For example, only certain journals of various disciplines are included in publishers’ journal citation reports (e.g., metrics, impact factors) prompting some academic institutions to count only publications in these journals towards tenure and promotion. “If the journal is not indexed by Thomson Reuters, there is no impact factor available” (Pendlebury, 2009, p. 4). Among adult education journals, only Adult Education Quarterly is indexed by Thomas Reuters. Additionally, “the lack of coverage of books, the modest coverage of conference proceedings, non-English language and regional journals, the logic of assignment of journals to subject categories and subcategories, the omission of serials of international importance, [and] the inclusion of journals with questionable importance” (Jacso, 2009, p. 604) is leading to a situation where academic “life becomes geared to chasing publications in elite journals with the highest impact factor” (Corbyn, 2009, P. 1).

Finally, in other academic fields, impact factors have moved from being a measure of a journal’s citation influence in the broader literature to a surrogate that appears to assess the scholarly value of work published in that journal. More worryingly, such metrics are now also being used to assess individual researchers, institutions, and departments (McVeigh & Mann, 2009).

also explore the effects of corporate publishers and impact factors and how they, as editors, balance the often-competing needs and demands of their readers, the authors they publish, and the requirements of academic societies, scholarly publishers, and other owners and sponsors.

**Adult Education Quarterly**  
*Edward Taylor, former Co-Editor*

The *Adult Education Quarterly* (*AEQ*) is one of the leading international journals in the field of adult education yet the only one “ranked” in the *JCR*. This affords greater privilege over other journals and potentially inordinate power over shaping the research in the field. Most significant has been the considerable increase in manuscript submissions, particularly international manuscripts because of some universities particularly those in Asia, Europe and the United Kingdom are giving greater credit towards tenure for publications in ranked journals. The *JCR* as a measure pressures scholars to publish in the *AEQ*, explaining to some degree the increase in submissions. Furthermore, the editors are often pressured by the publishers where “interest has turned to using publishing and editorial practices to influence, alter, and even manipulate the impact factor” (McVeigh & Mann, 2009, p. 1107), through the publication of certain types of manuscripts (e.g., literature reviews, conference abstracts, letters to the editors) and encouraging authors to self-cite and cite references from the journal of submission (Brown, 2011). As the only AE journal to be indexed there is little space for AE faculty to publish in a ranked journal, forcing scholars to look for ranked journals outside the field limiting their publication exposure to their academic peers. Recognizing the related consequences of the *JCR*, how best are the editors of *AEQ* to respond? Should its owners—the American Association of Adult and Continuing Education—withdraw the journal in protest? If this was even possible, since Reuters has access to most on-line publications, it is likely that another journal would simply takes its place. Also, some would argue that it could negatively impact the publication activity of the journal. However, I think impact would be minimal because of the journal’s reputation among the academy and its overall subscription size. At least the major journals of field could include a shared statement in their masthead reflecting a unified statement of descent against the use of the metric system. Another approach would involve exploring alternative measures of the journal impact factor (e.g. citation download, social impact model, Google Scholar Citations) among interested editors in a collaborative effort (e.g., Bollen, Van de Sompel, Smith, & Luce, 2005; Cynical Geographers Collective, 2011; Pendlebury, 2009). Although it is important to note that each of these measures have their own limitations and further support the ideology of the metric system. Regardless of the approach, as editors we need to continually: educate others about the application and misuse of journal metrics, hopefully preventing it from becoming apart of the unquestioned norm of academic development among faculty, and be alert to the intentions of publishers in influencing the journal in response to the impact factor.

**Canadian Journal for the Study of Adult Education**  
*Tom Nesbit, former Editor*

To help promote adult education as a field of study, the main academic association of Canadian adult educators (CASAE/ACÉÉA) owns and publishes a biannual printed peer-reviewed academic journal (*CJSAE*) that contains research-based and theoretical articles, literature reviews, reflections on practice and current issues, and book reviews. With only a relatively small readership, *CJSAE* has yet to pique the interest of commercial publishers or be included in the annual Journal Citation Index. In this, it is not alone amongst Canadian journals. More
specifically, no Canadian journals are included among the list of 170 education journals. So, while university rankings and the assessment of scholarly achievement and productivity feature as large in Canadian academic life as elsewhere, Canadian practices still resist the allure of quantification and tend to rely more upon peer judgment and review rather than external metrics. Additionally, the research assessment exercises used as a basis for allocating public funding that have so bedeviled universities and academic colleagues in other countries have yet to be established in Canada. Consequently, the pressures to measure scholarly productivity (whether by individual researchers, academic institutions or scholarly journals) have not been felt so strongly. Maintaining journal autonomy is crucial. Although it publishes manuscripts on any relevant topic and from anywhere in the world, CJSAE’s editorial approach focuses on the emergent issues affecting Canadian adult education by locating them in a broad yet critical perspective. Interpretive approaches are valued along with multi-vocality and a concern to offer space to under-privileged voices and perspectives. Defining and maintaining such an attitude is aided by the Association’s retention of overall fiscal and administrative control; a stance that it shows no signs of yielding, especially as the fields of Canadian adult and higher education and the arena of scholarly publication all seem to be increasingly affected by increased competition and the discourses of consumerism, and market discipline. Of course, such autonomy comes at a price. CJSAE’s pro-Canadian approach inevitably reduces the number of manuscript submissions from outside Canada: in the past three years, less than 20% (12/62) of manuscripts were submitted from abroad. And, not surprisingly, the Journal has comparatively low international visibility being neither as well-known nor as accessible as it might be. So, despite the presence of several internationally-regarded Canadian adult educators on its board of consulting editors, CJSAE is caught in a vicious circle: low visibility induces relatively low manuscript submission rates that attract comparatively little attention and fewer subscriptions. However, recognizing that the electronic availability of manuscripts attracts more readers and citations, CJSAE (with the added impetus of a new editorial team) is now beginning to explore how it might move towards online publication and open access. The challenge it faces will be how to improve its visibility, access and impact while also maintaining scholarly independence, promoting diverse, marginalised and non-hegemonic perspectives and continuing to be financially viable.

International Journal of Lifelong Education
John Holford & Patti Gouthro, Co-Editors

As adult education is foremost a field of practice, a key element of its scholarship is improving teaching and learning. Yet the field also has a strong ethical dimension. In the words of the British Ministry of Reconstruction report, “adult education is a permanent national necessity, an inseparable aspect of citizenship, and therefore should be both universal and lifelong” (1919). Such understandings are central in scholarship and academic journals have remained relevant to its practice. How far are these values challenged by recently intensifying trends towards judging journals, and the worth of scholarly output, by “metrics” and “impact factors”? From the perspective of a journal editor, “metrics” are both troubling and seductive. We know that institutions – university administrators and research funders – are increasingly obsessed by journal rankings. Higher factors, broadly speaking, are good for the status for the journal and for those who publish in it. Publishers regularly provide “data” to editors on their positioning in “the citation index.” Yet these indices are not objective constructs. They are profoundly influenced by commercial considerations. The percentage of education journals included by Thomson-Reuters in the Web of Science is markedly smaller than many other disciplines. Inclusions often appear
in response to market or political concerns than to criteria of “quality” alone. Smeyers & Burbules (2011) note that the Web of Science is being used increasingly within academe to assess which publications will be valued around decisions pertaining to tenure, promotion, hiring, and research funding; decisions that profoundly affect academic careers. Publications outside of this narrow spectrum are not given the same value, so researchers seek to publish in high ranking journals, which places pressures on journal editors to develop strategies to improve the ranking of their journals. There are also concerns in focusing too extensively on quantified assessments of citations of journal publications (Lang & Canning, 2010). Just because an article is cited, does not mean it is of exemplary quality. Sometimes articles are being critiqued, sometimes they are part of a secondary citation, and sometimes they are used in a perfunctory fashion. Journals in the Web of Science are predominantly in English, so researchers from non-English speaking countries may be less likely to research about localized or national concerns (Smeyers & Burbules, 2011). While ILJE publishes in English, it has traditionally welcomed an international scope of publications. Editors, however, are given charts from publishers indicating the popularity of particular articles. Less visible scholars focusing on unique cultural or geographical locations often receive lower levels of citations. The challenge, then, is how to create a higher ranking journal whilst still retaining a social justice focus that provides opportunities for scholars from a wide range of cultural contexts.

International Review of Education
Virman Man, Editor

Discussions at the International Review of Education’s annual Editorial Board meetings turn and return to the thorny issue of accreditation in citation indices. Buying into the citations game means, rather crudely, that we encourage authors to cite the right kinds of articles from the right kinds of journals. If done often enough, we increase our own score and, therefore, our supposed journal ranking. To be considered eligible to join the band of rated journals, as for any club, we have to demonstrate how closely we match the identity of existing members. Membership is not, of course, a guarantor of quality. Nevertheless, authors may perceive it thus (especially those at the start of their careers). How do citation indices and impact factors affect a journal’s editorial selection policy? What counts as valid and high-quality research? Do articles submitted in languages other than English have less chance of being cited and contribute to a journal’s overall impact factor? This is a problem if, like IRE, part of your mission is to encourage scholarship from writers from the South. Is the dominant (western) form of knowledge being reproduced at the expense of others? Some hard choices need to be made about the purpose of the journal. Is it to provide a forum for academic exchange and debate? A great idea, but there are plenty of ways these days of getting your ideas into the public domain without the sometimes interminable wait for feedback. No, people value journals partly because they want to feel part of a community – it’s their means of communicating and of identifying with those whom they regard as their peers. The pressure to play the game comes in part from research institutions and academics who seek publication in what they perceive to be the most visible/influential/respected vehicles. Securing research funding is perhaps the strongest driving force, though professional advancement and prestige figure in as well. Learned societies generally don’t have the wherewithal, time or expertise to put into the mechanics of getting the material “out there”. That’s why we need publishers – and we need them to be sympathetic to our needs. In most cases they seem to be. Nevertheless, publishers have an interest in their journals being quality – to defend their investment and market position. Our publishers, Springer, have asked us to think carefully
whether we as an Editorial Board wish to try to gain inclusion in one particular citation index. The risk, they say, is that we sell part of our soul to gain entry and we need to be certain that this index is an appropriate measure of what we value. The *International Review of Education* may yet take this route, but we will have no illusions.

**The Journal of Adult and Continuing Education**  
**Michael Osborne, Editor**

The *Journal of Adult and Continuing Education*, published by Manchester University Press, provides a forum for rigorous theoretical and practical work in lifelong learning and adult, community and continuing education. There are challenges to journals such as JACE, occupying a niche market in adult education, such as the decline in the academic community of adult education; a foci on metrics and impact factors of journals; and the emergence of non-commercial on-line only journals. With the demise of many well-established adult education departments, particularly in the UK, there simply is not that local group of academics providing material. Further the Research Excellence Framework (REF) (see [http://www.hefce.ac.uk/research/ref/](http://www.hefce.ac.uk/research/ref/)) in the UK (previously Research Assessment Exercise (RAE)) rewards the quality of research and this is linked to significant government funding. In principal it is quality of output that matters: in reality most academics do not believe that, and will direct their work to journals that rank highly where the most successful departments submitted work in the 2008 RAE. That includes those academics remaining in our field, who tend to orientate their work to the safe generic journals in education rather than adult education. A similar situation pertained within the Australian Research Quality Framework (RQF), which focused on quality and impact of research (Donovan 2008), and in its successor the Excellence in Research Australia (ERA) initiative in 2010 (see [http://www.arc.gov.au/era/](http://www.arc.gov.au/era/)), managed by the Australian Research Council (ARC). In this process journals were ranked A*/A,B/C. This clearly influenced submissions since the ranking of the journal was an important metric in determining quality and in the case of Australia, government funding. Details of the rankings for journals in our area, and alternative rankings from the Australian Vocational Education and Training Research Association (AVETRA) make interesting reading (see [http://avetra.org.au/avetra-initiatives/avetra-journal-rankings](http://avetra.org.au/avetra-initiatives/avetra-journal-rankings)). Methodologically one must dispute such rankings simply on the basis that it was achieved by viewing just one edition of each journal. The ARC decided in 2011 not to use ranking in the second round of ERA in 2012, but rather a list of eligible journals. It will be interesting to observe whether behaviour of Australian academics will change as a result. Whilst in our field there hasn’t been a challenge from commercial publishers, the emergence of journals run through societies in pure e-form certainly provides a credible alternative (e.g., European Journal for Research on the Education and Learning of Adults, [http://www.rela.ep.liu.se/](http://www.rela.ep.liu.se/)). There are challenges for conventional journals, and some flexibility does need to be introduced. However, there are still arguments to suggest that the traditional journal has a place if it incorporates flexibility (e.g., accepted articles are available electronically as soon as possible) and is backed by a reputable publisher.

**Studies in the Education of Adults**  
**Jim Crowther, Editor**

*Studies in the Education of Adults* is an international, peer reviewed journal, which is not included in the Thomson Social Science index. High quality publications in the journal are, therefore, unlikely to be recognised in citation indexes for ‘measuring’ academic value. Although
article submissions to the journal are steady the situation may change because of the pressure on authors to publish in “high quality” journals, which the metric system of evaluation is supposed to measure. The use of personal citation rankings of academic “outputs” as a criterion for promotion and reward is a potentially powerful disciplinary tool. A key issue to address, therefore, is the politics of measurement and how appropriate techniques of academic value can be recognised and inappropriate ones negotiated and, if necessary, resisted. Working outside the metric zone is one that the editor and editorial boards of journals have to address. On the one hand, utilitarian measures of research and scholarship are alien to the tradition of adult education as a field of practice and study. On the other, this movement seems irresistible and being “outside” the metrics of measurement is likely to marginalise AE journals even further. In a context where AE is already on the margins of the Academy it is important to ensure that academic publishing in this area are recognised and valued. The proposed symposium comes at a timely moment and the response of editors to the dilemmas of metric techniques of measurement needs debating.

The Journal of Transformative Education
John Dirkx, Editor

The Journal of Transformative Education (JTED) was founded to advance the theory, research, and practice of transformative education and transformative learning. An expressed aim of JTED is to span the rhetorical gap that often separates research and theory from practice in the field. The journal reflects an interdisciplinary focus, publishing articles from diverse fields such as social work, teacher education, and the health professions, as well as adult education. It represents a traditional outlet for scholars that is clearly intended to speak to and influence practitioners in the field as well as researchers in the academy. Because we are relatively new, our primary goal has been to “grow the journal.” Discussions with the publisher have focused primarily on specific strategies to make the journal more prominent among academics and practitioners. We have, however, also discussed how JTED may become ranked by JCR. First and foremost, Thomson requires that journals publish on a regular schedule to be accepted into the JCR. This issue has represented the most significant challenge for the current editorship of JTED. Prior to this editorship, the journal had fallen significantly behind and our priority has been to return the journal to a regular publication cycle. As we approach this goal, we are now able to systematically consider the problem of metrics and the JCR. We have focused mostly on increasing citation activity by developing awareness of the journal through the use of promotion flyers; marketing the journal and specific issues around articles that will receive citation activity; issuing calls for papers on listservs; encouraging presenters at scholarly conferences to publish in JTED; planning thematic issues; and maintaining a presence at regional, national, and international educational research conferences. As a commercial publisher, Sage provides a substantial benefit to our efforts to increase citation activity. Having said all this, pursuing acceptance by JCR presents significant challenges for journals the likes of JTED. For most of us, editing journals in adult education is a very part-time affair and adopting such strategies requires a considerable time commitment that may be difficult to honor. The nature of JTED itself also poses serious issues for being accepted by JCR. We are, by comparison, a relatively small journal in the field of adult education. Our mission includes a significant commitment to the scholarly study of practice in transformative education. Finally, our interdisciplinary nature requires a focus on multiple disciplines and areas of study that are traditionally considered
outside the realm of adult education. These issues challenge us to work for more inclusive indicators of journal quality that more accurately reflect particular missions and audiences.

**Conclusion**

It's clear that the adult education journals are affected by the recent growth in measures of journal impact and the uses to which they are put. Especially in the inter-disciplinary yet already marginalised field of adult education, its journal editors feel that such measures as journal rankings and impact factors are unnecessarily limiting and detrimental to academic innovation. In a system that appears to favour narrow and standardized approaches to assessing scholarly quality, the need to be able to publish diverse views or on original or unconventional topics is crucial. The alternative is to endorse academic homogeneity based upon those of the already privileged, normalized and assumed universal relevance and legitimacy. Further, these editors seem to want to retain a high degree of control over the publication activity of the journal and believe a reliance on commercial publishers’ citation data is not the best judge either of scholarly quality or the rich variety of adult education research.

**References**


Motivation and Social Movement Activity: Perspectives on Learning and Social Change

Peter H. Sawchuk
Joseph E. Sawan
Rakhat Zholdoshalieva
Susan L. Carter
Agnes S. Thomas
OISE/University of Toronto
Amna Sha
St. James Town Women’s Council

Abstract: These papers draw on preliminary findings from the APCOL project related to perspectives on sociocultural learning. To what extent can sociocultural approaches to social movement learning support dialogue among adult educators, activists and academics to better understand the forms and dynamics of SML?

Introduction
Peter H. Sawchuk

The Anti-Poverty Community Organizing and Learning Project (APCOL; www.apcol.ca) was designed to use qualitative (eight neighbourhood-based case studies) and quantitative (surveying of anti-poverty activism) methods within a Participatory Action Research approach to study and contribute to social movement learning (SML) across four key pathways of anti-poverty action (housing, good jobs, health/nutrition and education) in the City of Toronto. At the centre of its analytic concerns has been the way that people learn, re-learn, un-learn and sometimes choose not to engage in forms of anti-poverty activism broadly conceived. Involving dozens of student and faculty academic researchers from different disciplines, community organization representatives and researchers, and the participation of over one hundred residents from Toronto’s most impoverished neighbourhoods – perhaps what unites the project conceptually is our orientation to the critically situated and socio-cultural character of these cornerstone dynamics of learning and the capacity for social change making. Applying socio-cultural learning theory to social movement participation and learning presents important challenges for adult educators committed to social justice and interested in intervening meaningfully into everyday learning of both those who are, and those who are not, currently engaged in community / social justice work. In particular, questions of motivation vis-à-vis learning and social movement participation matter to the work of adult educators – questions that are addressed in particular (and diverging) ways within the socio-cultural tradition.

As a general background to the material below it is important to note that inter-disciplinary Social Movement Studies approaches to anti-poverty activism on the one hand, and Adult Education approaches to SML on the other, offer rich, but dispersed and often dis-connected, traditions. For us, there are several important points of contact involving the following: the study of socio-cultural dynamics and outcomes of networks, norms and sanctions across multiple levels of analysis (individual, meso and macro levels); an account of mediating material and cultural resources; processes of bonding, bridging and linking; the role that high levels of trust
and social cohesion in facilitating community organizing, collective action and mutual aid; and, diverse appreciations (and criticisms) of social capital which, like other forms of capital, is unevenly distributed and is part of the process of reproducing social inequalities thus establishing the importance of a broad, anti-oppression perspective as well. At the same time, Adult Education based SML research frames our approach; specifically, socio-cultural theories of everyday (or informal) learning as well as the role of organized, popular education intervention within anti-poverty organizing. As we do this, we see more clearly how the grievance construction process, for example, is fundamentally an adult learning process. Likewise, understanding the role of mediating (material and cultural) resources entails the dissemination, use and development of forms of information, knowledge and skill in order to be realized as a resource. The same can also be said about social networks: people must learn to construct and engage in them and they must learn from social networks to realize gains. SML, in this sense, is endemic to effective community organizing, and yet there exist very few large-scale, multi-methodological and empirically-informed Canadian studies that have effectively combined studies of anti-poverty social movement making with these types of educational concerns at the centre.

In this context, we draw observations from these data to answer a series of emerging questions: how do theories of social networks and institutional ethnography relate to SML; how do the identities and the figured worlds of activist grievance construction processes depend upon issues of emotional learning and/or dynamics of alienation and de-alienation? We argue that answers to each of these questions, and others, speak to the extent to which these distinctive concerns may facilitate necessary dialogue among adult educators, activists and academics to better understand the forms and dynamics of SML. Ultimately, we take up a series of “learning lenses” to explore the purpose and the potential power of emerging activism in times of change.

Learning (De)Alienation: Motivational Aspects of Participation in Social Movements
Joseph E. Sawan and Shadya Yasin

Though anti-poverty movements are incredibly diverse, this paper argues that a key motivating factor among participants may be gleaned from a deeply human interest in de-alienation. By understanding motivation through a lens of productive activity and de-alienation, we may begin to better understand the shared interests among those struggling for social change, and possibly consider ways to facilitate learning processes that support holistic approaches to social movement activity.

Theoretical and Methodological Considerations
While this paper aims to focus primarily on the empirical basis for recovering Marx’s theory of alienation, it is important to briefly situate key theoretical and methodological considerations in relation to motivation in social movements. In a recent treatment of social movement theory and motivational dimensions, Maurice Pinard (2011) offers a model for understanding motivation by arguing that we must consider “internal motives, which are internal states, needs, forces, or drives pushing the actor to action” and “external incentives, which represent the goods ‘out there’ pulling the actor into action” and “expectancy of success” (pp. 91-92). While offering a more complex understanding of how motivation goes beyond singular grievances or opportunities, Pinard’s model mostly ignores the role of learning processes.
In this regard, there has been significant advancement in applying a non-canonical Marxist Cultural Historical Activity Theory (CHAT) perspective to social movement learning (Krinsky, 2008; Sawchuk, 2010). In this tradition, goals of transformation and social change are central to learning processes, and aim to understand learning and cognition from the individual and collective, simultaneously.

By approaching activity as the unit of analysis, we find a unique way to understand how individuals engage in social movements while addressing the complex array of motivations. In CHAT terms, the concept of object/motive is central to this argument as it “may be either material or ideal, either present in perception or existing only in the imagination or in thought” (Leontiev in Sawchuk, 2010, p. 12) and is a part of a complex set of internal and external relations.

With an understanding of activity as the centre of human learning and transformation, we may now consider how learning one’s alienation and a vision of an unalienated condition may be a significant factor to encourage participation in social movement activities. Marx outlines his theory as four distinct “breaks”– from human labour (activity), product (material), each other, and the “species” (one’s nature) (Marx, 1961).

The struggle to reconnect these ‘separations’ can be understood as one’s ‘object/motive’. In other words, our human interest in reconnecting with multiple forms of productive activity is at the centre of what drives participation in social movements. Through an understanding of the theoretical foundations of Marx’s theory of alienation as well as an application with CHAT – we find an opportunity to better understand how learning processes are central to motivation and the possibility of a shared object/motive: de-alienation.

Preliminary Findings
In the hopes to begin some initial discussion on the possibilities for applying such a theoretical framework, we now turn our attention to the narratives of participants in anti-poverty organizing. The interviews took place in two APCOL case studies – one in the Mt. Dennis neighbourhood in Toronto focused on economic development, and the second in East Scarborough on issues of affordable housing. One of the issues that emerged in several interviews across neighbourhoods relates to the term “activist”;

Interviewer: Would you call yourself an activist?

Respondent: No, I just identify myself as a person who’s doing my work, and what I can do I will do to the best of my ability… I’m a believer that we weren’t brought to this earth to just live, but to actually do something. It’s part of existence; you’re healthy, you’re well, you have a roof on top of your head, what more could you ask for? It’s to do something.

(APCOL Mt. Dennis Case Study)

Partly an aversion to categories and labels, the above dialogue also presents us with a motivational dimension that may be explored at the level of one’s existence – as the various factors influencing her interest “to do something” have contributed to her current position. A
need to engage in productive activity that contributes to positive social change is clearly rooted in this organizer’s interest in staying present and connected to her community on varying levels.

In a similar vein, a community volunteer in East Scarborough responded to the question by describing herself as a “worker,”

I’m just a worker… I can help get the job done… I just see a need, and I can try, especially through the people I know, I can say ‘hey this is happening here, how can we fix it?’ (KGO07, APCOL KGO Case Study)

This focus on the object of her activity – motivated by the apparent needs she encounters everyday – illustrates the importance of learning how to see a need and take action appropriately. Though she entered the conversation by calling herself just a worker, the dialogue provided a new understanding of the specific skill set she possesses and knowledge that she contributes to the various anti-poverty activities taking place in her community. By emphasizing the value of her experiences and knowledge, we are faced with a unique opportunity to facilitate consciousness-raising and emancipatory learning.

**Conclusion**

Amid the various contradictions that exist in our everyday life, it is often through collective action that we may learn to engage in the productive activity necessary for securing and maintaining our basic human needs – and subsequently to change the mode of production to a more humanistic approach to human labour. Central to understanding motivational aspects of activity is a need to understand learning processes that expose conditions of alienation and strategies for de-alienation in social movements.

**Initial Findings of the 2011 APCOL Survey**

Rakhat Zholdoshalieva

The APCOL survey was designed to document and analyze the breadth of anti-poverty community organizing and learning processes and compare commonalities and differences among different neighbourhoods. This paper presents initial findings from the first survey (n=485, conducted in eight neighbourhoods, completed in 2010/2011).

What motivates participants in getting involved with anti-poverty activities? Why do participants continue their involvement in anti-poverty activities?

The breakdown of respondents according to community activism reveal that 36% of 485 have never participated in any community activity, whereas out of 64% of respondents with activist backgrounds, 61% are the current participants and the rest had participated in different campaigns and in different countries— including Canada—in the past. Such higher percentage of respondents with activist backgrounds helped to further explore the motivational factors for community members to get involved in anti-poverty community organizing and campaigns.

Among current and past activists (n=312), the desire to make a change in their neighbourhood (25%) is among the most significant motivational factors that encourage community members to get involved in the campaigns on anti-poverty issues. Furthermore, if the perceived personal
competence (17%) seems to support such desire/willingness, the campaign-related motivational elements (9%) and the perception of collective efficacy (8%) may not necessarily be as strong as the personal experiences of poverty issues (14%). Such results raise critical questions related to the campaigns’ mobilization strategies and sense of collective efficacy in anti-poverty activities.

When asked why participants chose to stay involved, 57% indicated they enjoy helping others in the community. Followed by, passion/care about campaign issues (35%), developed relationships in my community (24%) and it has become an important part of my life (25%).

**Tools of Identity and Engagement in Learning: a pre-apprenticeship case study**
Susan L. Carter

The aim of this paper is to sketch out a relationship between identity construction, peer networks and learning in the context of a pre-apprenticeship program at an urban Ontario community college. This analysis is based in cultural historical activity theory (Engestrom, Leont’ev), with a particular focus on the practice of identity construction (Lave, Holland et al.), drawing on theories of emotion in learning (Boler), and sociocultural perspectives on motivation (Roth; Bobbitt Nolen). With respect to the case study, these connections help us begin to see how an individualized anti-poverty strategy can have some – limited but potentially significant – collective and community-based outcomes.

Bobbitt Nolen et al. put forward “three sources of motivation for learning engagement:

- the social world (figured world or community of practice including its goals, values and the possible identities)
- the obligations created in those social worlds
- and the ongoing and negotiated histories of both individuals and communities of practice” (2011, p. 112).

Theories of situated learning describe learning/development as an on-going process of “changing selves in changing practices” (Lave, 1996, p.161).

“People tell others who they are, but even more important, they tell themselves and then try to act as though they are who they say they are. These self-understandings, especially those with strong emotional resonance for the teller, are what we refer to as identities” (Holland et al, 1998, p. 3)

In our study we looked at the interconnection between neighbourhood networks (often related to informal/underground work activity); the pre-apprenticeship classroom activity system; the broader activity system of employment in the construction trades; family activity systems; and the formal school system. Where situated learning theorists would focus attention on identity construction and engagement (i.e., self-in-practice) vis-à-vis current and future-oriented communities of practice (i.e., classroom peers and the broader trades industry group), our research demonstrated the critical and on-going role that the background community (neighbourhood peers and family) play in actively mediating object and engagement. Together, past, present, and future activity systems are called up to collectively play a role in constructing
and reinforcing object: secure employment, respectability, agency through competency, image of masculine provider, etc. In particular, participants in our study repeatedly recounted their use of narratives (about the informal economy, drug trade, social assistance and the importance of education) as a kind of bootstrapping (Holland et al.) or transition tool of identity construction. When asked about how participation in the program might lead to their contributing to their communities, overwhelmingly participants spoke about the importance of testimony:

If I could walk with all my documents and say “Yaw see it ya”, me documents, I’m good you know I’m working you know I go to school and this is legit, you know what I’m saying? … and a picture at my church you know what I’m saying?” Just by showing my own self as an example, you know remind them where I was and where I’m at, and I can show them, I can’t just tell them, now I have proof on paper “hey man I went and got this it wasn’t easy, but if I can do it anybody can do it”

In this sense narrative and testimony are operating as tools of transition (mediating the subject’s own engagement) between figured worlds / activity systems. It would be a stretch to say that this pre-apprenticeship program is an anti-poverty movement, but as an anti-poverty initiative, it is clear that the narrative / testimony is an important tool of engagement, that has potential beyond participants in the program. In her work on social movement learning, Kilgore stressed the role of ‘collective vision’ and solidarity. While the apprenticeship program we studied reflected an institutional social initiative (which is directed at a particular community of unemployed and marginalized young people), participants themselves appear to share a fairly clear (mutually constituted) collective object.

Yeah, I feel like this is giving back, giving back what we deserve you know because we deserve, I feel everybody deserve an equal share of education, you know so I feel like we are getting back now. I’m getting back or my family tree is getting back. Or people that I know from my community I’m getting back for them right now you know.

There was a strong class, gender and race solidarity underlying many aspects of this case study – including the widespread commitment to ‘testify’ - what Bobbitt Nolen et al. refer to as the moral dimension of engagement.

**Informal Economy, Women and Activism**

Agnes S. Thomas and Amna Sha

Many professional immigrants find the formal labour market inaccessible once they arrive in Canada (Guo, 2009; Mirchandani, 2004; Mojab, 1999). This research explored the alternative strategies women adopt in order to survive economically and socially in this difficult situation. A number of elements such as globalization and neo-liberalism are found to be among the influencing factors that foster the growth of informal sector activities in Canada. This paper examines several main themes selected from preliminary findings from an APCOL study carried out in a Toronto priority neighbourhood. The women who participated were mostly first generation Canadians or immigrants who came to Canada in the last twenty years from Asia. Based on survey methods (n=72), individual interviews (n=12), and participant observation among immigrant women and youth, I explored how these groups develop strategies to resist the
barriers placed by institutions and the labour market to improve their socio-economic situations. It is in the face of these barriers constructed by the dominant cultural and social practises that this group of community members began working together to build informal activities that render change. Based on these findings, this paper attempts to answer the following questions: can the informal sector be an alternative to the neo-liberal market where individuals show agency, resistance and commitment to collective action? How do social networks play an integral role in this informal sector? Is there a potential for social networks to become collective agents for change in the capital economy?

Drawing on social network theory (Granovetter, 1973) and a community development perspective by Christenson (1989), this analysis looks at different dimensions of social networks and community action plans developed and run by local people that are informal in nature and proactive in terms of advocacy, leadership development and community ownership in fighting various forms of oppressive situations. In this particular study, networks that are geographically bound and spatially founded by people coordinating in all kinds of situations within communities and neighbourhoods were considered for analysis. Granovetter argues that the 'weak ties' in a network are essential for individuals to integrate well into modern society and to resist various forms of alienation. Observation from this highly populated and diverse neighbourhood suggests people come to trust the 'weak ties' that they created in the few available public and social spaces to navigate this new country and culture. One of the preliminary findings from the data collected also indicates that people get involved and learn of their community and neighbourhood through networks. They often join groups or activities by hearing of them from a neighbour or community member not necessarily in their immediate connection. The majority of the women who were part of the survey as well as of the interviews suggest how these informal networks become their main connection point with the community in which they live. It is in these informal networks that they find ways to fight economic and social deprivation caused by an inaccessible labour market and hegemonic cultural practises of their host country.

It is through these informal networks and connections that women sought out the informal work options that helped them to supplement their family income. The work options are gendered in nature and women find it fitting to do what they can to manage their households while earning extra income for the family and find a way to fight isolation. However, to examine the potential for a positive development it is crucial to understand women's choice of work in the sector and their view of work. In addition, outcomes of those work relations and the gendered nature of this work in reinforcing women's identity and place in the household and society also needs to be examined.

The key findings from this neighbourhood indicate the potential for change through community-owned and run initiatives. Both councils show individuals’ agency and competency to bring change to this under-resourced neighbourhood. Another crucial aspect of these councils is the way in which they collaborate with local agencies and the academy to bring various perspectives and expertise. Community ownership and partnership are identified as key in this new community development model that foster social change as it is suggested in all sustainable community development models. This collaborative work is of particular importance at this time of funding cuts and restructuring of social service programs in Canada and elsewhere.
The findings indicate that the informal sector has the potential to become an alternative to the formal sector as it includes people's voice and participation. However, for the women who are performing informal work in these communities and at home to benefit from this work and their experience, a shift in policy is required that is more inclusive of the labour market structures. Furthermore, social networks play a huge role in members of a community working together, their learning of the new environment and rights, the breaking of isolation, and the collective agency among individuals to fight common issues. Women who were part of this study conveyed the importance of equal voice, equal opportunity and acknowledging individual's potential for leadership and social change. Observation of the councils of women and youth in the neighbourhood suggests grass root level movements are powerful as they reflect the unified voice of people who are often not heard.

References

IV. Poster Abstracts

(PSTR) **Transforming PLAR for undergraduate adult educators**

Ian Hunt, Nym Hughes, & Sue Brown
University of the Fraser Valley

**Abstract:** The BA in Adult Education at the University of the Fraser Valley has recognized Prior Learning Assessment and Recognition (PLAR) as an important component of the degree. Student admission required 3-plus years of FTE employment as an adult educator. In practice, the promise of PLAR has proved difficult to implement. One critical reason for this challenge was its restriction to existing UFV courses. The result was minimal recognition of creditable experiential learning. In 2010-11, a rigorous and transparent process was devised to assess the prior learning of a group of ADED students. A coherent set of 13 program-level learning outcomes served as foundation for this pilot. The outcomes represented the basic knowledge, skills and dispositions representative of experienced adult education practitioners. A portfolio of learning was the medium for assessment. This poster presentation outlines the development, execution and results of this pilot, and subsequent developments within the BA Adult Education.

(PSTR) **Adult education and social repair after natural disasters**

Omer Aijazi
University of British Columbia

**Abstract:** The field of adult education needs to be further stretched and contoured onto our complex world. This research poster will aim to contextualize adult education for social repair and recovery in the aftermath of natural disasters in the developing world. Adult education processes will be presented as an alternative to traditional humanitarian interventions for the long term sustainability, resilience and emancipation of affected communities. Liberatory, anti-colonial adult education practices offer a way to re-conceptualize post-disaster interventions that build capacities and platforms enabling communities to break free of the systemic processes and relationships that keep them marginalized. Little research has examined how such theories of liberation and self-determining pedagogies can contribute to post-disaster reconstruction and rehabilitation and so this poster (as part of a larger research project) will break new ground in this area. It will also offer humanitarian workers an alternative framework for re-conceptualizing crisis situations and rehabilitation approaches.

(PSTR) **Harm reduction and feminist anti-violence work: "Safe" vs. "Free"**

Erin Graham
University of British Columbia
Abstract: This poster is an initial investigation of the analysis of 16 interviews with women who provide front-line anti-violence services to women. In particular this is about "harm reduction" as it's applied to women in prostitution. Participants experiences of providing services and support to women in prostitution form the spine of my PhD dissertation. Harm reduction ideology assumes the inevitability of addiction and prostitution. Feminism on the other hand assumes that freedom from male domination and addiction is possible. Feminist women who are employed in State-funded women's services are caught in a contradiction. They are required to promote and apply policies (harm reduction) which reinforce systems of domination in the interests of the powerful. How do these workers resolve the essential contradiction of carrying out the agenda of the state while engaging with prostituted women in a dialectical 'practice of freedom'?

(PSTR) Prospects of Lifelong Learning in Developing Countries
Kapil Dev Regmi
University of British Columbia

Abstract: The present notion of lifelong learning popular in the context of Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) and European Union (EU) is spreading to developing countries through UNESCO and the World Bank. Despite the combined efforts made by these transnational organisations and individual countries there has been limited success as evidenced by the midterm evaluation of Education for All (EFA) and Millennium Development Goals (MDGs). Two of the major reasons behind this limited success are: first, the initiatives so far made have been top-down, and second, there has been little consideration of adapting models in relation to the specific socioeconomic context of developing nations.

My poster will focus on two interrelated questions: what are the risks and benefits of adopting lifelong learning policies often developed in the context of economically affluent nations?; and what model of lifelong learning will be fit for developing countries?

(PSTR) Facebook, Twitter, & Linked-In: Online spaces for informal learning
Jacqueline Warrell
University of Calgary

Abstract: Internet social networking sites (SNS), such as Facebook, Twitter, and LinkedIn have become increasingly popular over recent years, especially among university students. These sites have the potential to be dynamic learning environments where adult learners engage in the collaborative creation, modification and sharing of information, ideas, and knowledge. However, little is understood about how learners can successfully participate in online social networking as a powerful learning tool. This proposed study is an exploration of the potential for informal and incidental learning when graduate students engage with others through these social networking sites. It will also advance the dialogue on connecting formal and informal learning in today's
digital age. Additionally, it addresses important issues about conducting Internet research, such as online methodologies and Internet Research Ethics.

(PSTR) Enhancing Professional Learning Through Self-Study Scholarship

Paula Mannington
St. Francis Xavier University

Abstract: Adult educators working with increasingly diverse groups of marginalized non-traditional learners in community-based settings have learning needs that transcend one-off, didactic models of professional development. An alternative approach to meeting the professional learning needs of practitioners working in “indeterminate zones of practice” (Schön, 1987) comes from self-study scholarship informed by the experiential, self-directed, and transformative aspects of adult learning theory (Wilcox, Watson & Paterson, 2007). Self-study research is a personal, systematic inquiry within one’s own practice context that requires critical and collaborative reflection in order to generate knowledge, as well as inform the broader educational field. The purpose of this self-study is “to embrace the hectic and fragmented territory of practice as the space for study” (Pinnegar & Hamilton, 2009) and improve my knowledge of practice in a personal and interpersonal way for the ultimate benefit of learners.

(PSTR) Learning place-based history: Decolonizing dialogues in Vancouver

Elizabeth Henry
University of British Columbia

Abstract: My research explores decolonizing place-based pedagogies with adult visitor-settlers at Kitsilano Neighbourhood House in Vancouver, BC. Curry-Stevens (2007) argues specific ‘pedagogies for the privileged’ are needed when working with people coming from privileged backgrounds. Building upon her understanding, I will research ways to facilitate learning about colonization, specifically among visitor-settlers, through historical place-based dialogues. In a series of three dialogues I will draw on Haig-Brown’s (2009) decolonizing autobiographies exercise, and will invite visitor-settlers to reflect on “Whose traditional land are you on?” (p. 4). Through historical photo exchanges and community mapping exercises I will encourage participants to learn more about their local neighbourhood history. I will research how these dialogues may be one way visitor-settlers can learn to decolonize their relationships with local indigenous community members including Musqueam, Squamish, Tsleil-Waututh and other Nations.

(PSTR) Confronting homophobia: Life histories of queer Ontario educators

Katherine Kerley
Brock University
Abstract: Homophobic bullying is a reality for many in the education systems in Canada and the United States. The life experiences and stories of queer educators can contribute to a “material and resource repertoire” (Grace, 2006, p. 828) that may enable educators to challenge heteronormativity and homophobia in the education system. This project will draw on the work of Grace and Benson (2000) on autobiographical queer life narratives, as well as that of Cole and Knowles (2001) in life history research to explore the life histories of 2-5 queer educators who are “out” in their schools and communities. Interviews will consist largely of conversation surrounding experiences of homophobia in education, as well as coming out and coming to terms with participants’ sexual identities. Data will be framed within an LGBTQ Transformative Learning (LGBTQ TL) model as proposed by King (2003).

(PSTR) Learning to construct gendered activist identities online

Laura Lane
Brock University

Abstract: Social network sites act as a gendered educational space; however, users also actively re/construct the digital context and social reality within which they are interacting. These educational spaces can be used to both challenge and reinforce power structures and normative gender representations. This research will explore how women learn to digitally represent themselves as females and social activists, as well as how gendered norms influence their self-representation in relation to their activist standpoint. As a research project currently in progress, I will present my proposed research. Specifically, I will present the literature related to how women are often underrepresented in political and technological spaces and how women use social network to engage in both spaces. I will also present my methodology that will use feminist theory and be combined with visual, narrative, and digital arts in a digital focus group that will promote liberatory digital practice.

(PSTR) Toward an online pedagogy for social justice education

Kathryn M. Bullon
Community Law School (Sarnia-Lambton) Inc.

Abstract: This theory development study focused on identifying a framework for developing an online pedagogy for social justice education. An historical inquiry into four adult education social justice initiatives—the Antigonish Movement, the Chautauqua Movement, the Highlander Folk School, and the Wisconsin Idea—identified core principles that can inform modern social justice curricula. A literature review explored analytical concepts of social justice, and traditional pedagogies of adult social justice education. I synthesized the historical inquiry and literature analysis into a theoretical framework that could guide the development of an online social justice pedagogy. In particular, I identify a set of core capacities essential to social justice education: learning to recognize privilege, critical reflection, and problem solving. Finally, I provide
recommendations for adapting traditional classroom techniques to an e-learning format. This study contributes to the adult education field by addressing a gap in the literature related to designing e-learning social justice curricula.

(PSTR) Transforming practice: Reflection as art

Jane Moseley
St. Francis Xavier University

Abstract: As a faculty member I am directly involved in integrating core competencies for cultural safety (Aboriginal Nurses Association of Canada, 2009) in the undergraduate Bachelor of Science of Nursing program. My practice as an adult educator is based on transformational learning, in which critical reflection by the learner, both myself and the student, is central to the process (Merriam, 2001). In a funded Scholarly Teaching Grant I kept a diary/journal for detailing conversations with Indigenous persons and experts, and key points from recommended articles and reports. I expressed my critical reflection as a painting. My Poster Presentation illustrates “dialogue as a living art form” (Moseley, 2004, p. 97), and the painting a starting point to engage students in dialogue and critical reflection on Indigenous knowledge, the impact of colonization, Treaty Rights, antiracism discourse, and becoming an ally.

(PSTR) Women of mystery

Patricia Gouthro
Mount Saint Vincent University